The experiences of health professionals who participate in teamwork education programmes in acute hospital settings: A systematic review of qualitative evidence

A thesis submitted as fulfilment for the award of Master of Clinical

Science

Name: Kylie Eddy

School/Discipline: The School of Translational Health Science, Joanna Briggs Institute

Date: 11th September 2014

## **Table of Contents**

TABLE OF CONTENTS	2
ABSTRACT	5
STATEMENT OF ORIGINALITY	8
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	9
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	10
CONTEXT OF THE REVIEW	10
Structure of the Thesis	21
CHAPTER 2: BACKGROUND	22
INTRODUCTION	22
THE PHENOMENON OF TEAMWORK EDUCATION IN ACUTE HOSPITAL SETTINGS	22
Research Aim	31
DEFINITION OF TERMS	31
CONCLUSION	
CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY AND METHODS	
INTRODUCTION	
OVERVIEW OF THE SCIENCE OF QUALITATIVE EVIDENCE SYNTHESIS	33
METHODOLOGICAL BASIS OF THE CHOSEN APPROACH TO SYNTHESIS	34
STATEMENT OF REVIEW QUESTION	35
CRITERIA FOR CONSIDERING STUDIES FOR THIS REVIEW	
Review Methods	37

	42
CHAPTER 4: RESULTS	43
	43
RESULTS OF SEARCH	43
DESCRIPTION OF INCLUDED STUDIES	45
METHODOLOGICAL QUALITY	45
Meta-synthesis of Findings	47
	71
CHAPTER 5: DISCUSSION AND CONCLUSION	73
INTRODUCTION	73
Organisational Context	75
Understanding of Successful Teamwork	76
Understanding of Individual Participants' Learning Needs	79
QUALITY OF TEAMWORK EDUCATION PROGRAMME	81
SPECIFIC TEAMWORK STRATEGIES EXPERIENCED BY PARTICIPANTS	84
Levels of Confidence and Motivation Gained During Education Programme	85
Potential Limitations	86
	87
IMPLICATIONS FOR PRACTICE	
IMPLICATIONS FOR RESEARCH	
Conflict of Interest	90
REFERENCES	91
APPENDICES	97
Appendix I: Search strategy	97
Appendix II: Studies selected for retrieval	112
	3

Appendix III Appraisal instruments	114
APPENDIX IV: DATA EXTRACTION INSTRUMENTS	115
Appendix V: Included studies	117
Appendix VI: Excluded studies	120
Appendix VII: List of study findings / Conclusions	121

## Abstract

Background: Teamwork is seen as an important element of patient care in acute hospital settings. The complexity of hospital settings, the changing care needs of patients and the increasing specialisation of clinicians highlights the need for health professionals to collaborate and communicate clearly with each other. Health organisations in western countries are committed to improving patient safety and the quality of care. A common intervention to achieve this is through education - and teamwork education programmes have been integral to this focus.

Objectives: The objective of this systematic review was to search for the best available evidence on the experiences of health professionals who participate in teamwork education in acute hospital settings.

Methods: A three-step search strategy, following the Joanna Briggs Institute method was used to find published and unpublished qualitative studies meeting set inclusion criteria. Critical appraisal and data extraction were completed using the Joanna Briggs Institute Qualitative Assessment and Review Instruments.

Results: Following the search and appraisal process, seven papers were selected for this review. Thirty-six findings were extracted and assigned to fifteen categories based on identified similarities across the papers. The categories were integrated into six meta-syntheses. The key themes that influenced health professionals experience of teamwork education were organisational culture, understanding how successful teams function, the quality of the teamwork education programmes, the starting points of individual participants when they participated in education programmes, the tools and strategies used in

5

teamwork education and the confidence and motivation of health professionals to transfer new skills into practice.

Conclusions: The review has identified qualitative evidence that can guide organisations and education facilitators in the preparation of participants for training and the development and implementation of teamwork education in acute hospital settings that changes practice. There are a number of issues that impact on the experiences of health professionals who participate in teamwork education programmes.

Implications: All members of a team should be encouraged by their organisation/managers to participate in teamwork education programmes in order to foster a positive culture of learning and teamwork within the team.

Facilitators of teamwork education programmes should understand how successful teams function and consider these factors when planning or delivering training.

Facilitators of teamwork education programmes need to explore participant learning needs and their prior experiences of working in teams before implementing teamwork education programmes.

Facilitators of teamwork education programmes should provide learning opportunities that are relevant, practical and foster constructive debriefing and reflection.

High fidelity simulation should be considered in acute hospitals for the training of teamwork skills in addition to clinical skills. Scenarios provide realistic opportunities for participants to practice collaboration and communication strategies that enhance teamwork.

Team managers should harness the new confidence and motivation of staff around teamwork skills following participation in teamwork education programmes and ensure that

6

there are opportunities in the workplace to apply new skills and knowledge into daily practice.

Keywords:

Health professionals

Teamwork

Education

Acute hospitals

Qualitative

## **Statement of Originality**

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name, in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name, for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint-award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright

Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Signed:

Date:

## Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my primary supervisor Associate Professor Zoe Jordan, from the Joanna Briggs Institute, University of Adelaide, for her expert guidance and support during all research phases of the process of this review.

I would like to thank my co-supervisor Matthew Stephenson, from the Joanna Briggs Institute, University of Adelaide for his support and regular assistance with 'details' throughout this research process.

I would also like to thank Carmel Mercer, who encouraged me to enrol in postgraduate studies and was my secondary reviewer.

I would also like to acknowledge my partner Bruce and daughter Claire who have been very supportive of my studies.