

**The Political Economy of Labour Migration from
Bangladesh**

Power, Politics and Contestation

Rupananda Roy

Thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy
in the

Discipline of Development Studies, School of Social Sciences

University of Adelaide, Australia

December, 2016

Table of Contents

Abstract	v
Declaration.....	vii
Acknowledgements.....	viii
List of Abbreviations.....	ix
List of Tables and Figures	xii
1. Introduction.....	1
Literature on Migration and Development.....	6
Literature on the Political Economy of Migration.....	10
Contribution of this Dissertation.....	22
Overarching Arguments.....	25
Methodology and Methods.....	27
Chapter Summary.....	29
2. Understanding the State in Bangladesh.....	32
A Brief Overview of Bangladesh’s Political History.....	33
Key Features of Politics in Bangladesh.....	36
Weberian Perspectives on the State of Bangladesh.....	38
Critique.....	52
Social Conflict Theory.....	55
Social Conflict View of Bangladesh State.....	57
Conclusion.....	65
3. Actors and Agendas.....	66
Neo-liberalism.....	66
Human Rights.....	76
Patriarchal Conservatism.....	83
Predatory Bureaucratism.....	90

Foreign Protectionism.....	93
Conclusion.....	96
4. Key Issues in Bangladesh’s Labour Migration Policies and Their Implementation.....	97
The Relative Roles of the State and the Private Sector in the Recruitment of Migrant Workers.....	97
Fraud in the Recruitment of Migrant Workers.....	100
Abuse of Migrant Workers’ Rights in Foreign Countries.....	106
Unequal Access to Labour Migration Opportunities.....	111
Conclusion.....	112
5. The Political Economy of Labour Migration Policies and Their Implementation in Bangladesh, 1971-1990.....	113
Labour Migration Policies and Their Implementation in Bangladesh, 1971- 1990.....	114
The Political Economy of Labour Migration Policies and Their Implementation, 1971-1990.....	126
Conclusion.....	146
6. The Political Economy of Labour Migration Policies and Their Implementation in Bangladesh, 1990-the Present.....	147
The Evolution of Labour Migration Policies and Their Implementation in Bangladesh, 1990 to the Present.....	148
The Political Economy of Labour Migration Policies and Their Implementation, 1990-the Present.....	168
Conclusion.....	189
7. Subaltern Forces and the Political Economy of Labour Migration Policies and Their Implementation in Bangladesh Since 1990: Two Case Studies.....	191
Case Study 1: The Overseas Employment Policy 2006.....	191
Case Study 2: The Ratification of the UN Convention and the Formulation of the Overseas Employment and Migration Act 2013.....	200
Conclusion.....	207
8. Conclusion.....	208
Policy Implications.....	211

Potential Areas of Future Research.....	216
Hope for the future?.....	217
References.....	218

Abstract

This dissertation aims to enhance our understanding of the role of political and social factors in shaping the terms under which migrant workers are incorporated into global labour markets by examining the case of Bangladesh, one of the world's principal migrant labour-sending countries.

The literature on migration and development has given little attention to the role of political and social factors in shaping the development impact of labour migration while that on the political economy of migration has focused overwhelmingly on labour-receiving countries. The few available studies on the political economy of migration in labour-sending countries have concentrated on how states have facilitated exploitation of migrant workers by, for example, celebrating them as national heroes/heroines and in so doing normalising violation of their rights. The existing literature has thus told us little about the contestation that occurs over migration policy within labour-sending countries. This is despite the fact that it has a significant bearing on who has access to overseas migration, on what terms, and to whose benefit.

This dissertation aims to fill this gap in the literature by analysing the contestation that has occurred over Bangladesh's labour migration policies and their implementation since the country achieved independence in 1971 and the implications this has had for the protection of migrant workers' rights. It makes two broad claims.

The first relates to the changing nature of the country's migration policies and their implementation in Bangladesh. Between 1971 and 1990, it argues, Bangladesh pursued an approach to labour migration that can be broadly characterised as neo-liberal with weak protection of migrant workers' rights and moments of direct state intervention. By contrast, in the period since 1990, it has pursued an approach that can be characterised as neo-liberal constrained by stronger protection of migrant workers' rights again with moments of direct state intervention. In both periods, there has been poor implementation of measures to reduce fraud in the recruitment process and protect migrant workers' rights.

The second claim relates to the political and social dynamics underpinning these policies and their implementation. Drawing on social conflict theory, the dissertation argues that the above continuities and shifts in the nature of Bangladesh's migration policies and their implementation have reflected: i) the continued political dominance throughout the post-independence period of an alliance between the dominant fractions of the domestic bourgeoisie and predatory state officials, ii) the patriarchal nature of Bangladeshi society and the ideological salience of Islam, iii) the increased scope for subaltern elements to participate in the policy-making process as a result of democratisation, and iv) the structural power of foreign governments, particularly those in receiving countries and that have provided aid to Bangladesh.

The final part of the dissertation suggests six policy-related implications of the analysis. As the main implication, it suggests that rights advocates in labour-sending countries should consider focusing on promoting democratic reform as it ultimately serves to provide better protection of migrant workers' rights by creating electoral incentives for politicians to pursue pro-poor policies and opening up new opportunities for migrant workers' groups to emerge, participate in and influence the migration policies and their implementation. The dissertation concludes by stating that in the foreseeable future, protection of Bangladeshi migrant workers' rights seems to rest on the outcome of political and social struggles between competing forces over the implementation of existing rights-based policies.

Declaration

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name, in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name, for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint-award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Signed: _____ Date _____

Rupananda Roy

Acknowledgements

It is a pleasure to acknowledge my indebtedness to people who have been kind and supportive to me throughout the journey of my PhD. Due to space constraints, I cannot provide an exhaustive listing. Nevertheless, I must mention some special names. I owe my most sincere gratitude and gratefulness to my principal supervisor, Associate Professor Andrew Rosser. His persistent help, encouragement and, above all, constructive feedback ensured that my research progressed solidly through each stage of the project. I must also gratefully acknowledge the assistance of my co-supervisor, Dr Georgina Drew, who particularly helped identify the sections that needed clarification and provided suggestions accordingly. I owe a special word of thanks to the University of Adelaide for all the facilities it allowed me to enjoy. Indeed, it would not have been possible to undertake this research without the scholarship that the University awarded to me. I also owe a special word of thanks to my fellow PhD candidates. Oftentimes, many difficult issues appeared to be very easy after consulting with them. I would also like to thank all my interviewees whose help has been essential in generating the empirical findings for this research. Finally, I extend my deepest appreciation to my husband, Ripon Tanchangya, our soon-to-be born first child, and my parents for their constant support, love and affection. Without their support and patience, I would not have survived the stressful moments I have experienced grappling with difficult theoretical concepts, making sense of reams of empirical material, and writing in a foreign language. They have been the source of my perseverance.

List of Abbreviations

- ADB— Asian Development Bank
- AL—Awami League
- ASA— Association for Social Advancement
- ASK—Ain O Salish Kendra
- BAIRA— Bangladesh Association of International Recruiting Agencies
- BLA— Bilateral Labour Agreements
- BLAST— Bangladesh Legal Aid and Services Trust
- BMET— Bureau of Manpower, Employment and Training
- BNP—Bangladesh Nationalist Party
- BNWLA— Bangladesh National Women Lawyers' Association
- BOESL— Bangladesh Overseas Employment Services Limited
- BOMSA— Bangladesh Ovibashi Mohila Sramik Association
- BRAC— Bangladesh Rural Advancement Committee
- CA— Chief Advisor
- CEDAW—Convention on the Elimination of all forms of Discrimination Against Women
- DEMO— District Employment and Manpower Office
- DFI—Development Financing Institution
- DFID— Department for International Development
- EBP—Evidence-Based Policymaking
- EEF— Extended Fund Facility
- EPZ— Export Processing Zone
- FDI—Foreign Direct Investment
- GDP—Gross Domestic Product
- GNI— Gross National Income

ILO—International Labour Organisation

IMF —International Monetary Fund

IOM— International Organisation for Migration

MFA— Migrant Forum in Asia

MoEWOE— Ministry of Expatriates Welfare and Overseas Employment

MoU— Memorandum of Understanding

MoWCA—Ministry of Women’s and Children’s Affairs

MP— Member of Parliament

NEC— National Economic Council

NELM—New Economics of Labour Migration

NGO— Non Government Organisation

NIP— New Industrial Policy

NPCG— Non Partisan Caretaker Government

NSB—National Seaman’s Board

ODA— Overseas Development Assistance

OEDB—Overseas Employment Development Board

OEP— Overseas Employment Policy

OSD— Officers on Special Duty

POEA—Philippines Overseas Employment Administration

PSC— Public Service Commission

RIP 1975— Revised Investment Policy 1975

RIP 1986— Revised Industrial Policy 1986

RMMRU—Refugee and Migratory Movements Research Unit

SAMReN— South Asia Migration Resource Network

SAPs— Structural Adjustment Packages

SDC— Swiss agency for Development and Cooperation

TIP— Trafficking In Person

TTC —Technical Training Centre

VAT —Value Added Tax

WARBE—Welfare Association for the Rights of Bangladeshi Emigrants

WEWF—Wage Earners' Welfare Fund

WID— Women in Development

List of Tables and Figures

Table 2.1 Women Contesting for General Seats in Parliamentary Elections.....	61
Table 2.2 Women Candidates Nominated by Political Parties in the 2001 Election.....	62
Table 5.1 Occupational Background of MPs, 1979.....	131
Table 6.1 Occupational Background of MPs, 1991.....	170
Table 6.2 Occupational Background of the Ministers of Khaleda Zia Regime, 1991.....	171
Figure 1 Bangladesh's Dependence on Official Development Assistance.....	75