



**INDONESIAN DOMESTIC WORKERS'
WORKING CONDITIONS
IN SAUDI ARABIA**

A NEWSPAPER ANALYSIS

BY : SRI DANTI

**A THESIS SUBMITTED FOR MASTER DEGREE
ON WOMEN'S STUDIES
UNIVERSITY OF ADELAIDE
MARCH 1996**

IN MEMORY OF MY FATHER

CONTENTS

<u>ABSTRACT</u>	iv
<u>STATEMENT</u>	v
<u>ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS</u>	vi
<u>LIST OF CONTENTS</u>	
CHAPTER I	1
INTRODUCTION	
1.1. Objectives of the Study	4
1.2. Methodologies	6
1.3. Organisation of the Study	12
CHAPTER II	15
INTERNATIONAL LABOUR MIGRATION IN LITERATURE	
2.1. International Labour Migration from Asian Developing Countries	15
2.2. Female Migration in Asian Developing Countries	20
2.3. Feminist Research on Domestic Work	23
CHAPTER III	30
LABOUR MIGRATION : POLICIES, CONVENTIONS AND WORKER PROTECTION	
3.1. Women in Development Policies	31
3.2. The Indonesian Women in Development (WID) Policies: A Critique	33
3.3. The Indonesian Labour Policies : A Critique	36
3.4. Regulations Pertaining to Overseas Workers	39
3.5. Labour Migration Policies of the Gulf States	41
3.6. Problems of Deployment of Indonesian Overseas Workers	42
3.7. International Labour Conventions and Recommendations for Migrant Workers	44
CHAPTER IV	48
CHARACTERISTICS OF INDONESIAN DOMESTIC WORKERS IN SAUDI ARABIA	
4.1. Characteristics of Indonesian Women Population	48
4.2. The Deployment of Indonesian Domestic Workers Overseas	53

CHAPTER V	
INDONESIAN DOMESTIC WORKERS' PERCEPTIONS OF THEIR WORKING CONDITIONS IN SAUDI ARABIA	59
5.1. Introduction	59
5.2. Women's Experiences of Maltreatment	62
5.2.1. Abusive and Physical Exploitation	63
5.2.2. Sexual Exploitation	67
5.3. Women's Responses to Maltreatment	69
5.4. Visual Images of Domestic Workers	71
5.5. Conclusion	72
CHAPTER VI	
ANALYSIS OF INDONESIAN GOVERNMENT'S PERSPECTIVES OF DOMESTIC WORKERS' WORKING CONDITIONS IN SAUDI ARABIA	75
6.1. Introduction	75
6.2. Quantitative Content Analysis	77
6.3. Qualitative Content/Interpretative Analysis	79
6.3.1. Overall Thematic Analysis	79
6.3.2. Semantic Macrostructures	80
CHAPTER VII	
CONCLUSION AND POLICY RECOMMENDATION	102
7.1. Concluding Summary	102
7.2. Policy Recommendations	106

LIST OF TABLES

Table 4.1.: Percentage Distribution of Females by Educational Attainment, 1971-1985	50
Table 4.2.: Population Aged 15 Years and Over by Educational Attainment, 1985-1990	51
Table 4.3.: Percent of Female Household Heads, 1971-1985	52
Table 4.4.: Number of Indonesian Overseas Contract Workers, 1969-1994 (in thousand)	54
Table 4.5.: Number of Indonesian Overseas Contract Workers in Saudi Arabia, 1983-1992	55
Table 4.6.: Distribution of Family Use of Remittances from Sample of Overseas Contract Workers in Java	57

Table 6.1.: Number of Newspaper Articles on Issues of Domestic Work, 1984-1995	78
---	-----------

APPENDIX OF TABLES

Table 6.2.: Size Coverage of 1984 Newspaper Articles	111
Table 6.3.: Size Coverage of 1985 Newspaper Articles	112
Table 6.4.: . Size Coverage of 1986 Newspaper Articles	113
Table 6.5.: Size Coverage of 1987 Newspaper Articles	114
Table 6.6.: Size Coverage of 1988 Newspaper Articles	115
Table 6.7.: Size Coverage of 1989 Newspaper Articles	116
Table 6.8.: Size Coverage of 1990 Newspaper Articles	117
Table 6.9.: Size Coverage of 1992 Newspaper Articles	118
Table 6.10.: Size Coverage of 1993 Newspaper Articles	119
Table 6.11.: Size Coverage of 1995 Newspaper Articles	120

<u>BIBLIOGRAPHY</u>	121
----------------------------	------------

ABSTRACT

The deployment of Indonesian women as domestic workers overseas has become a controversial issue in Indonesian society, particularly among religious organisations and women's organisations. This debate is fuelled by increasing reports on maltreatment encountered by domestic workers abroad. The treatment they receive suggests that the Government of Indonesia has not been able to render sufficient protection to the overseas workers.

This thesis explores the background and contents of this debate in two-pronged analysis. Firstly, it examines the Indonesian Government's perspectives of domestic workers' working conditions in Saudi Arabia on the basis of newspaper articles obtained from Kompas (an Indonesian quality newspaper) during 1984 to mid-1995. The aim here is to reveal the main themes and underlying assumptions of the issues through the Government's statements in the newspaper articles. Secondly, an attempt is made to assess the perspectives of returned domestic workers by analysing their published interviews. In contrast to the Government's statements which tend to underplay the difficulties experienced by overseas workers. These interviews portray domestic work in Saudi Arabia as a risky occupation. Finally, the thesis provides some policy recommendations for the Government of Indonesia to improve protection of Indonesian domestic workers overseas, particularly Saudi Arabia.

STATEMENT

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university. To the best of the candidate's knowledge and belief, the thesis contains no material previously published, or written by another person, except where due reference is made in the text of the thesis.

The author consents to the thesis being made available for photocopying, and loan, if applicable, if accepted for the award of the degree. It is expected that when such use is made of this work, it will be acknowledged by reference in any other work.

Signature

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank the following people for their helps on this thesis:

My supervisor, Dr.Susanne Schech for her patience and guidance;

The staff of the Department of Women's Studies at Adelaide University for their support;

Dr. Margie Ripper, for her enthusiasm;

Prof. Dr.Graeme, J. Hugo for providing me with a lot of materials;

Dr. Heather Paul for her editorial assistance;

My friends at Kathleen Lumley College for giving me support and assistance;

My husband, Yantonius and our children Kania and Donny for their continuing patience and encouragement;

My parents-in law Mr. Chaidoer Martamin and Mrs. Sjamsiar for watching over my children and the house;

Last but not least, my aunt Yurhani and my two maids, Tasniah and Iyem for helping to take care of the children and running the household while I was away to complete my studies.



CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

The rapid growth of contract labour migration since the first oil boom in 1973 has made it necessary to refocus scholarly attention on international labour migration. The temporary and contracted international labour migration of overseas workers has become one of the most momentous contemporary labour supply systems for labour-shortage countries like the Middle East and North Africa (Sassen-Koob 1981). In 1975, more than 1.6 million migrant workers were employed as contracted workers in the Middle East and North Africa, and by 1985, this figure was estimated to have reached 4.3 million (Sassen-Koob 1981). In the early 1970s and until 1975, the labour requirements of the Middle East countries were met by nearby non-oil producing Arab states. Since this time, however, South East Asian developing countries have played increasingly important roles in supplying labour to the oil-rich countries of the region (Serageldin, Socknat, Birk and Sinclair 1983a; Serageldin, Sinclair and Socknat 1983b; Gunatilleke 1984, 1986; Pongsapich 1989; Smart and Teodosio 1985; Cremer 1988; Arnold and Shah 1984; Birks and Sinclair 1989) the movement of such labour being facilitated by the network of earlier migrants, government policies, labour supply agencies and travel agencies (Kritz, Lim and Zlotnik 1992). Existing studies clearly identify how crucial and significant the international migration of labour has been for the labour-deficient, capital-rich countries of ~~that of~~ the Middle East, transforming third world countries into rapidly modernising economies over an extremely short period of time (Birks and Sinclair 1980; Serageldin *et al.* 1983 a, 1983b).

Indonesia is one of several South East Asian countries which have played a substantial role in supplying unskilled labour to the Middle East, especially to Saudi Arabia (Cremer 1988; Hugo 1992, 1994a; Manning and Hardjono 1993; Kompas 1984-1995). Since 1973, the Government of Indonesia has embarked upon the official transmission of Indonesian male overseas contract workers; however, the deployment of Indonesian women as overseas contract domestic workers, popularly known as maids/servants, was only initiated in 1984. In the eyes of the sending country, the deployment of Indonesians is principally a means of generating foreign exchange and earnings, a method of employment creation, of meeting the high demand for domestic workers or maids from Indonesia, and, finally, a means of improving the welfare and living conditions of Indonesians.

The high demand for unskilled Indonesian labour in the Middle East is due to the demographic shortages in the Middle East, and Indonesia's close relationship and similarity in belief/religion. Thus, international migration does not occur randomly but takes place usually between countries that have close historical, socio-cultural, and/or economic ties. Abella (1992) found that the placing of the Indonesian women as domestic workers/maids in the Middle East stems from the rising concern among Islamic leaders in the Middle East that their children are acquiring non-Islamic values from Buddhist, Hindu or Christian domestic workers. Between the period of 1983-1992, roughly 51 percent of Indonesian overseas workers were deployed mainly to Saudi Arabia (AKAN 1995; Hugo 1994a; Manning and Hardjono 1993), and most of them were sent to the latter country being female domestic workers (AKAN 1995; Cremer 1988; Hugo 1994a; Manning and Hardjono 1993).

A distinction, herein, must be made between pre-1970 and post-1970 labour migration. In general, there are four types of characteristics that distinguish the most recent phase from the pre-1970 era. The first is the extent to which countries, for example, Indonesia, have begun to deliberately market and supply their labour internationally in

response to fluctuating international demand of various types of labour. The second is the greater role played by the governments and by labour supply agencies, in both labour sending and receiving countries, in controlling international movements of contracted labour. The third is the manner in which individuals have oriented part of their lives toward working overseas. A fourth characteristic of recent migration is the greater degree of control by governments over migrants' residence in the receiving countries. Overseas contract workers are normally allowed to work only for short term employment, that is, for a two year contract period, so that the short-term migrants should not have a long term interest or rights in receiving countries* (Eclens and Speckmann 1990; Shadid, Spaan and Speckman 1992). Furthermore, they are normally residentially separated from the nationals of the host countries (except for domestic workers who live with their employers). Thus, the crucial feature that marks the difference between the previous migration and the contemporary labour migration, such as to the Middle East, is the degree of control used over the international labour market.

Primarily because of the recency of the phenomenon, relatively little research has been done on contract labour migration from Indonesia. Existing studies on Indonesian labour migration have been inclined to focus on identifying socio-demographic characteristics of migrant workers: motives /reasons for working overseas; the impacts of remittances on national economic development; effects of migration on family relationships through the extended absence of a member of the family; and the characteristics of migrants' primary occupation in receiving countries (Hugo 1994a, 1994b, 1993, 1992; Shah and Qudsi 1989; Chant and Radcliff 1992; Cremer 1988; Manning and Hardjono 1993). Also, most of the studies on female migration from the Asian developing countries concentrate on women's internal migration as the result of the expansion of industrialisation, rather than focusing on their movement overseas (Heyzer 1986; Salaff and Wong 1984; Mather 1985; Kung 1983; Jones 1984; Elson and Pearson 1981; Foo and Lim

* a fifth characteristic is that there is a substantial number of works dealing with the migration of Asian women to work as domestics, especially from Sri Lanka.

1989; Enloe 1986; Engarcia and Herrin 1984). In this, emphasis has been placed on female migration to urban areas as an impact of women's displacement in the agricultural sector (Berninghausen and Kerstan 1992; Stoler 1977; White 1989; Martin-Schiller 1980; Sajogyo 1983). Further, the studies that have been carried out on paid domestic work have been conducted by historians who have focused on the period before the Second World War, rather than the contemporary era (Katzman 1978; Maza 1983; Harris 1984; Fairchilds 1984; Gordon 1985; Cock 1980; Huggins 1987; Gaw 1988; Krantz 1993). Also, by and large, such studies have referred to the European context rather than to South East Asia.

Clearly, there is a need to refocus attention on the contract domestic labour issue facing Southeast Asia as there is evidence to suggest that some of the Indonesian overseas workers are experiencing difficulties, and even exploitation, when working in Saudi Arabia (e.g. Robinson 1990; Hugo 1994a; 1992; Manning and Hardjono 1993). The incidence of problems encountered by them in Saudi Arabia (maltreatment, physical and sexual abuses and exploitation) is claimed by some to be very high (RDCMD-YTKI 1986). Consequently, the employment of Indonesian women as domestic workers in Saudi Arabia has attracted considerable controversy, in the community in general, and among religious and women's groups in particular. Reflecting this concern, for the past twelve years, from 1984-1995, issues of domestic workers overseas have frequently been raised in national and international newspapers (ILO-Published Migration Newspaper Clipping and Kompas 1984-1995). Most of these articles have been inclined to focus on the women's lack of education and knowledge as the sources of their mistreatment in their overseas workplace.

1.1 The Objectives of the Study

This study seeks to redress the relative scarcity of academic studies on Indonesian contract domestic workers' working conditions in Saudi Arabia in the context of the current

claims regarding worker exploitation. To do this, several main sources of information will be used.

First, to elicit the domestic workers' opinions on the conditions under which they have been working, articles documenting returnee domestic workers' perceptions of their experiences will be analysed. These articles are based on i) interviews carried out by Kompas reporters during the period of 1989-1993, which were once published in the Kompas newspaper, and later on in book form; and ii) interviews carried out by freelance reporters from 1990-1993 which were published in book form. The lack of interviews before 1989 - the public silence of domestic workers on their work experiences during the years of 1984 to 1988 - may be attributed to the Ministerial Decree of 10 July 1985 which prohibited returned overseas workers to 'talk' to the Press. The policy was relaxed in 1989 with the press, from then on, being permitted to publish the stories of overseas workers. This change in policy suggests that the Government is starting to adopt a more mature approach to the issues of domestic workers overseas.

Second, to establish the Indonesian Government's attitude to the contract labour issue, two main sources of information will be used - i) newspaper statements made by the government and ii) their labour and women and development policy documents. The objective of studying the Government's perspectives of domestic workers' working conditions through their media statements is to identify main themes and underlying assumptions, since such statements inevitably reflect the Government's attitudes toward overseas domestic workers and their concerns. Importantly, it is these attitudes which ultimately influence the content of the women in development and labour policies which, as noted, are also analysed (under the 1993 Broad Guidelines of State Policy or GBHN). The Government's articles cover two Five Year Development Plans (1984-1989, and 1989-1994), and the period up until mid-1995, which were written under the auspices of two

*the arguement was made on the basis that the research had actually been conducted from early 1980s through the available microfiche.

different ministerial cabinets. Within this time, Indonesia had already three Ministers of Manpower, all of whom were males.

Overall, the objective of this thesis is to identify and explore the gaps existing between the Government's perspective of domestic workers' working conditions and the policy documents on women and development and on labour, and the accounts given by the Indonesian contract domestic workers themselves of their experiences in Saudi Arabia. Relevant research questions addressed by this study are: What are the experiences of the Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia? What kinds of maltreatment do they endure? How do they cope with the problems? What measures have been taken in response to these problems? What have been the Government's perspectives on the issue of domestic workers' working conditions in Saudi Arabia for the past twelve years up to 1995? Are these views reflected in the present policies on women and development and on labour (under the 1993 Broad Guidelines of State Policy)? What do these policies entail and are domestic workers' interests reflected in the policies? How can these policies be improved? And finally, what role do the Government and labour supply agencies play in controlling the international flow of contracted labour?

In short, the analysis of the newspaper enables me to trace the perspective of the Government via their statements through the twelve year period as well as critically describing the experiences of domestic workers.

1.2. Methodologies

As noted, for the purpose of the study, I will use newspaper articles obtained from Kompas, a prestigious Christian morning paper, as one of the most widely read and leading quality newspapers in Indonesia. According to Hill (1994), Kompas is the largest selling daily, reaching sales of 525,000 in 1991 with 50,000 more for the Sunday edition.

Using newspaper articles as a source of information has a number of advantages. First, they contain easily accessible information on very contemporary issues that have not yet found their way into the academic literature. Second, newspapers, as well as other popular media, are central to the daily lives of most people and are therefore influential. Third, they offer the opportunity to look at how an issue is portrayed over a longer period and what changes or consistencies can be detected. Fourth, the Indonesian Government's perspectives of domestic workers' working conditions are likely to be found in newspapers rather than any academic literature. Fifth, the Indonesian Government has powerful control over editorial decisions on the content of the news, with obvious consequences: the media may only report the news which is considered to be favourable to the government whilst it cuts out issues regarded as 'sensitive' by the Government, such as racial, religious and ethnic differences. This bias is clearly advantageous for this study in that it provides us with a clear view of the government's perspectives. Sixth, experiences of Indonesian domestic workers overseas are more likely to be found in newspapers rather than in any other sources.

Apart from having these advantages, the use of newspaper analysis also has some disadvantages. According to Fowler (1991), and Hall, Hobson, Lowe and Willis (1980), news is socially constructed. The events that are reported have been through an intricate process of transformation and selection suitable for publication in television or newsprint. Thus, both selection and transformation of the news is generally led by the ideas and beliefs of the processors. Hence, it can be argued that news is a practice, a discourse, which far from neutrally reflecting social reality and empirical facts, intervenes in what Berger and Luckmann declare to be "the social construction of reality". In his book Understanding News, Hartley (1982) places news as social and ideological concepts in semiotic theory. The foundations of semiotics were laid by the early twentieth century Swiss linguist, Ferdinand de Saussure, who introduced the concept of *signs* which act as the mediator

between human beings and the world they experience. Signs acquire meaning through being structured into codes, the principal code being language.

Hence, the first obvious disadvantage relates to the point that news is a representation of the world in language; because language is a semiotic code, it imposes a structure of values, social and economic in origin, on whatever is represented. Thus, news is a representation, a social construction; it is not a value-free reflection of 'facts' (Mcquail 1987). Second, news reports are rarely genuinely objective because they are coloured by the background, social and political values and interests of the people who are involved in their production (Van Dijk 1985, 1987; Fowler 1991). In relation to this study, such bias is likely to affect the representation of domestic workers in interviews conducted by middle class, well-educated reporters as these interviewers do not come from the same sort of background as the interviewed. Also, the informant used in news reports may not provide what may be perceived as the most accurate accounts or they may provide different accounts at different times, depending on who she/he is addressing. On one hand, she/he may be telling (what they perceive to be) the most accurate accounts to reporters in order to gain some sympathy from readers, and, following this, a positive government reaction. On the other hand, they may be not telling what they perceive to be the most accurate accounts to interviewers if they expect that nothing can be achieved from this in the end anyway. Third, when analysing the Government's perspectives of domestic workers' working conditions through headlines and the content of the articles, there is the problem of isolating the Government's statements from the reporters' points of view. Clearly too, besides the influence of the reporters, the pattern of the media ownership also plays a significant role in what news gets published. For example, when ownership becomes concentrated into fewer hands, the result is likely to be less diversity of opinion being represented (Hart 1991; Hartley 1982; Carey 1988).

Having discussed the advantages and disadvantages of newspaper analysis, we will proceed to the methodology used for newspaper analysis. Newspaper articles will be analysed by using content analysis (the examination of texts, also known as archival research, textual analysis or discourse analysis) which identifies the occurrence or pattern of objects or issues by counting them and/or interpreting the themes contained in them (Reinharz 1992).

The application of the content analysis in the newspaper and published interviews is two-fold. On one hand, Fowler (1991) introduces what is termed as critical linguistics, which means an enquiry into relations between signs, meanings and social and historical conditions that command the semiotic structure of discourse. For the study, attention will be aimed at analysing the critical use of language in news text. On the other hand, Van Dijk (1987) claims that news reports constitute a particular type of discourse (where discourses are defined as units of verbal interaction or as communicative events). This therefore suggests that their actual processing or uses in social and communicative contexts should also be accounted for in an integrated approach. The analysis of discourse, then, should not be limited to the structures of texts or dialogues, but should also be extended to the contextual structure of the discourse. Following the concept of news as discourse, Van Dijk introduces several ways in which it respectively constitutes grammatical analysis/linguistic grammar of newspaper articles/reports: the syntax/semantics of a sentence in a discourse; interpretation of semantic macrostructures (the overall meaning of an article in a newspaper by connecting headlines and the main body of the text) and interpretation of the overall thematic analysis (overall content of topics). For the purpose of this study, I will only apply the most relevant ones: the interpretation of semantic macrostructures and the overall thematic analysis.

As has been mentioned before, the Government's perspectives of domestic workers' working conditions will inevitably be reflected in their attitudes toward the policy and

decision making process. Potter and Wetherell (1987) found that the attitude of a person or group of people toward an object, an individual, or a group of people, could be analysed through their utterances. For the purpose of the study, the utterances are represented by the statements of elites in the bureaucracy (the Minister of Manpower mostly) of domestic workers' working conditions in newspaper articles. For example, it would seem that several messages are implied in an article in Kompas (10 July 1985:1) headlined "The Minister of Manpower stated that overseas workers are not allowed to talk to the press about their working conditions in Saudi Arabia". These are: the Government has full control over the overseas workers; overseas workers are not considered as human beings who have the rights to speak whatever they want, but as mere commodities who are managed by the Government; and finally, the Government assumes that the working conditions of the domestic workers are their responsibility and not that of the Press. In short, the statement suggests the underlying attitude of the Government is 'arrogant', 'authoritative' and 'dominant' toward domestic workers and their problems, an attitude which may well colour their judgement of the issues, and hence their policy and decision making. Following the claims of Potter and Wetherell (1987), who take the standard attitude theory approach in analysing utterances, it could be claimed that the speaker (that is, the Minister of Manpower / the Government) possesses an 'unsympathetic' attitude in this respect.

Whilst accepting that other aspects of media publication also affect the construction of news reality (eg. graphic format of the page, size of the prints and the style, composition and distribution of photographs, drawings, tables, maps and captions), these will be largely ignored in this study in order to enable greater attention to be focused on the issues of semantic macrostructures, overall thematic analysis, and the interpretation of the language used in headlines and published interviews.

In newspaper articles, the most important information must come first. This may affect not only the overall thematic analysis but also the ordering within the sentences

themselves (termed as relevance structuring). Whereas relevance structuring expresses/signals what is most important, various ways are used to make headlines; for example, in an article where the Minister of Manpower criticises the Head of the Muslim Organisation (Kompas , 25 May 1984:1), the article/text is made more attractive to readers by using rhetorical devices such as hyperboles (overstatements or exaggerations), or metaphors of war such as 'attack' or 'defence'. News reports also make frequent use of figures (whether correct or not) to signal rhetorically their exactness and hence their objectivity (Roeh 1982), an example here being where the Minister of Manpower claimed that, within five years, Indonesia was determined to reach a target of five hundred thousand overseas workers (Kompas, 6 February 1990:2), and the target was in fact exceeded.

How, then, is content analysis applied in this study carried out ? First, policy documents on women and development and on labour (under the 1993 Broad Guidelines of the State Policy) are critically analysed by applying qualitative content/interpretative analysis. Particularly relevant articles or passages are scrutinised and interpreted to identify the embedded messages (the implicit content of an article / passage). The thorough analysis of these policies will identify the underlying concepts of both policy areas as well as the Government's attitudes to, and perspectives of, Indonesian women as women per se and as workers.

Second, the newspaper articles are analysed by applying quantitative content analysis and qualitative content/interpretative analysis. On one hand, quantitative content analysis enables the researcher a) to distinguish the patterns in news coverage each year and over the entire period, to quantify the number of published interviews and photographs; and b) to assess the average size of each coverage/news article. On the other hand, qualitative content/interpretative analysis enables the researcher to learn about a) the government's perspectives of domestic workers' working conditions, by interpreting its semantic macrostructures (the overall meaning of the article in a newspaper by connecting headlines

and the main body of the text), by the application of critical linguistics, and the overall thematic analysis (overall content of topics) of selected newspaper articles; and b) the representation of returned domestic workers' accounts of their working conditions in Saudi Arabia and overall thematic analysis of the published interviews.

The quantitative content analysis is carried out by counting the number of newspaper articles which were published each month and by measuring the extent of the news coverage and mean length of an article. These measurements help to assess how important the issue of domestic workers has been to the government and the newspaper editors. This analysis is also used to count the number of published interviews and photographs available in book forms documenting the Kompas and freelance reporters' articles, to assess the extent to which accounts of domestic workers have been published.

The qualitative content/interpretative analysis involves identifying the main topics covered in all the published interviews of domestic workers' working conditions as well as the embedded messages of the workers' accounts. The semantic macrostructures of the articles are analysed by relating headlines to the main texts of the articles. The aim of doing this is to see to what extent the headline reflects the content of the given article, and what constitutes the main message to the readers. Furthermore, by critically analysing the language used by government representatives in the article, it is possible to identify their attitudes about domestic workers issue. The overall thematic analysis of the news reports will enable the researcher to view the main themes in the selected newspaper articles and published interviews.

1.3 Organization of the Study

The thesis is structured as follows. Before embarking on the analysis of the newspaper articles, a review of the literature on international labour migration from Asian developing countries is undertaken in Chapter II. It focuses on the main aspects; firstly, the

characteristics of the current labour migrants, and how they differ from earlier migrants; secondly, the motives of female labour migrants, especially domestic workers, to work overseas; and thirdly, feminist research on domestic work.

Chapter III is devoted to the analysis of the women in development and the labour policies in Indonesia. This analysis serves two purposes. The first is to identify what kinds of women and development and labour policies are available in the 1990s as these reflect the government's perceptions of Indonesian women and women workers which it held in the 1980s or earlier. Special attention is paid to the question of whether or not domestic workers, within the country or abroad, are included in the policies. This chapter also illustrates some of the labour regulations available in Indonesia and examines relevant international labour conventions for migrant workers. The second purpose is to focus on the problems related to the deployment of Indonesian workers overseas, and specifically to the problems faced before departure, while waiting for placement and, after returning to Indonesia.

Chapter IV describes the characteristics of those Indonesian domestic workers deployed to Saudi Arabia, focusing mainly on their educational background. It is argued here that the majority of these women have low levels of education, and therefore limited employment opportunities in Indonesia. Some commentators claim that low level of education prevents domestic workers from defending their rights and makes them more vulnerable to exploitation. This chapter also examines the growth of Indonesian overseas employment in Saudi Arabia between 1969 and 1994, and shows how the Indonesian domestic workers fit into international labour migration network.

In Chapter V, the working conditions and experiences of the Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia are described by using published interviews from period of 1989-1993. Chapter VI analyses the Indonesian Government's perspectives of domestic workers' working conditions in Saudi Arabia from 1984-1995. These two chapters are the core of

this thesis, as they reveal, within the same newspaper, a noticeable discrepancy between the Government's perspectives and information gathered from the affected women themselves.

To bridge the existing gaps between the Government's perspectives and its policies, on one hand, and domestic workers' experiences on the other, the concluding chapter suggests some policy recommendations on the issues of Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia, in particular, and overseas in general.

CHAPTER II

INTERNATIONAL LABOUR MIGRATION IN LITERATURE

As mentioned before, the movement of Indonesian domestic workers to Saudi Arabia is part of a wider network of international migration. Reflecting this, the main purpose of this chapter is to review the literature on the international labour migration of contract overseas workers (labour migrants) as well as feminist research on domestic work, particularly that relating to paid domestic work.

In the first section, I distinguish the pattern of labour migration pre-1970 and post-1970, particularly with regard to that oriented to the Middle East. It is argued that the increasing economic importance of labour migrants to sending countries, since the early 1970s, has led to the greater involvement of the state and of middle-men/brokers in the international labour flow. This section also includes a brief analysis of diversity of contract labour migrants. In the second section, I review the literature on female migration in Asian developing countries, while the last section focuses more specifically on domestic work as paid and unpaid work. It is argued the way in which domestic work has been constructed in mainstream discourses make migrant domestic workers particularly vulnerable to exploitation and maltreatment.

2.1. International Labour Migration from Asian Developing Countries

The 1970s were characterised by an economic recession in non-oil producing Third World countries which diminished the availability of work opportunities in these countries, while at the same time creating high labour demands in the oil producing countries of the Middle East. This situation led to a dramatic increase in labour migration in general, and to significant changes in the pattern of migration in particular (Quibria 1986; Gunatilleke 1984,

1986; Sakiet and Keely 1984; Ming Ling 1984; Serageldin *et al.* 1983a). Before 1973, migration was undertaken with the main objective being to establish permanent or long term residence abroad. Whether their reason for migration were economic or political, migrants moved with the intention of bringing their families at a later date. Migrant communities were formed as a result in the host countries. By contrast, since the 1970s, the majority of labour migrants have no prospects of settlement because their labour contracts are temporary. They usually migrate for specific jobs, with specified employers and duration of employment (the latter usually being a two-year contract). They therefore maintain close relations with families at home to where they will return after concluding their employment (Pongsapich 1989; Birks and Sinclair 1989; Ecevit 1983; Huguet 1989). This change, from long term / permanent to short term residence, is in response to the increased magnitude of migration flows which, in some Middle East countries, threatened to cast the indigenous population into a minority position. By controlling the influx and outflow of migrants, then, governments not only aim to preserve the existing political structure and dominant position of their populations. They also seek to avoid a disruption in what is already a delicate balance between the relative sizes of various racial groups in their societies - a disruption that could result from the large influx of a migrant labour force. To illustrate, the Gulf States have strict laws and regulations pertaining to citizenship, naturalization, and entry and employment of foreigners *Wan* (Russel 1989; Shahid *et.al.* 1992).

For the sending countries, whose export markets have been adversely affected by the global recession in the 1970s, the export of labour initially appears to be a more efficient, or at least a cheaper means of increasing employment levels and of generating foreign resources than the export of commodities. This is because exporting labour requires no additional domestic investment. Indeed, the sending countries generally consider labour migration to be economically beneficial and seem to have accepted the fact that their workers are not being offered the opportunity of social integration in the receiving countries

(that is, they accept that their nationals are going to be treated as temporary contract workers/guest-workers with temporary accommodation). They view labour migration as a short-term solution to unemployment problems which should become less important in the future when fuller levels of employment are expected to be achieved (Eelens and Speckmann 1990; Abella 1992).

Who then are the current labour migrants? According to Salt (1992) and Huguet (1989), the term 'labour migrant' is frequently used to mean those who migrate for work reasons. These constitute a very diverse group. Contract labour migrants are recruited in groups for specific projects: as individual contract workers (often for indeterminate periods); as highly skilled professional, managerial and technical workers on secondment, short-term assignments or in joint ventures; as domestic servants; and entrepreneurs. Such diversity is also found with Asian migration to the Middle East. Nevertheless, many studies have shown that manual workers, both unskilled and skilled, form by far the largest proportion of these labour migrants. Recent Asian migration to the Middle East involves mainly the lower income groups, predominantly from rural areas, whereas in the past, it was mainly restricted to the professional and other highly educated strata (Salt 1992; Gunatilleke 1984; Serageldin *et al.* 1983b; Spaan 1994). The same studies also show the following prevailing characteristics of the majority of migrant workers to the Middle East: they are usually male, 20-35 years of age, and have already completed junior and high schools. However, some countries, such as Indonesia, seem to specialize in sending lower educated migrants, while others, such as the Philippines and India, tend to export the more highly educated.

A further important feature of the Middle East labour migration flow from the Asian developing countries, the special type of interdependence it has created between the countries supplying the labourers and the countries demanding them. Many studies have shown that most of the labour exporting countries have become heavily dependent on their

migrant labour force in the Middle East for their own development (Zolberg and Aristide 1989). This is because the flow helps them to manage their balance of payments and relieve unemployment; it also spares the government of the need to provide social welfare to poor families (Stahl 1982; Keely and Tran Mga 1989; Appleyard 1989). According to Stahl and Arnold (1986), the amount of remittances received by a labour exporting country relies principally on ; a) the number of workers it has sent abroad; b) the earning^s of the workers; c) the percentage of the earning^s which can be ~~be~~ saved and; d) the percentage of the savings which the labourers are willing to remit. Many studies report that Asian workers in the Middle East save and remit a substantial proportion of their earnings to their country of origin. Indeed, if they do not send their remittances home, the government of the sending country can withdraw their permission to travel abroad (Enloe 1989). Smart, Teodosio and Jimenez (1985) documented that Filipinos in the Middle East remitted about 56 percent of their income on the average, and Enloe (1989) found that the remittances from Filipino men and women together amounted to 18 percent of the country's US\$15.7 billion in foreign exchange. Approximately 62 percent of the earnings of Thai workers in the Middle East were also remitted home (Stahl 1985). Similarly, Pakistani workers in the Middle East remitted about half of their earnings (Gilani, Khan, and Iqbal 1986). For Bangladesh, Mahmud and Osmani (1980) estimated that migrant workers saved between 65 and 75 percent of their earnings in the Middle East and send most of it home. Mantra, Kasnawi and Sukamardi (1986 cited in Hugo 1994a) discovered that most of the remittances sent by the Indonesian migrant workers were spent on children's schooling expenses and food. Similarly, about 90 percent of the remittances in India were used for consumption, mainly on food (Swamy 1981). Housing construction and renovation were the primary usage of remittances in Thailand (Pongsapich 1989).

The use of the remittances and their contribution to national economic development has been a major debate in the area of labour migration . Some experts argue that spending

on domestic consumption increases Gross National Product (GNP) and generates employment (Appleyard 1989; Potts 1990). However, the impacts of remittances, both on the family and the national economy, vary greatly depending on how much migrant labourers can save and remit home.

International labour migration can also produce a change in the status of women, although degrees and types of changes vary between countries. While there are several studies existing which analyse the effects of male migration on the wives of labour migrants who are left behind, little information is available in the academic literature on the impacts of women's absence within the family (Balasooriya, Kankanamge and Heendeniya 1985; Gilani 1983; Go, Postrado and Jimenez 1983). What evidence is available does not suggest a high prevalence of problems for the migrant's family whilst they are working overseas.

International migration produces a lot of problems, especially with the intervention of government and labour supply agencies in the network. Although labour migration provides families with an increased income, many migrants fall prey to fraudulent practices of middle-men/brokers in lieu with labour supply agencies before their placement, as well as to exploitation and maltreatment by bad employers after their placement. In nearly every labour exporting country, numerous cases have been reported that, before recruitment and departure, labour migrants have to pay large fees to middle-men/brokers and labour supply agencies in order to obtain employment overseas (Heyzer, Nijeholt and Weerakoon 1994). Some academic studies and national and international newspapers have documented these bogus practices, an example being one labour migrant from Indonesia who had to work several months in order to pay back more than US\$1000 to their broker/middleman (Utomo 1990; Bethan 1993). Roongshivin (1985), in his study of Thai labour migrants, revealed that 81 percent of respondents had debts averaging US\$1200 or more prior to going overseas. Half of the workers in debt had obtained loans from middle-men at rates of interest ranging from five to ten percent a month. Overall, the recruitment procedure was

time consuming and costly, with all kinds of administrative arrangements being required (Utomo 1990; Bethan 1993; Seok and Yang 1984). A study in the Philippines showed that for 57 percent of overseas workers, the period between first applying and actual departure was three month or less, but for 27 percent, the waiting period before departure was 4-6 months. For 13 percent, it was 7-12 months (Arnold and Shah 1984; Martin and Richard 1985). Many labour migrants accumulated debts during this waiting period. Some prospective workers discovered later that the middle men had disappeared after collecting their money (e.g. Kompas, 9 July 1990; Heyzer *et al.* 1994). Others had to sell their properties or borrowed money to pay the brokers and the labour supply agency's fees, so when no overseas employment was acquired, or when the wages were less than promised, the labour migrants and their families faced greater economic hardship (Hugo 1994a; Manila Chronicle, 3 February 1993; Heyzer *et al.* 1994).

The majority of studies before 1970 did not consider women to be the main labour migrants. This is probably due to the fact that labour migration was, at that time, primarily a male activity, whilst women and children were dependents who either accompanied the male migrant or were left behind. However, in recent years feminist researchers have directed their attention to female migration to examine the massive movement of women all over the world.

2.2. Female Migration in Asian Developing Countries

The tendency to view women as dependents of male migrants reflects the prevailing Western view of men as the primary breadwinners (Morokovasic 1984; Brettel and Simon 1986). But since the 1980s, evidence is accumulating in the literature which documents that women play a much more active role in both international and internal migration than this view allows for (see for example Abello 1992; Berninghausen and Kerstan 1992; Brydon and Chant (Eds.) 1989; Chant and Radcliffe 1992; Chant (Ed.) 1992; Cremer 1988; Enloe

1989; Engracia and Herrin, 1984; Heyzer 1986; Hugo 1992 ,1994a, 1994b ; Hune 1991; Jones 1992 and 1984; Kung 1983; Lean 1984a, 1984b; Mather 1985; Manning and Hardjono (Eds.) 1993; Papps 1992; Radcliffe 1990; Shah, Al Qudsi and Shah 1991; Salaff and Wong 1984; Spaan 1994; Tyner 1994; Zlotnik 1990). The literature also suggests that internal and international migration are closely intertwined. Often, it appears, the international flow begins with rural women first making their way to urban areas. It is from there, when they find out from their friends and neighbours that working abroad is more profitable, that they eventually decide to migrate overseas. Both internal and international migration are predominantly motivated by economic factors. A major pull factor is the desire to escape poverty and make a better living elsewhere. For instance, working as a domestic worker in the Middle East generates a higher income compared to identical work within the migrant's country of origin. For an Indonesian domestic worker, for example, working abroad can mean a wage of US\$100-187 per month, whilst the highest wage at home is roughly US\$30 (1992 figures) (Heyzer *et al.* 1994). Also, as Puru Shotam (1992) has found, the monthly salary of a domestic worker can vary according to the worker's country of origin. In comparison to the Indonesian worker's earnings of US\$100-187 per month (1992), a Thai domestic worker, for example, could earn roughly between US\$125 to US\$156 per month (1992); a Sri Lankan, about US\$156; and a Filipino, around US\$187 (Heyzer *et al.* 1994). Push factors influencing migration include the loss of employment opportunities in agriculture or in the national economy in general. For example, Engarcia and Herrin (1984), Enloe (1989) and Tyner (1994) documented despite that most of the Filipinas were educated to high school level, the Philippine economy was unable to provide sufficient jobs for them. As a result, domestic work became one of the life boats of many Filipinas especially in Singapore, Kuala Lumpur, Hongkong, and the Middle East, with most of the Filipino domestic workers being found in Singapore (Time, 3 April 1995).

*"it appears" refers to the writer's presumption. This doesn't mean that there is no direct recruitment made in the village.

In Indonesia, it was the introduction of agricultural mechanization and the changing of harvesting arrangements in rice production in rural areas that particularly triggered a rise in female migration both internally and internationally (Berninghausen and Kerstan 1992; Stoler 1977; Schiller 1980; White 1989; Hugo 1992, 1994a, 1994b; Cremer 1988; Heyzer 1989; Sajogyo 1983). According to Jones' 1978* study of female labour force participation in Jakarta, 69 percent of rural migrant women were employed in the services sector. In this, they were particularly concentrated in domestic work, occupying 72 percent of such employment. Ten years later, Cremer (1988) found that 78 percent of the Indonesian women departing for Saudi Arabia also worked as domestic workers

With respect to the number of domestic workers migrating to the Middle East in recent years, the number from Indonesia, for example, has expanded from 8000 in 1979 to 50,000 in 1989 (Appleyard 1991). For Kuwait alone, it was estimated that the number of foreign domestic workers increased from almost 12,000 in 1975 to almost 20,000 in 1980, tripling to 63,000 by 1985. According to the Philippines Overseas Employment Administration, in 1987 there were about 275,567 Filipino domestic workers in the Middle East (The Philippines Non Government Team, 1992). In early 1989 the estimated, ^{total} was in the range of 65,600 to 72,600 (Shah *et al.* 1991). This increase in the number of Asian women working in the Middle East has, in large part, been due to governments of sending countries' development policies (Appleyard 1991; Hugo 1994a; Cremer 1988; Chant (Ed.) 1992 ; Kritz *et al.* 1992; Shah *et a.l.* 1989, 1991).

In conclusion, overseas domestic work seems to have become a life boat for many low skilled and low educated women from some of Asian developing countries. Although migration, in general, has increased, it is overseas work, in particular, that is found attractive to migrants because it offers them a more profitable income.

* most recent data available.

In the next section, I present a feminist perspective on domestic work. The review focuses on two questions; firstly, how does unpaid domestic work differ from paid domestic work, and secondly, how has paid domestic work been discussed in the literature.

2.3. Feminist Research on Domestic Work

A lot of Western feminist researchers focusing on housework argue that the existing sexual division of labour designates domestic work as the housewives' main responsibility at home (Oakley 1974; Wearing 1984; Sharpe 1984; Yeandle 1984 ; Gerson 1985). Work in the home, such as cleaning, cooking and nurturing, is commonly regarded as 'dirty work' that women do *naturally* without needing any training. Further, it is unpaid because it is performed for someone else as a 'labour of love' within a particular set of social relations (Delphy and Leonard 1992; Romero 1992). The defining of the work of the home, as something done by women instinctively, leads it to being seen as a cheap, easily available and an unskilled form of labour. A further consequence arising from this is the reluctance of policy makers to extend legal protection to a job that has no proper name and that is not even seen as 'proper work'. Whether domestic work is seen as less valuable because it is performed by women, or women are seen as having a lower status as a result of being associated with this demeaning, and largely unpaid, kind of work, seems to be a circular debate. However, feminist research has agreed on the fact that domestic work is socially vital work requiring diverse skills.

Since much of this research has emanated from the West, it is worth asking how the Western concept of sexual division of labour applies to Indonesia. Berninghausen and Kerstan (1991) Williams (1990) and Epstein and Waris (1981) have found in their studies of Javanese women, that the Western patriarchal view concept which reduced women to their roles as housewife and mother, is spreading more and more in rural Java, although these women also play a significant role in the subsistence economy as breadwinners. It can

be implied that in both the Western and Indonesian concepts of the sexual division of labour, domestic work is perceived as predominantly being the women's responsibility and their natural task.

However, this does not necessarily mean that women do their own domestic work. As Indonesian women have become part of the formal economy*, they have increasingly hired domestic workers to perform domestic chores at home.

While there is a large body of feminist writings on unpaid domestic work, there has been little work done by feminist researchers on paid domestic work, let alone international domestic workers. Also, what research there is on paid domestic work in the West, is dominated by historical studies. The recent book edited by Heyzer *et al.* (1994), entitled The Trade in Domestic Workers: Causes, Mechanism and Consequences of International Migration, is among the first literature to be found on international paid domestic work in the Asia and the Pacific region.

What, then, are the differences between unpaid and paid domestic work? The differences lie largely in who does the job for whom, and its remuneration. The domestic work conducted by housewives is ordinarily regarded as an extension of their 'labour of love'; consequently, it is not paid and therefore does not generate income. In contrast, domestic work which is carried out by somebody who normally has no family connection with their employer, is generally paid work, albeit without the sorts of social benefits and legal protection associated with many other types of employment. Thus, according to mainstream economic thought, paid domestic work is productive work whilst unpaid domestic work is not. However, there are similarities between both in that they are overwhelmingly feminized. In other words, the different economic value placed on domestic work done as a 'labour of love' or for pay, does not seem to change the fact that domestic work is still seen as women's main responsibility, except that in the latter case it becomes the work of another woman, who is often from another race and class.

* women employed in Government institutions/departments, or private institutions, with adequate payment; as opposed to informal economy, or women as petty traders.

Clearly, both the feminization of domestic work and the feminization of poverty in some South and South East Asian developing countries, including Indonesia, and in Latin America, has led to an increasing number of women of different race and class working as domestic workers overseas (Heyzer *et al.* 1994; Enloe 1989). Perceiving foreign domestic workers as having more differences than similarities with employers determines their position and status in the host society and in the work place. This position of difference (referring to different races and cultures which are socially constructed as different, inferior and subordinate) is what Hall, Held and McGrew (1992) defines as being 'the other who is not us'.

Enloe (1989) documented that many middle and high class women (that is, of higher economic status) in Canada, America, Britain, France, Germany, Italy, Saudi Arabia and Kuwait hire lower class women (that is, of lower economic status) from Portugal, Mexico, Columbia, Jamaica, Sri Lanka, and the Philippines to do their household chores - their racial and class 'others'. The difference in class enables women in upper income families to buy their way out of domestic labour and to increase their social status. To illustrate, in Saudi Arabia, Shah *et al.* (1991) argued that foreign domestic workers enabled the Arab women to seek work outside the home, and where women did not work outside the home, domestic workers fulfilled an important role in augmenting the social status of the household. Acknowledging that domestic work is women's primary responsibility in a household, paid domestic workers are generally under the supervision of the mistress of the family. In this, the mistresses attempt to subject domestic workers to many of the same forms of control as factory workers are subjected to, including the standardization of procedures and time management (Romero 1992). They also consider their domestic workers as their possession, their objects, their diminutive pets, or all these things (Basch and Lerner 1986). Mistresses of the houses, however, are not the only ones who control domestic workers in the family. Masters of the houses are equally dominant, and the

domestic workers are considered to be not only their class and racial 'other' but also their gendered 'other'.

Various researchers (Gordon 1985; Gaw 1988; Glenn 1992; Phyllis 1985; Swaisland 1993) observed that in many countries, white middle class women could hire other women, usually recent immigrants, working class women, or women of colour, to perform much of the hard labour of household tasks. This implies that for Huggins, racial difference is the principal source of inequality between the female employer and the employee. Studies by Cock (1980), Collins (1986), King (1988) and Brown (1989), on waged domestic workers in South Africa, displayed how these workers were oppressed by both male and female employers because of their different race. Employment by a female means that the female employees are doubly subordinated by cumulative effects of class plus race; hiring of women of different ethnic or racial background not only promotes their own feelings of racial superiority, but also enhances their own feelings of power of escaping the stigma of housework.

Huggins (1987) goes further into the issue of racial subordination in her research on Aboriginal domestic workers in white Australian households, arguing that despite the predominance of patriarchal rule in early Australian society, the nation was colonized on a racially rather than sexually imperialistic basis. In this case, racial imperialist ideology granted all Australian women, however victimized by sexist oppression, the right to assume the role of oppressors in relation to Aborigines.

Part of this racial difference has been the tendency to hire and manage domestic workers on the basis of racial stereotypes (Romero 1992). For example, the tendency to employ Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia is not only due to the similarity in religion between these nations, but also because there is a perception of character difference between women of different Asian cultures (Abella 1992). Hence, Indonesian women are favoured because the Saudis consider them as 'sweeter in nature' and 'easier to manage'

than any other Asian nationalities (Kompas, 14 November 1984). Whilst, Robinson (1990) noted that in the Middle East, Indonesian domestic workers are treated as 'other', who are excluded from the protection in Saudi household. Also from the perspectives of the employers, it is possible that the ever-increasing number of Indonesian women migrants in Saudi Arabia may seem reason enough to consider them as threatening 'other'. In consequence, their very numbers may be used as an excuse for, or validation of, their subordinate position. In addition, the domestic workers are also often represented by the host nationals in ways that imply that it is because they are Asian that they face the particular difficulties and dangers that they do (Pettman 1992). Hence, the excuse put forward is that it may be the sweetness and docility of the Indonesians (gendered racism) that makes them more vulnerable to exploitation by their employers. In other words, racist ideologies provide a vocabulary about race, culture, and gender differences, an understanding about who 'we' are and what is 'normal' (Pettman 1992) and, therefore, what is an accepted practice.

It is not surprising to find that the treatment of domestic workers by their employers reflects the racial, class and cultural discrimination referred to above. Whilst there is nothing found in the literature with specific reference to Indonesian domestic workers, there is a significant amount of research on the treatment of foreign domestic workers in general. Many researchers (e.g. Dawes 1973; Fairchilds 1984; Higgs 1986; Harris 1984; Krantz 1993; Maza 1983; Gordon 1985; and Cock 1980) have described the treatment received by foreign domestic workers in middle and high class families in the following way. The employers address their domestic workers by their first names and require them to enter by the back door. The workers have to eat in the kitchen and wear a uniform. They are not to initiate conversation but are to remain standing or visibly engaged in work whenever the employer is in the room. They also have to accept, with gratitude, gifts of discarded clothing and left over food. They do not have the right to complain about their work

conditions - for example, they do not have written agreements on hours of work, salaries, pensions and other social benefits, or over periods of holidays. Their work is not regulated and therefore not protected by the labour legislation. Their work is of low status, isolated, privatized and lonely. Furthermore, they are expected to accept mistreatment without resistance. Obviously, their treatment may vary between culture, race, class, and countries. However, it can be presumed that Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia receive similar treatment to the above-mentioned examples, if not in all, at least in some of the ways.

Working in a foreign environment, then, seems to incur a number of problems for female domestic workers. In the workplace, they are subject to discrimination as women (sexist), as foreigners (racist) and as a subordinate economic class (Hune 1991). First, as women per se, and in particular, as women of low economic status, they are generally pushed to the lowest levels of employment, especially in the services (such as domestic work) and in the manufacturing sector. They also face physical and sexual abuses. Men, in contrast, have greater and more diverse opportunities as well as tending to have better paid, and more attractive, jobs. Further, they are less likely to be situated in private households where exploitation and maltreatment largely occurs. Second, as foreigners, female domestic workers may experience oppressive working conditions due to their racial status, and unregulated work, which threaten their lives, health and safety.

To summarize, as paid work, domestic work becomes overshadowed with concerns about race, gender and class relationship between employers and employees. Whilst advocating wages for domestic workers is seen as a solution to the problem of low status in the Western feminist literature, this does not challenge the basic sexual division of labour. Wages cannot eliminate the psychological and cultural consequences of that sexual division of labour. Domestic work, regardless of whether it is paid or unpaid, is still overwhelmingly perceived as women's work.

In the next chapter, the policies on women and labour, international standards and the Gulf policies on migrant workers will be discussed to obtain some ideas on how Indonesian women have been perceived in the national policies and how the international standards and the Gulf policies have considered the issue of migrant workers.

CHAPTER III

LABOUR MIGRATION : POLICIES, CONVENTIONS AND WORKER PROTECTION

In this chapter, the focus centres on the main national (Indonesian and Saudi) and international policies or conventions relating to migration, labour, and women in development, that impact on the lives of the paid domestic workers of Indonesia working overseas. That is, the chapter focuses its analysis on the Indonesian policies on women in development, migration and labour, the Gulf State policies on migration (adopted by Saudi Arabia) and the international conventions or standards for migrant workers which come under the United Nations legislative framework. Some attention is also paid to the issue of the actual labour contract signed by the domestic employee and to trade unions.

The Indonesian policies on women and development, which come under the authority of the State Ministry for the Role of Women, and their policies on labour, which come under the auspices of the Ministry of Manpower, have to be considered here because they affect women migrant workers one way or another. Underlying the technical implementation of these policies are the Broad Guidelines of the State Policy (GBHN) which are formulated every five years to provide direction for each Ministry in planning its Five-Year-Plan (PELITA). The GBHN, therefore, acts as the baseline for all development policies in Indonesia, covering issues from political to socio-economic fields of development. At issue in analysing these policies will be: what are their main concerns, are domestic workers included in their brief, what sort of regulations are provided, and what, if any, are their shortcomings?

The policies adopted by Saudi Arabia on labour migration, under the Gulf States Policies, are also briefly considered as these provide the legislative context of domestic workers in that country. Further, attention is given to the International Conventions and legislation regarding labour migration to ascertain, first, what these entail and second, whether the governments of Indonesia and Saudi are committed to their intent. Some attention is also paid to the issue of the work contract, in the context of these national and international regulations, to elicit what kinds of requirements regarding the domestic

labourer's working conditions are laid down in such contracts. Finally, the arena of trade union assistance for the domestic labour work force is canvassed, in particular, to focus on whether such assistance is available to Indonesian domestic workers abroad.

First, then, we turn our focus on the critiques of women in development policies.

3.1. Women in Development Policies

It has been presupposed that all social groups, including women, benefit from the expanded opportunities provided by modernization and development. It is conventionally assumed that development processes are gender-neutral and that they enable women who have been limited by traditional patriarchal ideologies to become autonomous contributors to society and its development efforts. If women were not absorbed equally into the modern sector, it was often assumed to be the result of women's conservatism and stubbornness in maintaining traditional attitudes (Jaquette 1982).

Boserup (1970), Tiano (1987), Tinker, Bramsen and Buvinic (1976), and Dauber and Cain (1981), however, criticized conventional development planning, arguing that men and women were affected differently and that women, particularly those in the lowest socio-economic groups, were likely to be affected negatively by severe changes of modernization.

By and large, most of the poor third world households depend for their livelihood on women's contributions of labour, income and other resources. However, many studies have shown that women have become impoverished both in absolute and relative terms. The studies demonstrate that women are marginalized in the subsistence and informal sectors of the third world economies and are frequently confined to the most precarious and vulnerable sectors of production (Arizpe 1977; Barrett and Browne 1993; Boulding 1981; Rogers 1980; Mies 1980; Elson and Pearson 1984; Martin-Schiller 1989; White 1989; Deere 1983; Heyzer 1986; Dauber and Cain 1981). For example, women are often displaced from their traditional occupations by the introduction of innovative and modern, capital intensive agricultural technologies (Berninghausen and Kerstan 1992; Stoler 1977; Dauber and Cain 1981; White 1989; Boulding 1981; Sajogyo 1983). Many poor women are forced to work longer and harder to fulfill their reproductive and productive roles because of their marginalization and attachment to domestic and subsistence activities and their limited access to cash, land and other resources (Roger 1980; Buvinic 1983; Mayra,

Margaret and William 1983). To illustrate, although women are the main food producers in society, they are frequently excluded from access to agricultural extension services which could assist them in improving agricultural activities (Sayogyo 1983; Stoler 1977; White 1989; Staudt 1977; Nelson 1981). Furthermore, in the development planning process, important inputs such as water and fuel, along with appropriate technology, which would relieve the long hours and drudgery of much of women's work, are often ignored (Palmer 1983; Staudt 1977; Tiano 1987).

Assumptions about women's roles, and their invisibility, in development are also disadvantageous to women in the Third World because it means that their needs are not adequately considered in government policies and programme formulation. To illustrate, it is extensively presumed by planners that heads of households are predominantly males. But in reality, as many as a third of Third World households are headed by women who are frequently the poorest of the poor (Nelson 1977; Buvinic 1983; Mayra *et al.* 1983; Charlton, 1984). For example, in urban areas, especially in Latin America, the Caribbean and parts of Africa, the number of households headed by females had reached 50 percent or more by the early 1990s (Moser 1993). Also, Hetler (1986 cited in Hugo 1994a) documented that one in eight households in Indonesia was headed by women in the mid-1980s. The invisibility of women's role in development has also been based on the assumption that women's reproductive roles within the family are of little economic value. To become an economic activity in the eyes of mainstream economists and planners, women's unpaid domestic work has to encompass one of the following economic criteria: gross domestic product, balance of payments, economic growth, efficiency and productivity. However, women's domestic work is devoid of all these characteristics. Accordingly, the definition of economically active refers to the labour force which is economically valued (Beneria 1981 and 1982; Palmer 1983; Buvinic 1983; Sayogyo 1983). As a result, women's productive and reproductive roles in the private and public spheres tend to be neglected in development planning.

Women in Development (WID) approaches since the early 1970s have argued for the inclusion of women in development planning, and various versions of WID policies have been adopted - at least in theory - by many countries around the world (for example, Buvinic 1983; Moser 1993). However, the limited success of such policies have led some

feminist critics to argue that greater gender-awareness at various levels of development planning is needed in order to achieve the successful implementation of gender and development policies. The Gender and Development (GAD) approach argued for here is based on Molyneux's concepts (1985) and developed further by Moser (1991,1993). It distinguishes practical and strategic gender needs and/or interests, whereby the former, commonly prioritised in many WID policies, focus on ways of improving women's daily lives, whereas the latter are concerned with the transformation of unequal power relations between women and men. While these two types of interests may not always be easy to separate, this distinction has been useful in characterising existing policies, and serves us here to identify the Indonesian policies as a WID, rather than a GAD approach.

3.2 The Indonesian Women in Development (WID) Policies: A Critique

In Indonesia, women were not considered in development policy until after the International Year of Women (IYW) in 1975, when international attention was drawn to the gender-based effects of development policies. Following the proceedings of the IYW, for the first time, in 1978, a section on the role of women in national development was incorporated into the Broad Guidelines of the State Policy (GBHN) of the Third National Development Plan (1978-1983). An Associate Minister for the Role of Women was appointed by the President of the Republic of Indonesia in 1978 with responsibility for those issues relating to Indonesian development. The position of the Associate Minister was later elevated to State Minister for the Role of Women in 1983.

In the 1993 GBHN edition, the section relating to the Role of Women in National Development was placed as the last sub-section within a chapter entitled 'People's Welfare, Education and Culture (GBHN 1993: 263-265). By including a passage about women within such a chapter - that is, one which is essentially concerned with welfare and culture - women have been constructed as both the custodians of culture and welfare and as the nurturers of society. This, I assert, brings to light a basic contradiction within the Indonesian development policy approach to women. Whilst, on one hand, there is some suggestion that women should be encouraged to actively participate in all walks of life, on the other, there is a considerable emphasis placed on their responsibility in the private

sphere. Support for this position is found in the GBHN which states that “women are responsible for the social welfare of the family and development of children, teenagers and youths toward the achievement of total development of Indonesians” (GBHN 1993:107-8). Further, it is stated that women’s roles in society and development should not conflict with their roles in the family. Their duties are to ensure an increased level of nutrition, health and education (including religious education) for the family and to provide for their children’s survival, physical, mental and intellectual growth, as well as their personal and social adjustment. Clearly, this promotes the notion that women’s primary responsibility within the private sphere is inherent in women’s biology and physical appearance. Walby (1990) has suggested that the time women allocate to work within the household would inevitably reduce their skills and ability in world of formal, paid work. As a consequence, women’s positions in society has been relegated to one that is secondary to that held by men. At the same time, in order to fulfill conflicting demands both inside and outside households, Indonesian women have to become super women who relentlessly have to manage their lives, their children’s (as the future generation), their families’ and spouses’. The GBHN also declares that women’s roles in development should continuously be augmented and guided in order to increase their participation and contribution to the development of the nation “in conformity with their nature, dignity and position” (GBHN 1993: 263-264). Their nature, dignity and position is taken as predetermined and pre-given, and therefore to be preserved and maintained by society. Consequently, society is incessantly requested to perceive women as being in harmony with their nature as women. Such an approach clearly infers that women, who are constructed as a homogeneous group, require direction and guidance from others.

On the positive side, the policies solidify the concept that the family is one of the most important aspects of Indonesian society and that women occupy a central role in maintaining it. They also suggest that the survival of children is one of the main objectives of the women in development policies. The shortcomings, I argue, are that there are overexpectations placed on the role of Indonesian women within public and private spheres in which the socio-cultural patriarchal background of the country still hinders the possibility of women meeting their full potential in development. As noted, in general, women’s main responsibility in the household is unquestioned and is deemed to be the primary function and

role, whilst their responsibility outside the domestic domain, albeit increasingly recognised as important, is seen as a secondary function.

Whilst there is this emphasis on the private sphere, at the same time, the same article also suggests that women should be provided “with skills and knowledge so that they can take more advantage of work opportunities”(GBHN 1993: 263-264). However, whilst these are important objectives, more opportunities to work does not necessarily change the root causes of gender inequality, nor does it ensure benefits to women. Many studies (Elson and Pearson 1981, 1982; Heyzer 1986; Salaff 1981; Young, Wolkowitz and McCullagh 1981) indicate that work opportunities for women do not ultimately change women’s subordination and oppression. To illustrate, export-oriented factories employ a cheap, female labour force that can be readily laid off in times of low demand. Work in such factories does not necessarily translate into adequate wages or economic security for women.

Within the framework of the GBHN, another article (GBHN 1993: 265) portrays women workers as fundamental to all fields of development. Therefore, it suggests, “specific attention” should be given to “their increased protection and welfare, domestic and abroad”. However, whilst this declaration may appear to be sufficient for ensuring the adequacy of domestic workers’ conditions, it has not resulted in sufficient action in practice. For instance, and as this thesis shows, women who work as domestic workers within, and outside, the country have long been acknowledged as undergoing mistreatment in their workplace. The nature of the work, which is privatized and isolated, is inclined to place women in a precarious and vulnerable position, and often in poor working conditions. Hence, in light of the various reports on the plight of domestic workers, both within the country and abroad, a thorough investigation is needed to establish whether there are significant actions undertaken by relevant governments to improve the working conditions of these domestic workers. One thing is clear, the State Ministry for the Role of Women, which is responsible for the implementation of the women in development policies, does not consider it as the Ministry’s responsibility to include the realm of domestic workers in its policies and planning. Rather, they assume that it is the duty of the Ministry of Manpower to care for the workers internally and internationally.

In general, what can be concluded from the above mentioned policies? It appears evident that the Indonesian government sees women as bearers of reproductive and productive roles but gives little attention to the clashes, contradictions, and often hardship arising from attempts to fulfilling these. We can see from the intent of the afore-mentioned policies, that the Indonesian women, while acting as the sole educators and nurturers of the family, should also be participating actively in the public sphere as workers and as community members and citizens. Their participation in these different environments is, however, restricted by their traditional and stereotyped roles within the household. In fact, several problems arise from the way in which women are represented in these policies. First, the policies assume that women's work is of a narrow type and character, and one that is in keeping with the women's nature. Second, and linked with the first, is the problem that women cannot fully participate in the development process and in the process of production due to their sole responsibility within the private sphere. Third, the policies contain the assumption that the present sexual division of labour ~~at present~~ is merely a biological matter, where women's designated roles in both the public and private spheres are associated with their biological and physical appearance. Fourth, and importantly for this thesis, they do not encapsulate women's role in paid domestic work, which refers to the combination of women's reproductive as well as productive roles. Fifth, they constitute a complete acceptance of the continuation of existing gender subordination and mode of production in both domains.

The conceptual underpinnings of the GBHN section on the role of women, therefore, have implications for paid domestic workers, as they make no space for the notion of domestic work in the public sphere. Consequently, paid domestic workers and their needs are also absent in the programme implementation of the State Ministry for the Role of Women.

3.3. The Indonesian Labour Policies: A Critique

If the women in development policies of the State Ministry for the Role of Women have overlooked these workers, how do they fare in the implementation of the Indonesian labour policies? In the 1993 Broad Guidelines of the State Policy (GBHN), the chapter

relating to labour policies is located under ^{the} main chapter of Economy. Domestic work in the public sphere, however, is not covered by these guidelines despite the fact that it is monetized, mainly because such work remains in the informal sector - an arena not considered within 'the economy'. Further, the invisibility of paid domestic work, as women's work, in the GBHN is compounded by the ostensible gender-neutrality of the labour policies as these make no distinction between men's work and women's work. As a result, women, and in particular those in the informal sector, such as paid domestic workers, remain marginalized from the mainstream development process because of this lack of visibility in the policy process and programme implementation.

The passage on labour policies reveals that the development of the labour force is aimed at creating ^a "professional, productive and self-sustained labour force" (GBHN 1993: 174). This policy, however, would be difficult to translate into reality, since most of the labour is still struggling at the lowest level of the economy, with low skills and education. Hence, most of the labour force is far from the heights of professionalism and productivity aimed for in this policy (Country Report 1994). Clearly, the policies would be more applicable and beneficial to most of the low skilled Indonesian workers, such as domestic workers, if they emphasized, and were targetted to, the needs of this group, and to the betterment of their living and working conditions, both abroad and within the country.

As already indicated, another article in the GBHN stipulates that women workers should be given "specific attention and protection in harmony with their self-esteem, nature and dignity as women"(GBHN 1993:174). The policies, I claim, apart from showing an honourable aim of paying respect and honour to women, also promote the notion of women's inequality with men. So whilst the objectives of the policies are well-intended, in reality the result is that they do nothing to prevent many women from being exposed to a lot of pressure, exploitation and abuses which will impinge upon their lives, health and safety. As noted above, the policies have nothing to say on the working conditions of domestic labourers. In contrast, work in the formal sector grants its workers rights embodied in labour legislation, regulations and policies. This implies that their work is covered with social security benefits, work protection, health insurance and superannuation schemes. However, paid domestic work, whilst being regarded as work because it generates income, is not considered to be part of the labour system. Consequently, this form of work is

excluded from the protection of legislation and regulations concerning workers' rights. Hence, poor working conditions usually prevail in this sector where many of the poor, lowly status women seek a livelihood. For domestic workers abroad the problem is exacerbated by the fact that Indonesian labour legislation, even if it did apply to domestic service, does not extend beyond the state borders.

Whilst domestic labourers working overseas lack the protection of national legislation and regulations, their work is still officially recognized as being an important part of the Indonesian economy. For example, one study documents that overseas domestic workers' remittances contribute about twenty five percent of the non-oil export revenue of Indonesia (Leela Gulati 1993 cited in Wiyono 1995). Such remittances are claimed by the Indonesian Government to be of economic benefit, and are used to finance imports, enhance national savings and have positive effects on the country's balance of payments (Priyono 1995). Indeed, one passage in the GBHN proposes that the "export of workers overseas is concurrent with export of other commodities", with the primary aim of exports being to acquire foreign exchange (GBHN 1993: 177-178). This emphasis in the policy, however, gives the impression that the overseas workers are merely to be regarded as commodities. Yet, if labour is perceived to be merely one of the various commodities which renders lucrative business for Indonesia, instead of being seen as flesh and blood human beings who also need security and work protection as well as work satisfaction, then, their primary needs and problems will be overlooked, as appears to be the current case.

To conclude, the Indonesian Government's attitude towards domestic workers abroad appears to be ambivalent. On the one hand, the government recognises their vital contribution to Indonesia's economic development through their remittances. On the other hand, the work itself is not considered to be an important issue in labour policies due to its privatized and informal nature. As shown in the previous section, only work which acquires qualified and recognised skills is included in labour legislation and regulations. It could be argued that a reason for excluding domestic workers is that their work is not perceived to be in need of protection and regulation because it is performed in the presumed safety protection of the domestic sphere.

This, however, is a simplistic view. Working in a private household, I argue, places women in a vulnerable situation, where domestic workers can be easily controlled and

exploited by their employers, in part, precisely because the household is considered to be private sphere where no one, or nothing, can trespass except with the owner's permission.

Even though the Government continues to attempt to rectify this situation, the increasing number of cases of maltreatment against the Indonesian domestic workers undermines the Government's endeavours. Greater efforts and political will to change this condition are unquestionably required in the future.

3.4. Regulations Pertaining to Overseas Workers

The purpose of this section is to discuss those regulations introduced by the Indonesian Government (under the Ministry of Manpower) concerning Indonesian domestic workers abroad. The aim is to elicit the nature of these regulations and the extent to which these have been implemented.

As noted, the Government recognizes the economic value of the Indonesian overseas labour force to the economy. In consequence, in 1970, the Ministry of Manpower proclaimed a regulation, PER 004/1970, to manage and control the operation of labour supply agencies in deployment of Indonesian workers overseas. In 1981, around 160 labour supply agencies/recruiters were registered within the Ministry of Manpower. Most of these agencies provide training to overseas domestic workers offering courses in cooking, cleaning, baby-sitting and the basics in Arabic language and culture. The training usually requires three months and upon successful completion of the courses, the prospective domestic workers receive their certification.

By 1983, and as a result of the increased number and variety of overseas workers and the perceived need to keep accurate statistics on these migrants, an Office for Overseas Employment (AKAN) was set up within the Ministry of Manpower in Jakarta, under the Ministerial Decree no 525/1983. The aim of this office has been to encourage, control and coordinate recruitment and deployment of the Indonesian overseas worker, and to maintain data on those transmitted.

Of the other regulations under the Ministry of Manpower, the most important ones are regulation No.PER 01/MEN/1986 on Intercountry Employment and Decision no KEP 3/MEN/1986, which state that the labour supply agency, on behalf of the Arabian employer, should sign the employment contract with a domestic worker, and have it witnessed by a

representative from the Ministry of Labour on behalf of the Minister of Manpower. Some examples of conditions written into contracts, as cited by Utomo (1990: 128-131) are that : “Employers should fully pay the salary of domestic workers each month and should insure their workers “ (Article 7); “Employers should give their domestic workers rest and sleep for eight hours per day” (Article 9); “Employers should allow their domestic workers to send and receive letters without being censored” (Article 10); and “When domestic workers are ill, employers should be responsible for their medical treatment until they are fully recovered” (Article 15).

The contract, prepared by the Government of Indonesia, however, cannot be enforced in Saudi Arabia because the laws of Indonesia are not administered outside its borders. Therefore, the Indonesian Government does not extend any legal protection for these workers. The lack of legal backing is confirmed by the Ministerial Decree, No.KEP106/MEN/1991, which states that, in the case of a dispute between an employer and a domestic worker, the Indonesian Government or its diplomatic representative in the Embassy, can consult with the worker (over ‘small disputes’) but cannot infringe upon the the internal affairs of Saudi Arabia. The Government’s reluctance to become involved in defending the rights of domestic workers in Saudi Arabia can be interpreted as signalling two things : first, that the issues of domestic workers are deemed to be of little significance and therefore unworthy of the Government’s efforts and troubles, with no further action being required; and, second, that the Government is more concerned about maintaining a good relationship with the Government of Saudi Arabia and does not want to risk damaging it by interfering with internal matters. Indeed, the finding of recent studies conducted by the Women’s Studies Centre of Padjadjaran University in Indonesia (1992), suggest that the requirement embodied in the contracts, granting rights to prospective overseas workers, are rarely adhered to.

Another problem faced by domestic workers overseas is that, given the inadequacy of the trade union structure in Indonesia, there is no domestic workers’ trade union that can provide them any assistance. If such a union existed, it would be able to assist those deployed in Saudi Arabia through its representative in this country. Accordingly, to gain such protection, each domestic worker would be required to become a member of the union. Also, Saudi Arabia similarly lacks a union movement (Heyzer *et.al.* 1994) and,

hence, there is no recourse in that country either to union support for these overseas workers.

In conclusion, whilst there is an office (AKAN) with the task of coordinating labour supply agencies and overseas workers, and regulations pertaining to contracts for overseas workers, there are no regulations which directly protect Indonesian domestic workers abroad. In this, the Indonesian Government is presumed to be either lacking interest in the needs of the workers or putting its relationship with Saudi (and other labour-importing nations) as top priority vis-a-vis the workers. Further, there is no union basis in either Saudi Arabia or Indonesia which can provide a support network for the workers.

3.5. Labour Migration Policies of the Gulf States

So far we have discussed Indonesia's policies on women and development and labour and Indonesia's regulations pertaining to overseas workers. I argue that it is also significant and relevant to discuss the labour migration policies of the Government of Saudi Arabia as the country which receives most of the Indonesian domestic workers. The point of view of this Government also has implications for the way in which the Government of Indonesia (as the sending country) handles the migrant domestic worker issue.

Saudi Arabia is a member of Gulf States, therefore its labour migration policies are enveloped within the Gulf States' policies. The Gulf States labour migration policies are characterized by the overarching goal of preserving their existing political structure and the dominant position of the national population and of preserving the strict laws and regulations pertaining to the entry and employment of foreigners.

In order to protect themselves against social and political domination by foreigners residing in their countries, the Gulf States endeavour to enact a strict strategy concerning citizenship and naturalization laws. The laws grant the privilege of citizenship on the combined basis of the blood principle (i.e. being born to a Gulf parent in, or outside, the country) and the territorial principle (i.e. having resided continuously within the country for several years) (Russel 1989; Shadid *et.al* 1992; Eelens and Speckmann 1990).

Migration policies aim at minimizing the number of migrants entering the country and at limiting their period of residence. The specific rules and regulations stating

conditions of entry and employment of overseas contract workers can be found in different labour codes and amendments. Normally, they require all visitors to present an entry visa on arrival. In the case of a social or commercial visit, overseas contract workers have to apply to the Ministry of the Interior for an entry visa. When the purpose of entry is employment, the application has to be made by the labour supply agencies or employers. In this case, residence and work permits have to be issued by the Ministries of Interior, Labour and Social Affairs (Dib 1988). Work permits and entry visas are issued on the basis of specific conditions such as age, health, competence and qualifications relevant to the job in question, as well as on the basis of good reputation and behaviour of the applicants (Eelens and Speckmann 1990). Work permits have to be renewed annually and, when cancelled, residence permits become invalid. The right of labour supply agencies/employers to recruit overseas contract workers is conditional in the sense that permission has to be given by the authorities, the concerned ministries, only when a national is not available for the job in question. In all of the Middle East countries, the primary responsibility is taken by the labour supply agencies or sponsors and employers. He /she is liable for the conduct of the employee and is obliged to ensure that he/she is employed in accordance with local legislation. Employees are generally required to relinquish their passports and other travel documents to the employers (Eelens *et al.* 1990). These important documents are returned on the completion of the two year employment contract.

As all labour migration from Asian countries is contract labour migration in which the workers are not granted citizen status, these domestic workers remain virtually unprotected by Saudi laws and are therefore totally dependent on the goodwill of their employers as well as both Governments for their well-being.

3.6. Problems of Deployment of Indonesian Overseas Workers

Whilst domestic workers lack protection, clearly, however, as this section illustrates, some form of protection and effective regulation is required. Data collected from Kompas newspaper clippings from 1984-1995 reveal that there are three types of problems faced by domestic workers overseas, namely lack of information, inadequate protection and unfair treatment. This can be seen at every stage; a) before departure and while waiting; b) while working overseas and ; c) when returning from abroad.

Many of the clippings indicate that before departure, labour supply agencies agents offer erroneous information as an enticement. For instance, two of the pledges which are rarely upheld are that there will be a chance for prospective workers to make a Hajj (pilgrimage) to Mecca in Saudi Arabia and to receive attractive salaries. Every worker has to pay a commission which varies according to the country of destination, type of work, and sex of a recruit. Prospective female workers have to submit a higher levy than men,* owing to the high demand for jobs in Saudi Arabia, to Immigration and Manpower Department officials who are in league with labour supply agencies. An intricate and elaborate bureaucracy requires that the prospective workers submit to a complex and time consuming process, which gives rise to illegal practices which are seemingly more inexpensive but which hold greater danger of exploitation.

While waiting, and after being given training for the job, prospective overseas workers are housed together in a dormitory, where they have to stay for a few weeks or months until their departure. They sometimes have to sleep on a mat on the floor in a poorly ventilated room (Kompas, 21 October 1989). The prospective workers are mostly kept ignorant of what kinds of employers they will work for abroad, and what kinds of problems they are likely to face. Further, the content of their contract of employment, which is signed by the labour supply agency, the prospective worker, and a representative of Ministry of Manpower, are rarely understood by the prospective worker.

While working overseas, domestic workers need to adjust to a new environment and accommodate to their new employer's life style and customs. Also, owing to the privatization of the work, it is impossible to control how the employer treats their overseas domestic workers and their fate is wholly in their employer's hands. Fernea (1985) revealed that domestic workers who came from foreign countries were treated like *khadam*, or slaves. This is facilitated by the practice of requiring overseas workers to submit their passports to their employers until the end of their contracts, presumably to prevent them from fleeing the country. To illustrate, there is a multitude of stories from domestic workers in Saudi Arabia claiming maltreatment, rape and sexual abuse. The social climate in that country is such that even foreign workers who carry out specialized work (hospital staff, teachers, etc) are treated as servants, a role considered to be but a small step up from 'slave' (Bethan 1993; Utomo 1990). For domestic workers then, if conditions are so bad
*correct according to an explanation from a field expert at the Department of Manpower.

that they choose to run away from their employer's place, the police will arrest them and any complaint is almost always ignored. They are then sent back to Indonesia, assuming that their employer wishes it, at their own expense, because they are seen to have not fulfilled the employment contract. If the employer wishes, however, they are constrained to continue working for them, usually under even worse conditions than before, and until the end of the contract.

When returning home, first of all, returned domestic workers have to use transportation designated by labour supply agencies who often take advantage of them. They must pay a considerable amount of money for busfares to their hometowns. Another problem is, when changing their Arabic currency into an Indonesian currency at the Airport Bank, the exchange rate is ordinarily lower than in any other places outside the Airport. Finally, when they arrive in their hometowns, they sometimes find that their hard-earned money has been squandered by their family. A large proportion of returnees therefore find themselves in a position where they must queue once again for overseas work in an attempt to improve their lives.

In conclusion, working overseas is problematic, and can become a vicious circle. On one hand, it provides workers with a sufficient amount of income to sustain themselves and their families. On the other hand, it raises many problems which cannot be easily resolved.

3.7. International Labour Conventions and Recommendations for Migrant Workers

Despite the aforementioned lack of protection in legislation for Indonesian workers deployed overseas, there are some international conventions (or standards) and recommendations for migrant workers under the United Nations legislative framework which are concerned with the protection of such workers. Unfortunately, only a handful of countries have ever signed or ratified the conventions whilst the recommendations are neither subject to ratification nor formally binding.

International labour conventions, when ratified (rather than just being signed) by member countries under the United Nations, carry a formal commitment for their implementation at the national level. In other words, the member countries which ratify

ILO Conventions are required, both by international law and by the provisions of the ILO Constitution, to bring their internal laws and practice into conformity with the conventions. The member countries are bound by ^{the} ILO Constitution "to take such actions as may be necessary to make effective the provisions of such conventions", except when existing laws, awards, customs or agreements ensure "more favourable conditions to the workers concerned than those provided for in the Convention" (ILO Constitution, cited in Leary 1982:10). In addition to the obligations demanded by terms of each convention, the ILO Constitution imposes a further obligation on ratifying Member countries through Article 22 of the Constitution which declares that :

"Each of the Members agrees to make an annual report to the International Labour Office on the measures which it has taken to give effect to the provisions of conventions which it is a party. These reports shall be made in such forms and shall contain such particulars as the Governing Body may request".

(ILO Constitution cited in Leary 1982:11)

The first ILO Convention (no 97) and a separate Recommendation (no 86), both concerning Migration for Employment, were initiated in 1949. To date, the convention has only been ratified by two countries, namely Malaysia and ~~and~~ New Zealand. A more contemporary convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, which was adopted by the United Nations General Assembly in 1990, has been ratified by Morocco and Mexico, and has been signed by the Philippines, Tunisia and Egypt. However, neither Indonesia nor Saudi Arabia have signed or ratified the two conventions (Kompas, 10 May 1995).

It is important to briefly survey the existing conventions and their potential benefits to migrant workers which are lost to non-signatory member countries. The convention which is most relevant to this study is the aforementioned 1990 Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and the Members of Their Families. Several articles which provide protection to overseas workers relate respectively to : i) the prohibition of torture, or cruel inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment to overseas workers, ii) prohibition of slavery or compulsory labour and iii) matters related to the employment contract. The first two articles clearly relate specifically to migrant workers whilst they are working overseas. The last article relates especially to the rights of

prospective workers before their departure. The guidelines in the convention state that prior to departure, migrant workers have the right to receive an employment contract, which is prepared by both given countries, covering their conditions of work, terms of employment and rates of pay. The Government of Indonesia, which has neither signed nor ratified this convention, has also not developed bilateral labour cooperation with the Arab Saudi Government on the issue of contracts. The result is a contract which is only settled by one party- the Indonesian Government - which, as the previous section indicated, cannot be administered in Saudi Arabia.

Besides the first ILO Convention no 97 and Recommendation no 86, concerning Migration of Employment in 1949, and the 1990 Convention on Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, there are several other international labour standards or conventions and recommendations which impinge upon migrant workers. These are:

Convention no 97/Rev.1949	Migration for Employment
Recommendation no 100/1955	Protection of Migrant Workers in Underdeveloped Countries and Territories
Recommendation no 151/1975	Migrant Workers
Convention no 143/1975	Migration in Abusive Conditions and the Promotion of Equality and Opportunity and Treatment of Migrant Workers

None of these, however, have been signed or ratified by either the Indonesian or the Saudi Government. Also warrenting attention are the main Conventions and Recommendations which deal with social security matters for migrant workers, that is:

Convention no 118/1962	Equality of Treatment of Nationals and Non-Nationals in Social Security
Convention no 157/1982	Maintenance of Social Security Rights
Recommendation no 167/1983	Maintenance of Social Security Rights

Again, neither Saudi Arabia nor Indonesia have ratified these conventions. To conclude, I claim that the implementation of the Convention(s) by both nations would be of great

benefit to the welfare of Indonesian domestic workers deployed abroad. However, such implementation would greatly depend on the political will of these Governments and the active interest of employers' and workers' organizations in these nations.

In conclusion, as this chapter has shown, the problematic issues concerning overseas domestic workers stem at least in part from the inadequacy of policies and legislation in both Indonesia and Saudi Arabia. For Indonesia, neither the women and development or the labour policies include domestic workers' issues in their brief. Further, the Ministry of Manpower's regulations mainly deal with administrative matters - of recruiting overseas workers and management of labour supply agencies rather than protecting overseas workers. Also, the availability of international conventions on migrant workers have no meaning for the domestic workers' well-being, given the Indonesian and Saudi Governments' failure to ratify them.

CHAPTER IV

CHARACTERISTICS OF INDONESIAN DOMESTIC WORKERS IN SAUDI ARABIA

The functions of this chapter are two-pronged. First, the general characteristics of Indonesian women will be outlined to serve as a general backdrop on the position of those Indonesian women who work as domestic workers both abroad and within the country. In particular, their level of education will be ascertained, as education is a significant development indicator, having a significant impact on the economic and class status of women. Second, the chapter will picture, statistically, the number of Indonesian overseas contract workers in Saudi Arabia from the early 1980s. The increasing number of women working overseas each year verifies the economic importance of this work for both women and the Indonesian Government.

4.1. Characteristics of the Indonesian Women's Population

Indonesia is the world's ^{fifth} most populous country living on more than 3000 islands with more than 200 ethnolinguistic groups (Country Report 1994). The total population was around 173 million in 1990 (1990 Population Census) of whom 93 percent were Muslim. Women represented approximately 50.3 percent of this total (Population Census 1990).

According to Mariyah (Inside Indonesia, March 1995), 53.62 percent of the Indonesian women work in the agricultural sector, although this percentage is on a downward trend. In the late 1980s and 1990s the number of men surpassed that of women working in the agricultural sector, owing to the introduction of modern agricultural technologies in rural areas, which have displaced much of women's traditional work (Berninghausen and Kerstan 1992; Martin-Schiller 1989; White 1989; Stoler 1977; Cain

1986; Sayogyo 1983). For example, Hugo (1993) found that modern technology in rice cultivation involved direct seeding of rice instead of labour intensive transplanting, using pesticides instead of labour intensive weeding and hand tractors instead of plough. As a result, as much as a third of the agricultural workforce, both men and women, have had to find off-farm employment. Having found no work in rural areas, they have migrated to nearby urban areas in search of employment. However, because of their low level of education and skills, women's employment opportunities, in particular are severely hampered. Hence, in urban areas, they are inevitably engaged in informal sector work, namely as street traders and domestic workers (Country report 1994) which, owing to its low productivity and skills, does not result in a substantial amount of earnings for its workers. Tables 4.1. and 4.2. give some indication of the educational status of women in Indonesia.

Table 4.1., indicating the level of education attained by rural and urban females (1971-1985), demonstrates that the overall non-attendance for females is high and that the percentage of females who did not attend school was higher in rural areas than in urban areas. In 1971, the percentage of females who did not attend school in rural areas was 55.1 percent whilst in urban areas it was 31.6 percent. Although the percentage dropped in 1985 to 29.9 percent in rural and 14.6 percent in urban areas, the former still present a higher level of non-attendance for females. The table also illustrates that a significant proportion of females do not finish primary school. In this, there is a marked difference between the rural and urban areas, in the 1985 survey period, when 39.8 percent of females from rural areas did not complete their primary education, compared to only 28.9 percent of those in urban areas. As the table also indicates, no rural, and a small percentage of urban, females attained the academy/university level of education (only 0.4 percent in 1971, a figure which remained constant in 1985).

**Table 4.1.: Percentage Distribution of Females by Educational Attainment
1971 - 1985**

EDUCATIONAL LEVEL	URBAN		RURAL	
	1971	1985	1971	1985
NO SCHOOLING	31.6	14.6	55.1	29.9
DIDN.T COMPLETE PRIMARY SCHOOL	28.8	28.9	29.2	39.8
COMPLETED PRIMARY SCHOOL	23.8	27.8	13.6	23.4
LOWER SECONDARY SCHOOL	7.9	13.2	1.2	3.8
UPPER SECONDARY SCHOOL	N.A.		N.A.	
VOCATIONAL	2.2	5.1	0.3	1.3
ACADEMY	0.4	0.8	-	
UNIVERSITY	0.4	0.4	-	
TOTAL	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
N(MILLION)	7.3	16.4	34.0	44.7

Sources: Indonesian Census 1971 and Intercensal Survey 1985

Table 4.2., outlining the educational attainment level of the population fifteen years and over, from 1985-1990 (broken down by gender), also indicates that the percentage of females who did not attend school remained high in the late 1980s. Further, it illustrates that the percentage was more than twice as high as the equivalent figure for males.

However, the figures for incomple~~t~~ed primary schooling were similar for boys and girls at around 24 percent in 1990. The percentage of females completing lower or secondary schooling displays a significant improvement since the 1970s, but is still much lower than that of males.

Table 4.2.: Population Aged 15 years and Over by Educational Attainment, 1985-1990

PERCENTAGE OF POPULATION WITH:

	YEAR	NO SCHOOLING	INCOMPLETE PRIMARY SCHOOLING	COMPLETED PRIMARY SCHOOLING	COMPLETED LOWER OR UPPER SECONDARY SCHOOLING	ACADEMIC/ UNIVERSITY EDUCATION	N %
M	1985	14.4	30.1	30.8	23.3	1.4	100.0
	1990	12.2	24.3	32.2	28.8	2.5	100.0
F	1985	30.6	29.3	25.0	14.6	0.5	100.0
	1990	25.4	24.9	28.1	20.3	1.3	100.0
M+F	1985	22.7	29.7	27.8	18.9	0.9	100.0
	1990	18.9	24.6	30.1	24.5	1.9	100.0

Sources: Jones and Manning, 1990; CBS 1990; 1990 Population Census(cited in Hugo 1994a:14)

In addition to having low levels of skills and education (which includes those with no schooling, those who have not completed, or have only completed, primary school and lower secondary school), an abundant number of Indonesian women are the heads of poor households. In 1990, 13.3 percent of households were headed by women compared with 14 percent in 1980. Of these, a large proportion were living below the poverty line (71 percent in 1985, a marked increase from 58 percent in 1971) with a high proportion of this percentage being widows (65 percent in 1985) or separated (18 percent in 1985). Most of these poor female heads of households, range in age between 25 and 35 years old (Country Report Indonesia,1994). Hetler's findings (1986 cited in Hugo 1994a), moreover, reported that Indonesia had the highest number of female headsh~~ip~~ in South East Asia. As Table 4.3. indicates, more than one in eight households in Indonesia are headed by women. It also

indicates that the percentage of female household heads in urban areas was slightly lower than in rural areas in both 1971 and 1981, but that the percentage was higher in 1985.

Table 4.3.: Percent of Female Household Heads, 1971-1985

YEAR	URBAN	RURAL	TOTAL
1971	14.1	16.7	16.3
1981	13.5	14.4	14.2
1985	13.5	13.0	13.1

Source: Indonesian Censuses of 1971 and 1980 and Intercensal Survey of 1985

Widarti (1991) found in her study of female labour force participation and work patterns in Jakarta that there was a correlation between the level of education and employment pattern of women. Evers, (1989 cited in Widarti:191), also noted that in Jakarta, educational attainment was highly correlated with the level of living. In other words, a low level of income for a family usually means a low level of education for these families. It also follows that those with low incomes and education have fewer avenues of employment opportunities which further impacts their standard of living. Low levels of education for women consequently places them in low status, informal sector work such as vending or domestic work. To illustrate, Widarti (1991) found that having some education makes Indonesian women more discriminating in the type of work they are willing to choose. This may be due to the high aspirations and expectations that usually accompanies the higher levels of education as well as being the result of the formal sector labour market demands for increasingly better educated persons. The upshot of this is that there are few opportunities for the lower educated women in finding work in the formal sector. It is not surprising then, as the same study showed, that women were over-represented in the low status jobs of the informal sector (service sector). It is apparent

then, that there are two different labour markets operating within the service sector: a formal labour market that absorbs the more educated women, such as work in government offices, and an informal labour market (e.g. for domestic work and trade) that attracts the bulk of uneducated women.

In conclusion, a large number of Indonesian women have low levels of education and skills and occupy informal sector (service sector) occupations. Further, a significant number are also heads of poor households and most of these range in age between 25-36 years old.

4.2. The Deployment of Indonesian Domestic Workers Overseas

According to Cremer (1988), most of the Indonesian women who were deployed as domestic workers to Saudi Arabia were heads of households from rural areas, with 28 percent never attending school, 63 percent having a primary education and most having no previous experience or training as domestic workers. These findings on their educational level and household headship status appear to corroborate the characteristics of Indonesian women in the preceding discussion if one takes the percentage having a primary education to mean all those having attended primary school, whether they completed that stage of the education cycle or not. Hugo (1994 a) indicated that provinces of Java, especially West Java, were the main areas of origin of the Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia. As 60 percent of the total of 173 million people (1990 Population Census) live in Java, their dominance in overseas employment is not surprising.

Hugo (1994a) noted that transportation and mass communication facilities have made the most isolated areas of Indonesia accessible to all kinds of information including employment opportunities both outside and within the country. This, together with important factors such as the rapidly changing economic, social and political context in Indonesia, the strong support, by the Government, of the migrant labour flow from

Indonesia, along with the mobility of middle-men/brokers who are able to persuade villagers to work overseas, has led an an increase in the number of overseas workers each year. In fact, as Table 4.4. portrays for the period 1969-1994, the legal flows of Indonesian workers overseas, chiefly to the Middle East and Singapore/Malaysia, has exhibited a significant annual growth. The figures for each of the Five-Year-Plan periods particularly highlights this increase, indicating an escalation in labour flow from a small number in the 1964-1974 period (5,423) through to around 600,000 in the 1989-1994 period.

**Table 4.4.: Number of Indonesian Overseas Contract Workers 1969 -1994
(In thousand)**

YEAR (SINGLE YEAR)	MIDDLE EAST NO.	%	MALAYSIA/ SINGAPORE NO.	%	TOTAL NO.	PERCENTAGE CHANGE OVER PREVIOUS YEAR	SEX RATIO (MALES PER 100 FEMALES)
1977					3,675		N.A.
1979/80	7,651	74	720	7	10,378	-	N.A.
1980/81	11,231	70	564	4	16,186	+58	N.A.
1981/82	11,484	63	1,550	9	17,904	+11	N.A.
1982/83	9,595	47	7,801	38	21,152	+18	N.A.
1983/84	18,691	66	5,597	20	29,291	+39	141
1984/85	35,577	79	6,034	13	46,014	+58	79
1985/86	45,024	83	6,546	12	54,297	+18	44
1986/87	45,405	66	20,349	30	68,360	+26	61
1987/88	49,723	81	7,916	13	61,092	+11	35
1988/89	50,123	82	6,614	11	61,419	+1	29
1989/90	60,456	72	16,007	19	84,074	+37	32
1990/91	39,810	46	36,983	43	86,264	+3	73
1991/92	89,244	60	51,230	34	149,782	+74	48
1992/93	96,772	56	62,535	36	172,157	+15	54

FIVE YEAR PLANNING PERIODS

I : 1964/74	5,423	-	N.A.
II : 1974/79	19,332	+256	N.A.
III : 1979/84	94,921	+391	N.A.
IV : 1984/89	291,182	+207	47
V : 1989/94*	600,163	+106	51

Source : AKAN Office, Jakarta (compiled from Hugo 1994a : 5). *For 1993-1994 up to November 1993 only

Of the total number of Indonesians working in the Middle East, most are deployed to Saudi Arabia. Table 4.5., which indicates the number of Indonesian of Overseas

Contract Workers in Saudi Arabia from 1983-1992, illustrates that there are (and for this time period always were) far greater number of Indonesian female contract workers in Saudi Arabia than males. In 1983, the number of women was twice that of men and by 1990-1992, it was 8-10 times larger. Further, Hugo (1994a), Manning and Hardjono (1993) and Cremer (1988) have indicated that the majority of the women who work in Saudi Arabia are engaged in domestic work in private households.

Table 4.5.: Number of Indonesian Overseas Contract Workers in Saudi Arabia, 1983-1992

YEAR	MALE	FEMALE	MALE+FEMALE
1983	5,936	11,180	17,116
1984	9,319	18,621	27,940
1985	9,030	38,933	47,963
1986	4,769	22,728	27,497
1987	6,307	42,434	48,741
1988	6,510	45,839	52,349
1989	6,971	47,919	54,890
1990	6,363	47,883	54,246
1991	7,8023	56,963	64,765
1992	10,677	85,231	95,908
TOTAL	73,684	417,731	491,415

Source : AKAN Office , Jakarta, 1995

As suggested earlier, the expansion of the overseas workforce each year, is, in part at least, a reflection of the Indonesian Government's increased interest in promoting this movement to convey foreign exchange, through remittances, into the country. Indeed, it has been reported by UNFPA (cited in Wiyono 1995), that remittances from the overseas workforce, in general, had reached US \$ 170 billion per year. Since the initial official

the total worldwide flow of remittances was overseas deployment of workers in 1973, ~~Indonesia has obtained~~ US \$631,510,666 in ~~remittances~~ (Department of Manpower, 1994 cited in Wiyono 1995). To reiterate, such a figure is important to the economy of Indonesia with Leela Gulati (1994, cited in Wiyono 1995) revealing that the contribution of overseas domestic workers to the non-oil export revenue of Indonesia was twenty five percent.

However, whilst remittances are welcomed, the movement of workers overseas is also an indicator of the country's high ~~un~~^{under}employment rate. In the Fifth Five Year Plan, 11.9 million people were classified as unskilled and as active job seekers (Country Report 1994). Clearly, the deployment of the Indonesian domestic workers overseas is related to ~~with~~ the process of heightening unemployment in urban and rural areas.

In addition to the Government's interest in promoting the overseas labour flow, there are also some strong economic reasons for the workers themselves to labour overseas. One prominent factor is the differences in earnings obtained - for doing identical work, one can earn almost five times higher the wage in Saudi Arabia than in Indonesia. To illustrate, a domestic worker in Jakarta may procure about US \$ 30 a month, whilst this work is worth five times that amount in Saudi Arabia (Kompas, 15 May 1990). Another factor influencing the labour flow is the chance it provides workers to conduct Hajj or pilgrimage to Mecca (as one of the pillars of Islamic faith). Indeed, Mantra, Kasnawi and Sukamardi (1986 cited in Hugo, 1994a), Bethan (1993) and Utomo (1990) have indicated that the ability to visit and conduct Hajj in Mecca is an important factor influencing overseas labour migration for Indonesians being secondary to the chance to get a higher salary and improve the welfare of the family.

In terms of assisting the family or using pay for personal satisfaction, domestic workers bring valuable goods home when they have finished their contract. Studies by Mantra *et al.* in 1986 showed that 68 percent of the sample returning in Yogyakarta, West and Central Java brought back radios, televisions, motor cycles and furniture. The

utilisation of their remittances varies according to the priority needs of each family. Table 4.6 displays typical use of remittances with the majority of the income being put to housing, then land purchase, family day to day needs and lastly towards business enterprises.

Table 4.6. : Distribution of Family Use of Remittances From Sample of Overseas Contract Workers in Java

USE OF REMITTANCES	PERCENT OF REMITTANCES
LAND PURCHASE	27.1
HOUSING	45.8
BUSINESS ENTERPRISE	2.7
FAMILY DAY TO DAY NEEDS	24.4

Source: Department of Manpower 1991:71 (cited in Hugo 1994a:26)

Clearly, most of the remittances are consumed on basic needs. In the case of land purchase, it is possible that before embarking for Saudi Arabia, it was essential for a worker to sell his/her land to enable them to pay all recruitment costs, especially when dealing with middle-men/brokers. Other studies reported that upon fulfilment of their work in Saudi Arabia, women were more apt to take control of household finances than before their overseas employment (Yayasan Pengembangan Pedesaan 1992 cited in Hugo 1994a). Whether this category suggests an increased role and status of women in the family ^{re}acquires another study.

In conclusion, the main points which have been discussed in the chapter are the push and the pull factors influencing the overseas flow of female labour from Indonesia. The push factors are the low level of education, poverty and the lack of employment opportunities in the country for these women. The pull factors are the attractive income overseas as well as the opportunity to make Hajj/pilgrimage to Mecca. The yearly increases in the number of women deployed overseas for work also indicates that the Government strongly supports this movement. Further, the chapter has indicated that most of these women work as domestic workers/maids in Saudi Arabia.

In spite of the encouragement and support that the Indonesian Government provides for this overseas movement, as Chapter III indicated, however, they do not appear to have rendered sufficient protection to these lowly educated women. Yet, that they need such protection can be seen from the increasing number of reports on maltreatment experienced by these domestic workers in their work place in Saudi Arabia. It is to these experiences and working conditions, as documented in published interviews with returnees, that our focus now turns.

CHAPTER V

INDONESIAN DOMESTIC WORKERS' PERCEPTIONS OF THEIR WORKING CONDITIONS IN SAUDI ARABIA

5.1 Introduction

The purpose of this Chapter is to analyse the Indonesian domestic workers' perceptions of their working conditions in Saudi Arabia on the basis of published interviews of returnees. As indicated in the introductory chapter, the interviews were carried out by two separate groups. The first group consisted of Kompas reporters who interviewed and released their experiences as serial stories in Kompas between 1989 and 1993. The second group consisted of free-lance reporters who were interested in, and concerned with, Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia. Their interviews were conducted between 1990 and 1993. Both sets of interviews were later published in the form of two books. The first book, called Antara Rantai Kemiskinan dan Nasib Perempuan, which translates as Between Poverty and Fate, was edited by Utomo in 1990, and the second book, entitled TKW di Timur Tengah or Indonesian Overseas Contract Domestic Workers in the Middle East, was edited by Bethan in 1993. In all, 34 articles were included in the two books. Before these interviews were published, most of the information on domestic workers was obtained from third parties, such as the Head of the Muslim Organization who, in 1984, reported that 80 percent of the Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia were mistreated. As already noted in Chapter I, the Minister of Manpower's 1985 Decree meant that domestic workers were forbidden to talk to the press - a decree issued to protect inter-governmental relations with Saudi Arabia. With the relaxation of the decree in 1989, however, this lack of first hand information was remedied, in part, by the publication (as

serial stories in Kompas) of the first interviews with returnees about their working conditions and experiences.

Whilst access to such experiences is enlightening, there are some difficulties faced in the analysis of the published interviews. The principal difficulty is that they have to be translated into English. This often means that nuances in the original text are changed, or lost altogether, as some of the Indonesian words have no equivalents in the English language. Also, the interviews were written up in the form of a third person narrative, as well as in first person where the interviewees' actual words are quoted by the reporters/writers. The text, therefore, consists of a mixture of reporters' analysis and returnees' own words, making it difficult to separate out the reporters' perceptions from those of the domestic workers. The way in which the interviews are finally presented, for example, may be coloured by the initial reasons why the reporters decided to record the working conditions: i.e., to warn prospective workers about going to this country, to provoke a reaction by the government to the issue, to inform readers of the situation as general knowledge, and/or to show the press has a national interest in exposing humanitarian problems. Another reason could be that that, as it is more acceptable for the press to expose a humanitarian problem in a foreign country, rather than at home, they may have wanted to turn the mistreatment of Indonesian nationals into an issue which provokes feelings of national outrage. Hence, whilst the published interview picture for us the experiences of the workers, 'in their own words', we should be mindful of the fact that this is not all we are getting through the text.

With these caveats in mind, the primary purpose in studying Indonesian domestic workers' perceptions of their working conditions from published interviews is to gain some insights into their experiences in order to find out the kind of treatment they endure in private households in Saudi Arabia. Whilst acknowledging that not all domestic workers are mistreated, a point reflected in the interviews, in this study, I will concentrate on those

who have experienced poor working conditions, because their stories point to the need for governments and labour supply agencies of both countries to address this issue. Also analysed are the visual images of domestic workers portrayed in the afore-mentioned book edited by Utomo's, Antara Rantai Kemiskinan dan Nasib Perempuan. These visual images will illustrate their subordinate position and status to readers.

As I have mentioned in Chapter I, the methodology I am going to use for this Chapter is qualitative content/interpretative analysis.

The main points made in the thirty four articles and emerged in the interviews can be summarised as follows :

a. Motives

1. The initial motive to work in Saudi Arabia is to attain higher income, so as to be able to support and improve the welfare migrants' families. The second is to make the Hajj to Mecca, as the one of the Islamic pillars in Islamic faith.

b. Characteristics

1. Most of the domestic workers come from rural areas in Java, are mainly aged between 25-35 years, are primarily female and the heads of households. Also, most have only low levels of education and have never travelled further than their home town.

c. Use of remittances

1. The income of the domestic workers is mostly spent on housing, land purchase, providing daily necessities of the families, paying school fees and for starting a small business.

d. Treatment

1. Most of the prospective domestic workers are exploited by labour supply agencies and middle men before departure, while waiting for placement, as well as when returning from Saudi Arabia.
2. Nearly all of the interviewed Indonesian domestic workers have come across bad employers who have physically and/or sexually exploited them.

e. Economic factors

1. The deployment of the Indonesian contract domestic workers has contributed to Indonesia's economy; more specifically it benefits airlines, immigration offices, labour supply agencies, brokers, transportation, village development, and family.

2. The economic participation and contribution rate of the Indonesian overseas workers ranked second, after financial development assistance to Indonesia, in terms of foreign currency income in the national economy.

f. Recommendations for Government Action

1. The Ministry of Manpower should endeavour to incorporate the rights of the domestic workers in the labour legislation, regulations and policies.

From the published interviews I can observe that the unregulated and private nature of domestic work has meant that these contract female workers are placed in situations in their workplace where the potential for exploitation is great. Similarly, the lack of monitoring of the labour supply agencies, as well as the middlemen, or brokers, by the Indonesian Government, has also created a climate enabling the exploitation of the prospective overseas workers. Clearly, the poor economic condition of women overcomes their fears of the possible exploitation that they may encounter. Further, the articles also suggest that, because overseas domestic workers contribute substantially to the national economy in terms of remittances/foreign exchange, then the Government should endeavour to protect overseas workers through labour legislation, regulations and policies.

5.2 Women's Experiences of Maltreatment

We now turn to describe the representations of the women's perceptions of their working conditions in Saudi Arabia as published in the interviews. This is to illustrate my point that being a domestic worker can be a risky occupation, one which places women in a vulnerable position. Their perceptions will be analysed in terms of different mistreatment categories to bring to light the abuses faced by the women during their overseas working life and therefore the problems areas that need addressing.

5.2.1. Abuse and Physical Exploitation

It appears evident that domestic workers suffer from both physical abuse (e.g. hitting/slapping the body) and physical exploitation (in terms of physical workloads). Both result from various factors. First, the high number of tasks to be done simultaneously in one day can lead to a physical exploitation as well as punishment. For example one domestic worker, Ms. Kurtiah, states that:

On the fourth day of my stay, while I was cooking in the kitchen my mistress asked me to clean the carpet in the living room. I decided that I had to finish my cooking first, then attend to the carpet afterwards. You know what happened? She slapped me hard on the face. Later on she told her husband that I had disobeyed her. Her husband was furious and started beating and kicking me.

(Bethan 1993:50)

Employers do not only use their bare hands to punish the domestic worker, but also objects as a means of abuse. This was experienced by Ms. Fatimah who relates that:

Because my mistress said that I did not wash the clothes cleanly, she beat me on the face with a lead pipe.

(Bethan 1993:53)

Sometimes the mistress's attitude toward her domestic worker is even more cruel and rough than that of the master, as described by Ms. Fatimah :

My head was badly cut and I needed seven stitches. I was hospitalized for a week. My master had to house me at other place to avoid my mistress's tortures

(Bethan 1993:53)

This physical abuse conducted by both the mistress and master of the house indicates that gender is not the only basis for the oppression of foreign domestic worker. Whilst class came out in the interviews as a basis for such oppression, race did not. However, the racial basis of exploitation of housemaids in the Middle East does appear as an issue in the academic literature. Robinson (1990), for example, said that "(i)n the Middle

East [the housemaids] are regarded as 'other' and outside the protection afforded women of Saudi Households." Hiring women of different ethnic or racial background as the 'other', Collins (1986) and others suggest, promotes feelings of race superiority and authority toward the Indonesian domestic workers, on the part of the employers, which can lead to mistreatment. As Robinson went on to say, "(c)ultural credos about male responsibility to protect female honour are not adhered to in the case of the Indonesian domestic workers abroad, whereas they do appear to influence how female servants are treated at home". Still, whilst race is an issue here, it is also clear that gender bias is at work as well - as Robinson indicated, "(t)here have been no revelations in the press about ill treatment of male workers in the Middle East".

Physical punishment does not only come from some adults of the household, but also from the sons:

If I disobeyed the sons, they did not only hit me with their bare hands but also used lead pipes or broomsticks. Once I was shoved by the eldest son. While lying on the floor he walked all over me until I could not breathe and I passed out. I regained my consciousness after my mistress poured a bucket of cold water over my face.
(Bethan 1993:52)

Even young male children engage in beating of domestic workers. Ms. Ani states:

My employer's nine year old son beat me with a broomstick until I was badly bruised.
(Utomo 1990:24)

However, there are no accounts and explanations from the texts as to why daughters are not involved in the physical abuse. Why, then is there this difference in treatment between the sons and daughters of the household? One explanation could be that the daughters lack a position of power in the household, both in terms of gender and status within the family. The sons, on the contrary, have a degree of power because they are male (Nafia 1988; and Fernea 1985).

The number of young children in a family also contributes to the physical exploitation of domestic workers, as Ms. Kurtiah describes in the following way:

x My employers had eight children. They were extremely naughty. I had just finished cleaning the carpet and a minute later they dirtied it again while at the same time I had to prepare food. I was really confused; which work did I have to finish first?
(Bethan 1993:51)

Similarly, Ms. Nani Dahlia declares that :

There were five children in the house and the eldest was 12 years old. As soon as I had finished cleaning up the house, it got dirtied again.
(Utomo 1990:30-31)

Physical exploitation can also result from the differences in socio-cultural life and customs of a Saudi Arabian family, which can lead an extremely long hours of work each day. Ms. Nani Dahlia claims that :

I started working at five in the morning and finish at one or two in the morning. The family usually had dinner around 11 o'clock at night. After clearing out the table and washing up, I hang clothes up and finally went to bed around one or two in the morning..
(Utomo 1990:30-31)

Ms. Nani Dahlia stated that she could only wash the clothes at night because she did not have time during the day, and that she did not even have time to rest.

Likewise, Ms. Sunarsih affirmed she really had to get up very early in the morning to start her job:

I had to get up at three in the morning, imagine I just went to bed at one in the morning.
(Utomo 1990:33)

This does not only occur for one day, but throughout the weeks, months and until the end of the employment contract. Clearly, the eight hours of rest per day stipulated in the labour contract signed back in Indonesia (see Chapter III) do not appear to have been adhered to in these cases. This can result in physical injury as Ms. Nani Dahlia's experience demonstrates. She recalled falling from the second floor of the house, obviously overtired

by the work, and broke both of her arms. Further, despite being hospitalized for 10 days, her employers never visited her and failed to pay for her hospital treatment.

The structure of most of the houses in Saudi Arabia, along with special treatment of family's possessions, can also tire the domestic workers physically. As an example, Ms. Kiswat's account indicated that:

My knee almost broke. Every day I had to go up and down the stairs I don't know how many times. Cooking at the third floor, eating at the second floor, and when the employers came, I had to rush down to the first floor to open the door and bring their stuff in.

(Utomo 1990:32)

Domestic work is not only physically demanding but also requires skill and care. Large carpets are normally found in Saudi Arabian homes which require special treatment. Domestic workers are not allowed to use vacuum cleaners for fear of damaging the carpets. Instead they have to clean them manually by using special kinds of soft brushes. Equally, silk clothing also demands particular treatment. Some domestic workers claim that:

In order to wash the silk clothing we need to apply a special kind of washing soap. These soaps were very strong in a sense that the chemicals could tear and bleed your hands which gave you a burnt feeling. When washing the clothes we had to do it very gently like treating a baby.

(Utomo1990:32)

On reflecting upon such statements, we are reminded that all we read may not be 'fact', and that all the statements made by returnees, or recorded by the reporters, may include inaccuracies, whether intended or unintended. After all, how can a strong soap be used to wash such a delicate material as silk clothing? The statement appears quite contradictory to the fact that silk clothing needs a very gentle soap, so soft it could be used to bath a baby. Perhaps in this case at least, the domestic workers has either been exaggerating their working conditions in Saudi Arabia or has been misrepresented by the reporter.

Last, physical abuse can also result from misunderstandings between the employer and domestic worker, which is attributable to the latter's insufficient command of the Arabic language - a lack preventing her from fully understanding duty requests. Ultimately this would affect the work performance around the house, with unsatisfactory work perhaps leading to the employer's annoyance. To illustrate, the interviews indicated that Ms. Sukiyah, having been told by her mistress how to use an electric stove in Arabic, pretended to understand what her mistress said by nodding her head several times. Her pretence in understanding the language finally led to her being physically abused by her employer. When trying to boil some milk on the stove, suddenly the stove caught fire - the stove fused resulting in loss of electric power to the whole house. Finally when the mistress questioned her, she tried to explain what had happened in her broken Arabic which further infuriated the mistress. Two hard slaps resulted, which landed on her right and left cheeks.

5.2.2. Sexual Exploitation

Another category of mistreatment is sexual exploitation which includes sexual insinuations in attitude and behaviour as well as rape itself, usually by masters and sons of the house.

Ms. Fahma claims that she was close to being raped by her employer:

My master frequently came into my room naked when my mistress was still sleeping in their room. He was forcing himself on top of me, although he did not actually rape me.
(Bethan 1993:55)

On the other occasions the master seemed to provoke Ms. Fahma sexually by exhibiting himself to her:

When no one was around, my master frequently showed his genitals to me. usually I just screamed and ran.
(Bethan 1993:55)

Similarly, Ms. Sri Hastuti confirmed that:

Several times my master went to my room naked and tried to rape me while my mistress was sleeping in the other room.
(Utomo 1990:27)

While these cases happened when the masters were sober, others involved drugs and alcohol, as experienced by Ms. Sri Unun:

My master liked cocaine and whiskey. One night he came into my room drunk and managed to climb on top of me. Pretending to my master that I would close the window first, I managed to run away and hide in the bathroom.
(Utomo 1990:27)

In another account, the domestic worker claims to have been raped several times by her master and his sons. Ms. Ros recounts :

One night my master came into my room and forced me to have sex with him. I could not do anything, he was very strong and I was really scared of him. If I refused, he would be furious and hit me. It happened several times - he raped me and all I could do was cry.
(Bethan 1993:58)

The master of the house was not the only one who forced Ms. Ros to have sex with him, but also his teenage elder and younger sons. One night, the two teenage sons discovered that their father had sex with their maid. They blackmailed her into having sex by threatening to report Ms. Ros to the authorities for making sexual advances. Each day, during her term of employment, Ms. Ros had to perform two jobs: first, as an ordinary domestic worker, and then as their sex toy. Ms. Ros was finally sent back to Indonesia in a pregnant state.

Rape or forced sex is not the only mistreatment that domestic workers experience in Saudi Arabia. Other forms of sexual exploitation are indicated implicitly. For example, Ms. Hordiah's master requested that she perform a task which had sexual connotations. Describing this, she declares that:

Every morning before my master went to work, he asked me to help him put his socks on. After coming back from work he asked me to take them off him and wipe his feet up to his *thighs*. I cried

and implored him to spare me from doing this, but he got really angry and kicked me in the stomach.
(Bethan 1993:56)

5.3. Women's Responses to Maltreatment

How do the Indonesian domestic workers cope with physical and sexual exploitation? The interviews reveal two main types of responses, submission and resistance, which are discussed in turn.

Some domestic workers suffer mistreatment in silence until they are finally sent back home. Ms. Fatimah claims:

I had to stay in Saudi Arabia for 10 months during which time I had to endure all the exploitation. I could not contact my parents home, whenever I started writing, my mistress would instantly tear up my letter.
(Utomo 1990:22)

Some of the domestic workers who were sent back before the end of their contract were given plane tickets, but no remuneration. Ms. Nani Dahlia, who was hospitalized after falling from the second floor, received her ticket home but was left penniless. She had to rely on other people's kindness. She remembered that:

At that time I was penniless. Luckily a doctor in Jeddah gave me 200 riyals, and I got US \$ 50 from a Malaysian.
(Utomo 1990:31)

Even after their return to Indonesia, domestic workers have to cope with their experiences on their own as employers threaten them not to open their mouths to anybody about what they have endured in Saudi Arabia. Their passports and other documents are photocopied so that they can be traced easily. One domestic worker recounted that her employer even threatened to involve her parents if she unveiled her predicament, saying:

I could come to Indonesia and slit your father's throat if you reported your experiences in my country.
(Bethan 1993:52)

Another way to silence a domestic worker is evident in the case of one domestic worker who was made to succumb to her situation by the bluffing of her employer that he was a powerful policeman whose job was to catch runaway domestic workers. Naturally afraid of being arrested, the domestic worker in this case refrained from escaping.

Other domestic workers, however, try to resist abuse. One example is Ms. Sunarsih, who described her resistance to her employer's sexual advances in the following manner:

I will never forget that when my master tried to enter my room I always yelled at him. It seemed that if we showed courage and defied them, they would think twice about attacking us, but if we looked timid and scared, they would certainly be encouraged.
(Utomo 1990:23)

This suggests that she was successful in evading her employer's sexual advances by screaming and yelling at him. A similar attitude was expressed by Ms. Lilis :

During our recruitment back home we were told not to show disrespect to our employers. But if we did not defy and challenge them from the beginning, they would certainly "eat" us. They were just like wolves, once we were careless, we would be eaten.
(Utomo 1990:23)

The interviews do not provide information about other kinds of responses. Thus, in general, domestic workers are portrayed in the published interviews as passive victims of maltreatment, rather than agents in their own rights. To what extent this is an accurate picture is impossible to say. This could imply that the returnees did not perceive any other ways to escape from maltreatment. But it is also possible that the questions asked by reporters did not specifically aim at obtaining answers on how the domestic workers coped with the mistreatment but, rather, they focused their attention on the treatment the workers' received. Also, most of the articles do not discuss how the domestic workers found their way home, apart from stating that "they were sent back home".

5.4. Visual Images of Domestic Workers

One of the books included pictures of some of the interviewed domestic workers. For example, there is a picture of Ms. Kurtiah wearing a long dress and a head scarf with her eyes downcast. It looks as if the picture were taken in an immigration office because of the documents in her hand, and a small travelling bag with Arabic words on it lying beside her on the floor, suggesting she had just arrived from Saudi Arabia. This is confirmed by a caption underneath the photo which reads: "This is Ms. Kurtiah who withstood sufferings for 20 months in Saudi Arabia. Behind her long dress and a head scarf, there is a lasting hideous scar. What a long and bitter life she has endured" (Utomo 1990:110). The down cast eyes could be read as indicating the submissiveness and helplessness of Ms. Kurtiah who dares not meet the eyes of readers. They could also indicate that she was scared and lacking in self-confidence.

The other picture is of Ms. Nani Dahlia. In this picture we can see clearly that her face is swollen and a little bit disfigured, especially around her left eye and her mouth. She is assisted by another person who helps her to brush and tidy up her hair because both of her hands are bandaged. Her eyes look down, apparently in her attempt to hide her pain and suffering. The caption underneath reads:

Ms. Nani Dahlia (30) from Majalengka, West Java, could only survive two months in Riyadh. She fell from a window seven metres above the ground when hanging out clothes. The picture was taken when she had just finished having shower in a transit place in Ciracas.
(Utomo 1990:110).

The picture portrays, as did the picture of Ms. Kurtiah, the unfair treatment and a victim's status of submissiveness and helplessness as well as their lack of self confidence.

A third picture is of an anonymous woman with a swollen left eye, looking as if she is almost crying. She also does not look at the camera. The caption reads: "One of the "souvenirs" from Saudi Arabia. It is "better" than having broken arms or legs, or losing

one's life through suicide"(Utomo 1990:109). The picture implies that in being an overseas domestic worker, one has to be prepared to meet any kind of treatment, including losing one's life. The rest of the pictures show more positive impressions of domestic workers. To cite a few examples, there are pictures of domestic workers looking cheerful at a training centre at the immigration before embarking for Saudi Arabia; at Jeddah Airport when arriving in Saudi Arabia; and at the Indonesian Airport with a lot of luggage when returning from Saudi Arabia.

The pictures of the bruised and injured domestic workers contain three messages. First, the pictures act as living proof of their maltreatment in Saudi Arabia which are more convincing than their accounts. The pictures also serve to provoke an emotional response in the reader. They may spark feelings of anger against the perpetrators of maltreatment, sympathy for the victims, and sadness, frustration and helplessness in the face of injustice. Second, the pictures represent power relations: the weak against the strong; the poor economy against the rich economy; the low class against the middle and upper class; the servant against the master/mistress; and the developing country against the developed country. They suggest a world of dichotomies, of black and white. Third, the pictures attempt to paint the vulnerability of domestic workers. The down cast eyes suggest unfair treatment of the victims, their submissiveness and helplessness to the whole situation as well as their lack of confidence in the world. It paints a picture of female workers sacrificing themselves to unfair treatment in exchange for wages so that they may be able to feed their families back home. They are, therefore, symbolized as "heroines" of their family and of the sending country.

5.5 Conclusion

In conclusion, and overall, stories told by the returned overseas domestic workers in Saudi Arabia reflect the risks involved in their work and are a stark reminder of the

insufficient protection mechanism related to this work. Domestic workers all over the world are the least recognized of the labour force both in the work place, in regulations, legislation, and labour policies. Yet, as has been mentioned in an earlier chapter, their work meets strong demand in Saudi Arabia, due to the lack of a local domestic worker supply, the increasing number of Saudi women in the formal labour force requiring assistance in managing their household chores, and finally, the perceived need of some Saudi families for the status that comes with hiring servants. For the sending country, the workers' remittances are also a significant economic factor as, to reiterate, they contribute almost 25 percent of the total non-oil export of Indonesia. This importance is further reflected in the Government's statements on issues of domestic workers' working conditions which will be analysed in Chapter VI. That chapter will show, however, that economic importance does not necessarily translate into greater concern for the workers' well being.

The interviews analysed herein indicate that the returnee women are aware that working as paid domestic workers in a foreign country is hazardous, made precarious both due to the great number of socio-cultural differences between workers and employers and the lack of formal protection mechanisms which uphold their rights to, for example, safe work conditions. Some of them, it has been shown, acknowledge that this work can be open to abuse and exploitation, both physical and sexual. In order to prevent this, some of them have confronted the situation bravely from the beginning of their contract. Others, as indicated, have resigned themselves to the situation because of their fears or some other reason.

As indicated in Chapter II, feminist researchers focusing on paid domestic work have argued that the feminization of domestic work in the private sphere is undervalued because it is seen as women's natural task and therefore it is not remunerated. Where domestic work is paid, in this case, it is because it is now performed by somebody outside the family. Still, it remains feminized. Does this mean that paid domestic workers have

better positions and status because their work is monetized and valued, and because other social benefits are expected to accompany such work?. The analysis of domestic workers' interviews has shown to the contrary. Paid domestic workers are deprived of social security benefits and are subject to poor treatment. In this sense, their situation can be described as inferior to those of the unpaid domestic workers. The latter are not purely contracted as workers, since the relationship between a housewife and a husband/partner is predominantly based on affection/sexual attraction and other non-economic interests. Paid domestic workers, however, especially those from a foreign country, are often undermined because of their different race, class, and gender (Enloe 1989; Collins 1986; King 1988; Brown 1989; and Robinson 1990). Also, most of the feminist literature on paid domestic work portrays the women working as paid domestic workers as powerless and helpless. Nevertheless, the published interviews have shown us how some domestic workers have struggled to maintain their self-esteem and dignity in the face of the sexual advances of their employers.

CHAPTER VI

ANALYSIS OF INDONESIAN GOVERNMENT'S PERSPECTIVES OF DOMESTIC WORKERS' WORKING CONDITIONS IN SAUDI ARABIA

6.1. Introduction

The purpose of this Chapter is to critically analyse the Indonesian Government's perspectives of domestic workers' working conditions in Saudi Arabia on the basis of newspaper articles printed in Kompas from the period of 1984 to mid-1995. Before embarking on this analysis, it is necessary to answer some methodological questions. To begin with, why merely choose one newspaper agency for the study? The explanation is two-fold. First, it is easier to examine one newspaper for reasons of consistency in reporting style, presentation, credibility, interests and publication if the aim is to describe the patterns of change in the government's attitudes. Second, in spite of the emerging quality newspapers in Indonesia, it can be claimed that the morning newspaper Kompas still maintains its credibility as the best quality newspaper in the country. Hill (1994) found that it was Indonesia's most prestigious and largest selling daily, reaching sales of 525,000 in 1991 with 50,000 more for the Sunday edition and that it was usually regarded as the largest quality newspaper in South East Asia.

Also we need to ask why it is assumed here that newspaper articles represent the Government's perspectives? The answer lies with the fact that most of the statements made by the Government, principally in regard to socio-economic issues in the country, will be picked up by the press in the form of articles. In this, the Government is represented through comments made by the relevant ministries, such as the Ministry of Manpower and/or other high ranking officials within the ministries. These statements can be taken,

then, to be representative of the Government's viewpoints, in this case, on issues of overseas domestic workers' working conditions. The press will also report on what kinds of policies have been formulated and implemented, and it will speculate on the extent to which those policies may influence the working conditions of most of the Indonesian overseas domestic workers. Moreover, any change detected in the articles with respect to the Government's statements relating to the latter's working conditions may also indicate that there has been a change in the government's attitudes which eventually will impinge on their policy and decision making. In other words, these newspaper articles represent the official government view-points through their comments and thus attitudes on domestic workers' issues and can therefore serve as an indicator of the progress of government-policy-making.

The term of office of the Indonesian government is five years and coincides with one Five Year Development Plan, or PELITA. In other words, while the President stays on, high-ranking government officials such as ministers, will have tenure for five years, after which they can be replaced or kept on, depending on the President's decision. The period of analysis includes the Fourth PELITA (1984-1989) and the Fifth PELITA (1989-1994) as well as the beginning of the Sixth PELITA (1995). Within this period, Indonesia had three Ministers of Manpower who were all male. It will be interesting to note their views and see if there are any detectable differences in their attitude towards the domestic issues.

The analysis of the newspaper articles will be conducted by applying quantitative content analysis and qualitative content/interpretative analysis, an approach already elaborated upon in Chapter I. Since there are a large number of articles, i.e 104 in all, it is not possible to analyse all of them within the confines of this thesis. Therefore, only those articles which are considered most relevant to issues of domestic workers in Saudi Arabia will be included in the analysis, making sure that each year's coverage is represented.

6.2. Quantitative Content Analysis

In trying to gain an overview of the level of space which Kompas has given over to the newspaper coverage of domestic workers' issues over the period from 1984 to mid 1995, I have counted and tabulated the articles. The total extent of an article is derived from the multiplication of its width and length. The mean length is determined by a division of the total size of the news coverage by the total number of the articles.

According to Table 6.1., there are about 104 articles published from 1984 to mid 1995, with the total size of coverage of 18,814 cm square, and an average size of 180 cm square. The most extensive coverage was in 1984, which marked the first year in which Indonesian domestic workers were officially sent overseas as contract workers. The coverage varied in the subsequent years with none at all in 1991 and 1994. (The monthly variations in coverage for each year are found in the tables in the Appendix of this thesis.) Table 6.1., below, reveals that the years of 1989 and 1990, in particular, exhibited a growth in the newspaper coverage in regard to issues of domestic workers in Saudi Arabia because it was during this time that the interviews of returned domestic workers (which were discussed in the previous chapter) first began to be published. The total number of articles within this year presented an unimpressive figure; however, the total size of the coverage was quite outstanding, relative to other years, at 2015 and 2982 cm square. It was followed by a complete absence of news on domestic workers in 1991, presumably because the Gulf crisis obliterated other concerns in the newspaper and the government's and readers' interests were more concentrated on the latest developments in the Gulf states.

**Table 6.1.: Number of Newspaper Articles on Issues of Domestic Work
1984-1995**

YEAR	NUMBER OF ARTICLES	TOTAL SIZE OF COVERAGE IN CM2	MEAN LENGTH OF ARTICLES IN CM2
1984	21	3528	168
1985	13	1822	140
1986	9	1568	174
1987	9	1889	209
1988	4	964	241
1989	11	2015	183
1990	14	2982	213
1991	-	-	-
1992	9	1115	123
1993	9	1434	159
1994	-	-	-
1995	5	1497	299
TOTAL	104	18,814	180

Source: Compiled from Kompas, January 1984- May 1995

The frequency of the reports each year varies according to the emerging issues but there is a recognisable pattern. Generally, the frequency is highest within the month of December, which is the month of Indonesian Women's Day,

Whilst there are few photographs found in the newspaper articles relating to domestic workers, these still warrant attention. What stands out when analysing these (in relation to the Government's perspectives) is that the Minister of Manpower is, or other high-ranking officials are, the centre of attraction.

Most of the news on issues of domestic workers' working conditions is placed in the second, the sixth or the twelfth page of the 18 pages of the newspaper. Most of the news is written by reporters of Kompas. The average size of the monthly coverage, as shown in the Appendix, is less than one-tenth of a newspaper page. On rare occasions these issues made

front page news but then the articles were short compared to other topics presented in the newspaper.

6.3 Qualitative Content/Interpretative Analysis

Against the background of this quantitative content analysis, our focus now turns to the qualitative content/interpretative analysis of the news data. As pointed out in Chapter I, the qualitative content/interpretative analysis enables the researcher to learn about a) the government's perspectives of domestic workers' working conditions by interpreting its semantic macrostructures (in which the overall meaning of the article in newspaper is derived by connecting the headlines with the main body of the text and by criticising its language (i.e. critical linguistics); and b) the overall thematic analysis (overall content of the topics) of the news data.

6.3.1 Overall Thematic Analysis

The first step is to start with the thematic analysis of the articles which defines what is presented as the most important information in the text. Due to space limitations, only two articles from each year have been examined in this manner. The articles selected are those which are directly related to the working conditions of the women.

From an analysis of these, it is evident that the major themes covered by the parties involved in the domestic labour debate, such as the Government, academics, women's organisations and Muslim leaders, are as follows :

- a. The arguments for, and against, the deployment of domestic workers to Saudi Arabia.
- b. The Ministry of Manpower's plan to export (1989-1994) about 641,000 workers, 83 % of whom are women.
- c. The deplorable treatment experienced by the Indonesian domestic workers.
- d. The Government's reaction to reports of maltreatment.
- e. The need to regulate and protect the rights of domestic workers.

There are also the themes of the context of, and background to, domestic labour migration:

- a. Demographic and social background of domestic workers.
- b. The contribution of overseas domestic workers to the non-oil export revenue of Indonesia.
- c. The difficulties involved in monitoring working conditions in private household in Saudi Arabia.
- d. The effect of socio-cultural differences between Saudis and Indonesians on working conditions and practices.
- e. The isolation and restrictions on movement of domestic workers.

As the above suggests, most of the themes encompass the economic, socio-cultural background of the domestic workers, the Government's main objective in deploying these workers and the problems which arise from this type of employment. The main issue raised is the governments' difficulty in controlling and monitoring the situation of the Indonesian overseas workers in Saudi Arabia which has lead to increasing numbers of reports of maltreatment.

6.3.2 Semantic Macrostructures

The next step is to critically analyse the semantic macrostructures of the selected articles, particularly, those relating to the Government's statements, which, as stated above, will be achieved by interpreting and analysing the headlines and the main body of the article as well as by criticising its language (critical linguistics).

The following are excerpts, by year of publication, of the newstexts/articles which are critically analysed, whilst being mindful of the problems associated with analysing the language of translation. As indicated in Chapter I, there is some difficulty in analysing the language of the news in Kompas as the articles needed to be translated from Indonesian into English, for the purposes of the study. During the process, for some of the words,

expressions and phrases, there may not be a close equivalent. Therefore, there is the possibility that the translated language may lose some of its original meaning and context.

The Year 1984

Table 6.2. in the Appendix shows that there were 21 reports of the Government's view points on issues of domestic workers' working conditions during 1984 and that the majority of these occurred in May (when there were 11). The first newstext under analysis for 1984 comes from one of these May editions. It is located on the front page of the paper and is headlined as follows:

The Minister of Manpower: Statements about the poor working conditions and treatment of Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia cause a deterioration in the existing good relationship between the two countries.
(Kompas, 25 May 1984:1)

This headline refers to a statement made by the Head of Muslim Organisation after his return from Saudi Arabia where he examined the poor working conditions of Indonesian domestic workers. When one reads the whole newstext, the relationship between the headline and the main body of the article is not very clear. There are no reports on the quality of the relationship between the two countries either before or after the remarks. Also, how significant Saudi Arabia is to Indonesia is left out.

The Minister of Manpower is quoted in the article as accusing the Muslim leader of "*gegabah dan tidak bertanggungjawab serta mendiskreditkan hubungan antara Indonesia dan Saudi Arabia*", which can be translated as "gullible/careless or irresponsible and discrediting the good existing relationship between the governments of Indonesia and Saudi Arabia". The words chosen by the Minister in the news texts are harsh and blunt, clearly showing his annoyance with the Muslim leader. They clearly indicate a difference in power between the two public figures, as they establish the Minister's authority while implicitly

declaring the Muslim leader's statement to be fictitious. In the text, the Minister warns the press not to:

generalize over the working conditions of domestic workers in Saudi Arabia. Of 40,000 workers, I am positive that no more than 1000 experienced bad treatment.
(Kompas, 25 May 1984:1)

Two messages are implied in this statement. First, the issue of the domestic workers' working conditions are not seen as a problem by the Government at this point in time, and second, the informant is presented as unreliable and untrustworthy, although no evidence is provided to substantiate the government's view of the matter. Instead, the reader is requested to trust the Minister's words.

The second article I am going to examine from the year 1984 is entitled :

The Minister of Manpower: The deployment of the Indonesian women as domestic workers in Saudi Arabia is to provide employment.
(Kompas, 14 November 1984:2)

The headline reports the action taken by the Government as one of the means for solving the unemployment problems in the country. Judging from the headline, a reader could presuppose that domestic workers play a crucial role as a safety valve in relieving some of Indonesia's over-supply of unskilled labour.

In one paragraph the Minister states that:

What makes the Indonesian domestic workers more attractive than their counterparts elsewhere are their similar beliefs to those of Saudis and their sweet nature.
(Kompas, 14 November 1984:2)

This statement objectifies Indonesian women as 'sweet' and 'attractive', supposedly female traits which put women in a subordinate position especially to men. The article goes on to indicate that Indonesian women are also a source of profit for the Government of Indonesia, since they bring in more foreign currency than male workers do. In order to employ a

female Indonesian domestic worker, an employer in Saudi Arabia has to pay roughly US \$ 1,300, while for a male worker they only pay US \$ 700. This employment fund is channelled through both the labour supply agencies and the Government. How much both the labour supply agency and the government actually benefit from overseas workers requires a separate study.

In summary, in 1984 the first report relates to the head of a Muslim organization who has entered into the debate stating that eighty percent of the Indonesian domestic workers were mistreated. Whilst not shown here, his remarks set off an intense debate in the newspapers practically for almost the whole of the year 1984, involving researchers, politicians and also the Government. Instead of analysing the issue seriously, however, as both the articles chosen for analysis indicate, the Government absolved itself from responsibility and played down the negative reports, at the same time as defending its own good intentions.

The Year 1985

The newspaper coverage of the issues suggests that they were on the agenda less than during the previous year, with only 13 articles being printed (Appendix, Table 6.3.).

The first article, whose thrust is similar to that of previous year, is entitled:

The Minister of Manpower criticised the Press for publishing such untrustworthy news on the poor working conditions of the Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia.
(Kompas, 4 February 1985:12)

The Minister not only criticizes the press in this way, but also blames the media for not re-checking the main source of information and thereby releasing information which could impede the existing good relationship between the two countries. He is quoted as saying that:

usually the Press makes up stories about the working conditions of the Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia. Their fabricated stories could impinge upon the good diplomatic relationship existing between Indonesia and Saudi Arabia.
(Kompas, 4 February, 1985:12)

The exact words the Minister uses in the article are *“suasana kerja baik, hanya satu masalah saja dan ini yang paling susah, biasanya pers memuat berita yang macem-macem tentang ini”*, which is translated as “the working conditions are fine but there is only one problem, and this is the most difficult; usually the press invents stories about their working conditions”. This seems to imply that the domestic workers in Saudi Arabia do not have any problems with their working conditions. This only becomes a problem because the press makes it a problem. Thus the issues of working conditions themselves are swept under the carpet. In other words, it is the press’s fault if the good existing relationship between the two countries is impeded, because of the news about poor working conditions in Saudi Arabia.

The fact that the Government tries hard to conceal the working conditions of the domestic workers in Saudi Arabia confirms that there is a real problem, but for some reason this is not deemed to be an urgent issue. As in the newspaper article of May 1984, which was quoted earlier in this section, the Minister plays down the significance of working conditions. This time, however, he attacks the press more directly, warning them not to “just dump the news in the papers” (Indonesian: “jangan main muat saja”) or “to make a mountain out of a mole hill” (Indonesian: “jangan dibesar-besarkan”). He advises the press that

National interest should be the first priority, rather than publishing that kind of news. Before publishing news about poor working conditions of the Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia, the press should check and re-check from various sources.

(*Kompas*, 4 February 1985:12)

National interest thus appears to refer to the interest of the Government of Indonesia in Saudi Arabia, as a country able to absorb a large number of Indonesian domestic workers and as a source of much needed foreign currency. Conversely, the working conditions of its citizens do not constitute an issue of national interest. Further, in a subsequent article the Government goes as far as prohibiting its overseas workers to “tell the press about their

working experiences overseas, so as not to threaten the good relationship with Saudi Arabia” (Kompas, 10 July 1985:1).

This article is given further weight by its position on the front page, with big headlines and a photograph of the Minister of Manpower. The headline instructs prospective workers and returned workers not to reveal anything related to their working conditions in Saudi Arabia or in any other country where they work. In spite of being placed on the front page, the article is short, suggesting that it is to serve as a command rather than a subject for debate. The title of the headline refers to a newly issued Decree of Manpower concerning migrant workers, which is to be included in the employment contract signed by each prospective worker before his/her term of employment in Saudi Arabia.

According to the Minister:

The issuance of the Ministerial Decree is in order to legislate the Indonesian workers’ awareness and responsibilities as Indonesian citizens abroad, so that they behave themselves and retain the good diplomatic relationship between both countries.

(Kompas, 10 July, 1985:1)

The two issues can be seen as causally connected, in that a good diplomatic relationship between the two countries is seen as being mainly the responsibility of migrant workers. Thus, responsibility appears to cancel out their rights of freedom of speech and of fair employment contracts and protection of their well being. The article represents a turning point after the long polemic on the issue during 1984 and 1985, in that it signals the Government’s decision to act in order to curb the debate. It also displays the arrogant and authoritarian attitude of the Government in treating issues of overseas contract workers. Seemingly oblivious to its own responsibilities towards its citizens, the Government instructs them to sign an oath in the contract of employment which effectively means signing away their freedom of speech:

I will never tell the Press, both national and international, or any other unauthorized bodies about my working experience overseas (in this case Saudi Arabia), because I realise that this is a very sensitive issue which could affect the maintenance of

the diplomatic relationship between my country and the country I work in.
(Kompas, 10 July 1985:1)

This decree also indicates a realisation by the Government that there is a real problem which needs covering up.

In summary, the year 1985 is marked by an increase in the news on the subject of overseas contract workers which the Government tries to curb by introducing a ministerial decree. This puts a halt to a debate which has emerged amongst Indonesians, especially the labour organizations and human rights organizations, on the privatized nature of domestic work which excludes the workers from labour legislation, regulations and policies. By prohibiting the workers to share their experiences with society through the press, the government removes the only chance of putting pressure on the state to extend legislation.

The Year 1986

In 1986, the news on domestic workers decreases, as evidenced by the drop from 21 articles in 1984, 13 in 1985 to mere 9 in 1986 (Appendix, Table 6.4.) which suggests that the Ministerial Decree has been successful. However, the Government still sees it as necessary to justify itself, as the title of the following article indicates:

The Minister of Manpower: It is untrue that the Government does not provide legal protection for the Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia.
(Kompas 21 January 1986:2)

That they believe they provide some protection is implied in the following excerpt:

Every problem faced by the Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia should be reported first of all to the representative of her labour supply agency in the country, secondly to the local authority, lastly (if necessary) to the Indonesian Embassy.
(Kompas, 21 January 1986:2)

Although there are some labour supply agencies which have their local representatives in Saudi Arabia, most of the agencies do not have their own representatives

in the country because of the expenses involved in establishing and maintaining such a network. This is not in the interest of the labour supply agency whose main intention is to make profits. The Government assumes responsibility only in the last instance when all other avenues have been explored. From the article, it is left unclear how the Embassy would protect its own citizens and it makes it obvious that any action would be taken only reluctantly. This indicates that domestic workers are left on their own and have to solve their problems in a foreign country.

In a subsequent article, the Government reminds readers that its primary interest in domestic workers' issues is restricted to:

the deployment of the Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia in order to expand employment opportunities.
(Kompas, 10 December 1986:1)

To underline the advantages of this policy, the headline indicates the extent of the Indonesian domestic workers' contribution to the domestic economy. These advantages are mainly seen in terms of foreign currency earnings through remittances of overseas workers. This dual motive for continuing the export of labour is made clear in the main body of the article:

The deployment of the Indonesian overseas contract domestic workers has two functions, one is to obtain foreign currency and the other to utilise the available employment opportunities. Indonesia can not stop the sending of the domestic workers to Saudi Arabia, as there is no alternative domestic employment.
(Kompas, 10 December 1986:1)

Expanding employment opportunities for unskilled workers is indeed a responsibility of the Government; however, this should be accompanied by extending the legal protection and security offered in Indonesia to overseas workers for the sake of human rights and the workers' economic worth. The Government's view point now goes unchallenged because both the affected workers and the press have been effectively silenced by the 1985 Ministerial Decree.

The Year 1987

The number of articles on issues of domestic workers' working conditions in this year is similar to the previous year (Appendix, Table 6.5.). The first of the selected articles continues the previous year's statements in the following headline :

The Minister of Manpower : labour supply agencies should not involve the Indonesian Embassy on issues of domestic workers.
(Kompas,30 April 1987:2)

The main issue is the Government's demand for the labour supply agencies to increase their role in protecting the Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia, following the increase in reports/cases of maltreatment. The Minister asks the labour supply agency to:

be able to assist the domestic workers with whatever problems they face, before and after their deployment in Saudi Arabia, without involving the Indonesian Embassy.
(Kompas, 30 April 1987:2)

It clearly proposes that the Government, which is responsible for formulating labour migration policies, regulations and legislation, wash their hands of the problem once the domestic workers are sent off to Saudi Arabia. So, instead of taking the lead in forming protection mechanisms for the benefit of its workers overseas, the Government off loads this task to the labour supply agencies. This ignores the fact that the latter's main task is recruiting domestic workers, not looking after them. Even if these agencies want to protect the Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia, as private companies they are unlikely to have the power and the means. However, in another article, the Government acknowledges the problems involved in trying to protect domestic workers. It claims that:

Monitoring and managing the working conditions and the well-being of the Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia are intricate tasks; consequently the Government of Indonesia will gradually reduce the export of this kind of labour.
(Kompas, 17 January 1987:1)

Whether the Government wants to warn Saudi Arabia or the prospective workers is not clear from the article. It is possible that the Government feels reluctant to deal further with the sensitive issue of the domestic workers' working conditions which have been debated ever since the first deployment of workers. Rather than trying to deal with the issue, the Government has apparently considered replacing unskilled workers with more educated workers, as the headline of the article indicates:

The Minister of Manpower: The Government is seriously considering sending more skilled and educated workers overseas in the future.

(Kompas, 17 January 1987:1)

If this suggestion is to be taken seriously, it would indicate, first, that the Government is no longer so concerned about the problem of unskilled employment, and second, that it perceives domestic workers themselves to be responsible for the treatment they are given by their employers. In this, the Government appears to be arguing that better educated workers would also experience better treatment. What would happen to the low-educated women working as overseas domestic workers, who form the majority of overseas movement, if they were replaced by more educated ones, is not further discussed in the article.

The Year 1988

The coverage of the Government's views on issues of domestic workers and their working conditions in this year is for 1988 smaller than in the earlier years. Only four articles are printed (Appendix, Table 6.6.), one of which is entitled:

The Minister of Manpower: The Government tightens the procedure of exporting Indonesian overseas contract workers.

(Kompas, 24 September 1988:2)

The headline gives the impression that the Government presumes that the current procedure is rather 'easy-going' and that more stringent requirements need to be introduced.

According to the Minister:

The Government of Indonesia plans to restrict the expedition of its overseas workers. Only those who are skilled and qualified will be exported such as baby sitters, cooks and nurses.

(Kompas, 24 September 1988:2)

Although a similar warning was given in 1987, no further action has been taken. This suggests that the statement is merely a bluff to put pressure on the labour supply agencies to improve their recruitment procedures and, in reality, the Government still sends low educated overseas workers, which shows a significant increase each year, as has been discussed in Chapter IV.

The bad working conditions of the Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia are given more attention on 9 August, 1988, when the Ambassador himself mentions that:

Many Indonesian domestic workers undergo maltreatment and exploitation.

(Kompas, 9 August 1988:6)

In one of the paragraphs, he accuses labour supply agencies of not looking after their migrant workers once they are employed in Saudi Arabia. Their predicament is considered to be the failure of the agencies to protect them. He points out that:

abusive treatment is mainly caused by the failure of the labour supply agency to protect them.

(Kompas, 9 August 1988:6)

The Embassy, as the official representative of the Government of Indonesia, is not held responsible. Instead, a smaller institution, which has neither power nor authority, is declared to be the culprit, and probably typifies the attitude of the Indonesian elite. It also shows that the Government seems to be at pains not to implicate Saudis.

The Year 1989

1989 heralds the beginning of increasing publicity about the abusive treatment of domestic workers in Indonesia, with 11 articles printed during the year (Appendix, Table

6.7.). It emerges that the experiences they go through are as bad as those of their counterparts overseas. In spite of this, they are still considered as more fortunate than the migrant workers because they do not need to adapt to a new environment and culture. They are also seen as having more choice than the migrant domestic workers, because they can change employers if they are fed up and sick of the job and the treatment they receive. The Government reacts by again playing down the issue, as a headline in November indicates :

The Minister of Manpower: The negative impacts of the domestic work in Saudi Arabia will be minimised.
(Kompas, 15 November 1989:12)

The article is placed on the last page of the newspaper, indicating the Government's unwillingness to take up further discussion upon the matter, or maybe the paper sees it as insignificant. Evidently, the improvement of the domestic workers's working conditions remains an issue to be debated, although the Minister of Manpower claims that:

efforts to alleviate the negative effects have been properly implemented.
(Kompas, 15 November 1989:2)

No further information is found in the article explaining which measures have been taken, and the Minister sees it as unnecessary to provide any evidence. The problem escalates when eleven domestic workers commit suicide in Saudi Arabia. The gravity of this act forces the Government to react and it announces in one of the headlines:

The Minister of Manpower: The suicide of 11 Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia will be investigated.
(Kompas, 28 December 1989:2)

Before the investigation has even been started, however, the Minister has already claimed that depression and stress could possibly be the principal causes of the mass suicide, without clarifying what would have caused the depression and stress amongst the domestic workers.

It is clear that these workers regarded their conditions as unbearable and did not see any way out other than taking their own lives. This situation should become a lesson to the Government to take action to ensure the protection of their citizens.

The Government is careful not to accuse anybody or any institution. This could mean that it is afraid to point the finger at the Saudi Arabian Government which would react defensively. This is made clear in the article where the Government states that :

we have to be careful not to accuse any one in this case....the most important thing is to maintain the existing good diplomatic relationship with Saudi Arabia.
(Kompas, 28 December 1989:2)

As in earlier statements, the Government seems to give the “good relationship” with Saudi Arabia a higher priority than the duty to investigate fully the context of the mass suicide.

The Year 1990

Reportage of the maltreatment cases experienced by Indonesian domestic workers rose again in 1990 with the printing of 14 articles (Appendix, Table 6.8.). Most of the case stories were later published in a book by Kompas which was analysed in the previous chapter. The difficulty in monitoring the working conditions of Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia is acknowledged by the Minister of Manpower in an article where it states that :

the difficulty in monitoring the working conditions of the Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia is that the Government cannot interfere with local legislation and regulations.
(Kompas , 6 February 1990:2)

One solution put forward by the Minister is to establish cooperation with local legal consultancy bureau. However, this proposal is found to be expensive. Each migrant worker who seeks assistance is required to pay a large amount of money. Despite the

difficulty in controlling and monitoring the workers, the Minister is confident that the deployment of overseas workers would increase during the year:

In this Five Year Plan, the Government plans to achieve the target of 500 thousand overseas workers.
(Kompas, 6 February 1990:2)

This suggests that the Government is aware of the problem but is either incapable or unwilling to solve it. Nonetheless, the Government is aware of the economic worth of overseas workers and determined to keep increasing their deployment in each five-year-plan. After almost six years of exporting overseas workers, the Government of Indonesia seems to have just realised the causes of its monitoring and controlling difficulties, yet no tangible efforts are made even now. It is clearly unlikely that the problems would be resolved by themselves without any effort from either government.

Another article to be examined is one in which a member of Parliament requests the Indonesian Government to:

Approach the Saudi Arabian Government to solve issues of domestic workers.
(Kompas, 22 June 1990:2)

The member of Parliament accuses the labour supply agencies of having neglected Indonesian domestic workers in the Middle East, a neglect resulting in unpaid salaries, sexual and physical abuses or humiliation frequently taking place. Such neglect need to be looked into by the Government of Indonesia. He gives an example of the significance of the problem, stating that:

between 1989 and 1990 in Mecca and Jeddah alone there were 1052 cases of domestic workers' maltreatment. The cases among others were concerning unpaid salaries; exploitation of the domestic workers; rape, etc.
(Kompas, 22 June 1990:2)

While the member of the Parliament does not mention the source of his information, it is the first time that a figure has been put on the cases of abuse. If it is correct, it would indicate that around 1.45 cases per day came to light over that two year period. These cases, according to the member of the Parliament, have affected the image of Indonesian citizens in Saudi Arabia, and in order to rectify this the Government of Indonesia is requested to:

approach the Government of Saudi Arabia in order to assist in solving the issues of domestic workers. This approach is required to retain the good image of the Indonesian nation.
(Kompas, 22 June 1990:2)

In this, image seems to be the most substantial issue for the Indonesian Government rather than the plight of the domestic workers. To restore the image of Indonesian women as 'sweet' and 'nice', despite their treatment, is the main concern of the member of Parliament. If the Saudi Arabian Government finds that Indonesian domestic workers to be troublesome employees, it might look elsewhere to satisfy its demand. Thus, the Indonesian Government is asked to act on reports of maltreatment only to restore the attractiveness of its workers.

The Year 1992

As indicated earlier, there were no reports on domestic labour issues in Kompas during 1991, presumably due to the Gulf Crisis. However, in 1992, there were nine reports (Appendix, Table 6.9.) in which the Government paid more attention to the role of the labour supply agencies. Many articles for this particular year exhibit the fraudulence of labour supply agencies. These newstexts describe most of the workers as coming from poor rural areas of Java with low levels of skill and education. The eagerness and enthusiasm to work as domestic workers far away from their own country and hometown indicate the seriousness of the poverty they are in, and many workers appear to make great sacrifices to gain an employment contract.

Brokers and labour supply agencies play a significant role for the prospective migrants, yet they can also be a source of troubles. One such case is reported by a journalist in an article which is entitled :

Labour Supply Agencies/Recruiters cheated prospective domestic workers during recruitment.

(Kompas, 25 February 1992:2)

The reporter provides evidence of the fraudulence of labour supply agencies from all the letters that the paper has received. He/she finds that, normally after prospective workers have paid the recruitment fees, the agent cheats them by absconding with their money. The promised overseas job is a mere pretext to rip the money off prospective workers.

Six messages can be interpreted from this article. First, the problems face^d by overseas workers (including domestic workers) appear to ~~have started~~ even before departure. Second, the prospective overseas workers have no way to claim their money back. Third, the Government does not, or cannot, control all labour supply agencies in Indonesia, and thereby prevent malpractice. Fourth, overseas workers seem to be an easy prey for labour supply agencies since they are willing to pay any amount of money for an overseas job. Fifth, overseas work is more desirable than local work for various reasons. Sixth, overseas workers are mainly of low educational level and unskilled. They are, therefore completely dependent on brokers/middlemen to arrange overseas employment administrative procedures, a fact which is seen as further encouraging the brokers to outwit them.

To rectify this situation, the Director of Office of Overseas Employment (OOE) proposes that:

Labour Supply Agencies and Office of Overseas Employment need new management.

(Kompas, 11 September 1992:2)

The headline suggests that the Director of OOE recognises the problems encountered by both labour supply agencies and Office of Overseas Employment (OOE) during recruitment

and placement procedures. No indication is provided in the article as to how the Government would carry out this idea of "new management". Instead, the director elaborated on the overall number of overseas workers in terms of gender during the current five year plan.

In summary, cases of treacherous conduct of labour supply agencies dominate the 1992 news coverage. Apart from the legal labour supply agencies, there are also a considerable number of illegal labour supply agencies whose existence cannot be controlled or monitored. They normally smuggle in the overseas workers with fraudulent documents so that these workers face the risks of being imprisoned or deported if caught by Saudi authorities. Illegal practices, however, persist as they help to avoid bureaucratic procedures and are claimed to be substantially cheaper.





The Year 1993

The year 1993 once again saw nine articles covering domestic labour issues (Appendix , Table 6.10.) and signalled a revival of the labour force improvement argument with the Minister of Manpower's claim that:

At the beginning of January 1994 the Ministry of Manpower will revise the procedures for exporting of overseas workers.
(Kompas, 23 November 1993:12)

The revisions referred to the deployment procedures for Indonesian overseas contract workers. The issues for revisions are predeparture training and upgrading of status of workers. First, the Minister claims to have proof of the workers' inadequate skill levels from various sources, though these are not stated in the article. Second, the revision suggests that all this time prospective workers have not been given predeparture training, which is entirely incorrect. The current procedures, which are laid out in Ministerial Decree no 1305/1988, require the prospective workers to enroll in training for three months prior to departure. As indicated in Chapter III, domestic workers, for example, are trained to use modern domestic facilities such as rice cookers, washing machines, hoovers etc, and are taught some Arabic language and culture. At the end of the training they are awarded a certificate. Third, the revision aims at reducing the number of domestic workers (and other informal sector workers) in exchange for sending more of those who have worked in the formal sector instead. What would happen to workers in the informal sector is not further clarified. It could imply that in future the Government would refuse to deploy unskilled workers overseas, despite the massive unemployment imposed on this group of workers. In an earlier statement, the Minister's attitude toward domestic workers (informal sector workers) was quite defensive. He declares that:

The assumption that Indonesia could only export cheap labour was an insult to the whole nation.
(Kompas, 1 May 1993:2)

Several messages are implied by the headline. First, Indonesia does not only export cheap labour such as overseas workers, but also other skilled labour. However, this is not illustrated in the article. The Minister affirms that both skilled and unskilled labour should be considered as national assets, in particular, the overseas workers who have substantially contributed to the Indonesian economy, as quoted in one of the paragraphs :

Please do not underestimate Indonesian overseas workers. They have contributed a substantial amount of income to the country but of course not every one would be satisfied with this kind of job.

(Kompas, 1 May 1993:2)

Second, domestic workers are indeed deemed to be cheap labour, therefore it is really an insult to accuse Indonesia of exporting only such workers. Third, it proposes that Indonesia should not define overseas workers merely as cheap labour, but as national assets as well.

There was no relevant news in 1994.

The Year 1995

In the beginning of 1995, the Indonesian society was shocked, first, by the execution of a couple of Indonesian migrants in Saudi Arabia who were accused of murdering their employers. Second, some of the Indonesian domestic workers in Malaysia were trapped in a house, forced to become pregnant and to sell the babies. In this context, I analyse two of the five articles that appeared during the year (Appendix Table 6.11.). The first is entitled:

ILO Officer in Jakarta: Protection for Migrant workers is still weak

(Kompas, 10 May 1995:1)

In spite of the immense headline on the front page, the article is short, which would suggest the insignificance of the issue to the paper. Following the headline, the ILO officer discusses the need to supply legal protection to overseas workers especially to the unskilled and uneducated. The weakness of the legal protection, he claims, results from a

failure to sign the international conventions on migrant workers. The migrant workers' issue, in his opinion, is sensitive and provokes an intensive debate for both countries, especially with the increase in number of workers each year. Clearly, after almost twelve years of the official deployment of Indonesian domestic workers overseas, protection is still a dominant issue discussed at the top level of government. The minimal protection of overseas domestic workers is said to originate from their own low education, as stated by the ILO Officer in one of the paragraphs:

In general, the low education of overseas workers contributed toward the treatment they received in the workplace.
(Kompas, 10 May 1995:1).

The vulnerability of overseas workers in the workplace might indeed be compounded by their low skill and education. By definition, domestic work is unlikely to attract highly skilled persons. However, this is not the only reason why workers are so vulnerable. The way in which labour relations are structured also plays an important role. Another article published in 1995 summarises the dilemma faced in the domestic workers issue in its title :

Indonesian domestic workers -foreign currency and agony.
(Kompas, 11 January 1995:6)

This is a long article written by a well-known Indonesian researcher who appears familiar with the topic. Evidence is presented in the form of statistics. The writer seems to have shown sympathy with the Indonesian domestic workers who are exploited overseas, and admits that they have had made a significant contribution to the Indonesian economy. He agrees that:

behind the glittering foreign currency, most of the Indonesian domestic workers experienced the misconduct of their employers and the protection for this kind of job is still inadequate.
(Kompas, 11 January 1995:6)

Nevertheless, the writer does not say what sorts of legal protection the workers require in this situation. The writer perhaps assumes that readers already know the answer to this

question or believes that it is not his task to elaborate more on the subject. Instead, he/she focuses more on what he/she perceives as being the main difficulties which the domestic workers face in Saudi Arabia. He alleges that:

communication in Arabic language and cultural adjustment seemed to be the main problems faced by Indonesian domestic workers.
(Kompas, 11 January 1995:12)

In the article two examples are given to support his arguments. Communication-wise, there is one occasion when the master of the house asks his foreign domestic worker to bring him apples for his guests; not understanding what the master has requested, the worker brings a toilet brush, instead. Obviously this would cause embarrassment to the master. The other case is the different time of eating. In Saudi Arabia, dinner usually starts around eleven at night. By that time the worker has already worked for a long time. In other words, the worker does not get sufficient time to rest and sleep, because she has to get up very early and start all over again the next day. To compare, dinner in Indonesia is usually served around seven to eight at night, after which the domestic workers can join the family to watch television or attend to personal needs. The long hours of work would certainly affect a domestic worker's performance and alertness.

Communication and habits are not the only reasons why domestic workers are being exploited. However these are the most obvious aspects, especially when working in a foreign country. Even if domestic workers can speak the language and adopt to the culture adequately, it does not mean that they are not going to be manipulated. I argue that the low status of the work itself contributes to their low position and subordination in the work place. This will inevitably influence their working conditions.

In conclusion, in the beginning of the years 1984-1986, the attitudes of the Government of Indonesia towards issues of domestic workers' working conditions were arrogant, authoritative and defensive, a pattern that continues to underlie their whole approach from 1987 to 1990, and 1992 to 1993, although promises of changes were



claimed to be made in the future. It could be implied that efforts to improve the domestic workers' working conditions have been made and might be aiming at the right direction, but was not fast enough. Consequently, issues of the overseas workers' working conditions are still being debated. During the entire 12 year period under study in this thesis, it seems that the Government's concentration and attention was on how to maintain a good relationship with the Saudis, putting aside issues of domestic workers' working conditions in this country.

Instead of investigating the issues of maltreatment, the Government blamed third parties either for blowing the issue out of all proportion or for inaccuracies in reporting (the media and the Head of Muslim Organization), and for insufficient protection of the workers (the labour supply agencies).

CHAPTER VII

CONCLUSION AND POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS

The main purpose of this thesis has been to analyse the debate on female overseas domestic workers which has been waxing and waning in the Indonesian press since the year 1984, when the Indonesian women were first sent to Saudi Arabia to work in the domestic service. In reviewing the academic literature on female international migration in general, and on domestic workers specifically, it was noted that considerable gaps existed which needed to be filled if the conditions and circumstances under which women work overseas were to be better understood. Numerous researchers allude to domestic workers experiencing exploitation of various kinds during their term of employment, but there is little concrete evidence and analysis of the types and circumstances under which exploitation takes places, nor of the reasons why it occurs. This thesis has attempted to make a modest contribution to the field by examining newspaper articles published over a twelve year period in the Kompas newspaper, focusing on their representation of the Indonesian Government's perspective, and of returning domestic workers' own accounts, of working conditions in Saudi Arabia.

This final chapter offers a summary of the main findings emerging from the analysis and makes some policy recommendations.

7.1. Concluding Summary

A major argument in this thesis is that Indonesian domestic workers' working conditions overseas must be seen in the context of various, more or less inter-related policies. First, there are, within the Indonesian government's Broad Guidelines, policies on women in development (WID) which have been shown to be rather fragmented, and contradictory as to the roles, functions and rights they assign to women. Also, Indonesian policies that deal with labour issues tend to exclude overseas domestic workers on the grounds that they are part of the informal sector of the economy, hidden in the domestic

sphere, and not actually working in Indonesia. Second, there are international standards on migrant labour set by the International Labour Organisation, but it has been shown that neither the Indonesian nor the Saudi Government have signed or ratified the conventions. This clearly is an area where considerable improvement could be achieved. Third, there are labour policies pertaining to the Gulf which, similarly to Indonesian labour policies, do not cover domestic workers, and generally are not applied to non-nationals. This means that the legal system and social services in Saudi Arabia are hardly available to Indonesian domestic workers, which puts them into a precarious position. It is clear that the host country is not aiming for social and cultural integration of the overseas workers, but rather that the main objective of the Gulf State labour policies seems to be the establishment of a transient, tractable and efficient overseas contract labour.

Issues are complicated by networks of - often unequal - relationships between migrants, recruiters or labour supply agencies, governments and foreign employers. Particular attention has been paid to the role of labour supply agencies and middlemen/brokers, on which the majority of the prospective overseas workers depend to secure an employment contract. This is due to the strict policies upheld by both governments which necessitate compliance with numerous entry and selection criteria (religion, age and state of health etc.) as well as with various formal procedures. While such requirements and procedures could have been intended to protect overseas workers, they can end up achieving the opposite if they are too complicated and if they are not properly enforced and monitored. In general, the analysis in Chapter III has shown that, if the working conditions and well-being of Indonesian overseas contract domestic workers are to be improved, then more specific policies are required which need to be harmonised and structures for their implementation established. At present there are no signs of the Indonesian and the Saudi Governments collaborating to solve the problems faced by overseas migrants.

One argument which is well-rehearsed in the literature sees the characteristics of the Indonesian women who end up migrating as domestic workers as an important factor in the explanation of their experiences of exploitation and abuse. There appears to be a consensus among researchers that the desire to escape from poverty is the most important reason for the decision to migrate to Saudi Arabia. Chapter IV has demonstrated that the majority the

Indonesian women who were deployed as domestic workers to Saudi Arabia belonged to the most disadvantaged groups of female workers: many were heads of households from rural areas, and around 60 percent had only primary education or no schooling at all (Cremer, 1988). Low levels of education consequently places women in low status, informal sector work such as domestic work. While migrating to Saudi Arabia does not open up a wider range of employment opportunities, women are able to ^{earn} almost five times higher the wage there than in Indonesia for domestic work. This obviously constitutes a powerful pull factor despite the various kinds of hardship women may face in Saudi Arabia. However, while it is clear that low levels of education, combined with the pressures of poverty and unemployment at home, leaves women workers with little choice and in a relatively weak position, this should not be seen as the sole, or main, reason for their maltreatment by Saudi employers. The Indonesian Government's suggestions to this effect (see Chapter VI) tend to ignore the structural inequalities which characterise overseas migration, as well as the fact that domestic service is constructed as a feminized, low status and poorly rewarded type of work which typically puts its incumbents into a subordinate position.

In Chapters V and VI an attempt was made to trace the development of the debate on domestic workers' working conditions in the Kompas newspaper and in two collections of interviews. Chapter V analysed some of the interviews conducted by reporters with domestic workers who had returned from Saudi Arabia, selecting those which discussed maltreatment in order to gain some insight into the workers' portrayal of these types of experiences. This endeavour was complicated by the facts that interviews were written up in narrative form by reporters, and that the reader does not have access to the questions asked of the women. Indeed, the pictures of domestic workers illustrating the interviews suggest that the interviewers intended to represent the domestic workers as passive victims of abuse and as national heroines, thus missing an opportunity to challenge patriarchal constructions of women. Bearing this limitation in mind, this chapter showed not only that some domestic workers were subjected to exceedingly long working days, physical punishment, and/or sexual abuses including rape, but also that their scope for action was severely limited by the lack of legal protection, workers' organisation and representation, and even by restrictions on individual freedom of movement and other basic human rights.

Given the severity of maltreatment emerging from these records, it is worth asking what the Indonesian Government's perspectives and responses consist in. This question was explored in Chapter VI which examined twelve years of news reporting on this issue in Kompas. One of the findings is that the Indonesian Government's action, or lack of action, is partly explained by the profound implications for the national economy of the Indonesian domestic workers' exodus to Saudi Arabia. The economic benefits include a reduction of unemployment and underemployment, the alleviation of poverty, expansion of exports to this country, and, most importantly, the receipt of remittances in hard currency. Thus, the Indonesian Government appears to have assigned greater importance to maintaining good economic and diplomatic relationships with Saudi Arabia than to ensure the welfare of its citizens overseas, whereby the difficulty of achieving the latter goal, given existing legislation, must be borne in mind. For much of the period under review the Indonesian Government underplayed the problems encountered by overseas domestic workers and even repressed public debate of this matter. When pressed, it reluctantly promised action to change the conditions under which migration takes place, but little evidence is found in the new reports of any actual progress being made. Some of the Government's statements reveal a biased attitude towards domestic workers, to the extent that they are seen to bring maltreatment upon themselves because they are poorly educated, and poorly equipped to cope with a foreign culture. In other statements the underlying message is that domestic workers should put their country's development above their own needs and interests; this type of argument echoes constructions of women elsewhere as selfless wives and mothers who are either devoid of needs and interests of their own, or else expected to place them second to those of other family members.

While it is clear that patriarchal constructions of women have influenced the debate on the overseas domestic workers in various ways, it also must be recognised that the protection of overseas workers is a difficult matter not only for the Indonesian Government. It epitomises the contradictory position in which developing countries are placed within a capitalist world economy and a "universal" discourse on human rights. On one hand, developing countries, such as Indonesia, are expected to exploit their comparative advantage in cheap labour, while on the other they are also subject to human rights claims and national value systems which demand the protection of women in general, and overseas

domestic workers in our particular case. Furthermore, the predominant structure of national and international laws makes such protection across national boundaries difficult, especially if we bear in mind the structural inequality between rich and poor countries.

With these considerations in mind, in the following section I will attempt to underline some recommendations to both the Indonesian and the Saudi Governments, and to both to the Indonesian State Ministry for the Role of Women and the Ministry for Manpower, which aim to strengthen the protection of Indonesian domestic workers in Saudi Arabia. The thesis has raised some important issues that are crucial to an understanding of the significance of international migration as a process. The Indonesian Government's points of view on issues of domestic workers and their working conditions seem to be showing some changes over the past twelve years. It seems that the Government has gradually come to the view that there is a real basis for the public debate which cannot be answered by suppressing the debate, or in other words by "shooting the messenger". Various weaknesses in the migration process have been identified in Government statements which could be addressed, eg. by tightening up, and at the same time simplifying the recruitment process. The Government has also begun to (indirectly) admit that the enforcement of contracts and protection of the women workers' human rights overseas lies beyond the powers of the Government. It therefore seems that the debate on domestic workers' working conditions is now being conducted on a more realistic plane.

7.2. Policy Recommendations

As a prerequisite to the improvement of the domestic workers working conditions in the host country, it is recommended that Government of Indonesia should establish a bilateral labour cooperation/agreement with Saudi Arabian Government. Such an agreement can then be used as a legitimized and official mechanism for the establishment of a joint supporting institution of both countries. The joint institution should reside in Saudi Arabia with the functions of providing consultation and assistance to Indonesian domestic workers with regard to their working conditions and their general position in the host country. The joint institution will also act as the representative of the domestic workers when a case has to be taken to a Saudi labour court. For this to be possible, the Saudi

Government has to extend its labour legislation to overseas nationals working in domestic service occupations.

Next, both Indonesian and Saudi Arabian Governments should be persuaded to ratify the existing UN /ILO Conventions concerning migrant workers. If the two countries have signed these important provisions, they are both committed to implement them nationally and abide ^{by} ~~to~~ them internationally. Accordingly, when international standards such as UN/ILO Conventions on Migrant Workers are accepted by both countries, it becomes difficult for them to take up the position that what happens to their citizens abroad, or to foreign nationals within their own borders, is not their concern. The ratification and adoption of the international conventions and standards legitimize monitoring of the situations in which overseas workers find themselves. Existing ILO procedures for monitoring and evaluation of the implementation of conventions could be strengthened to impose sanctions for any flaws and infringements. However, in order to persuade Indonesia and Saudi Arabia to ratify existing conventions, it is necessary to increase the awareness of their populations of the necessity to do so, as well as applying international pressure. Deeply entrenched perceptions of women's "natural role", of domestic work, of "other" cultures, and of national development priorities must be challenged in this process.

It is crucial that domestic workers are regarded as workers who have the same rights as any other worker. Given the long history of discrimination against domestic workers, and their precarious position within what is generally seen as a private sphere into which governments should refrain from intervening, special regulations may be necessary to improve the position of domestic workers at home and abroad. It is recommended, therefore, that the Indonesian Government should formulate specific labour policies which are geared to the needs of the Indonesian overseas contract domestic workers, for example, under a Migrant Worker Act. Thus within Indonesia the Migrant Act can strengthen the functions of the office of Overseas Employment (AKAN) which had been established since 1983. In order to strengthen its functions and roles, this office, which presently resides in Jakarta, should have ~~its branches~~ office^s in the 27 provinces of Indonesia, so as to decentralise the roles of the AKAN office in Jakarta. The basic role of the protectors is to ensure that the licensed and official labour supply^{ier} agencies in each province should abide

by all rules and regulations laid down by the Government. Any violation of the rules should be followed up and labour supply agency in questions be fined or banned.

The Government of Saudi Arabia, in their labour policies, should also adopt a special code to protect overseas domestic workers which recognises their vulnerability.

Other measures to be taken by both countries, I suggest, should include the institution of a contract of employment which details the specific tasks and rights of the job. The job description should also specify the number of household members to be serviced, the hours of work, overtime work, wage rates, health insurance, life and accident insurance, holiday arrangements, and the like. If the domestic worker's performance is deemed unsatisfactory by the employer, this should be seen as an issue between labour supply agency, the employee and her representative organisation, the employer, as well as the relevant labour court. Similarly, if the employee is dissatisfied with her working conditions, she should be given the option of leaving the post and taking up another.

It is obviously important that the language of the contract of employment be understood in both the labour exporting country as well as the host country. The contract has to be written in a style that is clearly understood by the employee in particular. In the host country, employees should be made aware of the location of, and given free access to, local institutions such as the Indonesian Embassy, public transport, mosque/church, police station, representative of labour supplier agency, markets etc.. Domestic workers should be allowed freedom of movement in the host country and be allowed to organize themselves, such as in trade unions or other formal labour organisations. Organization is important to create a sense of solidarity among domestic workers, lobby and campaign for improvements in working conditions, upgrade skills and knowledge, and generally empower domestic workers.

The issue of physical and sexual abuse is one of the most important to tackle. Before departure, prospective workers must be thoroughly informed of the dangers inherent in domestic work as it is presently structured. They could also be trained in effective ways of responding to abuse and how to get themselves out of an abusive situation. Allegations of physical and sexual abuse should be seriously investigated and steps be taken to protect the victim from the perpetrator. It must be recognised that such abuse is often difficult to prove, especially in legal systems which silence women, and it is therefore more realistic to

focus on getting the victim out of the situation than on punishing the perpetrator, although the latter should not be completely ignored. With an effective system of reporting of abuse it would at least be possible to boycott employers who have been accused of committing abuses.

informing

While ~~increasing~~ ^{informing} prospective workers of their rights should be an important part of training, there should also be a focus on the improvement of their skills and knowledge, with the aim of lifting the status of domestic work. At present, prospective workers have to attend pre-departure training on household functions, Arabic culture and tradition, as well as Arabic language courses - although it is doubtful that much Arabic can be learned within such a short timespan by persons who have minimal schooling. Training is usually carried out by the assigned labour supply agency in its training institution for about three months. It is recommended that the training should be conducted by professional private training institutions under the authority of the Governments. This is intended to reduce the load of the work of the labour supply agency and encourage the agency to concentrate more on their recruitment, placement and other administrative work. By shifting training to private training institutions managed by professional instructors, it is expected that the quality of the Indonesian domestic workers would be improved so as to meet the demands of the labour market under increasing competition. It is also expected that with their improved skills and knowledge, cases of maltreatment will be mitigated due to lack of understanding and skills capability. The training should be conducted for six months, instead of three months, so as to provide them with ample time to learn a sufficient amount of new skills and knowledge. The Governments should determine the expenses for the training which would be the responsibility of each prospective domestic worker. Access to training could be restricted to persons who have completed junior high school, but this may defeat the other purposes of the Government, namely to make much needed jobs accessible to poor, under-educated women. Also, lengthening the training period and increasing the cost of training might discourage women from taking the formally legislated path to overseas work, and lead them into the arms of illegal recruiters. This could seriously undermine any government attempt to control the flow of migrants, and therefore such ² ~~steps~~ ⁵ need to be considered carefully.

The Government of Indonesia should review the activities of the labour supply agencies on a regular basis - and indeed the Government has already moved in this direction by increasing the conditions for licenses and restricting the number of licenses granted (Diah Widarti, personal communication, 18 March 1996). If there are any violations of the rights of the prospective domestic workers, the Government should take a decisive action against the agency in question. All of the labour supply agencies should have a representative overseas who, together with Embassy and the joint institution which should be set up by both countries, is able to monitor the working conditions of the Indonesian overseas contract domestic workers in Saudi Arabia and able to offer assistance to domestic workers. In order to facilitate the monitoring of the domestic workers' working conditions, each domestic worker is requested to report at least one a month to the nearest institution.

Finally, in view of the significant impact of the remittances on the balance of payments, and hence the development of the country, the Indonesian Government could look more carefully into effective methods of utilizing remittances from domestic workers to enhance the opportunities for education and employment, particularly of poor women. This may require a rethinking of national development objectives and of women's role in these which could be very beneficial to Indonesia's longer-term future, and it might well help to bring about a future in which Indonesian women are able to choose more freely how to make their living.

APPENDIX

Table 6.2.: Size Coverage of 1984 Newspaper Articles

MONTH	NUMBER OF ARTICLES	SIZE IN CM SQUARE	% OF THE COVERAGE	MEAN LENGTH OF ARTICLES IN CM SQUARE
January	1	80	3.7	80
February	1	96	4.4	96
March	1	116	5.3	116
April	2	580	26.8	290
May	11	1860	86.11	169
June	2	516	23.88	258
July	-	-	-	-
August	-	-	-	-
September	-	-	-	-
October	-	-	-	-
November	1	100	-	100
December	2	180	8.33	90
TOTAL	21	3528	-	168

Table 6.3.: Size Coverage of 1985 Newspaper Articles

MONTH	NUMBER OF ARTICLES	SIZE IN CM SQUARE	% OF THE COVERAGE	MEAN LENGTH OF ARTICLES IN CM SQUARE
January	2	152	7	76
February	1	136	6.3	136
March	-	-	-	-
April	1	182	8.4	182
May	1	116	5.4	116
June	-	-	-	-
July	3	496	23	165
August	1	318	14.8	318
September	1	216	10	216
October	2	142	6.5	71
November	1	64	3	64
December	-	-	-	-
TOTAL	13	1822	-	140

Table 6.4.: Size Coverage of 1986 Newspaper Articles

MONTH	NUMBER OF ARTICLES	SIZE IN CM SQUARE	% OF THE COVERAGE	MEAN LENGTH OF ARTICLES IN CM SQUARE
January	2	372	17.2	186
February	-	-	-	-
March	-	-	-	-
April	-	-	-	-
May	-	-	-	-
June	-	-	-	-
July	2	238	11	119
August	-	-	-	-
September	-	-	-	-
October	-	-	-	-
November	-	-	-	-
December	5	958	44.3	191
TOTAL	9	1568	-	174

Table 6.5.: Size Coverage of 1987 Newspaper Articles

MONTH	NUMBER OF ARTICLES	SIZE IN CM SQUARE	% OF THE COVERAGE	MEAN LENGTH OF ARTICLES IN CM SQUARE
January	1	104	4.8	104
February	2	612	28.3	306
March	-	-	-	-
April	1	104	4.8	104
May	-	-	-	-
June	1	172	8	172
July	-	-	-	-
August	-	-	-	-
September	-	-	-	-
October	1	150	7	150
November	1	112	5	112
December	2	635	29.3	317
TOTAL	9	1889	-	209

Table 6.6.: Size Coverage of 1988 Newspaper Articles

MONTH	NUMBER OF ARTICLES	SIZE IN CM SQUARE	% OF THE COVERAGE	MEAN LENGTH OF ARTICLES IN CM SQUARE
January	-	-	-	-
February	-	-	-	-
March	-	-	-	-
April	-	-	-	-
May	-	-	-	-
June	1	488	22.5	488
July	-	-	-	-
August	1	154	7	154
September	1	134	6.2	134
October	-	-	-	-
November	1	188	8.7	188
December	-	-	-	-
TOTAL	4	964	-	241

Table 6.7.: Size coverage of 1989 Newspaper Articles

MONTH	NUMBER OF ARTICLES	SIZE IN CM SQUARE	% OF THE COVERAGE	MEAN LENGTH OF ARTICLES IN CM SQUARE
January	2	472	21.9	236
February	-	-	-	-
March	2	436	20	218
April	-	-	-	-
May	1	144	6.7	144
June	-	-	-	-
July	-	-	-	-
August	-	-	-	-
September	-	-	-	-
October	1	143	5.8	143
November	2	362	16.8	181
December	3	458-	21-	152-
TOTAL	11	2015	-	183

Table 6.8.: Size Coverage of 1990 Newspaper Articles

MONTH	NUMBER OF ARTICLES	SIZE IN CM SQUARE	% OF THE COVERAGE	MEAN LENGTH OF ARTICLES IN CM SQUARE
January	3	538	25	179
February	5	920	42.5	184
March	3	586	27	195
April	2	786	36	393
May	-	-	-	-
June	1	152	7	152
July	-	-	-	-
August	-	-	-	-
September	-	-	-	-
October	-	-	-	-
November	-	-	-	-
December	-	-	-	-
TOTAL	14	2982	21	213

Table 6.9.: Size Coverage of 1992 Newspaper Articles

MONTH	NUMBER OF ARTICLES	SIZE IN CM SQUARE	% OF THE COVERAGE	MEAN LENGTH OF ARTICLES IN CM SQUARE
January	-	-	-	-
February	3	404	18.7	134
March	1	160	7.4	160
April	-	-	-	-
May	-	-	-	-
June	1	156	7.2	156
July	-	-	-	-
August	-	-	-	-
September	4	395	18.3	99
October	-	-	-	-
November	-	-	-	-
December	-	-	-	-
TOTAL	9	1115	21	123

Table 6.10.: Size Coverage of 1993 Newspaper Articles

MONTH	NUMBER OF ARTICLES	SIZE IN CM SQUARE	% OF THE COVERAGE	MEAN LENGTH OF ARTICLES IN CM SQUARE
January	-	-	-	-
February	-	-	-	-
March	-	-	-	-
April	-	-	-	-
May	1	186	8.6	186
June	-	-	-	-
July	-	-	-	-
August	2	362	16.8	181
September	-	-	-	-
October				
November	3	428	19.8	142
December	3	458	21	153
TOTAL	9	1434		159

Table 6.11.: Size Coverage of 1995 Newspaper Articles

MONTH	NUMBER OF ARTICLES	SIZE IN CM SQUARE	% OF THE COVERAGE	MEAN LENGTH OF ARTICLES IN CM SQUARE
January	2	472	21.9	236
February	-	-	-	-
March	1	398	18.4	398
April	-	-	-	-
May	2	627	29	313
June	-	-	-	-
July	-	-	-	-
August	-	-	-	-
September	-	-	-	-
October	-	-	-	-
November	-	-	-	-
December	-	-	-	-
TOTAL	5	1497		299

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Abella, Manollo. I. (1992). 'Contemporary Labour Migration from Asia: Policies and Perspectives of Sending Countries'. In Mary. M. Kritz , Lin Lean Lim and Hania Zlotnik, (Eds.). International Migration Systems: A Global Approach . Oxford, Clarendon Press.
- Appleyard, Reginald.T. (1989). 'Migration and Development: Myths and Reality'. International Migration Review, 23 (3), 486-99.
- Arnold, F., Shah, N.M. (1984). 'Asian Labour Migration to the Middle East'. International Migration Review , 28(2), 294 -318.
- Arizpe, L. (1977). 'Women in the Informal Sector: The Case of Mexico City'. Wellesley (Eds.), Committee. Women and National Development. Chicago, University of Chicago Press.
- Balasooriya, Hemachandra., Kankanambe,Vinne., & Heendiniya, Jayampathi. (1985). Dilesh Jayantha (Rev.), Sri Lanka's Migrant Workers . Colombo, Ministry of Labour.
- Barret, Hazel., & Browne, Angela. (1993). 'The Impact of Labour Saving Devices in the Lives of Rural African Women'. In Janet. H. Momsen and Vivian Kinnaird (Eds.), Different Places, Different Voices. London, Routledge.
- Basch, Linda., & Lerner, Gail. (1986). 'The Organization of Migrant Women'. Migration World, 15, (1-2), 7-19.
- Beneria, Lourdes. (1992). 'Accounting for Women's Work: The Progress of Two Decades'. World Development , 20 (11), 1547-1560.
- Beneria, Lourdes. (1982). 'Accounting for Women's Work'.In Lourdes Beneria (Ed.), Women and Development: The Sexual Division of Labour Rural Societies. New York, Praeger.
- Berger, P.,& Luckmann, T. (1976). The Social Construction of Reality. Harmondsworth, Penguin.
- Berninghausen, Jutta., & Kerstan, Birgit. (1992). Forging New Paths: Feminist Social Methodology and Rural Women in Java. London, Zed Book.
- Bethan, Ignas. (1993). TKW di Timur Tengah (Indonesian Women Domestic Workers in Middle East). Jakarta, Grafikatama Jaya.
- Birk, J.S., & Sinclair, C.A. (1989). 'The International Migration Project An Inquiry into the Middle East Labour Market'. International Migration Review, 26,;123-135.
- Boserup, Esther. (1970). Women's Role in Economic Development. London, Allen and Unwin.
- Boulding, Elise. (1981). 'Integration into What?'. In Roslyn Dauber and Melinda. L.Cain (Eds.), Women and Technological Change in Developing Countries. Boulder, Westview Press, 4-30.

*¹ Collins, Roger (1986). Black women domestics as The Other.
Johannesberg, Ravan Press.

Brydon, Lynne. , & Chant, Sylvia. (1989). 'Gender and Migration'. In Women in the Third World. London, Edward Elgar Publish Ltd.

Buvinic, Mayra. (1983). 'Women's Issues in the Third World Poverty : A Policy Analysis'. In Mayra Buvinic, Margaret A. Lycette and William Mc.Greevey (Eds.), Women and Poverty in the Third World. Baltimore, The John Hopkins University Press , 14-31.

Carey, James. W. (1988). Media, Myths and Narratives: Television and the Press. London, Sage.

Central Bureau of Statistics. (1990) Statistik Indonesia 1990 (Statistical Year Book of Indonesia). Jakarta , CBS .

Chant, Sylvia., & Radcliffe, S.A. (1992). 'Migration and Development : The Importance of Gender'. In Sylvia Chant (Ed.), Gender and Migration in Developing Countries. London, Belhaven Press, 1-205.

Charlton, Sue Ellen .(1984). Women in the Third World Development. Boulder, Colo, Westview Press.

Cock, Jacklyn. (1980). Maids and Madams. Johannesburg, Ravan Press.

*¹ *²

Cremer, Georg . (1988). 'Deployment of Indonesian Migrants in the Middle East : Present Situation and Prospects'. In Bulletin of Indonesian Economic Studies, 24 (3), 73-86.

Dauber, Roslyn., & Cain, Melinda, L. (Eds.). (1981). Women and Technological Change in Developing Countries. Boulder, Westview Press.

Dawes, Frank. (1973). Not in Front of the Servants: Domestic Service in England 1850-1939. London, Wayland Publishers.

Deere, Carmen Diane. (1983). 'The Allocation of Familial Labour and the Formation of Peasant Household Income in Peruvian Sierra'. In Mayra Buvinic, Margaret. A. Lycette, William A. Mc. Greevey (Eds.), Women and Poverty in the Third World. Baltimore, The John Hopkins University Press, 36-50.

Delphy, Christine., & Leonard, Diana. (1992). Familair Exploitation: A New Analysis of Marriage in Contemporary Societies. Cambridge, Polity Press.

Department of Manpower. (1992). Himpunan Peraturan Ketenagakerjaan (Collection of Labour Regulations). Jakarta, AKAN Office.

Dib, G. (1988). 'Laws Governing Migration in Some Arab Countries'. In R.T.Appleyard (Ed.), International Migration Today vol I: Trends and Prospects. Paris, UNESCO, University of Western Australia, 168-180.

Ecevit, Zafer. H (1983). 'International Labour Migration in the Middle East and Africa: Trends, Effects and Policies'. In B. Keely and Silvano M.Tomasi (Eds.), Global Trends in Migration. New York, Centre for Migration Studies.

Eelens, Frank., & Speckmann, J.D. (1990). 'Recruitment of Labour Migrants for the Middle East : The Sri Lankan Case'. International Migration Review , 24 , 297-321.

*²Country Report (1994), Indonesia's National Report on the implementation of the Nairobi Forward Looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women. Office of MRW, Jakarta

- Enloe, Cynthia. (1989). 'Just Like One of the Families: Domestic Servants in World Politics'. In Cynthia Enloe (Ed.), Bananas, Beaches and Bases. Berkeley, University of California.
- Elson, Diane., & Pearson, Ruth. (1981). 'The Subordination of Women and the Internationalism of Factory Production'. In Kate Young, Carol Wolkowitz and Roslyn Mc.Cullagh (Eds.), Of Marriage and the Market: Women's Subordination in International Perspective. London, CSE Books.
- Engarcia, Luisia, T., & Herrin, Alejandro, N. (1984). 'Employment Structure of Female Migrants to the Cities in the Philippines'. In Gavin.W.Jones (Ed.), Women in the Urban and Industrial Workforce: Southeast and East Asia. Australia, the Australian University Monograph, 33, 243-303.
- Epstein, T. Scarlett., & Waris, A.Rosemary. (1981). 'Married Women's Work Pattern in Rural Java'. In In the Endless Day: Some Case Material on Asian Rural Women. U.K, Penguin Press.
- Fairchild, Cissie. (1984). Domestic Enemies: Servants and their Masters in Old Regime France. London, the John Hopkins Press.
- Fernea, Elizabeth Warnoc. (1985). Women and the Family in the Middle East: New Voices of Change. USA, University of Texas Press.
- Foo, Gillian.H., & Lim, L.C. (1989). 'Poverty, Ideology and Women Export Factory Workers in South East Asia '. In Haleh Afshar and Bina Agarwal (Eds.), Women, Poverty and Ideology in Asia. Houndsmill, Macmillan, 212-3.
- Fowler, Roger. (1991). Language in the News. London, Routledge.
- Frankenberg,Ruth.,& ManiLata.(1992). 'Crosscurrents, Crossstalk: Race,"Postcoloniality" and the Politics of Location'. In Cultural Studies, 7(2), 292-310.
- Gaw, Kenneth. (1988). Superior Servants: Legendary Cantonese Amahs of the Far East. Singapore Oxford University Press.
- Gerson, Kathleen. (1985). Hard Choices: How Women Decide about Work, Career and Motherhood. Berkeley, University of California Press.
- Gilani, I.S., Khan, M.F., and Iqbal, M. (1986). 'Labour Migration from Pakistan to the Middle East and Its Impact on Domestic Economy'. In Research Project on Export of Manpower. Washington, World Bank.
- Gilani, I.S. (1983). 'Overseas Pakistanis'. Paper Presented at the Conference on Asian Labour Migration to the Middle East, Honolulu ,19-23 September.
- Glenn, Evelyn Nakano. (1992). 'From Servitude to Service Work: Historical Continuities in the Racial Division of Paid Reproductive Labour'. SIGNS, 18 (11), Autumn.
- Go, Stella.P., Postrado., Leticia.T, & Jimenez, Pilar Ramos. (1983). The Effects of International Contract Labour, (1), Manila, De La Salle University.
- Gordon, Suzanne. (1985). A Talent for Tomorrow. Johannesburg, Ravan Press.

- Gunatilleke, Godfrey (Ed.). (1986). Migration of Asian Workers to the Arab World. New York, The UN University.
- Gunatilleke, Godfrey. (1984). 'The Impact of Labour Migration on Households: A Comparative Study in Seven Asian Countries'. International Migration Review, 18 (1).
- Hall, S., Hobson, D., Lowe, A., & Willis, P. (Eds.). (1980). Culture, Media, Language. London, Hutchinson.
- Hall, Stuart., Held, David., & McGrew, Tony (Eds.). (1992). 'The Questions of Cultural Identity'. In Modernity and Its Futures. Cambridge, Polity Press, 273-280.
- Harris, Karren. (1984). Women in Domestic Service in Adelaide, S.A (1933-1947) and Changes into the Female Workforce. M.A. Dissertation, University of Adelaide.
- Hart, Andrew. (1991). Understanding the Media: A Practical Guide. London, Routledge.
- Hartley, John. (1982). Understanding News. London, Routledge.
- Heyzer, Noeleen. (1986). Working Women in South East Asia: Development, Subordination and Emancipation. Kuala Lumpur, Alden Press.
- Heyzer, Noeleen . (1989). 'Asian Women Wage Earners: Their Situation and Possibilities for Donor Intervention'. World Development , 17 (7), 1109-23.
- Heyzer, Noeleen., Nijeholt, Geertje. Lycklama., Weerakoon, Nedra. (Eds.). (1994). The Trade in Domestic Workers: Causes, Mechanisms and Consequences of International Migration. Kuala Lumpur, APDC.
- Higgs, Edward. (1986). Domestic Servants and Households in Rochdale USA (1851-1871). USA, Garland Publishing Co.
- Hill, David.T. (1994). 'The Press in New Order Indonesia'. Asia Papers (4), University of Western Australia in association with Asia Research Centre on Political and Economic Change, Murdoch University, W.A.
- Hugo, Graeme, J. (1994a). International labour Migration and the Family: Some Observation from Indonesia. A paper presented at Tokyo Symposium, 5-7 December.
- Hugo, Graeme.J. (1994b). Migration and Family . Occasional Papers series 12, UN. Vienna.
- Hugo, Graeme.J. (1993). Indonesian Labour Migration to Malaysia: Trends and Policy Implications'. In Southeast Asian Journal of Science, 21 (1), 36-70.
- Hugo, Graeme. (1992). 'Women on the Move : Changing Pattern of Population Movement of Women in Indonesia'. In Sylvia Chant (Ed.), Gender and Migration in Developing Countries. London, Belhaven Press.
- Huguet, J.W. (1989). 'International Labour Migration from the ESCAP Region'. In Reginald Appleyard (Ed.), The Impact of International Migration on Developing Countries.

Paris, Development of the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, Development Centre Seminars.

Hune, Shirley. (1991). 'Migrant Women in the Context of International Convention on the Protection of Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families'. International Migration Review , 25 (4), 800-815.

Jaquette, Jane. (1982). 'Women and Modernization Theory: A Decade of Feminist Critique'. World Politics, 34 (2), 267-284.

Jones, Gavin. W. (1992). The Role of Female Migration in Development. Revised version of paper presented at UN Expert Group Meeting on Feminization of Internal Migration, Aguascalientes, Mexico, 22-25 October.

Jones, Gavin.W. (1984). Women in the Urban and Industrial Workforce: South East and East Asia. Canberra, ANU, Development Studies Centre Monograph, 33.

Jones, Gavin.W. (1978). 'Factors Affecting Labour Force Participation of Females in Jakarta'. Kajian Ekonomi Malaysia , 13, 71-93.

Katzman, David.M. (1978). Seven Days A Week: Women and Domestic Service in Industrializing America. New York, Oxford University Press.

Keely, Charles. B., & Tran Nga, Bao. (1989). 'Remittances from Labour Migration: Evaluations, Performance and Implications'. International Migration Review 23 (3), 501-25.

King, Deborah. K. (1988). 'Multiple Jeopardy, Multiple Consciousness: The Context of a Black Feminist Ideology'. SIGNS 14 (1), 42-72.

Krantz, David. (1993). The Mobility of Domestic in 19th and Early 20th Century in Britain. London, Tavistock.

Kritz, Mary.M., Lim, L.L., & Zlotnik, Hania. (Eds.). (1992). International Migration System: A Global Approach . Oxford, Clarendon Press.

Kung, Lydia. (1983). Factory Women in Taiwan. Ann Arbor, Michigan UMI Research Press.

Lean, L.L. (1984a). 'Toward Meeting the Needs of Urban Female Factory Workers in Peninsular Malaysia'. In Gavin.W.Jones (Ed.), Women in the Urban and Industrial Workforce South East and East Asia. Canberra, Development Studies Centre Monograph. 33, 129-48.

Lean.L.L. (1984b). The Consequences of International Migration for Social Change:The Case of Malaysia'. Paper presented at the Workshop on the Consequences of International Migration, Canberra 16-19 July.

Leary, Virginia. A. (1982). International Labour Convention and National Law. The Hague, Martinus Nijhoff Publishing.

Mcquail, Denis. (1987). MassCommunicationTheory:An Introduction. London.Sage

- Mahmud, H and Osmani, S.R. (1980). 'Impact of Emigrant Workers Remittances in the Bangladesh Economy'. The Bangladesh Development Studies, 8 (3), 1-28.
- Manning, Chris., & Hardjono, Joan (Eds). (1993). 'Indonesian Assessment 1993, Labour-Sharing in the Benefits of Growth?'. In Political and Social Change Monograph, 20, Canberra, ANU, 109-123.
- Mantra, Ida.B., Kasnawi, Tahir. M., & Sukamardi. (1986). 'Mobilitas Angkatan Kerja ke Timur Tengah' (Movement of Indonesian Workers to the Middle East)'. In Graeme, J. Hugo (1994a), International Labour Migration and the Family: Some Observation from Indonesia, 35-37.
- Martin, P.L., & Richards, A. (1985). 'International Migration of Labour: Boon or Bane?'. Monthly Labour Review, (103).
- Mariyah, Chusnul. (1995). 'Gender and Patriarchy in Indonesian Politics'. In Inside Indonesia. March, 18-20.
- Mather, Celia. (1985). 'Rather than Make Trouble, It's Better to Leave: Behind the Lack of Industrial Strive in the Tangerang Region of West Java'. In Haleh Afshar (Ed.), Women, Work and Ideology in the Third World. London, Tavistock, 153-79.
- Mayra, Buvinic., Lycette, Margaret., Mc.Greevey, William (Eds.). (1983). Women and Poverty in the Third World. Baltimore, John Hopkins University Press.
- Maza, Sarah. (1983). Servants and Masters in 18th Century France. Princeton, Princeton University Press.
- Mies, Maria. (1980). 'Capitalist Development and Subsistence Reproduction: Rural Women in India'. In Bulletin of Concerned Asian Scholars, 12(1), 2-14.
- Ming Ling, L.Huan. (1984). 'East Asian Migration to the Middle East: Causes, Consequences and Considerations'. International Migration Review, 18, 19-37.
- Mirdal, G.M. (1984). 'Stress and Distress in Migration: Problems and Resources of Turkish Women in Denmark'. International Migration Review, 18(4), 984-1003.
- Moser, Caroline, O.N. (1991). 'Gender Planning in the Third World-Meeting Practical and Strategic Gender Needs'. In Rebecca Grant and Kathleen Newland (Eds.), Gender and International Relations. London, OUP, Milton Keynes.
- Moser, Caroline, O.N. (1993). Gender Planning and Development: Theory, Practice and Training. London, Routledge.
- Nahib, Toubia. (Ed.). (1988). Women of the Arab World. London, Zed Book.
- Nafziger, James.A.R., & Bartel, Barry.C. (1991). 'The Migrant Workers Conventions: Its Place in Human Rights Law'. International Migration Review, 25(3), 771-99.
- Nelson, Nici. (1981). African Women in the Development Process. Fotowa, Frank Class and Co.
- Oakley, Ann . (1974). Housewife. London, Penguin Book.

- Office of the State Minister for the Role of Women. (1994). Country Report: National Report of the Implementation of the Nairobi Forward Looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women. Jakarta, Indonesia.
- Palmer, Ingrid. (1983). 'Women's Work and Economic Change in Developing Countries. Paper presented to the 53rd ANZAAS Congress, Perth.
- Papps, Ivy. (1992). 'Women, Work and Well-Being in the Middle East: An Outline in the Relevant Literature'. Journal of Development Studies, 28 (4), 595-615.
- Pettman, Jan. (1992). Living in the Margins: Racism, Sexism and Feminism in Australia. Sydney, Allen and Unwin.
- The Philippines Non-Government Team. (1992). Kalayaan, Centre for Women's Resources, Kaibigan and the Women's Resources and Research Centre, Philippine.
- Phyllis, Palmer. (1985). Domesticity and Dirt : Housewives and Domestic Servants in the United States, 1920-1945. Philadelphia, Temple University Press.
- Pongsapich, A. (1989). 'The Case of Asian Migrants to the Gulf Region'. International Migration Review ,(13), 171-83.
- Potts, Lydia. (1990). The World Labour Market : A History of Migration. London, Zed Book.
- Potter, J., & Wetherell, M. (1987). Discourse and Social Psychology. London, Sage.
- Priyono, Edi. (1995). 'Dilema Pengiriman TKW Ke Luar Negeri (The Dilemma of Deploying Overseas Domestic Workers)'. Kompas., 11 January 1995.
- Puru Shotam, Nirmala. (1992). 'Women and Knowledge/Power: Notes on the ingaporean Dillema', in Bah Kah Choon *et al.* (Ed.), Imagining Singaporean. Singapore, Times Academic Press.
- Quibria, M.G. (1986). 'Migrant Workers and Remittances: Issues for Asian Developing Countries'. Asian Development Review , (3).
- Radcliffe, S.A. (1990). 'Ethnicity, Patriarchy and Incorporation into the Nation :Female Migrants as Domestic Servants in Peru'. In. Environment and Planning Development : Society and Space , (8), 379 -93.
- RDCMD-YTKI .(1986). The Prospects of Labour Market in Saudi Arabia for Indonesian Workers. Jakarta, Research and Documentation Centre for Manpower and Development (RDCMD-YTKI) in cooperation with National Development Planning Agency (BAPPENAS).
- Reinharz, Shulamit. (1992). Feminist Methods in Social Research. New York, Oxford University Press.

Robinson, Kay. (1990). 'Households: The Effects of Gender and Culture on Internal and International Migration of Indonesian Women'. In Gill Bottomley, Marie de Lepervanche and Jeannie Martin. (Eds.), Intersexians: Gender-Class-Culture-Ethnicity. Sydney, Allen and Unwin, 33-51.

Roeh. I. (1982). The Rhetoric of News. Bochum, Studienverlag.

Rogers, Barbara. (1980). The Domestication of Women. London, Macmillan.

Romero, Mary. (1992). Maid in the U.S.A. London, Routledge.

Roongshivin, Peerathep. (1985). 'Survey of the Situation of Thai Returned Migrant Workers for Development of a Re-Integration Policy for Sixth Five Year Plan, 1987-1991'. A paper presented at the Policy Workshop on International Migration in Asia and Pacific, Bangkok, 15-21 October.

x Russel, S.S. (1989). 'Politics and Ideology in Migration Policy Formulation: The Case of Kuwait'. International Migration Review, 20(1), 135-157.

Sakiet, B. And Keely, C.B. (1984). 'Jordanian Migrant Workers in the Arab Region: A Case Study of Consequences for Labour Supplying Countries'. In The Middle East Journal, 38 (4), 685-98.

Salaff, Janet., & Wong, Aline. (1984). 'Women's Work, Factory, Family and Social Class in Industrializing Order'. In Gavin.W.Jones (Eds.), Women in the Urban and Industrial Workforce: South East and East Asia. Canberra, Development Studies Centre Monograph, 33, 189-214.

Salt, John. (1992). 'The Future of International Labour Migration'. International Migration Review, 26, 1077-1107.

Sajogyo, Pudjiwati. (1983). Peranan Wanita dalam Perkembangan Masyarakat Desa (The Role of Women in Rural Development). Jakarta, CV Rajawali.

Schiller, Barbara, L.Martin. (1980). 'The Green Revolution in Java: Ecological, Socio-Economic and Historical Perspective'. Prisma, 18 September, 76-85.

Sassen-Koob, Saskia. (1981). 'Towards a Conceptualization of Immigrant Labour'. Social Problems, 29 (1), 65-68.

Seok, Hyun-ho., Jang, Jong-Hoe. (1984). 'A Decade of Korean Labour Migration to the Middle East: An Overview'. Korean Social Science Journal, (11), 45-56.

Serageldin, Ismail., Socknat, Jones., Birks, Stace., & Sinclair, Clive. (1983a). 'Some Issues Related to Labour Migration in the Middle East and North Africa'. The Middle East Journal, 37 (3), 571-652.

Serageldin, I., Sinclair, C.A., Socknat, J.A. (1983 b). 'Who is Migrating Where?, An Overview of International Labour Migration. In Allan Richards and Phillip. L.Martin (Eds.), Migration, Mechanization and Agriculture Labour Markets in Egypt. Cairo, the American University Press, 103-116.

- Shah, Nasra. M., Al-Qudsi, Sulayman. S., Shah, Malihdoom.A. (1991). 'Asian Migrant Workers in Kuwait'. International Migration Review , 25 (3), 464-86.
- Shah, Nasra. M.,& Al-Qudsi., Sulayman, S.(1989). 'The Changing Characteristics of Migrant Workers in Kuwait'. International Journal of Middle East Studies, 21, 3-35.
- Shadid, W.A., Spaan, E.J.A.M., & Speckmann, J.P. (1992). 'Labour Migration and the Policy of the Gulf States'. In F.Eelens.T.Schampers and J.D. Speckmann (Eds.), Labour Migration to the Middle East: From Sri Lanka to the Gulf. London, Kegan Paul, 64-80.
- Sharpe, Sue. (1984). Double Identity : The Lives of Working Mothers. Harmondsworth, Penguin-Pelican Book.
- Simplex, P.T. (1993). GBHN 1993. Jakarta, Indonesia.
- Singhanetra-Renard, Anchalee and Nitaya, Prabudha Nitisarn. (1992). 'Changing Socio-Economic Roles of Thai Women and Their Migration'. In Sylvia Chant (Ed.), Gender and Migration in Developing Countries. London, Belhaven Press.
- Singh, A.M. (1984). 'Rural to Urban Migration of Women in India: Patterns and Implications' in Fawcett, J.T., Khoo, S.E. and Smith, P.C. (Eds.), Women in the Cities of Asia : Migration and Urban Adaptation. Boulder, Westview Press, 81-107.
- Smart, J.E., & Teodosio,V.A., & Jimenez., C.J. (1985). 'Filipino Workers in the Middle East : Social Profile and Policy Implications'. International Migration Review, 223 (1), 29-41.
- Spaan, Ernst. (1994). 'Middlemen and Brokers in Javanese International Migration'. International Migration Review, 28, 93-113.
- Stahl, Charles.W and Arnold, Fred. (1986). 'Overseas Workers's Remittances in Asian Development'. International Migration Review , 20 (4), 899-925.
- Stahl, Charles. W. (1982). 'Labour Emigration and Economic Development'. International Migration Review, 16, 866-899.
- Staudt, Kathleen. (1977). 'Inequities in the Delivery of Services to a Female Farm Cleintele: Some Implications for Policy'. Discussion paper no.247, Institute of Development Studies. England, Sussex University.
- Stoler, Ann. (1977). 'Class Structure and Female Autonomy in Rural Java'. SIGNS, (3), 75-89.
- Swamy, G (1981). 'International Migrant Workers' Remittances'. Washington, D.C., the World Bank.
- Swaisland, Cecillie. (1993). Servants and Gentle Women to the Golden Land: The Emigration of Single Women from Britain to Southern Africa 1820-1939. South Africa , University of Natal Press.
- Thadani, Veena., & Michael, P.Todaro. (1984). 'Female Migration: A Conceptual Framework'. In James T. Fawcet, Siew -Ean Khoo and Peter C.Smith (Eds.), Women in the Cities of Asia: Migration and Urban Adaptation. Boulder Co, Westview Press.

- Tiano, Susan. (1987). 'Gender, Work and World Capitalism: Third World Women's Role in Development'. In B.B. Hess and M.M.Ferree (Eds.), Analyzing Gender. Newbury Park, Sage Publication.
- Tinker, Irine., Bramsen, Michelle B.O., & Buvinic, Mayra. (Eds.). (1976). Women and World Development. New York, Praeger.
- Tyner, James, A. (1994). 'The Social Construction of Gendered Migration from the Phillippines'. Asia and Pacific Migration Journal, 3 (4), 589-615.
- Utomo, Y.Priyo. (Ed.). (1990). Perjalanan Nasib TKI-TKW -Antara Rantai Kemiskinan dan Nasib Perempuan (The Path of Indonesian Overseas Workers' Destiny -Between Chains of Poverty and the Fate of Women). Jakarta, PT.Gramedia.
- Van Dijk, T.A. (1987). News as Discourse. Hillsdale, NJ.Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.
- Van Dijk,T.A. (1985). Hand Book of Discourse Analysis, (Vol.1-4). London, Academic Press.
- Walby, Sylvia. (1990). 'Paid Employment'. In Theorizing Patriarchy. London, Basil Blackwell, 25-60.
- Wearing, Betsy. (1984). The Ideology of Motherhood: A Study of Sydney Suburban Mothers. Sydney, Allen and Unwin.
- White, Benjamin. (1989). 'Java's Green Revolution in Long Term Perspective'. Prisma (48), September, 66-81.
- Widarti, Diah.(1991). Determinants of Female Labour Force Participation and Work Patterns: The Case of Jakarta. PhD. Dissertation, Flinders University, South Australia.
- Williams, Linda.B. (1990). Development, Demography, and Family Decision-Making: The Status of Women in Rural Java. Boulder, Westview Press.
- Wiyono, Nur Hadi. (1995). 'Derita TKW di Balik Aliran Devisa'(The Suffering of Indonesian Domestic Workers Overseas behind the Glittering of Foreign Exchange). Kompas, 11 January 1995.
- Women's Studies Centre. (1992). 'Trade in Domestic Helpers, Indonesia: Micro Study of East javanese Domestic Helpers'. Bandung, Padjadjaran University, Indonesia.
- Yeandle, Susan. (1984). Women's Working Lives : Patterns and Strategies. London, New York, Tavistock.
- Young, Kate., Wolkowitz, Carol., & McCullagh, Roslyn. (Eds.). (1981). Of Marriage and the Market : Women's Subordination-International Perspectives. London, CSE Book.
- Youssef, Nadia.H. (1974). 'Women and Work in Developing Societies'. Population Monograph Series, (15), Westport, Greenwood Press.
- Zlotnik, Hania. (1990). 'International Migration Policies and the Status of Female Migrant'. International Migration Review ,(24).

Zolberg, Aristide, R. (1989). 'The Next Waves: Migration Review for a Changing World'. International Migration Review , 23 , 403-427.