



PROBLEMS OF THEORY AND RESEARCH :
AN EVALUATION OF A VOCATIONAL TRAINING PROGRAMME
FOR DISABLED ADOLESCENTS

Marta Lohyn, B.A. (Hons.) (Adelaide)

awarded 23.3.90

Thesis submitted for the Degree of Master of Arts

**Department of Psychology
The University of Adelaide
Adelaide. South Australia**

March 1989

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES	v
DECLARATION	vi
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vii
ABSTRACT	viii
CHAPTER 1 : DEFINING THE CONTEXT	1
1.1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.2 THE BACKGROUND	1
1.3 THE HETA PROGRAMME	3
1.3.1 The Evaluation	5
1.3.2 Problems of Theory and Research	5
CHAPTER 2 : PROBLEMS OF THEORY AND RESEARCH	7
2.1 THE INTERRELATIONSHIP OF THEORY AND RESEARCH	7
2.1.1 Consequences of the Interrelationship of Theory and Research	8
2.1.2 The Structure of Social Science Theory	8
2.1.3 The use of Academic and Applied Theories	9
2.1.4 Summary : The Interrelationship of Theory and Research	10
2.1.5 Relevance to the HETA Evaluation	10
2.2 METHODOLOGICAL PROBLEMS IN FIELD RESEARCH	13
2.2.1 Randomization	13
2.2.2 Obstacles to Randomization in the Field	14
2.2.3 Alternatives to Randomized Designs	15
2.2.4 Threats to Validity	16
2.2.5 Quasi-Experimental Designs	17
2.2.6 Problems Particular to Evaluation Studies	18
2.2.7 Methodological Issues inherent in Field Research	20

	<u>Page</u>
CHAPTER 2 : (continued)	
2.3 THE CASE STUDY FRAMEWORK	21
2.3.1 Relevance to the HETA Programme	22
CHAPTER 3 : THE PSYCHOLOGICAL LITERATURE AND THE DISABLED	23
3.1 INTRODUCTION	23
3.2 THEORIES AND EMPIRICAL DATA ON ADJUSTMENT OF THE DISABLED	23
3.2.1 General Comment	23
3.2.2 The Maladjustment View : The Theories and their Problems	25
3.2.3 The Maladjustment View : The Studies and their Problems	29
3.2.4 Summary	40
3.2.5 The Non-Maladjustment View : The Theory and its Problems	41
3.2.6 The Non-Maladjustment View : The Studies and their Problems	46
3.2.7 Summary	53
3.3 THEORIES AND EMPIRICAL DATA ON SELF CONCEPT, VOCATIONAL MATURITY AND INDEPENDENCE SKILLS	54
3.3.1 General Comment	54
3.3.2 Self Concept	55
i) Why Self Concept?	55
ii) Self Concept	56
iii) Self Concept and the Disabled: The theory and its problems	58
iv) Self Concept and the Disabled: The studies and their problems	62
v) Summary : Self Concept	67
3.3.3 Vocational Maturity	67
i) Why Vocational Maturity?	68
ii) Vocational Maturity - Problems with the theory	69
iii) Vocational Maturity - Problems with the research	76
iv) Summary : Vocational Maturity	80

	<u>Page</u>
CHAPTER 3 : (continued)	
3.3.4 Independence Skills	81
i) Why Independence Skills?	81
ii) Summary : Independence Skills	82
3.4 SUMMARY : CHAPTER 3	82
CHAPTER 4 : PSYCHOLOGICAL LITERATURE ON GROUP THERAPY	83
4.1 THE GROUP THERAPY LITERATURE	84
4.1.1 General Comments	84
4.1.2 Group Therapy : Findings and Methodology	84
4.1.3 Group Work with the Disabled	87
4.1.4 Conditions Necessary for Change in Groups	92
4.2 SUMMARY : PSYCHOLOGICAL LITERATURE AND GROUP THERAPY	101
CHAPTER 5 : METHOD	103
5.1 DESIGN	103
5.2 THE SETTING	104
5.3 TEST MEASUREMENTS	105
5.3.1 Procedures and Purpose	105
5.3.2 Subjects	106
5.3.3 Instruments	107
5.3.4 Content Analysis	112
CHAPTER 6 : RESULTS	115
6.1 INDIVIDUAL MEASURES	115
CHAPTER 7 : RESULTS	123
7.1 CONTENT ANALYSIS	123
7.1.1 Hypothesis 3	123

	<u>Page</u>
CHAPTER 7 : (continued)	
SECTION A : The context defined by relationships between leader behaviour and participant behaviour/perception	125
SECTION B : Change scores which emerge as being significantly related to leader behaviours	131
Summary : Hypothesis 3	136
SECTION C : Further Hypotheses	138
Hypothesis 4	138
Summary : Hypothesis 4	139
Hypothesis 5	139
Summary : Hypothesis 5	140
CHAPTER 8 : DISCUSSION	142
8.1 SUMMARY OF RESULTS	142
8.2 INTERPRETATION OF RESULTS	143
8.3 PROBLEMS OF INTERPRETATION	146
8.4 LIMITATION OF THE EVALUATION	147
8.5 FINAL CONCLUSIONS	149
8.5 RECOMMENDATIONS FOR FURTHER RESEARCH	150
8.6 FINAL COMMENTS	151
APPENDICES:	
A. Description of Disabilities	154
B. Explanation of Categories	156
C. Participant Questionnaire	163
D. Data Tables	166
BIBLIOGRAPHY	175

LIST OF TABLES

		<u>Page</u>
1.	Means for Tennessee Self Concept Scale (TSCS), Career Maturity Inventory (CMI) and Adaptive Functioning Index (AFI)	117
2.	2-Way Analysis of Variance for CMI Scores	120
3.	Students t for AFI Scores (HETA Group only)	121
3(a)(i)	Significant Correlations between Leader and Participant Behaviour	126
3(a)(ii)	Significant Correlations between Participant Behaviour and Participant Change scores	128
3(a)(iii)	Leader Behaviour Correlated with Participant Perception	129
3(a)(iv)	Significant Correlations between Participant Perceptions and Change scores	130
3(b)(i)	Correlations between Leader Behaviours, Participant Behaviour and Participant Change scores	132
3(b)(ii)	Correlations between Leader Behaviour and Participant Perceptions and Change scores	133
3(c)(i)	Correlations between Participant Behaviour and Participant Perceptions	135
3(c)(ii)	Significant Correlations between Leader Behaviour and Participant Behaviours, those Behaviours and Perceptions, those Perceptions and Change scores	137

LIST OF FIGURES

FIGURE 1.	Changes Vocational Maturity for HETA and Control Group	120
FIGURE 2.	Correlating Leader Behaviour, Participant Behaviour and Participant change scores	124
FIGURE 3.	Correlating Leader Behaviour, Participant Behaviour, Participant Perception and Participant Change Scores	124

DECLARATION

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any University and to the best of my knowledge and belief, the thesis contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference is made in the text of the thesis.

Signed

Marta Lohyn

March 1989

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to thank my Supervisor, Mike Innes, of the Department of Psychology, University of Adelaide, for his help and encouragement.

My thanks also to Bob Willson of the Department of Psychology for his assistance with the computer analysis of the results.

I wish also to thank the participants in this work and my colleagues at the Regency Park Centre for their help in carrying out the study.

ABSTRACT

This thesis addresses the problems involved in the evaluation of a vocational training programme for disabled adolescents. The vocational training programme attempted to alter participants' job skills, their self concept and also their levels of vocational maturity and the evaluation tried to assess the degree to which any such changes might be related to processes of interaction within the group of participants over the course of the programme. The thesis reports the results of the evaluation and places the evaluation in the broader conceptual context of the relationship between theory, methodology and analysis in programme evaluation in naturalistic settings.