

THE AMATEUR WRITES BACK:

**NEW THEORETICAL DIRECTIONS FOR PROGRESSIVE
LEFT POLITICS AND SOCIAL POLICY**

Ian Goodwin-Smith

**Thesis submitted for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
Discipline of Politics
The University of Adelaide
May 2008**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract	ii
Declaration	iii
Acknowledgements and Dedication	iv
1/ INTRODUCTION	1
2/ THE POSTMODERN PROBLEM: INERTIA AND THE LEFT’S END OF HISTORY	9
2.1/ An End of History	
2.2/ Embracing the Elephant	
2.3/ Weak Thought	
2.4/ Smaller gods	
2.5/ Contingency and Purposeful Artefacts	
2.6/ Conclusion: Resurrecting Softness	
3/ QUESTIONING EXPERTS: UNIMAGINING A RATIONAL WORLD	21
3.1/ Science’s Reductive Tendencies: Problematic Epistemic Commitments	
3.2/ The Specialist, the Expert and the Problem	
3.3/ Discursive and Exclusive Boundaries – the Expert as Professional	
3.4/ From Discourse and Knowledge to Power	
3.5/ The Question of Identity	
3.5.1/ National Identity	
3.5.2/ Discourse, Culture and Hegemony	
3.5.3/ Orientalism	
3.5.4/ The Constitutive Outside: the Presence of the Other in the Construction of the Self	
3.6/ Alienation and Domination	
3.7/ Legitimacy/Illegitimacy	
3.8/ Conclusion: Untenable Pretensions	
4/ POSTCOLONIAL THEORY: STRENGTHENING AGENCY	66
4.1/ A Different Post and the Left’s Undead	
4.2/ But what is Postcolonial Theory?	
4.2.1/ The Subject of Culture	
4.2.2/ Culture and Imperialism	
4.2.3/ Globalisation and Transformations	
4.3/ The Contortionist	
4.4/ Overlapping Histories, Intertwined Territories	
4.5/ The Category of Humanity (Ogres are Like Onions)	
4.6/ Conclusion: All You Need is Love	
5/ WORLDLINESS AND AMATEURISM	99
5.1/ Overriding Petty Fiefdoms: Intellectuals, Worldliness and Affiliation	
5.2/ Exile	
5.3/ Amateurism	
5.4/ Overcoming Humanism: The Amateur Writes Back	
5.5/ Conclusion: Emancipation and Engagement	
6/ HERESY AT WORK: AMATEURISM AND BIRTH	132
6.1/ Remembering and Reminders	
6.2/ A Brief Introduction to the Sociology of Health	
6.2.1/ An Article of Faith	
6.2.2/ Critiquing the Remove	
6.2.3/ The Social Construction of Illness	
6.3/ Heresy and Birth: The Amateur Writes Back	
6.3.1/ Blood Lust: Ambivalence, Control and Desire	
6.3.2/ Technocracy, Rituals and Obstetrics	
6.3.3/ The Cascade of Intervention	
6.3.4/ Caesar Über Alles	
6.3.5/ VBAC	
6.3.6/ Writing Back	
6.4/ Conclusion: May the Force be with You	
7/ THINKING AT THE LIMIT: THE AMATEUR AND THE SOCIAL DEMOCRATIC TRADITION	193
7.1/ The Economy is a Worldly Text, Stupid	
7.2/ A Beast which Must be Courted	
7.3/ Conclusion: Back to the Start	
8/ CONCLUSION	209
BIBLIOGRAPHY	216

ABSTRACT

This work develops an opportunity for transgressive resistance to discursively formed structures of material and theoretical power and closure, based on a methodology of amateurism. The concept of amateurism draws heavily on the writing of Edward Said. This work synthesises Said with a broader corpus of postcolonial theory, following a theoretically postcolonial trajectory which applies the lessons from that referent to an engagement with traditional theoretical and cultural closure. The central thesis of the engagement follows a critique of strong ontology and vertical epistemology, or of expertise. Through an examination of health policy around birth, and sociological approaches to health, that critique is deployed to invigorate a new critical direction for the Left with a focus on subjectivity, social policy, social democracy and substantive citizenship.

DECLARATION

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university. To the best of my knowledge and belief, the thesis contains no material previously published except where due reference has been made in the text of the thesis.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University library, being made available for photocopying and loan.

Ian Goodwin-Smith.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS AND DEDICATION

My thanks to Pal Ahluwalia and Greg McCarthy for supervision and editing, and to Benito Cao for editing and support. In this, I must note a particular gratitude to Pal for his inspiration, help and faith. An enormous gratitude to David Evans, Bek Byrne, Rahul Trikha and the general population of Digital Monkey, without whose friendship, support and sheer largess this project could not have been undertaken.

This work is, in part, a critique of the profession of obstetrics. In that context, it would be obscene of me not to thank the wonderful obstetric staff and the equally wonderful midwives who kept my wife and baby alive through some very difficult months during the period of this dissertation's development - thankyou. And for so much love and support during that time, and during all times, my thanks to our friends, and to our family: my mum, my dad, my sister Sally, Marie and Crawford, my sisters and brothers in-law - Gareth, Kirsty, Jordan, Madeleine and Jason - and our grandparents, along with a growing collection of nieces and nephews. Thanks also to Catherine for friendship and support.

Katie - my wife - I love you. And my children - Tilly, Jude, Gabriel, and Jeremiah: I love you kids too. My beautiful family - for you there is a depth of gratitude, of love, and of humility, which is too much to express. My thanks to you for everything. And I mean *everything*. It is from you that everything springs, and it is because of you that anything is possible. Everything I do comes from you. And so this work, and everything I do, is dedicated to you.