

PATTERNS IN CORRELATION MATRICES ARISING
IN WINE-TASTING AND OTHER EXPERIMENTS

by

Christopher J. Brien
B. Sc. Agric. (Sydney)

Thesis submitted for the Degree of Master
of Agricultural Science

in The University of Adelaide,
Biometry Section.

May, 1980

CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
SUMMARY	i
SIGNED STATEMENT	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iv
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION	4
CHAPTER 2: EXPERIMENTS AND DATA	8
2.1 Five-year viticultural field experiment	8
2.2 Single-evaluation wine experiment	9
2.3 Duplicate-evaluation wine experiments	10
CHAPTER 3: LARGE-SAMPLE JOINT DISTRIBUTION OF FISHER'S z-TRANSFORMS OF ELEMENTS OF CORRELATION MATRICES	14
3.1 Joint distribution of the z-transforms of the elements of a correlation matrix	14
3.2 Some particular joint distributions	20
3.2.1 Independence	20
3.2.2 Equal correlation	20
3.2.3 A more general equal correlation pattern	22
CHAPTER 4: PATTERNS IN CORRELATION MATRICES	31
4.1 An analysis for the equally correlated set	31
4.1.1 Proof of theorem 4.1 by the algebraic technique	35
4.1.2 Proof of theorem 4.1 via the analysis of variance technique	42
4.1.3 Analysis of variance for the equally- correlated set	47
4.2 Analysis for variables cross-indexed by two factors	51
4.2.1 Proof of theorem 4.2.1 via the analysis of variance technique	58
4.2.2 Proof of theorem 4.2.2 via the analysis of variance technique	65
4.2.3 Proof of theorem 4.2.3 via the analysis of variance technique	66
4.2.4 Proof of theorems 4.2.1 - 4.2.3 via the algebraic technique	72
4.2.5 Analysis of variance for variables cross-indexed by two factors	77

	<u>Page</u>
CHAPTER 5: RESULTS AND INTERPRETATION OF THE ANALYSIS OF z-TRANSFORMS	83
5.1 Five-year viticultural field experiment	83
5.2 Single-evaluation wine experiment	85
5.3 Duplicate-evaluation wine experiments	86
5.3.1 Analysis of full sets of tasters	89
5.3.2 Analysis of subsets of the tasters	92
5.3.3 Discussion	107
5.4 Body composition of calves	109
5.5 Primary ability tests on two occasions	113
5.6 Conclusions	116
CHAPTER 6: COMPARISON WITH OTHER TESTS FOR PATTERNS IN CORRELATION MATRICES	117
6.1 Other tests for patterns in correlation matrices	117
6.2 Equally correlated variables	120
6.3 More general equal correlation patterns	121
6.4 Discussion	123
CHAPTER 7: DISCUSSION	125
7.1 Analysis of patterns in correlation matrices	125
7.2 Wine-tasting experiments	128
APPENDIX A: ORIGINAL SCORES FOR FOUR DUPLICATE-EVALUATION WINE EXPERIMENTS	134
APPENDIX B: LISTINGS OF GENSTAT INSTRUCTIONS FOR THE ANALYSIS OF THE z-TRANSFORMS OF THE ELEMENTS OF CORRELATION MATRICES	140
APPENDIX C: CORRELATION AND z-TRANSFORM MATRICES FOR THE FIVE-YEAR VITICULTURAL FIELD EXPERIMENT	151
APPENDIX D: CORRELATION AND z-TRANSFORM MATRICES FOR THE SINGLE-EVALUATION WINE EXPERIMENT INVOLVING CABERNET AND RIESLING WINES	153
APPENDIX E1: CORRELATION AND z-TRANSFORM MATRICES, CALCULATED FROM THE ORIGINAL SCORES, FOR THE FOUR DUPLICATE-EVALUATION WINE EXPERIMENTS	155
APPENDIX E2: CORRELATION AND z-TRANSFORM MATRICES, CALCULATED FROM RESIDUALS, FOR THE FOUR DUPLICATE-EVALUATION WINE EXPERIMENTS	166
APPENDIX F: ANALYSIS OF VARIANCE TABLES FROM THE ANALYSIS OF THE z-TRANSFORMS FROM THE FOUR DUPLICATE-EVALUATION WINE EXPERIMENTS	177

	<u>Page</u>
APPENDIX G: CORRELATION AND z-TRANSFORM MATRICES FOR BODY COMPOSITION MEASUREMENTS ON CALVES	182
APPENDIX H: CORRELATION AND z-TRANSFORM MATRICES FOR THURSTONE PRIMARY ABILITY TESTS ADMINISTERED ON TWO OCCASIONS	185
BIBLIOGRAPHY	188

SUMMARY

There are two distinct areas of research on which the work in this thesis impinges. They are methods for the analysis of patterns in correlation matrices and the analysis of taster performance in wine-tasting experiments in which the wines are scored.

For the analysis of patterns in correlation matrices, least squares procedures are developed to examine patterns under certain equal correlation hypotheses. The procedures are applied to the z-transforms of the elements of correlation matrices that can be based on either a single group of variables, or variables that can be cross-indexed by two factors such as the multitrait-multimethod matrices given by Campbell and Fiske (1959). The procedures are of the analysis of variance type, being investigative in the sense that, in the event that the correlation matrix is judged to depart from the hypothesised pattern, alternative models to be pursued further are indicated. The associated statistics are calculated directly from closed-form expressions, rather than requiring the iterative solution of some estimation function as is the case with some alternative methods.

The procedures are used to analyse the data from a number of wine-tasting and other experiments. The results obtained are shown to be similar, in many instances, to those obtained with maximum likelihood procedures applied to variance-covariance matrices; in other instances, large differences occur between the methods. The test for the hypothesis of equal correlation between all variables developed here is also shown to give similar answers to Lawley's (1963) test for the same hypothesis, in a number of cases.

For the analysis of taster performance in wine-tasting experiments in which the wines are scored, the method of examining patterns in correlation matrices can be applied to multitaster and multitaster-multisession

correlation matrices. Certain conditions to be fulfilled by multitaster-multisession matrices are specified; the extent to which they are met in a particular experiment can be ascertained from the results of these analyses. The data from several wine-tasting experiments are analysed and the results provide further substantive evidence of the lack of agreement and differences in reliability that can occur between tasters in such experiments.

As the technique is applied to data from a single experiment, it can be used, particularly when session replicates are included, to select tasters on the basis of their performance in the experiment under consideration - a highly desirable approach. Four duplicate-evaluation wine-tasting experiments, that were aimed at determining the effect of several treatments on wine quality, fit into this category and so are analysed in more detail. A group of less heterogeneous tasters is selected, where possible, for each of the experiments using the results of the analysis of the multitaster-multisession correlation matrices.

Compared with other techniques for selecting tasters on the basis of their results in a wine-tasting experiment, the analysis of multitaster-multisession correlation matrices has the advantages that both reliability and agreement are measured and that the measures are correlation coefficients.

However, even the subsets of selected tasters do not behave in a manner that would justify a single analysis for mean differences for each subset. Because this is likely to be a common phenomenon, it is recommended that wine-tasting experiments be designed to include session replicates and the scores of each taster be analysed for mean differences separately. The results of the analysis of the multitaster-multisession matrix can then be used to determine the confidence to be attached to the results of individual tasters in drawing inferences from the experiment.

SIGNED STATEMENT

This thesis contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, the thesis contains no material previously published or written by another person, except when due reference is made in the text of the thesis.

C.J. Brien

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

It is with much appreciation that I acknowledge the guidance and assistance that I received from Professor A.T. James and Drs O. Mayo and W.N. Venables. In particular, Professor A.T. James suggested the approach taken in Chapters 3 and 4.

I am grateful to Dr P. May for providing me with the original problem, for encouraging me to undertake a higher degree and for his indulgence while I carried out the work.

The work was begun while I was employed by the CSIRO Division of Horticultural Research and completed after I moved to Roseworthy Agricultural College. I thank these institutions for their support.

I am greatly indebted to Mrs H.M. Simpson who performed the demanding task of typing the majority of this manuscript. I also wish to thank Mrs B. Adlard who typed appendices D-H.

Messrs D. Armstrong, J. Brown, A. Hoey, A. Hood, P. John, G. Kerridge, N. Lindsay, R. Moody, G. Prass, M. Tummel, B. Tyson, C. Weeks and P. Weste played a vital role in the work presented in this thesis. They were the tasters in the four wine-tasting experiments described in section 2.3.

Finally, I thank Ellen, Jamie and Melissa who gave up more than they might have so that I could do this work.