

CDs containing Music Recordings are included in  
volume 1 of the print copy held in the Elder Music  
Library

---

# Notated and Implied Piano Pedalling

c.1780–1830

---

Julie Haskell

Volume Two

Portfolio of Recorded Performances and Exegesis  
submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy

....

Elder Conservatorium of Music  
Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences  
The University of Adelaide  
January 2011

---

## Table of Contents

### Volume Two: Exegesis

Table of Contents .....	ii
Volume One: Recordings.....	iv
Pianos used in the Recordings .....	v
CD 1 .....	vi
CD 2 .....	vii
CD 3 .....	viii
CD 4 .....	ix
CD 5 .....	ix
CD 6 .....	x
Supplementary CD .....	xi
Abstract.....	xiii
Declaration .....	xiv
Acknowledgements.....	xv
Editorial Notes .....	xvii
Introduction .....	1
Chapter One Early Pedalling: C.P.E. Bach and Mozart .....	6
Chapter Two The English and French Schools of the Eighteenth Century: Clementi, Dussek, Field and Jadin .....	21
Chapter Three The English and French Influences on the Classical Viennese School: Haydn and Beethoven .....	45

Chapter Four	Vienna, 1810–1828: Beethoven, Voříšek and Schubert .....	66
Chapter Five	The Nocturne Style: Field, Chopin, Liszt and Mendelssohn .....	93
Chapter Six	The Effect of the Classical Style on Early Romantic Pedalling:	
	Chopin and Schumann .....	108
Conclusion	.....	119
Appendices	.....	123
	Appendix A: Details of the Pianos used in the Recordings .....	124
	Appendix B: Pedal Methods .....	131
	Appendix C: Other Pedals used in the Recorded Performances .....	132
List of Sources	.....	133
A: Bibliography	.....	134
B: Discography	.....	145
C: Filmography	.....	148
D: Musical Scores	.....	148

---

Volume One: Recordings

---

---

## Pianos Used in the Recordings

Pianos from the collection of Cornell University, (Ithaca, NY, USA).

Made available through the generosity of Emeritus Professor Malcolm Bilson.

- Copy of a 1784 Johann Andreas Stein piano (Augsburg).  
Built by Thomas McCobb (USA) in 1972.
- Copy of a c.1800 Anton Walter und Sohn piano (Vienna).  
Built by Paul McNulty (Divisov, Czech Republic) in 2002.
- Copy of an 1824 Conrad Graf piano (Vienna).  
Built by Rodney Regier (Freeport, Maine, USA) in 2000.
- Original 1827 Broadwood (London).  
Restored by Edwin Beunk (Eschede, The Netherlands).

From the private collection of Emeritus Professor Malcolm Bilson (Ithaca, NY, USA).

- Copy of a 1799 Longman, Clementi & C<sup>o</sup> piano (London).  
Built by Chris Maene (Ruisselede, Belgium) in 2003.

Piano owned by the Melbourne Conservatorium, University of Melbourne (Australia).

- Copy of a Louis Dulcken piano (Munich) c.1800.  
Built by Richard Schaumlöffel (Adelaide, Australia) in 1983.

Piano owned by the Elder Conservatorium, University of Adelaide (Australia).

- Copy of an Anton Walter piano (Vienna) c.1780.  
Built by Richard Schaumlöffel (Adelaide, Australia) in 1987.

---

CD One

Carl Philipp Emanuel Bach (1714–1788)

		[Stein replica]	
Track 1:	Fantasia in F, Wq. 59, no. 5 (1782)		5.02
Track 2:	Sonata in E minor, Wq. 59, no. 1 (1784)		8.15
	<i>Presto — Adagio — Andantino</i>		

Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart (1756–1791)

		[Stein replica]	
Track 3:	Fantasia in D minor, K 397 (c.1782)		5.21
	Sonata in G for piano and violin, K 379 (1781)	[Dulcken replica]	
Track 4:	<i>Adagio - Allegro</i>		12.06
Track 5:	<i>Thema: Andante cantabile</i>		9.50
	(with Rachael Beesley, violin)		

Muzio Clementi (1752–1832)

	Sonata in F sharp minor, Op. 25, no. 5 (c.1790)	[Clementi replica]	
Track 6:	<i>Piuttosto allegro con espressione</i>		6.04
Track 7:	<i>Lento e patetico</i>		3.47
Track 8:	<i>Presto</i>		4.45

Hyacinthe Jadin (1776–1800)

	Sonata in C sharp minor, Op. 4, no. 3 (1797)	[Clementi replica]	
Track 9:	<i>Allegro moderato</i>		4.32
Track 10:	<i>Adagio</i>		5.32
Track 11:	<i>Rondeau allegretto</i>		3.13

Total Time: 68.24

---

## CD Two

### John Field (1782–1837)

	Sonata in A, Op. 1, no. 2 (1801)	[Clementi replica]
Track 1:	<i>Allegro moderato</i>	7.04
Track 2:	<i>Allegro vivace</i>	4.44

### Jan Ladislav Dussek (1760–1812)

	Sonata in F sharp minor, Op. 61 (1806)	[Clementi replica]
	<i>Élégie harmonique sur la mort de son Altesse Royale le Prince Louis Ferdinand de Prusse</i>	
Track 3:	<i>Lento patetico – Tempo agitato</i>	11.55
Track 4:	<i>Tempo vivace e con fuoco quasi presto</i>	8.06

### Joseph Haydn (1732–1809)

	Sonata in C, Hob. XVI:50 (1794–95)	[Clementi replica]
Track 5:	<i>Allegro</i>	8.46
Track 6:	<i>Adagio</i>	6.02
Track 7:	<i>Allegro molto</i>	2.52

### Ludwig van Beethoven (1770–1827)

		[Walter und Sohn
	Grande Sonate <i>Pathétique</i> in C minor, Op. 13 (1798–89)	replica]
Track 8:	<i>Grave – Allegro di molto e con brio</i>	10.10
Track 9:	<i>Adagio cantabile</i>	4.41
Track 10:	Rondo: <i>Allegro</i>	4.58

Total Time: 69.17



---

CD Three

Ludwig van Beethoven

Sonata *quasi una Fantasia* in C sharp minor, Op. 27, no. 2 [Walter und  
'Moonlight' (1801) Sohn replica]

- Track 1: *Adagio sostenuto* 5.10  
Track 2: *Allegretto* 2.14  
Track 3: *Presto agitato* 7.50

Track 4: Klavierstück *Für Elise*, WoO 59 (1810–22) [Graf replica]  
3.10

Jan Václav Voříšek (1791–1825)

Impromptus, Op. 7 (c.1820) [Graf replica]

- Track 5: No. 1 in C – *Allegro* 4.36  
Track 6: No. 2 in G – *Allegro moderato* 4.43  
Track 7: No. 3 in D – *Allegretto* 5.10  
Track 8: No. 4 in A – *Allegretto* 7.06  
Track 9: No. 5 in E – *Allegretto* 10.05  
Track 10: No. 6 in B – *Allegretto* 7.25

Total Time: 57.28

---

## CD Four

Franz Schubert (1797–1828)

Moments musicaux, D 783, Book 1 (1820–1828)

[Graf replica]

Track 1:	No. 1 in C – <i>Moderato</i>	5.34
Track 2:	No. 2 in A flat – <i>Andantino</i>	5.38
Track 3:	No. 3 in F minor – <i>Allegretto moderato</i>	1.50

Ludwig van Beethoven

Sonata in A flat, Op. 110 (1821)

[Graf replica]

Track 4:	<i>Moderato cantabile molto espressivo</i>	6.28
Track 5:	<i>Allegro molto</i>	2.21
Track 6:	<i>Adagio, ma non troppo – Arioso dolente</i>	10.38
	<i>Fuga: Allegro, ma non troppo – L'istesso tempo di Arioso – L'inversione della Fuga</i>	

Total Time: 32.29

---

## CD Five

Franz Schubert

Sonata in B flat, D 960 (1828)

[Graf replica]

Track 1:	<i>Molto moderato</i>	18.23
Track 2:	<i>Andante sostenuto</i>	9.07
Track 3:	<i>Scherzo: Allegro vivace con delicatezza</i>	4.08
Track 4:	<i>Allegro, ma non troppo</i>	8.43

Total Time: 40.20

---

## CD Six

John Field (1782–1837)

[Clementi replica]

Track 1: Nocturne no. 1 in E flat, first version (1812) 3.21

Fryderyk Chopin (1810–1849)

Track 2: Nocturne in E minor, Op. 72, no. 1 (1827) [Graf replica]  
4.00

Track 3: Nocturne in C sharp minor, Op. posth. KK IVa, no. 16 [1827 Broadwood]  
(1830) 3.53

Franz Liszt (1811–1886)

Etude en douze Exercices, Op. 1 (1826)

[Graf replica]

Track 4: no. 9 – *Allegro grazioso* 3.34

Track 5: no. 12 – *Allegro non troppo* 2.05

Felix Mendelssohn (1809–1847)

Sechs Lieder ohne Worte, Op. 19 (1832)

[1827 Broadwood]

Track 6: no. 1 – *Andante con moto* 3.13

Track 7: no. 2 – *Andante espressivo* 2.13

Track 8: no. 3 – *Molto allegro* 'Jägerlied' 2.53

Track 9: no. 4 – *Moderato* 1.59

Track 10: no. 5 – *Poco agitato* 3.57

Track 11: no. 6 – *Allegro non troppo* 'Venetianisches Gondellied' 2.00

---

CD Six (cont.)

Fryderyk Chopin

- |           |                              |                  |      |
|-----------|------------------------------|------------------|------|
|           |                              | [Graf replica]   |      |
| Track 12: | Mazurka, Op. 6, no. 2 (1830) |                  | 2.26 |
|           |                              | [1827 Broadwood] |      |
| Track 13: | Mazurka, Op. 7, no. 1 (1830) |                  | 2.16 |

Robert Schumann (1810–1856)

- |           |                              |                |       |
|-----------|------------------------------|----------------|-------|
|           |                              | [Graf replica] |       |
| Track 14: | Papillons, Op. 2 (1829–1831) |                | 15.29 |

Total Time: 53.18

---

Supplementary CD

Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart

- |          |  |                  |       |
|----------|--|------------------|-------|
|          | Piano Concerto in C minor, K 491 (1786)  | [Walter replica] |       |
| Track 1: | 1 <sup>st</sup> movement: <i>Allegro</i>   |                  | 14.43 |
|          | (With Keith Crellin, conductor and the University of Adelaide Chamber Orchestra) |                  |       |

Ludwig van Beethoven

- |          |   |                           |      |
|----------|---|---------------------------|------|
| Track 2: | Sonata <i>quasi una Fantasia</i> in C sharp minor, Op. 27, no. 2    | [Walter und Sohn replica] |      |
|          | 'Moonlight' (1801)  |                           |      |
|          | <i>Adagio sostenuto</i> (played with conventional legato-pedalling) |                           | 4.48 |

Total Time: 19.30

All works except for the Mozart piano and violin sonata and the Mozart Piano concerto recorded at Cornell University, Ithaca, NY, USA, 19 June – 5 July, 2010.

Recording engineer: Dane Marion.

Piano tuning and preparation: Ken Walkup.

Pitch: A 430 Hz

Mozart, Piano and Violin Sonata in G, K 379.

Recorded at The University of Melbourne, 20 December, 2010.

Recording engineer: David Collins.

Piano tuning: Vladimir Chishkovsky.

Pitch: A 430 Hz

Mozart, Piano Concerto C minor, K 491.

Recorded at The University of Adelaide by Radio Adelaide.

Live recording – Lunchtimes at Elder Hall series, 28 May, 2010.

Recording engineer: Don Balaz.

Piano tuning: Geoff Smith.

Pitch: A 440 Hz

CDs mastered 24 December, 2010.

Recording engineer: Cam Mitchell, 2 Acre Studio, Melbourne.

---

## Abstract

This doctoral submission comprises two volumes and is entitled 'Notated and Implied Piano Pedalling c.1780–1830'. Volume One consists of six CDs and contains performances of works composed between 1781 and 1832, recorded on historical instruments housed in the collection at Cornell University, Ithaca, NY. The repertoire includes works by C.P.E. Bach, Mozart, Haydn, Beethoven, Hyacinthe Jadin, Clementi, Dussek, Field, Voříšek, Schubert, Felix Mendelssohn, Chopin, Robert Schumann and Liszt. The works are performed on seven different pianos, six replicas and one original instrument, dating from 1780–1827.

Volume Two is the Exegesis. While the history of pedal mechanisms and various forms of pedal notation have already been expertly researched and documented, it is often difficult to understand the composer's intentions with regard to the appropriate use of the damper pedal in performance, especially in works from the Classical period. The Exegesis examines the documentation of damper pedal techniques from c.1780–1830 and articulates decisions made with regard to the use of pedal in the performance of this repertoire on historical instruments.

The research is performance based, and draws heavily on primary sources and existing scholarship. Comparisons are made between the English, French and Viennese instruments and the schools of piano playing that developed, and the repertoire has been selected to highlight the growing significance of pedalling as an integral part of the performance. The primary outcome of this research resides in the recorded performances themselves. They represent the first fully detailed investigation of the various types of pedalling found in a comprehensive range of repertoire and documented through recordings made on the appropriate instruments.

---

## Declaration

I hereby declare that the recordings and the supporting exegesis that comprise this submission are my original work.

They contain no material that has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contain no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text of the thesis.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for photocopying and loan. It should be noted that permission for copying does not extend to the CDs in Volume One without consultation with the author.

Julie Haskell

January 2011

---

## Acknowledgements

The recordings are dedicated to my late husband, Gerard van der Weide, who always supported and encouraged me in my pianistic endeavours during our twenty years together. He was aware of my desire to embark on doctoral studies, but would have been surprised and even amused at the direction that it has taken. I am extremely grateful to my parents for the many years they spent driving me to lessons and performances, supervising practice, and for all the support and encouragement they gave me throughout my childhood years. Little did they know that more than forty years after commencing piano lessons I would be studying again! My late grandparents also played an important role in my early years and were always eager to listen to my performances and record them.

I am extremely grateful for the following people who have enabled me to play historical pianos either from their personal collections or under their supervision: Paul Downie for his hospitality in New Zealand, James Tibbles (University of Auckland), David Ward, (Royal College of Music, London), Professor Michael Endres (Canterbury University, New Zealand), Edwin Beunk (Eschede, The Netherlands), Professor Peter Roennfeldt (Queensland Conservatorium), Richard Schaumloffel (Adelaide) and Gavin Gostelow (Canberra). Gavin, particularly, was the source of many thought-provoking conversations.

Sincere thanks are due to Emeritus Professor Malcolm Bilson for his incredible kindness and generosity in allowing me to record at Cornell, and for all the extra advice and help he gave me with practicalities of organizing the whole recording project. Thank-you also to Dane Marion, recording engineer at Cornell University, who worked tirelessly to help me complete an almost impossible recording schedule, and to Ken Walkup, piano tuner, who was also extremely accommodating to my needs.



My sincere thanks to Rachael Beesley for introducing me to the Mozart Piano and Violin Sonata in G, K 379 and for playing so beautifully, and also to Associate Professor Keith Crellin OAM for his wonderful work with the Elder Conservatorium Chamber Orchestra. I am extremely grateful to Victoria Watts and Tim Kennedy who were both extremely helpful regarding the Dulcken fortepiano and the organization of the recording at the University of Melbourne. Thank you also to David Collins and Cam Mitchell for completing the final recording and mastering work.

Sincere thanks are also due to my supervisors Professor Charles Bodman Rae, who has made me think differently about many different aspects of the project and to Professor Bart van Oort for getting me totally fired up about the fortepiano and providing me with some excellent advice.

I am indebted to Dr Diana Weekes, who not only was my principal supervisor and major point of call throughout this study, but was also many years ago my piano teacher throughout perhaps the most important and formative years of my study as a teenager. It was through her encouragement that I embarked on this course of study, and due to her unfailing energy and patience, her wonderful editing skills, and the many times she acted well beyond her role as supervisor that this project has come to fruition.

Thank-you to my dear friend and colleague Glenn Riddle for his encouragement and support throughout the process. My partner Trevor Jones has put up with a great deal in the last few years – we now have a house full of fortepianos, and he has barely seen me at times. He did, however, understand how important this was to me and gave me space to practise, travel and write. Thank you Trevor.

---

## Editorial Notes

### The Pedal

In this Exegesis the word 'pedal' is used to describe what is commonly known as the sustaining or damper pedal found on the modern piano (the pedal on the far right). This mechanism lifts the dampers off the strings so that they can vibrate freely. The word 'pedal' is also used to describe all damper lifting mechanisms, including those that preceded the modern pedal. An exception is made when differentiating between the various methods of application, i.e. hand-operated knobs and levers, knee levers or pedals operated with the feet.

It should also be noted that this study is concerned only with the damper pedal and not the various other tone-modification mechanisms that flourished during the early years of the piano, although these are discussed briefly when relevant. David Rowland gives an excellent account of the various stops, levers and pedals found on pianos throughout their history in his book *A History of Pianoforte Pedalling*.<sup>1</sup>

### Pedal techniques

The phrase 'changing the pedal' is used to describe the lowering of the dampers onto the strings briefly to stop vibrations before lifting them again, either by means of the knee lever or foot pedal.

In 'rhythmic-peddalling' the pedal is depressed together with a chord, usually on the strong beats of a bar. It is then released again towards the end of the bar before being depressed again on the following strong beat.

---

<sup>1</sup> David Rowland. *A History of Pianoforte Pedalling*. (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1993).

'Legato-pedalling' can be described as changing the pedal on the beat so that the sound continues right up to the point of change. In other words, the pedal is released as a new chord is played, and then quickly depressed again before the fingers leave the notes, catching the new harmony, but avoiding any blurring from a previous chord. This is sometimes also described as 'syncopated pedalling' due to the fact that the foot is depressed *after* the beat and not *on* the beat.

## The Piano

Throughout this exegesis the word 'piano' is used in general discussion to describe any piano, whether it be an eighteenth or nineteenth century or a modern instrument. Where necessary, however, the word 'fortepiano' will be used to refer to specific historical instruments.

## Editions

The editions consulted during the course of this research were, wherever possible, first editions<sup>2</sup> and *Urtext* editions.<sup>3</sup> It was beyond the scope of the research to source original manuscripts except in the case of the Beethoven scores, which are freely available online.<sup>4</sup> Only in one instance was it impossible to source any of the above (Dusseck Sonata). When writing about the pedal indications I am referring (to the best of my knowledge) to the pedal indications noted and approved by the composers, and never to pedal indications notated by an editor which are different or in addition to the original notation of the composer.

---

<sup>2</sup> Facsimile editions published by Acardi, Garland, Minkoff, Tecla.

<sup>3</sup> G. Henle Verlag, Peters, Könnemann and Wiener Urtext Editions.

<sup>4</sup> Beethoven-Haus Bonn. <http://www.beethoven-haus-bonn.de/>

## The CDs

The repertoire is discussed in the exegesis in order as it appears on the CDs. The only exceptions are the two supplementary recordings (Mozart Piano Concerto K 491, 1st movement, and the alternative version of the Beethoven Sonata Op. 27, no. 2, *Moonlight*, 1st movement), which can be found on the Supplementary CD. The performances on the supplementary disc are intended to illustrate conclusions drawn in the exegesis, but do not form part of the main submission.