

MEDIA TRANSPARENCY IN CHINA:
A CRITIQUE OF THE PARTY-STATE RHETORIC
AND MARKET DISCOURSES

Submitted by

XIE Baohui

Thesis submitted in fulfilment of the requirements

For the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

Centre for Asian Studies

School of Social Sciences

University of Adelaide

September 2012



SUB CRUCE LUMEN

THE LIGHT UNDER THE CROSS

Table of Contents

Table of Contents	i
List of Figures	v
List of Appendices	vi
Glossary of Terms.....	vii
Abstract.....	xi
Declaration.....	xiii
Acknowledgements.....	xv
Conventions	xvi
Chapter One: Introduction.....	1
1.1 Introductory Background	1
1.2 It is not all about Censorship.....	6
1.3 Research Problem	11
1.3.1 Press Freedom	11
1.3.2 More Freedom Today?	17
1.3.3 Research Problem.....	21
1.4 Theoretical Framework and Significance	22
1.4.1 David Heald’s „Transparency Illusion“	23
1.4.2 A Neo-leftist Perspective	27
1.4.3 Significance.....	36
1.5 Methodology	36
1.6 Organization.....	40
Chapter Two: Media Transparency.....	42
2.1 Introduction.....	42

2.2 General Principles of Transparency	43
2.3 Three Aspects of Media Transparency	47
2.3.1 Transparency for the Media	48
2.3.2 Transparency of the Media.....	55
2.3.3 Transparency by the Media.....	63
2.4 Concluding Remarks	69
Chapter Three: Denial of Censorship: A Justification Problem.....	72
3.1 Introduction.....	72
3.2 Censorship and Censorship Reality	73
3.3 Censorship of Censorship in Contemporary China.....	77
3.3.1 Positive Self-presentation.....	79
3.3.2 Countering Accusations	83
3.3.3 Toning down	86
3.3.4 Moral Blackmail.....	89
3.3.5 Denying Legal Construction	92
3.4 Changing Party, Changing Censorship	97
3.5 Concluding Remarks.....	102
Chapter Four: Media Malpractices, Grassroots Professionals and Three Dilemmas	104
4.1 Introduction.....	104
4.2 Media Malpractices.....	107
4.3 The Market Dilemma	111
4.4 The Ethical Dilemma	119
4.5 The Identity Dilemma	125

4.6 Concluding Remarks.....	128
Chapter Five: Marketization and Conglomeration of State-owned Media: a Media Transparency Myth?	
5.1 Introduction.....	131
5.2 Business management and Marketization.....	133
5.3 Conglomeration and New Corporate Governance	139
5.3.1 Conglomeration.....	140
5.3.2 Restructured Corporate Governance	142
5.4 Concluding Remarks: Demythologizing Marketization and Conglomeration.....	152
Chapter Six: „Skylight Windows“, Media Activism Revived?	
6.1 Introduction.....	155
6.2 Media Activism before 1949.....	158
6.2.1 Skylight Windows.....	158
6.2.2 <i>Jujian Yundong</i> [Rejecting Censorship Campaign]	160
6.2.3 Broad Participation and Ideological Consensus.....	163
6.3 Skylight Windows in the Reform Era	168
6.4 Media Activism, Whose Activism?	176
6.4.1 Absence of pre-1949 Participation and Consensus in the Post-Mao Era	177
6.4.2 New Consensus and Implications	180
6.5 Concluding Remarks.....	186
Chapter Seven: Conclusion: Transparency Illusion and Disjuncture of Representation ...	
7.1 Summary: from Illusion to Disillusionment	188
7.2 Disjuncture of Representation.....	193
7.3 Impact of Media Transparency on the Public Sphere Today	204

7.4 Limitations and future research.....	207
Appendices.....	212
Appendix 1 List of rules and regulations concerning newspapers.....	212
Appendix 2 List of rules and regulations concerning radio and television broadcasting.....	220
Appendix 3 List of rules and regulations concerning digital and online media.....	224
Appendix 4 List of general rules and regulations concerning journalism.....	227
Appendix 5 Apology Letter from HMD to CWA.....	230
Appendix 6 List of Press Groups Established upon Approval by the GAPP.....	232
Appendix 7 The Sixteen Outlets Initiating the <i>Jujian Yundong</i> in August 1945.....	233
Appendix 8 Reportedly Censored Page B2 of CBV.....	234
Appendix 9 Blank Spaces Left on the <i>Southern Weekend</i>	235
Appendix 10 List of <i>Pinyin</i> – Chinese Characters.....	236
Bibliography.....	240

List of Figures

Figure 1.1	Number of newspapers, radio stations and TV stations from 1978-2009.....	1
Figure 1.2	Public-centred representational relationship between the public media, the public and the Party-state.....	30
Figure 1.3	Party-state-centred relationship between the public media, the Party-state and the public in the Reform Era.....	31
Figure 2.1	Types of rules and regulations for journalism in China.....	50
Figure 2.2	Party-state control over the media in China.....	64
Figure 4.1	Top ten fabricated and misleading news items in China from 2001 to 2010	108
Figure 5.1	Organizational structure of the senior management <i>Sheweihui</i> of Guangzhou Daily Press Group.....	148
Figure 5.2	Organizational structure of the senior management <i>Sheweihui</i> of Wenhui-Xinmin Press Group.....	149

List of Appendices

Appendix 1	List of rules and regulations concerning newspapers.....	212
Appendix 2	List of rules and regulations concerning the radios and televisions.....	221
Appendix 3	List of rules and regulations concerning online and digital media.....	224
Appendix 4	List of general rules and regulations concerning journalism	227
Appendix 5	Apology Letter from <i>Huaxi Metropolis Daily</i> to China Writers Association.....	230
Appendix 6	List of Press Groups Established upon Approval by the GAPP.....	232
Appendix 7	The Sixteen Outlets Initiating the Jujian Yundong in August 1945.....	233
Appendix 8	Reportedly censored page B2 of China Business Views.....	234
Appendix 9	Skylight Windows on the Southern Weekend.....	235
Appendix 10	List of <i>Pinyin</i> – Chinese Characters.....	236

Glossary of Terms

Term	Definition	Chinese Title
ACJA	All-China Journalists Association	中华全国新闻工作者协会
APP	Administration of Press and Publication	新闻出版署
AUD	Australian Dollar	澳元
BBC	British Broadcasting Corporation	英国广播公司
CHRD	China Human Rights Defenders	维权网
CBS	Columbia Broadcasting System Broadcasting Inc.	美国哥伦比亚广播公司
CBV	China Business View	华商报
CCP	Chinese Communist Party	中国共产党
CNN	Cable News Network	美国有线新闻网
CNNIC	China Internet Network Information Center	中国互联网信息中心
CNY	Chinese Yuan	人民币
CPD	Central Publicity Department of the Chinese Communist Party Central Committee	中共中央宣传部
CPPCC	Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference	全国人民政治协商会议
CSRC	China Securities Regulatory Commission	中国证券监督管理委员会
CWA	China Writers Association	中国作家协会
GAPP	General Administration of Press and Publication	新闻出版总署
GMD	Guomindang	国民党

Term	Definition	Chinese Title
GOCCPCC	General Office of the Chinese Communist Party Central Committee	中共中央办公厅
HMD	Huaxi Metropolis Daily	华西都市报
IPO	Initial Public Offerings	初次公开发行股票
KMT	Kuomintang	国民党
LL	People's Republic of China Legislation Law	中华人民共和国立法法
MANJCS	<i>Measures for the Administration of Newspaper and Journal Correspondent Stations</i>	报刊杂志记者站管理办法
MAPC	<i>Measures for the Administration of Press Cards</i>	记者证管理办法
MIIT	Ministry of Industry and Information Technology	中国工业和信息化部
MNS	Ministry of National Security	国家安全部
MOFTEC	Ministry of Foreign Trade and Economic Cooperation ¹	外经贸部
MOA	Ministry of Agriculture	农业部
MOC	Ministry of Commerce	商务部
MOFC	Ministry of Construction ²	建设部
MPA	Ministry of Personnel Administration	人事部 ³
MPG	Minor Parties and Groups	民主党派
MPS	Ministry of Public Security	公安部

¹ The MOFTEC was reorganized into the Ministry of Commerce in March 2003.

² The MOFC was reorganized into the Ministry of Housing and Urban-Rural Development (MOHURD) in March 2008.

³ The MPA was reorganized into the Ministry of Human Resources and Social Security (MOHRSS) in March 2008.

Term	Definition	Chinese Title
MPT	Ministry of Post and Telecommunication ⁴	邮电部
MRFT	Ministry of Radio, Film and Television	广播电影电视部 ⁵
NBSC	National Bureau of Statistics of China	中国国家统计局
NPC	National People's Congress	全国人民代表大会
NPCSC	National People's Congress Standing Committee	全国人民代表大会常务委员会
OCED	Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development	经济合作与发展组织
PRC	People's Republic of China	中华人民共和国
SAIC	State Administration of Industry and Commerce	国家工商总局
SAP	State Administration of Publication	国家出版局 ⁶
SARFT	State Administration of Radio, Film and Television	国家广播电影电视总局
SARS	Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome	非典型性肺炎
SC	State Council	国务院
SCB	State Copyright Bureau	国家版权局
SCIO	Information Office of the State Council	国务院新闻办公室
SEC	State Education Commission ⁷	国家教委
SDPG	Sichuan Daily Press Group	四川日报报业集团
SMD	Southern Metropolis Daily	南方都市报
SPB	State Post Bureau	国家邮政局
SSA	State Secrecy Administration	国家保密局

⁴ The MPT was reorganized into the Ministry of Information Industry (MII) in March 1998, and then into the Ministry of Industry and Information Technology (MIIT) in March 2008.

⁵ The MRFT was reorganized into the State Administration of Radio, Film and Television (SARFT) in March 2008.

⁶ The SAP was reorganized into the Administration of Press and Publication in January 1987, then into the General Administration of Press and Publication in 2001.

⁷ The SEC was reorganized into the Ministry of Education in March 1998.

Term	Definition	Chinese Title
TLEP	Three Learning and Education Programs	三项学习教育活动
TMT	Three Major Transformations	三大改造运动
TRC	Thought Reform Campaign	思想改造运动
UFW	United Front Work	统一战线
UNESCO	United Nations Educational Scientific and Cultural Organization	联合国教科文组织
VOA	Voice of America	美国之音

Abstract

The arguments and analysis of this thesis surround the issue of the illusion of media transparency in China. It argues that the gap between the official transparency rhetoric and the censorship reality has demonstrated the discrepancy between what the Party is and what it claims itself to be. Media transparency, which is proclaimed to be something that should be aimed at by the Chinese government and the media, and which includes but goes beyond the issue of press freedom, is defined as a multi-faceted concept, but has been undermined by the consensus reached between the Party-state and the media on political and market control. Subsequently, the subjectivity of the disenfranchised groups has been diminished in the public sphere, their image distorted, and their voices muzzled. The thesis aims to show that the logic of political control and market has been suppressing the voices of the broad masses of people in China. This thesis argues this suppression is rooted in the disjuncture of political representation of both the party-state and the media. Hence, this thesis proposes that explanation for the transparency illusion can be drawn from Wang Hui's *daibiaoxing duanlie* [disjuncture of representation] argument, showing how this disjuncture has resulted in the irrelevance of the reform and boom of the media to the expansion of public sphere. To substantiate this point, this thesis explores the problems of media transparency in four aspects. Firstly, censorship's justification problem is analysed to reveal the contradictory Party principle of journalism. Secondly, exploitative management, ethical confusion and denial of the professionals' rights are examined to identify the causal connection between media malpractice and the consensus of political and market control. Thirdly, the trajectory of marketization and conglomeration is discussed to demythologize the prediction of press freedom on market forces. Fourthly, media activism is examined to show how transparency illusion posits its market discourses on misinterpretation of the past and the present. This thesis concludes that the disjuncture of the Party-state and the media

from their political representation of the public has resulted in the media transparency illusion.

Declaration

This work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution to XIE Baohui and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

The author acknowledges that copyright of the published works contained within this thesis (as listed below) resides with the copyright holder(s) of those works.

Some chapters have been presented at various academic conferences. Chapter Four „Media Malpractice in China: Grassroots Professionals in Three Dilemmas“ was presented at the 2011 Conference of "Developing Sustainable Societies: Challenges and Perspectives" co-hosted by the Flinders University and China Academy of Social Sciences in Adelaide on 22nd March 2011. Chapter Three „From Censorship to Meta-Censorship Rationale“ was presented at the 12th CSAA Biennial Conference hosted by the National University of Australia in Canberra on 14th July 2011. Chapter Five „Business management, Corporatization and Conglomeration: A Media Transparency Myth?“ was presented at the 2011 Melbourne Conference on China hosted by the University of Melbourne on 7th August 2011. An abridged version of Chapter Two was presented at the „2012 Emerging Leaders“ Dialogue“ co-hosted by the Asia Institute at the Griffith University and Peking University in collaboration with the Queensland Government on 23rd May 2012.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University’s digital research repository, the Library catalogue, the

Australasian Digital Theses Program (ADTP) and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

SIGNED:

Xie Baohui

25th June 2012

Acknowledgements

I am very grateful to the University of Adelaide. The generous full Adelaide Scholarship International has made my decision to come to Australia a lot easier.

I would extend my sincere gratitude to my principal supervisor Professor Mobo Gao, who has always been inspiring and encouraging during my study. His insightful advice and opinions have been critically helpful for the development of this thesis. Many thanks also go to Dr. Gerry Groot, my co-supervisor, who has been generous with his time, making comments on and editing my writing. A number of Australian friends also offered invaluable help with proofreading. They are Mr. Colin Schumacher, Mr. Darren Loechel and Mrs. Helen Dunkley. I also feel grateful to Dr. Zhang Shaoquan who introduced me to the field of Chinese Studies.

I would like to thank the School of Social Sciences at the University of Adelaide and my colleagues. Dr. Shoko Yoneyama, postgraduate coordinator, has always been there with her kind understanding throughout the years. Also, I deeply thank Dr. Zhang Ning whose kindness and support have made the office hours pleasant and rewarding. Besides, the School's postgraduate funding made it possible for me to attend a number of conferences outside Adelaide and present my chapters. Especially, I should extend the same courtesy to the School for the opportunity to join the Emerging Leaders 2012, an academic program sponsored by the Griffith University, Peking University and the Queensland Government.

I would like to thank my parents, and my sister's family for their unreserved helping hands. My father, Professor Xie Min particularly, has always been my role model. My dear wife Chen Ling and son Xie Shengjia have given me not only hope and joy in a harmonious Christian family life full of understanding and trust, but also constant drive towards a motivated academic future.

Conventions

In this thesis, Chinese name order, by which surname is followed by given name, is used when referring to Chinese figures. Therefore, the name of President of the People's Republic of China is addressed as Hu Jintao.

A partial exception to this rule applies to Western citizens with Chinese origin, whose names follow the given name – family name order. For example, the author of the book *The Battle for China's Past: Mao and the Cultural Revolution* is referred to as Mobo Gao.

The spelling of the Chinese names in this thesis follows the *Pinyin* convention in Mainland China, which adopts a spelling system different from those in other Chinese speaking regions such as Hong Kong, Macao, Taiwan and Singapore, and in some Western literature. For example, the name of Jiang Jieshi instead of Chiang Kai-shek is used herein to refer to the former President of the Republic of China.

Chinese characters, i.e. the name of an official document or regulation, are substituted with its *pinyin* equivalence to avoid these characters being garbled when read on computers that are not installed with Chinese fonts. Translation of these Chinese characters is provided either in form of bracketed in-text notes or footnotes. A list of *Pinyin* – Chinese characters is also provided in Appendix 10 for bilingual reference.