

A FUTURE TO PINE FOR

懐かしい未来:

TRANSMODERNIST MOVEMENT IN JAPAN

STEVEN ATTWOOD

THESIS SUBMITTED FOR

MASTERS OF PHILOSOPHY IN ASIAN STUDIES

SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCE

UNIVERSITY OF ADELAIDE

OCTOBER 2014

Acknowledgements

My journey towards completing this thesis has been filled with many great highs and lows, and it has been made possible thanks to the support of many people.

I would like thank the Asian Studies department of the University of Adelaide, especially to my supervisors Dr. Shoko Yoneyama and Dr. Gerry Groot for their consultations and time. Without them this would have never been possible.

Thank you to my family and friends, especially to my wife Alana, for all the love and support and for the additional time reading over my thesis. In addition, I would like to thank Sam Lymn for the services of reviewing my thesis where possible.

Once again, thank you to everyone would ever gave support or assisted in the creation of this work.

Abstract

The natural and nuclear disaster of the Fukushima Daiichi Nuclear Power Plants of TEPCO and its continuing aftermath reflected the emotions and frustrations of Chernobyl. The incident reignited the debate on nuclear power and critical engagement with modern society. More than ever, critical discussions and seeking alternative solutions is as important. The thesis explores one such alternative to modernity called transmodernism, a theoretical concept that was formulated by Enrique Dussel and expanded in various directions from contemporary writers. Dussel's concept is the defining idea of his engagement with modernity and its relationship to the Other. The thesis will focus on one such contemporary interpretation of transmodernism. Paul H Ray and Sherry Ruth Anderson conceptualised transmodernism to describe the emergence of a new social group called the Cultural Creatives in the United States and Europe.

The Cultural Creative's value system fuses modern values with traditional and indigenous values from across the globe. Their core values revolve around the sacredness of the environment, self-actualisation through spiritual growth, importance of family and friends, green economics, activism and altruism. They are a generation of people that evolved from new social movements and consciousness movement of the 1960s and have pushed these ideas further than before. The Cultural Creatives are a new wave coming from advanced industrialised nations in the West. Can this concept of transmodernism be applied outside Western advanced industrialised nations to other advanced industrialised nations? Through a literature study, the thesis will examine 11 Japanese people from Andy Couturier's *A Different Kind of Luxury*, a group named in the thesis as the Slow Culture Artists. The Slow Culture Artists live by principles of slow, self-sufficient living and incorporate traditional arts and practices. Their values are a fusion of modern values and traditional or alternative values from traditional Japan and countries abroad. The way they approach their lives can be reflected in the core values of the Cultural Creatives.

The thesis will show how Ray's transmodernism can also be used to describe them and will discuss the importance of transmodernism in relations to critically engaging modernity. It will involve a theoretical background of transmodernism, a discussion of the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists and a comparison. From this comparison, the thesis will point to: 1) the significance of Asia in the concept of transmodernism, as the foundations of transcendentalism that constitutes the philosophical foundation of Cultural Creatives; 2) the problems of linearity in the discourse of modernity; 3) and the importance of dialogue in transmodernism, both as an 'internal dialogue' in their formation of their values and 'external dialogue' to discuss their relationship with modernity and the Other.

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements.....	1
Abstract.....	2
Table of Contents.....	3
Declaration.....	6
Introduction.....	1
Chapter 1: Transmodernism: Moving Beyond Postmodernity.....	8
1. Enrique Dussel and the Contemporary Transmodernists.....	8
2. Enrique Dussel.....	10
3. Critique of modernity and globalisation.....	10
4. Liberation Philosophy.....	15
5. Transmodernism.....	19
6. Contemporary Transmodernists and Writers on Transmodernism.....	23
7. David Smith.....	23
8. Mike Cole.....	23
9. Fred Dallmayr.....	25
10. Ziauddin Sardar.....	26
11. Paul Gilroy.....	29
12. Paul H. Ray.....	30
13. Integral Transmodernism as a Theoretical Framework.....	35
Chapter 2: The Cultural Creatives: An Emerging Subculture.....	38
1. Introduction.....	38
2. How the Cultural Creatives Emerged: The Relationship between the ‘Traditionals’ and the ‘Moderns’.....	41
3. The Two Subcultures (1): The Moderns.....	44

4. The Two Subcultures (2): The Traditionals.....	49
5. The New Social Movement: Foundations for a Manner of Living.....	53
6. The New Social Movement (1): Civil Rights Movement.....	54
7. The New Social Movements (2): The Women's Movement	55
8. The New Social Movements (3): Environmental Movement	57
9. The New Social Movements (4): Consciousness Movements.....	59
10. Cultural Creatives: An Emerging Subculture	62
11. Core Values of the Cultural Creatives.....	63
12. Cultural Creatives: Academic Criticisms	69
13. Politics: A Lack of Impact.....	69
14. Commercialised Spiritualism	70
15. The Problems Concerning a Utopic Nature.....	73
16. The Cultural Creatives' Influences in Japan.....	76
17. Shinichi TSUJI	76
18. The Sloth Club.....	79
19. Conclusion	82
Chapter 3: The Slow Culture Artists	85
1. Couturier's A Different Kind of Luxury	85
2. Slowness and Art: Connection.....	88
3. Fusing Ideas and Living Alternatively: Living differently to the mainstream	99
4. Ogata's Philosophy	113
5. Conclusion	119
Chapter 4: Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists	122
1. Transmodernism: Cultural Creatives and the Slow Culture Artists.....	122
2. Environment and Spirituality.....	123
3. Relations to People and Culture.....	125
4. Critical Engagement with Modernity	128

5. Results	130
6. Inferences: Asia, Linearity and Dialogue	133
7. Transcendentalism and Asia.....	134
8. Emerson and Thoreau and their Relations to the Orient.....	134
9. Linearity in the Discourse of Modernity.....	139
10. The World Value Surverys (WVS)	140
11. WVS Results.....	144
12. Dialogue and Transmodernism	147
13. Internal Dialogue	147
14. External Dialogue	149
15. Conclusion	154
Conclusion.....	156
Bibliography	163

Declaration

This thesis contains no material that has been accepted for an award of any type of degree or diploma in any other university or tertiary school. To the best of my knowledge, no material previously published or written by another person, unless with due reference which has been highlighted in the thesis. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint-award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy, when deposited in the University library, being made available for photocopying and loan.

SIGNED: _____

DATE: _____

Introduction

Modernisation has been one of the goals of nation states since the late 19th century. There is a question, however, of what indeed it means for a society to be 'modern'. To be a modern society is associated with many things. Generally, it is associated with development, away from being a traditional agrarian society to a society that emphasises economic, scientific and technological growth, i.e. a shift away from values and practices considered 'traditional' to that which promotes secularisation (Brugger and Hannan 1983:1). It coincides with industrialisation, division of labour, and eventually leads to longer life-spans, greater living conditions and decreased fertility (Dixon 1999:1-2). Modernisation is also usually related to westernisation in non-western societies (Brugger and Hannan 1983:1) with the United States as the most modernized. This view, however, is merely an ethnocentric perspective of the modernisation process. In reality, there are different modes of modernisation that exist within particular cultural and historical backgrounds. In other words, modernisation is 'multilinear' (Brugger and Hannan 1983:1). It is influenced by such things as the mode of production, the level of economic development (especially that of market economy), the political system, and patterns of behaviour. Those who are critical towards modernisation note that whilst modernisation has promoted various forms of social change, the core principles of modernisation are impenetrable from any influence from outside cultures, values and ideas and as such, this makes alternative modernisations difficult to cultivate (Khan 2001). Modernisation and its promoters find sustaining tradition for tradition's sake to be harmful to modernisation mechanisms (Khan 2011:162-164). This presents a tension in a society outside the West, where the frame of reference for modernisation exists outside its traditional culture

Japan is a country that is often considered to be a benchmark of modern development. Modernisation in Japan started with the Meiji Restoration, but it took giant steps in the advent of American Occupation after Japan surrendered at the end of the World War II. With a new constitution that was centred on democratisation and demilitarisation, Japan focused on achieving rapid economic and technological growth, to become the second largest economy in the late 1960s and remained so until surpassed by China in 2011. For all the positive developments that have occurred from modernisation and industrialisation (e.g. improved living conditions, longer life spans, greater gender equality), there have been negative consequences, i.e. the cost of modernisation.

The most notable cost of modernisation in Japan has been industrial pollution that was most fierce at the time of Japan's rapid economic growth: from the mid-1950s to early 1970s. It included the 'big four' cases of industrial pollution: Itai-Itai (It-hurts It-hurts) Disease, which is cadmium poisoning caused by Mitsui Mining in the Toyama Prefecture; Yokkaichi Asthma caused mainly by sulphur dioxide emitted from petrochemical factories; and two cases of Minamata Disease (in Niigata and Minamata) caused by organic mercury discharged by chemical companies, Chisso in Minamata and Showa Denko in Niigata. The impact of the industrial pollution upon the ecology, society and human health has lingered throughout Japan's post-war history. When the Japanese government closed in 2012 the application for compensation of the uncertified sufferers of the Minamata Disease to achieve the 'final political solution' to the issue, some 65,000 people applied (Kyodo News 2013:2).

The nuclear disaster unleashed at Fukushima Daiichi Nuclear Power Plants of TEPCO (Tokyo Electric Power Company) in 2011 in many ways also symbolises the negative consequence of Japan's rapid industrialisation and modernisation since the 1950s.

Although the Level 7 nuclear disaster was initially caused by the earthquake and tsunami on March 11, it was later considered to be ‘man-made’ disaster in the official report submitted to the Japanese government (The Fukushima Nuclear Accident Independent Investigation Commission Report 2012: 16). The nuclear disaster displaced around 30,000 people from their homes, which caused fatigue and illness in many, and in some cases deaths (Smith A 2013:1). Radiation has contaminated and continued to contaminate land and waters not only within Japan but at a global scale.

The nuclear disaster at Fukushima fuelled the anti-nuclear movement, reignited the debate on nuclear power and renewable energy. More fundamentally, however, it reinstated the need to critically examine the meaning of modernity and to ask the question of what kind of future we wish to live in. More specifically, this includes the questions of how we live as humankind in relation to nature, to each other, and to our deeper self, as well as the question of whether we have begun to reach the limits of progression championed by modernity. The critical evaluation of modernity thus leads to the quest for alternatives that can address the question of not only environmental, ecological and social sustainability, but the question of ‘spirituality’ in the most general sense, i.e. the sense of ‘connectedness that an individual feels to everything that is other than self’ (De Souza, Francis, O’Higgins-Norman, Scott 2009:1). With this problem consciousness (*mondai ishiki*), this thesis explores the questions of surrounding the quest for an alternative future.

This thesis will engage with one such alternative to modernisation, the theoretical concept of transmodernism, a relatively new critique of modernity and postmodernity. Transmodernism examines modern society from outside of the system and seeks a utopian balance of tradition, nature and modern society as co-existing entities living and

evolving together. Transmodernism offers a model of development as an alternative to modernization.

The concept of transmodernism is based on the work of Paul Ray and Sherry Ruth Anderson who have been analysing and telling the story of emerging groups of people who have sought this transmodern utopia since the late 1980s. Ray and Anderson have named these individuals as the 'Cultural Creatives'. The Cultural Creatives seek to fuse values, philosophies, spiritualities and ideas from cultures around the world regardless of their level of being 'modern/developed' or 'primitive/underdeveloped', and promote values unlike 'modern man'. The Cultural Creatives have been acknowledged in the United States and in Europe. However, the concept of Cultural Creatives is fairly non-existent outside the US and Europe.

The purpose of this thesis is to explore two questions: 1) is transmodernism, given that its use has primarily been in the western portion of the world, capable of explaining phenomenon in Asia?; 2) if transmodernism can indeed be applicable outside the West, and more specifically in Asia, what is its significance?

In order to explore these questions, this thesis compares two distinct 'groups'. One is Cultural Creatives, which has been the focus of the discourse on transmodernism in the West, and the other is what I call 'Slow Culture Artists', a group of artists in Japan, who pursue alternative lifestyle and defy the conventional lifestyle of modern Japan. My hypothesis is that there is substantial commonality between the two groups, which suggests that the notion of transmodernism is indeed applicable outside 'Cultural Creatives' and outside the Western cultural sphere, which in turn suggests that a broader value change are happening in the world, including both the West and the East.

The thesis will examine this hypothesis by using two pieces of literature as source ‘data’ to be compared. One is *Cultural Creatives* by Ray and Anderson; the other is *A Different Kind of Luxury* by Andy Couturier, the book that tells the stories of individuals that I call in this thesis the Slow Culture Artists. By using the method of literary comparison, the thesis shows that transmodernism is applicable to explain the lifestyle of the Slow Culture Artists in Japan (as described in Couturier’s book). The thesis then expands this point by putting the Slow Culture Artists in the broader context of the Slow Movement in Japan. Through these analyses, the thesis concludes that the significance of including ‘Asia’ in the discourse of transmodernism, is threefold.

- 1) ‘Asia’ is crucial as a cultural framework that has produced values alternative to modernity;
- 2) Linear notion of modernity is limiting and limited in explaining social development; and
- 3) The significance of ‘dialogue’ comes as the core value of transmodernism.

Chapter 1 clarifies the theoretical concept of transmodernism. It discusses, in particular, the notion of transmodernism developed by Enrique Dussel, as the origin of the notion of transmodernism, from which various other notions were formulated later. After clarifying Dussel's transmodernism, the chapter discusses various other applications of transmodernism including those by Smith, Cole, Dallmayr, Sardar, Gilroy and Ray. Of these, the thesis will adopt the one developed by Ray, who is one of the authors of *The Cultural Creatives*. The chapter will detail the core ideas of transmodernism as cemented by Dussel and it will clarify the reasons for adopting Ray's version of transmodernism as a more specific theoretical frame to conduct the comparative analysis of *Cultural Creatives* in the ‘West’ (Europe and the US) as described in *The*

Cultural Creatives, and the Slow Culture Artists in Japan as illustrated in *A Different Kind of Luxury* by Andy Couturier.

Chapter 2 discusses who the Cultural Creatives are and what they value. The chapter begins by explaining their foundations and how they came to form. The chapter discusses their six key values, which are later used as a set of ‘tools’ to compare them with Slow Culture Artists. They constitute the analytical parameter to compare the Cultural Creatives in the West and the Slow Culture Artists in Japan.

Chapter 3 presents a detailed discussion of the Slow Culture Artists. The chapter focuses on Couturier's book, *A Different Kind of Luxury*. More specifically, the chapter will analyse the lifestyle of eleven individuals introduced in Couturier’s book, against the parameters of six key values of the Cultural Creatives. By examining these eleven individuals, the overall values and ideas of this group are explored.

In Chapter 4, the Cultural Creatives and the Slow Culture Artists are compared using the six key values. The comparison will proceed with contextualising the values of these groups with broader transformation of values between the 1980s and the mid-2000s. The source for this data will be available from the World Value Surveys and will focus on information about value trends in Japan and the United States: which are the main focus of this thesis, as the Cultural Creatives are typically discussed about American Cultural Creatives in the book by Ray and Anderson.

The last chapter will then lead into the final concluding chapter that will discuss three key points arising from previous chapters:

- 1) the importance of Asia in regards to the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists.

In regards to the Cultural Creatives it stems from their foundations in transcendentalism and esoteric spiritualities and modern interests in Asian philosophies like Buddhism. For the Slow Culture Artists, the experience of living abroad in Asia, especially the surrounding region near India and the Himalayas combined with their foundations in traditional Japanese philosophy were significant to their value transformations.

2) The concern of linearity in forming progression of values. This will explore the WVS and discuss the analysis of modernisation.

3) The importance of the ideology of 'dialogue': connection of two-way 'voiced' communication, both physical and spiritual, with human to human and human to nature.

Chapter 1: Transmodernism: Moving Beyond Postmodernity

1. Enrique Dussel and the Contemporary Transmodernists

The purpose of this chapter is to give an insight into what transmodernism is, and the various schools of thought within it, to indicate which conceptualisation of transmodernism has been chosen for use in this thesis and why. Transmodernism is a concept founded by those who are critically engaged in the questions of modernisation and postmodernisation, and how modernisation has developed over time and across the globe.

The global age was founded on principles of modernisation and many previously developing nations have started using this model in order to begin transforming into prosperous and modernised nations. Modernisation, however, has often been associated with westernisation (Dussel 2003; Miyoshi & Harootunian 1989: vii) and finding a means to distinguish between the processes of modernisation away from westernisation is now seen as critically important (Luyckx 1999: 975-976). As these nations progress economically and technologically, the need to exchange dialogue and critiques concerning modernisation has increased, paradoxically, with major crisis arising from the 'modern' world: climate change, the Global Financial Crisis, and the nuclear disaster at Fukushima. It is an imperative of our age to search for alternatives to modernisation.

This thesis will focus on an emerging theoretical school of value changes that is seen as a solution to the problem of modernisation that is inextricably linked to westernisation. The name of this concept is transmodernism, a critique of modernity and postmodernity

as both dominating, one-way form of dialogue empowered through the West. The concept was created by Argentinian-Mexican philosopher, Enrique Dussel. Dussel's thoughts and philosophy has had great influence in Latin America and the Third World, but is still relatively unknown in the North (Lange 2000: 136).¹ Nevertheless, the school of transmodernism is slowly evolving, with contemporary transmodernists emerging across the globe.

In order to understand the origins transmodernism, a brief explanation of Dussel's philosophy will be explored to demonstrate how he formulated his concept of transmodernism. This section will begin by exploring his critiques of modernity and globalisation, which created the basis for his conceptualisation of liberation philosophy will be explored, as these conceptualisations played a major part in Dussel's shift from postmodernism to transmodernism (Lange 2000:136). Once the backdrop has been established, the chapter will discuss the foundations of transmodernism through Dussel's transmodernism by looking at its key features. The basic framework of transmodernism will be clarified and then the chapter will move into discussing some of the contemporary thinkers who positively adopt ideas from transmodernism into their own critiques of modernity (i.e. Sardar, Gilroy, Cole) and other transmodernist thinkers who have begun applying the concept to groups of people (i.e. Ray). In concluding this overview, the chapter will present Ray's conceptualisation as the most adequate model for comparative study within this thesis and briefly demonstrate how Ray has expanded upon the key values formulated by Dussel.

¹ By the 'North', Lange is referring to the highly industrialised advanced nations in the West, particularly Europe and United States. This definition also includes other nations Canada and Australia who were founded on the principles and morals of their western colonisers and/or other nations that have becoming prosperous and in course adopted many Western ideologies (i.e. Japan).

2. Enrique Dussel

Dussel's transmodernism is a theoretical concept that is envisioned as an alternative to modernity and the shift towards postmodernity. Transmodernism is a concept that seeks to critically engage the universality and particularity of ideas and engages with actual dialogue with the Other. Dialogue is the central theme of Dussel's thoughts and through the creation of transmodernism, he formulated a concept that avoids or transcends modern and postmodern relativism which subjectively views thoughts, values and ideas from a Western standard. As Goizueta (2000) notes, the 'notion of transmodernity does not propose a new way of thinking as to a new way of living in relation to Others, it rejects the subject-object dichotomy underlying both modern and postmodern paradigms' (Goizueta 2000:189).

Transmodernism or transmodernity can be seen as a culmination of the critical thinking of Dussel in his critique of modernity and its translation through globalisation and postmodernity, as projections of Western domination. The concept relates closely to Dussel's Philosophy of Liberation. As such, this chapter will begin by briefly looking at basic concepts behind Dussel's thoughts giving a backdrop to transmodernism.

3. Critique of modernity and globalisation

Dussel's work has been developed since the 1960s but his ideas have always focused on key themes of the Other and modernisation. These key themes relate to his philosophy of ethics and geopolitics of knowledge (Mignolo 2000:27): modernisation and globalisation, linked to Eurocentric and Western colonisation, critical analysis of modern philosophy, universality and particularity of ideas, and changing view of the Other in modernity and postmodernity. Dussel's philosophies and writing can largely be

placed into classified stages of thoughts throughout his life, and these periods have been influenced by many scholars, primarily Martin Heidegger, Karl-Otto Apel, Karl Marx, Jürgen Habermas and Emmanuel Levinas (Marsh 2000:51).

Dussel's critique of modernity, postmodernity and globalisation revolves around a critique of Eurocentric or Western historical processes that has given 'universalism' to European modern philosophies. This constructed 'universal history' has existed since the world-system was formed through Western colonialism and imperialism (Mignolo 2000:27-28). His own experience of living in Latin-America and understanding the dominating effects of modern philosophy led Dussel to critically examine the effects of modernisation, globalisation and the application of universal history.

Modernisation is a process of Eurocentric and Western expansion that was only made possible through the transfer of centrality from the Middle East to Europe and then through colonialism. Europe (and eventually North America) became the centre of history, philosophy and development with everything else seen as the marginal periphery. According to Mendieta (2000), however, the view that European history has universal applicability became questionable due to two key events: the collapse of European identity and the shift to 'world history' and the formation of the Third World (Mendieta 2000:118).

Dussel once considered himself a postmodernist, utilising many of its radical ideas such as anti-ideological stance, anti-globalisation, and the promotion of racial equality. More specifically, the reaffirmation of the dignity and validity of the Other was important for Dussel (Lange 2000:136). In time, however, his critique of modernity and postmodernity eventually guided Dussel to go beyond postmodernism, presenting his

own theory of modernity: transmodernism.

Dussel's criticism of postmodernism is that it failed as a critical tool for the Other. He holds that postmodernism is a continuation of modernity in that it is also a one-sided theory. Postmodernism is also West-centred. Dussel's point is perhaps best illustrated by Linda Lange's *Burnt Offerings to Rationality* (2000). Lange compares Dussel's critique of postmodernity with Chandra Mohanty's critique of feminist discourse. According to Lange, Dussel's analysis of postmodernism is similar to Mohanty's analysis of feminist's 'treatment' of Third World women (1991) (Lange 2000:146). Mohanty argues that the way Western feminists view themselves has been formulated based on their own reflection on, understanding of, and comparison with Third World women (Lange 2000:146). Feminist discourse has been created by privileged middle-class women in the West, and as a corollary, has created a negative image of women in the Third World. Mohanty argues that Third World women have diverse identities, and suggests that rather than focusing on 'cultural differences' feminist critique can be utilised as a different means to create political action.

In addition, Dussel also sees postmodernism as a safe tool for 'critical criticism', where radical talks do not produce radical results (Marsh 2000: 61). Postmodernism, whilst being able to denounce modern philosophy and perceive the errors of the modern world, fails to be critical towards the socio-economic problems that are the true issues for critical analysis. According to Marsh, 'postmodernism twists in the wind uneasily, praising a liberation it cannot deliver and claiming a legitimacy it cannot justify' (Marsh 2000:61). Hence, whilst Dussel did adopt ideas from postmodernism, he eventually recognised its failures in order to actually address real life issues that were causing alienation and oppression to the socially oppressed peoples.

Dussel sees globalisation as a new project of modernisation, whereby a new cartography of the West was formulated. The 'planetization' of history, i.e. the acceptance of a modern Western perspective as the method of understanding the globe and the entire human history, occurred through the universal application of Western model of modernisation, its modern philosophy, its notion of free market, laissez-faire liberalism, mass consumption and mass culture (Mendieta 2000:118). Dussel argues against this theory of globalisation, and seeks to dislodge its ethnocentric and Eurocentric framework (Mendieta 2000:124).

Dussel creates his argument by discussing the relationship between globalisation, history and ethics, and just like Apel, makes an ethical analysis of modernity and globalisation (Mendieta 2000:127). The core of his argument is that modernisation and globalisation are powered by the West as a hegemonic power due to its position as the centre of the world. Africa and East Asia have become the 'sacrifice' to the West's 'triumph', allowing for the West to formulate its philosophy and history as world history. Thus, Dussel discusses the 'underside' of this 'civilising' project. Dussel in *Politics of Liberation* (2007) discussed the relationships between globalisation, history and ethics by analysing the various stages of history and its development of modernity, ethics and globalisation.

Modernity in Dussel's understanding is the basis of sacrificial logic whereby the executor (this case Europe) has no blame placed on their onslaught of other cultures via civilisation, bureaucratisation and secularisation (Mendieta 2000:125). Globalisation as the next process, is seen as an ethical challenge: three fourths of the world live in poverty, being excluded and marginalised from having their own voice, while at the

same time, being succumbed to the financial institutions and politics that put them in the position of disadvantage. As Hans-Peter Martin and Harald Schumman claim, globalisation has allowed for a '20:80' world (Hans-Peter & Schumman 1996). The '20-80' world ratio concept implies that the voice of modernisation is split excessively skewed towards '80%' of the voice being Eurocentric West and the remaining '20%' spread across the rest of the world. In order to create a new kind of modernity and a new kind of globalisation that is not Eurocentric, Dussel suggests to give a voice to the those in the position of being oppressed (the 'unheard 20%').

Dussel proposes that the serious issues of globalisation could be changed with contemporary ethics giving recognition of life to all peoples. Just like Levinas' work is based on the ethics of the Other, or 'ethics as first philosophy' which was concerned with ethical justification of being, Dussel is concerned with the position of the Other — the marginalised, the excluded, the dominated, and the exploited individuals and collective 'other', relatively external to a system of economic, political and social domination now centred in North America, Europe and Japan (Marsh 2000:51). Dussel created three principles of foundational ethics: material principle, formal principle, the principle of feasibility (Marsh 2000) as a critical ethic to demonstrate the weakness of modernity and globalisation. In Dussel's view, the appropriate and necessary ethics for an age of globalisation and exclusion must begin with the affirmation of life and must include recognition of the plurality of ethical good (Mendieta 2000:129). All forms of socially constructed ethics and philosophies must be submitted to an universalisation test and at the same time, one should recognise what is both materially possible and feasible for each ethic and philosophy. Dussel however, recognises that every social system, norm and practice are imperfect, all ethical reflection must at the same time seek out victims of the system, and the ways in which they enunciate a critique of the

system, while also seeking to liberate these victims from their situation of negativity, privation and lack (Mendieta 2000:129). For globalisation to work, the voice of the world-system must be shifted to the victims, to engage in a critic of the system and give value to all.

The conceptualisation of Dussel's ethic and critique of modernity, postmodernity and globalisation eventually culminated into his Philosophy of Liberation. Philosophy of Liberation could be classified as the starting point of the formation of Dussel's transmodernism and the ideas that originate in it.

4. Liberation Philosophy

The philosophy of liberation or liberation philosophy has been a constant project for Dussel, who has grounded its ideas in transformational ethics and geopolitics.² Liberation philosophy is one of many intellectual and social decolonisation projects that emerged from the 1970s that announced the crisis of neoliberalism but was an impossibly abstract, universal democratic theory (Mignolo 2000:30). It has been largely influenced from his examination of Marx's work (1985, 1988 and 1990) and his revision of Marxism from Friedrich Engels to Habermas, going through Georg Lukacs, Vladimir Ilyich. Lenin, and Rosa Luxemburg (Mignolo 2000:27). Mignolo considers the influence of Levinas, however, to be the most prominent in forming Dussel's creative thinking.

In Mignolo's *Dussel's Philosophy of Liberation: Ethics and the Geopolitics of*

² Dussel views that ethics can be either 'reformational' or 'transformational' (Dussel 1998: 528-537). Dussel's liberation philosophy is a transformational ethic. Land and people cannot be 'naturally' subjective to system and as such, when they become *exteriority* once subsumed two things occur: they are exploited and at the same time, they still contain the essence of being exterior. Reformational ethics subside to or return to state of the system.

Knowledge, Mignolo acknowledges the ‘originality’ in Dussel's version of liberation philosophy. Dussel's experience of growing up and living in Latin America contributed greatly to his liberation philosophy, as he became aware and critical of the experience of ‘domination’: a given subjectivity dominating other subjectivity as universal phenomenon (Mignolo 2000:27). His ideas were framed in this experience of the modern\colonial world, the importance of 1492³ and dependency theory of Cardoso and Faletto (1969). From this, Dussel developed his concept of the world-system and the analysis of this system.

Levinas played a major role in Dussel's conceptualisation of liberation philosophy.⁴ Extending Heidegger, Levinas introduces the exteriority of ‘being’ as the fracture within the ‘Europe of Nations’, from the perspective of Jewish experience in the modern/colonial world (Mignolo 2000:30). In Dussel’s first major work, *Para una Ética de la Liberación Latinoamericana (Ethics and Liberation of Latin America)*, his discovery of Levinas allowed him ‘to move beyond Heideggerian ontology’ in understanding the field of liberation (Beach 2004:315). Geopolitics of knowledge was already heavily rooted in Dussel's thinking in the early 1970s, but after meeting Levinas in 1971, he discovered the effects of colonial difference in face-to-face contact but also discovered the limitations to Levinas.⁵ Dussel went beyond Levinas to incorporate the Third World and locates the critique of totality therein (Mignolo 2000:29). This colonial difference shared great similarity to Levinas' imperial difference; this marked the

3 1492 represents the date the colonisation of Latin-America by the Spanish. This was the period in which the world-system begun.

4 Dussel was greatly influenced by Levinas's *Totality and Infinity [1961]* (Mignolo 2000:27).

5 This is referring to the limitations in Levinas' work in regards to the passive nature of women, and Dussel in conversation with Levinas, seems to believe that Levinas fails to give an answer outside a Jewish context. Dussel used Levinas and Marx to further his ideas on ethics to produce his three principles of a critical ethics.

importance of regionalism and geopolitics.

The 16th century, colonial expansion and the formation of the Third World are all fundamental historical moments for Dussel. Third World was a marginal exteriority, part of totality but no power (Mignolo 2000:35) to a system divided by the 'American' camp and 'Soviet' camp. Mignolo points out a correlation: the strict geopolitical correlation and the Third World and the emergence of liberation philosophy on one hand and between liberation philosophy and Levinas' philosophical reflections on 'otherwise than being' after the Holocaust on the other (Mignolo 2000:35). The originality of Dussel's thoughts is that he does not construct his argument to supersede Levinas by stating that 'Latin American theory for Latin America' or 'English theory for English', but rather an attempt to re-rationalise the production of knowledge and its geohistorical relevance via geopolitics and its space.

Dussel constructed his thinking by using Marxism from the historical perspective of Latin America instead of looking at 'Marx in Latin America': universal perspective based on regional perspectives, as regional as that of Engels, Lenin, Luxembourg, Habermas or Althusser (Mignolo 2000:31). Dussel through reading *Das Kapital*, reconstructed Marx's *totality* through the ideas of Levinas, rereading as the *exteriority*; labour is the *exteriority* of capital. The *exteriority*, in this case labour, is subsumed by the system and controlled. In the 1970s, Dussel defined exteriority as the practice of the oppressed – oppressed primarily as the 'poor'; also considering oppression of gender, sexuality, age and ethnicity. For example, Latin America is subsumed by a world-system whereby its centrality is Europe, North America, Japan and other economically prosperous nations. Furthermore, *exteriority* can also be seen in knowledge and the production of knowledge, whereby the history of knowledge is confined to knowledge

of the West, with knowledge of the exterior being for cultural study not for epistemological potential. Liberation philosophy as living labour, is labour that engages critically with the totality of the system, that marks its boundaries and its limits, instead of being subsumed by and from the perspective of the system (Mignolo 2000:41).

Philosophy of liberation opens up the ‘coloniality of being’⁶ as a legitimate place for thinking, thus showing the regional limits of the universal production of ‘modern’ knowledge (Mignolo 2000:38). As a project, philosophy of liberation looks to intellectually ‘decolonise’ philosophy and knowledge production and in addition, it demonstrates the limits of universal pragmatism and instead gives legitimacy to regionalism. By focusing on regionalism⁷, liberation philosophy becomes a tool from the Third World linking explicitly place and knowledge, the ratio between historical locations and epistemic production (Mignolo 2000:40). Hence, it is a theoretical concept based on diversity: diversity of histories, philosophies, ideas, and people. However, being based on diversity liberation philosophy cannot be a monotopic and universal discourse ‘speaking’ the liberation of the diverse constituencies of civil society that can be identified as ‘oppressed’ (racially, sexually, generationally, economically etc.) (Mignolo 2000:42).

Liberation philosophy invites diversity to the way in which we think. It nullifies universal theory by representing the world in a framework of plurality. The *exteriority*, the living labour, the Other, is presented as being on the margins of the system, yet not subsumed, rather independently developing. Liberation philosophy invites finding an

6 [C]olonality of being’ refers to living with a colonized area. Dussel constructed this idea by extending ideas from Levinas.

7 Regionalism (international relations) is an expression used to define a sense of common identity and purpose together with the participation of institutions to promote a particular identity or idea. This identity shapes the collective actions within that geographical area.

alternative to capitalism and modernisation as it is currently known. As Dussel put it, 'Our project of liberation can be neither anti- nor pre- nor post-modern, but instead must be transmodern. This is . . . the condition of all possible philosophical dialogue between North and South, because we are situated in an asymmetrical relation.' (Dallamayr 2004: 116). Dussel's critiques and his philosophy of liberation were the foundations for his transmodernism, a theoretical concept that is an alternative to modernisation, postmodernisation and culminates in the ideas that he has been forming over many decades.

5. Transmodernism

Transmodernism is a theoretical conceptualisation that promotes 'difference' or particularism, sitting between postmodernism's absolutisation or particularity⁸ and the modern negation of particularity (Goizueta 2000:183). It is not a concept that looks to supersede modernism or postmodernism, rather the central thread between them. On the other hand, transmodernism also looks to 'transcend' modernism, not by creating something new, but by shifting modernism from something that is particular (Eurocentric).

Transmodernism has its roots in other theoretical conceptualisations of Dussel, primarily his philosophy of liberation. This 'parenthood' also means that transmodernism shares many of the same influences that Dussel used to form his thinking. Marxism and Catholicism, especially Roman Catholic Church's liberation theology wing (Cole 2008:69), played major influential roles the formation of liberation

⁸ Whereby modern particularism centres an argument or discussion on a subject from one particular point, postmodern particularism takes a single subject and looks at reflecting and transcending the original implications of this idea. Postmodern particularity is often associated with religious concepts of universalism, particularism and relativism.

philosophy (and consequently transmodernism). In addition, Dussel's thinking has evolved with his stages of influence and thought, and transmodernism can be regarded as one of these stages of thought. Dussel's transmodernism is complete cultivation of the ideas he has built on his critique of modernity and postmodernity: the myth of modernity, the failures of Europe to acknowledge and communicate in proper dialogue with the other and the limitations of postmodernism.

Marxist theorist Mike Cole in *Transmodernism, Marxism and Social Change* and *Transmodernism in Educational Theory*, perceives the key characteristics of Dussel's transmodernism as:

- Not so much a way of thinking as a new way of living in relation to Others;
- critique of modernity;
- critique of postmodernity;
- Anti-Eurocentrism;
- Anti-(US) imperialism;
- Analogical reasoning: reasoning from *outside* the system of global domination;
- Analectic interaction: listening to the voices of 'suffering Others' and interacting democratically with suffering Others;
- Reverence for (indigenous and ancient) traditions of religion, culture, philosophy and morality;
- Rejection of totalising synthesis. (Cole 2005:90; Cole 2008:69)

Philosophy of liberation and transmodernism are theories engaged with the Other; liberation philosophy opens the gate to the realisation of the Other whilst transmodernism attempts to create multi-particular space for universal dialogue and

integration between the dominate, the Other and even the 'absolutely absolute Other.'⁹ Transmodernism is not monotopical conceptualisation or tries to convey a singular universal principle, but attempting to create authentic inter-cultural dialogues (Goizuetta 2000:186).

Transmodernism, just like its 'attendant liberation philosophy' (Dallamy 2004:10), is critical towards modernisation and postmodernisation. Cole proposes that transmodernism is theoretically and practically more useful than postmodernism (Cole 2005:91). David Geoffrey Smith sees transmodernism as an anti-Eurocentric and anti-imperialist theory and unlike modernisation and postmodernisation, he regards that the theory sympathises with those outside their global dominance (Smith 2003; 2004). As such, transmodernism is a theoretical concept that can be considered to be associated with concepts that are generally alternative to the modern system, which includes such ideas as slow living.

Smith argues that transmodernism is effective as a theory, because it uses 'analogical' reasoning (Smith 2003:497), a system that gives voice to certain communities (being the suffering Other) and gives importance to the use of traditions in daily life. It disregards the total synthesis with modernisation, and instead proposes a fusion of traditional and modern ideas. Analogical reasoning comes from the work of Lenin (1901-1902)¹⁰ but Dussel departs from Lenin's conceptualisation of analogical reasoning. Dussel believes that the recognition of a 'co-realisation of solidarity' should occur from *outside* analogic reasoning itself. As Dussel asserts, 'this co-realisation of solidarity is analectic,

9 The 'absolutely absolute Other' refers to transcendent God. see Goizuetta's *Locating the Absolute*

10 Lenin's conceptualisation of analogical reasoning came from the concept that revolution is obtained outside the system of capital. It is outside the system of all classes. However, this outside cannot be obtained by the workers but by intellectual bourgeois who act with a revolutionary romanticism (Lenin 1932:1-2).

analogical, hybrid and *mestizo*,¹¹ which bonds the centre to the periphery, woman to man, race to race, ethnic group to ethnic group, class to class, humanity to Earth, and occidental to Third World' (Dussel 1995:138). In other words, unlike Lenin's approach, Dussel holds that the processes of reasoning should come from dialogue that embraces reasoning from all sides, thus creating a 'revolution' from a hybrid form of reasoning. This approach is similarly seen in transmodernism's analogical interaction with the suffering Other through democratic dialogue to give revelation to the Other and to liberate it. This principle is a core component of the thinking process of transmodernist groups like the Cultural Creatives.

Whilst Dussel was the father of transmodernism, transmodernism has begun to be applied by other intellectuals. I divide these 'contemporary transmodernists'¹² into three groups: 1) Marxist-Transmodernists including those individuals, such as David Geoffrey Smith, Mike Cole and Fred Dallamyr who have engaged in Dussel's transmodernism and its relationship with Marxism; 2) Those influenced by Dussel's transmodernism in regards to their own thinking, but are not necessarily labelled as 'transmodernists' such as sociologist Ziauddin Sardar and Paul Gilroy; 3) lastly, there is the 'Integration Theory Transmodernism' group, that extends Dussel's transmodernism. The primary advocates of the 'Integration Theory of Transmodern' are sociologist Paul H. Ray and Ken Wilbur.

11 It is a Spanish or Spanish Latin American term to refer to someone who is born from Spanish and Native American parents.

12 I refer to the intellectuals discussed below under the banner of Contemporary Transmodernists. In actuality, not all of them would be actually classified as 'transmodernists', but have been influenced or extremely interested in the application of transmodernism and what it is capable of theoretically doing.

6. Contemporary Transmodernists and Writers on Transmodernism

Dussel's transmodernism has been analysed and utilised by many academics, especially by Marxist intellectuals. In this section, a brief examination of some intellectuals (both transmodernists and otherwise) will be undertaken to demonstrate some of the applications of Dussel's transmodernism. This section will canvas some of the work by Smith, Cole, Fred Dallmayr, Ziauddin Sardar, Paul Gilroy and Paul H. Ray.

7. David Smith

In Smith's *Enfrauding the Public Sphere, the Futility of Empire and the Future of Knowledge after 'America'* (2003), Smith engages with a critic of the Bush Administration in the United States in using its information wars for imperial gains. 'Enfrauding' is a term coined by Smith, and it means 'to become in the condition of being deceived' or 'to become more so deceived'. In this case, 'enfrauding the public sphere' is not a case of simple deception but a more generalised deception through conditioning the system via systemised lying and deception (Smith 2003:488-489). Smith aligns this enfrauding to the Bush administration's 'war on terror' ('us' versus 'them') and the imperial aims behind it by manipulation of the media and its restrictions on the academic world. He believes that a 'new imperial' agenda based on a *singular* model: freedom, democracy and free enterprise. Smith utilises Dussel's 'myth of modernity' to demonstrate that the 'myth of sacrificial reason' is still being used by the United States.

8. Mike Cole

Cole is a Marxist academic who has written extensively on the relationship between Marxism and transmodernism through frequent literary debates with Smith. Cole discusses transmodernism twice in his book *Marxism and Educational Theory*. Whilst

he is a Marxist, Cole sympathises with many of the features of transmodernism, but does discuss issues in some areas of transmodernism. The importance of Cole's engagement with transmodernism is that it recalls Dussel's own influences from Marxism, and allows for intellectual dialogue between the two theories.

His first chapter within the book, *Transmodernism in Educational Theory*, gives a critique of Smith's transmodern analysis of educational theory by using Marxism and demonstrates some of the flaws of Smith's application of transmodernism. Cole analyses the features of transmodernism and argues that Marxism is more effective. He concludes that Smith's work 'as a denied romanticism' that cannot theoretically function in the real world. Cole suggests that a 'romanticised moralism based on Confucius, Buddha and Amerindian philosophy' would be a much better outcome (Smith 2003:500; Cole 2008:83). Following his critique of elements of transmodernism, Cole does see transmodernism as a much more viable means of theoretical interpretation than postmodernism as a step towards the future.

In the later chapter, *The New Imperialism*, Cole examines the 'new imperialism' through the theoretical perspectives of postmodernism, transmodernism and Marxism through discussing Smith's work once again. Smith, using transmodernism, extends his analysis of the United States' imperialistic agenda. Cole surmises that Smith's enfranchising are useful tools but he finds problems for Marxism in the vagueness of transmodernism's 'narcissism'. Cole proposes that racialization, an ideological process that accompanies the appropriation of labour power (the capacity to labour), where people are categorised falsely into scientifically defunct notion of distinct 'race' (Cole 2008:106) is a more appropriate tool. This is because the racialization of the Other and Otherness gives better reasoning for the violence against them and the Other

subjugation by the 'dominate'. He concludes that both transmodernism and Marxism are useful in teaching imperialism to students.

The importance of these dialogues between Cole and Smith is that these dialogues can help strengthen and expose the weaknesses of transmodernism and Marxism. Cole's personal acceptance of many of the aspects of transmodernism clarify Dussel's own influences with Marxism and helps supports transmodernism is a theoretical tool over the current trend towards postmodernism. In addition, Marxism and transmodernism could be applicable to one another due to these concepts both discussing the victims or Others of the modern condition. Cole and Smith do well to highlight established ideas of Dussel and expand upon his ideas but targeting a specific area (in this case the discussion of education). They demonstrate how transmodernism can theoretically be put into practice.

9. Fred Dallmayr

Fred Dallmayr is a political scientist based at the University of Notre Dame and has written many extensive papers on the topic of modernity. In *The Underside of Modernity: Adorno, Heidegger and Dussel*, Dallmayr examines the critical engagement of modernity by Theodore Adorno and Heidegger, ending with the new critique of modernity from its 'underside' by Dussel. He does an analysis of Adorno and Heidegger and the impact they have had on modernity and the construction of the 'North and South'. He discusses Dussel and his transmodernity as a contemporary critique of modernity and as an academic of the 'South' greatly influenced by a variety of European writers like Marx, Gramsci, and Adorno to the Heidegger, Ricoeur and Levinas (Dallmayr 2004:113). Dallmayr examines Dussel's two major texts: *The Invention of the Americas* (1992) and *The Underside of Modernity* (1996). This

examination articulates Dussel's suggestion of an alternative to modernity through the lens of the Other via the philosophy of liberation and transmodernity. Philosophy of liberation is viewed as one of the most prominent counter-discourses of present time, truly a philosophy 'born in the periphery' but with 'global or planetary aspirations' (Dallmayr 2004:116).

10. Ziauddin Sardar

Sardar is a prominent Pakistani-London based academic, who has written on a wide range of issues from science, critique of modernity, postmodernity and cultural relations, Islamic issues and the future of Islam as well as transmodernism. Whilst not a transmodernist, he has adopted this theoretical concept on many occasions, especially in regards to his critique of modernity, dealing with cultural relations and engagement with the Other. Sardar's conceptualisation of transmodernity goes beyond modernism and postmodernism, the 'last bastion of Western imperialism' (Sardar 1998: 69).¹³ His transmodernity is a fusion of traditionalism that can be changed and reshaped and a new form of modernity that respects and values traditional culture (Sardar 2006).

In *Beyond Difference*, Sardar engages with the topic of cultural relations, a new seminal issue and created by many different histories (Sardar 2006:288). Sardar discusses how modernity has severely distorted cultural relations. The history of cultural relations is

¹³ Sardar discusses postmodernism as a tool of Western imperialism. Postmodernism consequently is a means to transmit cultural imperialism onto the third world, and forcing them to adopt a modernity and postmodernity of the West. By adopting the pathway to modernisation seen in Western history, they would have to discard their own traditional cultural practices. He views transmodernism a better solution, as it allows for the creation of a third world modernity that can incorporate tradition. He references Vinay Lin and Parvez Manoor.

embedded into two specific concepts that need to be transcended: modernity and multiculturalism (Sardar 2006: 289). The framework of modernity represents itself as a superior mode of existence with a mono-history. It has been able to spread from Europe (after the Enlightenment period) by colonisation and still holds significant influence in the postcolonial society. A system of 'push' and 'pull'¹⁴ keeps modernity in. Multiculturalism is a product of modernity. Coming out of the push for racial equality in America in the 1950s, it opens the gates for greater equality but at the same time, it created further issues: the standardised interpretation of multiculturalism (American version) that translated ideas democracy, civil society, human rights and 'whites' and 'ethnics' (Sardar 2006: 292-293).

Sardar believes that a framework of modernity and multiculturalism based on a Western model in cultural relations will simply fail. For cultural relations to work, the current model of applied modernism needs to be transformed into a model of applied transmodernism, and the current model of multiculturalism needs to be transformed into a model of mutually assured diversity (Sardar 2006: 294). Transmodernism goes beyond modernism and postmodernism. It is not a linear progression. It is best understood with Chaos Theory (Sardar 1998) in mind as it is a transition from chaos into a new order, whereby traditionalism and transmodernism synthesise together. In regards to cultural relations, transmodernism sees tradition as dynamic, amenable, capable and eager to change: cultures capable of transcending the dominant model of modernity (Sardar 2006: 296). Transmodernism, unlike modernism and postmodernism, can make visible the changes in traditions. In addition, and most importantly,

14 The 'push' factor was conceptualised by Indian intellectual Ashi Nandy. It corresponds to the Western ideas through modernity being pushed on to traditional societies to enlighten them into the global economic system. The 'pull' factor, as Sardar describes it, is elites in traditional societies accepting their cultures as 'backward' to modernity. This creates imitations who reflect on 'golden times'. This has created a hostile ambivalent relationship for traditional and modernity (Sardar 2006: 289-290).

transmodernism segments history from being monohistorical to plural, allowing for many interpretations being modern. In cultural relations, parity is formed: rather than the 'West' modernising the 'East', it can be that the 'East' can transmodernise the 'West' (Sardar 2006: 297). Mutually assured diversity coincides with the framework of transmodernism, creating a space for difference to exist as difference. It is a universal mutual acceptance of the continuity of cultural diversity for all within a space of adaptive, meaning, negotiation and dialogue; a 'polylogue' (multiple dialogues) that redistributes the concept of power.

In *Opening the Gates*, Sardar examines gated communities which are those communities that are segregated within the mass consumer capitalist system. They are victims of a constant want for economic growth and progress by market forces that manipulate the world's societies. Growth and progress are the bedrock of modernity (Sardar 2010: 9), and whilst this solved many societal problems, inequality still remains. In Gated communities certain individuals are seen to be segregated from the wealth, and the wealthy prevent them from acquiring sustainable equality. As such, gated communities do not have neutral values, as they idealise, incorporate and empower a particular set of aspirations and the social and economic structures they require (Sardar 2010: 10). Gated communities represent the commodification and monetarisation of everything and its subordination to the free market. It is a community system that relies on inequality to exist. Sardar says: 'gated communities are the neo-imperialist colonisation of society: they are like empires within a city that maintain the relationship of the colonisers and the colonised, albeit in an urban setting' (Sardar 2010: 11).

The global financial crisis of the market (2007-2008) and its economic impacts symbolically demonstrated the new crisis of modernity and it is through the ideas of

alternative philosophies such transmodernism (both in its original and contemporary forms) that new positive directions of modernisation can be considered and there is evidence of these changes. One such example is the shift in some parts of advanced, industrial societies towards more sustainable means of living to secure a future from further economic crisis, environmental degradation, climate change and the slow decline of the United States and Europe. For the problem of gated communities, a transformation into more equal urban spaces is needed; modernity needs to be transcended. Sardar suggests transmodernity: 'going beyond' modernity in every aspect: the way in which people live and structure communities; the way people interact with the environment; the way economic activities are pursued; the way people perceive progress; and the way people shape discourses of knowledge (Sardar 2010: 11). A transmodern economy would be a function of transmodernity: a more plural, diversified world where examples, ideas, values, cultures and traditions of all can be participate equally in dialogue about available solutions (Sardar 2010: 12). By shifting towards transmodernity, this would allow an interrogation of modernity from a diverse perspective of values and ideas from traditional and cultural practices and in addition, allows for greater dialogue onto solving societal problems such as the gated communities.

11. Paul Gilroy

Paul Gilroy (1993), a cultural theorist and a path breaking scholar of Black Atlantic diaspora, is also labelled a contemporary transmodernist (Cole 2008:69). In his book *The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness*, he uses transmodern thinking to discuss the evolution of black history through moving away from ethnic absolutism and more towards a space of transnational culture (Barnes 1996:106) based on a hybrid of black and European identity (Brazier & Mannur 2006:49).

Taking the idea of Jewish diaspora from Levinas, Gilroy applies the idea to a new contemporary diaspora: the black diaspora. Gilroy's black diaspora, however, does not take the classical model of diaspora, but works as a hybrid. It is not unitary, but based on movement, interconnection and mixed references (Chivallon 2002: 359). The Black experience of the Americas is then, neither modern nor traditional, but both at the same time. In *Black Atlantic*, Gilroy incorporates this idea proposing that cultural historians could view the Atlantic as one giant complex unit of analysis in their discussion of the modern world through an explicitly transnational and intercultural perspective (Gilroy 1993: 15). He proposes that the 'black Atlantic historical experience' cannot be confined by the tradition of slave, as it is only one part of an absolute or complete identity of black Atlantic people. This hybrid experience is reminiscent of Dussel's transmodernism. Gilroy attempts to reconstruct cultural theorists' analysis of the historical perspective of black political and cultural history from mono-timeline to a plurality of histories that cultivate a plurality of identities. This framework challenges the discourse of modernity in regards to black identity with a 'counter-culture of modernity'. Gilroy suggests that this counter-culture of modernity is not anti-modern, but equipped to defy the illusory separation of modernity (Chivallon 2002: 361). He attempts to redefine how black identity has been shaped, breaking from the slave tradition and more so to a hybridity based on a foundation in Africa and within the modern world. This conceptualisation echoes Dussel's transmodernism in regards to reframing the Other (in this case Latin-America).

12. Paul H. Ray

Ray is an American sociologist who has worked on analysing value changes in American (primarily) and European societies. Ray in 1996 wrote the article *The Rise of*

Integral Culture, an article that discussed his concept of transmodernism that was primarily influenced by Integral Theory, a theory that utilised transpersonal psychology and transpersonal spirituality through a transdisciplinary approach (i.e. Buddhist spirituality and physics) which was founded by Ken Wilber, a Nagarjuna and Madhyamika Buddhist practitioner (Kornman 1996:1) and philosopher, and also drew foundations from esoteric movements of the Renaissance period and Transcendentalism and other 19th Century philosophers (Ray & Anderson 2000:171).

Transcendentalism was a school of thought that originated in the 19th century and promoted individualism based on self-reliance, inherent goodness of humankind and nature and esoteric, utilising ideas from Eastern spirituality and philosophies. Its ideas were rooted in the transcendental thought of Immanuel Kant and German idealism and a variety of other sources, such as Vedic thought, various religious and spiritual and English Romanticism. The movement was formulated as a reaction to social and political conditions of the time, especially reacting to the state of intellectualism at Harvard University and utilitarian nature of the Christian church. Prominent figures of the transcendentalist movement were Ralph Waldo Emerson, Henry David Thoreau, John Muir, Margaret Fuller and Amos Bronson Alcott. They had significant influence on the Cultural Creatives.

The Transcendentalists engaged with a variety of ideas and values, both modern, traditional and 'exotic' and encompassed these ideas together to form an eclectic membrane of values, with Emerson, Thoreau and Alcott being prime examples. Emerson was highly influenced by Hinduism and Buddhism, as well as philosophically engaging with other areas of thought, such as Confucianism.¹⁵ Emerson developed a

15 Federic Carpenter's *Emerson in Asia* deeply examines Emerson's interactions with Buddhism, Hinduism and Confucianism. The book details how these philosophies came to influence him, how these

spiritual philosophy that placed the human within the context of a double consciousness, the 'inner self' and 'outer self'. He referred this spiritual philosophy to as the 'Over Soul' (Takanashi 2009:114-115). He viewed God as a personal God that one is connected to on an individual level. His Over Soul principle and his views of the spiritual realm were most influenced by Hinduism. Thoreau additionally developed much of his philosophy from Eastern philosophies and Eastern spiritualism. However, unlike Emerson who was interested in these philosophies from a spiritual and morale perspective, Thoreau was interested these philosophies' interaction with nature. Thoreau's legacy lies in his thoughts on nature which culminated best in his work *Walden*, which describes his time living alone amongst nature, relying on self-sufficiency and even discusses transcendentalism's debt to Vedic thought (Thoreau 1854:279).

The love of nature was not only founded in the ideas of transcendentalists like Thoreau, but naturalists like Muir played a crucial part in the evolvment of this idea in the Cultural Creative psyche. Muir was a naturalist and is perceived as the greatest forerunner for modern environmentalism. Muir believed that humans, no matter the ethnicity, were born with an 'inherited wilderness', and argued that genetically humans are born with a deep bond to nature, and there is an impulse to leave civilisation and go to nature (Hall 2008:3). Muir's spiritual connection to nature can be reflected in his many writings. He contributed greatly to geological and botanic studies, co-founded the Sierra Club, helped preserve many natural landscapes in America and formulated the environmental preservation theory. The foundations of these three men and principles of the transcendentalists were greatly influential in the United States, especially for the environmental movement and Ray's conceptualisation of transmodernism.

philosophies were used in his thought and his thoughts on them. Also see Arthur Christy's *The Orient in Transcendentalism: a study of Emerson, Thoreau and Alcott*.

Whilst Emerson, Thoreau, Muir and Alcott's engagements with multitudes of worldly values would become foundational cornerstones of the Cultural Creatives, transcendentalists like Fuller shaped the importance of women in the Cultural Creative mindset. Fuller was an author, journalist and women's rights advocate. Her book *Woman in the Nineteenth Century* widely regarded as the foundations of the women's rights movement (Fuller & Reynolds 1998). She was an early proponent of feminism and advocate for women's rights (Brooks 1952: 245). Fuller believed that if women could acquire more rights than they would eventually push for political rights (Blanchard 1987:132). She believed that both men and women could have masculine and feminine traits. In regards to the transcendentalist movement, Fuller agreed with enhancing the psychological well-being of the individual (Von Mehren 1994:231) but was more of a social activist than other members of the Transcendentalism Club, such as Emerson (Slater 1978:97-98).

These foundations in eclectic value absorption, the love of nature and significance of women and women's issues were part of a spiritual mould and thought processes of the Cultural Creatives, and the work of Wilber was used as a basis of describing their multi-layered spiritual/physical consciousness. Wilber's has been credited in conceptualising integral thought, starting with *the Spectrum of Consciousness* (1973), in which he attempted to integrate knowledge from disparate fields. Integral Thought, as described by Wilber, is primarily 'an overall world philosophy, an approach to consciousness and history that takes the best of the East and the West into account, and attempts to honour them both' (Kornman 1996: 1). Integral Theory is an eclectic philosophy based on a synthesis of pre-modern, modern and postmodern realities (Esbjörn-Hargens 2010). It originally was a concept of transpersonal philosophy that tried to fuse concepts of consciousness from Western and non-Western philosophies (Grof 2010:11). It is an

attempt at converging theories, ideas, philosophies and spiritualities that are in relation to each other and to synthesis their good parts to create a new idea that is complementary to all. This also includes accepting parts of modernity and postmodernity, however, he is still critical towards modernity and postmodernity, especially in their absolute acceptance of scientific materialism (Kornman 1996:1). Integral Thought is about a diversity of truths, both spiritual and material, and the ability to utilise ideas from everywhere. Therefore, Ray's transmodernism then, is a theoretical conceptualisation where traditionalism and modernism synthesis together with a cognitive style based on taking varied information from many sources and creating a new big picture (Ray 1996; Middendorf 1999).

Ray's conceptualisation of transmodernism synthesises Dussel's transmodernism and Wilber's integral theory, and as such I refer to it as 'Integral Transmodernism'. In *Rise of Integral Culture*, Ray discusses the value changes that have been going on in America, splitting the emerging groups of Americans into Tractional, Modernist and Cultural Creatives. The Cultural Creatives are those individuals emerging from this rising integral culture/transmodernism. In comparison to Dussel's transmodernism, Ray's transmodernism of the Integral school extends from Dussel's conceptualisation of transmodernism's key ideas (analogical and analectic reasoning that encompasses dialogue with the Other, critical engagement of modernity, postmodernity, Eurocentric and colonialism, reverence for traditions and rejection of totalising) by focusing primarily on transpersonal development, alternative religions and spiritualism. In addition, it places strong emphasis on the environmental protection, globalism, social equality and close family and community ties (Ray 1996; Ray & Anderson 2000:1-43). A primary difference between Dussel's transmodernism and that of Ray's transmodernism is that the latter has been created in the 'North'. This 'Northern'

transmodernism and 'Southern' transmodernism¹⁶ differentiate from each other in position to their critical engagement of modernity. Dussel's transmodernism is about engagement from the perspective of the Other to the dominant. 'Integral Transmodernism', on the other hand, is a theory derived from 'within advance modernity' and tilts towards 'the Other'. It values this contradiction of modern ideology and subsequently tries to create change internally towards a more equal space.

13. Integral Transmodernism as a Theoretical Framework

In this chapter, the theoretical concept of transmodernism was introduced through a brief explanation of transmodernism as a theory, as well as the various schools of transmodernist thought, highlighting some of its contemporary applications. For the purpose of this thesis, Ray's conceptualisation of transmodernism will be utilised.

Ray's transmodernism was specifically used as a means to evaluate and understand the values and ideas of groups of people. This concept has had practical application in the past. It was used to identify and understand members of the 'Cultural Creative' sub-culture. Transmodernism was used to show why members of the subculture were living like they do, how the sub-culture came about and what its existence could mean for the future. Similarly, in this thesis, a small group of Japanese will be examined to see if transmodernism is applicable to understand their way of living and philosophies of life. Also, Ray's Cultural Creatives are the only specific group categorised as a transmodernist group to date.¹⁷ As such, Ray's transmodernism has the most relevance to this thesis.

16 By Northern and Southern I am not just referring to geography, but also geopolitics. Ray is a 'white America' living in the United States, one of the centres of modernity and as a Caucasian he is can also be defined in the 'dominate ethnicity'.

17 Sardar in *Beyond Difference* states that Canada is the closet country to being transmodern. This is due to its multiple national languages and cultures, as well as allowing different traditional laws to interact with

The prime subject of this investigation will come from Japan. Japan is regarded as a nation categorised within the dominant geopolitical front of modernity. Since the end of World War 2 and the end of the American Occupation, Japan was gone from a dilapidated state to become the third most powerful economy in the world. As such, Japan holds significant influence politically, economically and culturally. Japan can be classified within the centrality of modernity due the great influences of western modernity. However, it is also unique, as an Asian nation that has successfully joined the central modernity. Japan is a dualist nation of western and Asian ideologies.

Even though Japan is classified as having a dual identity, in many ways it is a society built on hegemonic social identities and social constructions. The Japanese project themselves as mono-ethnic culture and even today; many long standing social expectations and roles have continued legitimacy in society. However, in reality, Japan is filled with diverse people and ideas. Japan's relationship with its own Others (*zainichi* Koreans and Japanese, indigenous Ainu and Okinawans, foreigners and Japanese that live outside the modern culture) has been a constant topic of discussion and examination both inside and outside of academia. The engagement with the Other is more important than ever now that cracks can evidently be seen since the economic bubble burst and the faults of modernity rose to the surface. These immediate problems include issues of a declining birth rate which has opened the discussion on intensify about Japan's immigration policies (Majirox News 2012), stagnating economy and unemployment facing Japan, and the perception of the Ainu (Japanese natives) (Fogarty 2008) and the other ethnic groups in Japan and the transforming social expectations being set by the following generations. These problems seen in Japan's modernity can also be seen in similar modernities such as the United States and Europe and these

similar modernities are being continually shaped by alternative social, political, economic and cultural ideas. The engagements have allowed these Western nations to deal on issues in a more plural nature, and interacting plurally will be an important step forward for Japan.

Japan's dualism and natural ability to absorb ideas though, has great potential in forming and shaping alternative possibilities and moving towards greater pluralism. The Cultural Creatives discussed in the following chapter emerged from engagement with the faults seen in modernity in the United States (well before Japan's economic crash) and are recognised as producing a possible revolution to the modern condition by promoters of the concept of transmodernism. Whilst they are not directly present in Japan, the ideology, practices and concepts of the Cultural Creatives have been absorbed and interpreted through Japan's alternative movements. Then, who are the Cultural Creatives and how have they used transmodernism to create an alternative to the hegemonic modernity? These are the questions addressed in the following chapter.

Chapter 2: The Cultural Creatives: An Emerging Subculture

1. Introduction

Following the general introduction of transmodernism presented in the first chapter, this chapter focuses on transmodernism as it was interpreted by Ray (2000) and expressed in his identification of the Cultural Creatives subculture. More specifically, this chapter investigates what and who the Cultural Creatives are by looking at the intellectual genesis of the values and ideas they hold. The aim of this chapter is to illustrate *transmodernism in practice* in order to make it easier to examine its applicability outside of the cultural boundary of America and Europe where transmodernism was originally applied. This chapter is in preparation for the examination of the hypothesis that the values and ideas of Cultural Creatives can be applied outside the West as can be seen in the case of the 'Slow Culture Artists' in Japan.

To put it simply, 'Cultural Creatives' refer to a vast number of individuals in America (and Europe) who have held a 'new' kind of value system since the 1980s. *Cultural Creatives: How 50 million people are changing their world* by Paul H. Ray and Sherry Anderson (2000) discusses an *emerging subculture* in America. This book is used here as the main source to provide the detailed illustration of the Cultural Creatives. The book combines two different elements, the first being the quantitative data concerning the Cultural Creatives, based on thirteen years of research on values and culture conducted by Ray's company, American LIVES. The data was collected from over a hundred thousand individuals by means of questionnaire surveys and focus groups, with two major studies conducted in 1995 and 1999 (Ray & Anderson 2000: xii). Secondly, the book is based on qualitative data collected from sixty individuals through in-depth

interviews. *The Feminine Face of God* by Anderson and Hopkins (1992) was used as the template for the stories included in the book. The stories supplement the statistical data, providing more concrete profiles of the Cultural Creatives.

The purpose of this chapter is to expand upon the theory of transmodernism by examining the Cultural Creatives as a sociological phenomenon that represents transmodernism. This investigation will be conducted by illuminating the historical context in which the Cultural Creatives emerged. More specifically, the chapter consists of two parts.

The first part explores the origins of the Cultural Creatives by clarifying its relationship with two dominant undercurrents in the United States that influenced the emergence of the Cultural Creatives: 'the Traditionals' and 'the Moderns'.

Furthermore, the investigation will highlight the likely influence of the Cultural Creatives in Japan's alternative circles and its critics within academia. By establishing who the Traditionals and Moderns are and what their values consist of, the characteristics of the Cultural Creatives will be clarified. The chapter demonstrates contrasting values and ideas advocated by The Traditionals and Moderns, and illustrates how the Cultural Creatives emerged as a *fusion* of the two, and how as a result, they came to find importance on such things as spirituality, innovative ecological business, environmental sustainability, anti-success culture, as well as family and friends.

This section in part one follows on to explore the origin of the Cultural Creatives in its relationship with new social movements that emerged in the 1960s. If the Traditionals and Moderns established many of the core values of the Cultural Creatives, the new social movements taught them how to live and think. According to Ray and Anderson,

the Black Freedom Movement and the Women's Movement¹⁸ ascribed the greatest influence to the Cultural Creatives (Ray & Anderson 2000:110-138). In addition, it will describe the impact of the Environmental Movement and Consciousness Movement on the Cultural Creatives. This section will examine how these movements influenced the Cultural Creatives' way of thinking, their values and the way they choose to live their lives.

Finally, based on this exploration on the origin of the Cultural Creatives, their core values will be clarified next. Their values reflect Ray's conceptualisation of integral transmodernism. The Cultural Creatives live by an eclectic fusion of 1) various traditional values, philosophies and practices from around the world with 2) modern values, practices and ways of living. This examination will focus on a selected number of values and ideas that represent the core of the Cultural Creatives, which include such things as sacredness of the environment, importance of women and women's issues, personal actualisation and personal development, spiritualism, globalism, social optimism, holistic thinking, and dislike of success culture.

The second part of this chapter will highlight some of the main academic criticisms of the Cultural Creatives, followed by their influence in Japan. Primarily, these critiques personify the Cultural Creatives as merely new economic consumers and with too utopian social aspirations. The Cultural Creatives emergence, however, has been seen by others as not significant for greater change in U.S and European society. This component will focus on writings by Cole, Stevenson, Cresen, Ginsberg and Gelfer. This section is placed within the thesis to demonstrate how transmodernism can

18 The Black Freedom Movement and the Women's Movement were two new social movements that emerged in the late 1950s- early 1960s. The Black Freedom Movement promoted racial equality. The Women's Movement used the success of the Black Freedom Movement and reframed the argument for gender equality.

potentially fail as well as to prevent bias. For all the positive pathways available from transmodernism, these critiques demonstrate that there are many ways transmodernism can have failed outcomes.

Following from this portion of the chapter, Shinichi Tsuji, a prominent Japanese academic and activist that promotes 'slow living' and the Sloth Club, a Japanese slow movement organization that promote sustainable living will be divulged. Tsuji and the Sloth Club have been significantly influenced by the Cultural Creatives, and demonstrates how the Slow Movement in Japan can be referred to as 'Japan's Cultural Creatives'.

2. How the Cultural Creatives Emerged: The Relationship between the 'Traditionals' and the 'Moderns'

The emergence of the Cultural Creatives demonstrates a momentous shift in values and ideas occurring in the U.S and Europe. Ronald Inglehart proposes that it is developed countries, rather than undeveloped countries, that are seeing shifts in values and ideologies from modernisation to postmodernisation (Inglehart 1997). The process of modern development will demonstrate how the Cultural Creatives emerged and how these processes created their transmodern thought.

Modernisation is a stage of social transformation that follows agrarian and traditional societies. It is considered to be a cluster of complex social changes, such as economic rationality, secularisation, an emphasis of science based technologies, the introduction of the mass media, the proliferation of a state-sponsored system of education, urbanization, secularization, increasing interdependence within the society and the increase of political rights to citizens. Modernisation, however, has often been

analogous with Westernisation (often seen as negative) and the erosion of traditional culture (Kunczik 2008:467-468). Economic, social, cultural and political values change in coherent and predictable patterns, and these changes are closely linked together (Inglehart, Basanez & Moreno 1995:8). These changes are intensified by historical events, processes of change such as industrialisation, postmodernisation and post-industrialisation and generational changes. Industrialisation is a process of modernisation and is the key instigator for the shift in values in societies; the more advanced a nation, the greater shift occurs.

Postmodernism, according to Sullivan is, 'a somewhat amorphous concept that at its core involves calling into question modernist or positivist assumptions about the nature of reality' (Sullivan 2009:396). Rather than modernisation's fixed objective view of reality, postmodernisation gather reality on the basis of human interaction with the world, from an individual, cultural and multicultural standpoint. As such, postmodernism is not constrained by being considered 'Western', but takes standpoint of multiculturalism. Hence, postmodernism can be difficult to define. The shift towards postmodernism and post-industrialisation are slow-changing in nature, but it means that values and ideas in mainstream society are slowly transforming (Ray 1997b:1), some examples being the emergence of postmaterialist values, increase of ecological values, greater emphasis on equal rights, questioning why things are done rather than how it can be done.

The period of the late 1950s to 1960s, according to Ray and Anderson, lived two subcultures that were prominent in the U.S within this realm of modernity: the 'Traditionals', a counterforce to modernisation whose values are embedded in the traditional and the 'Moderns', the most prominent group whose values and ideas are the

mainstream. According to Ray and Anderson, the Cultural Creatives emerged into 'war to define the social reality of America', a cultural conflict between two different types of people to define how Americans should live (Ray and Anderson 2000:67). In *Culture Wars*, James Davidson Hunter describes the current culture war (as Ray and Anderson describe as between Traditions versus Moderns) as representing deep fundamentals of American consciousness, and is a matter 'achieving dominance' (Davidson Hunter 1991:52) These two sides argue for cultural discontent to the other parties' values and practices. This discontent, as Smelser and Anderson in *Diversity and its discontents*, refute cultural discontentment as being associated with 'loss of values', 'hegemonic patterns', 'modern versus postmodern' and so forth but rather that social conflicts in the modern American setting are based on the *same* set of values (Smelser and Anderson 1999:11). Social conflict lies in reinterpretations of social norms and values, mostly norms. These conflicts are centred on more specific issues in a shared network of beliefs such as 'abortions should be allowed', 'women's right to say no to sex', 'fathers should be allowed to have sole custody'. Smelser and Anderson argue that the rational approach would be to create a new set of norms, but unfortunately either 'traditional intellectuals' affirm their position or modern culture takes the 'traditional views' and throws them out (Smelser and Anderson 1999:11). The new social movements started forming due to their own cultural conflicts of modern and traditional society. They looked to form new norms that changed the foundations in which traditional and modern society battled with one another. The Black Freedom Movement and the Women's Movement were the first to emerge and were the catalyst for other social movements. Ultimately, their existence would open space for communication, debate and reformation of the American identity, society and culture¹⁹ was changing, and this

19 This uncertainty refers to the lack of solid identity that would be created from the dramatic changes that would result from the new social movements. The idea of family, work, social standards, etc. would take new forms. This uncertainty meant that people could not 'predict' the outcome of their lives.

force of change would create new ways of thinking and living. These emerging social movements and this uncertainty would lay the foundations for the emergence of the third subculture: the Cultural Creatives.

In order to explore what the Cultural Creatives represent, this section will briefly discuss first who the Traditionals and Moderns are and what they value. Understanding who these subcultures are is important for establishing how the Cultural Creatives structured their values and ideas. This is particularly so because integration is key to integral transmodernism. The Cultural Creatives integrated ideas and values from Traditionals and the Moderns, whilst additionally being influenced by the emerging new social movements in order to establish their own sense of values and identity. In the next section, the values of the Moderns and the Traditionals are clarified before moving on to discuss the influence of new social movements.

3. The Two Subcultures (1): The Moderns

Examples of values and ideologies that are associated with being a Modern include:

- Making or having a lot of money.
- Climbing the ladder of success with measurable steps toward one's goals.
- 'Looking good' or being stylish.
- 'When the going gets tough, the tough go shopping'.
- Having lots of choices (as a consumer, as a voter or on the job).
- Being on top of the latest trends, styles and innovations (as a consumer or on the job).
- Supporting the economic and technological progress at the national level.
- Rejecting the values and concerns of native people, rural people, Traditionals,

New Agers, religious mystics (Ray & Anderson 2000:27).

The ideologies and values of Moderns that causes tension in their relationships to Traditionals (T) and Cultural Creatives (CC) include:

- Setting goals is very important and effective and so are measures of goal attainment (T).
- Analysing things into their parts is the best way to solve problems (T).
- It's not normal to be concerned about inner or spiritual life (CC and T)²⁰.
- You have the right to be entertained by the media (CC).
- Your body is pretty much like a machine (CC and T).
- Most organisations lend themselves to machine analogies (CC and T).
- Either big business knows best or big government knows best (CC and T).
- Bigger is better (CC and T).
- Science and engineering are the models of truth (CC and T).
- Being 'in control' is a top priority at work (CC and T).
- Efficiency and speed are top priorities (CC and T).
- You have the right to be entertained by the media (CC).
- Time is money (CC).
- What gets measured gets done (CC).
- Setting goals is very important and effective and so are measures of goal attainment (T).
- Analysing things into their parts is the best way to solve problems (T).
- Science and engineering are the models of truth (CC and T).
- Being 'in control' is a top priority at work (CC and T).

²⁰ CC means Cultural Creative and T equals Traditional. These indicators are placed here to mark which groups are more affected by these standpoints.

- Efficiency and speed are top priorities (CC and T).
- The mainstream media's awe for and sense of importance of the very rich is about right (CC).
- It makes sense to compartmentalise your life into very discrete and separate spheres: work, family, making love, education, politics and religion. It's a very complete kind of compartmentalisation, covering what you do and believe, and what you value (CC) (Ray & Anderson 2000:29-30).

'The Moderns' represent the majority subculture today, and as the name implies, are the by-product of modernisation, industrialisation and capitalism in American society. The standards of society are constructed to suit the Moderns. Their world view is based on 19th century European intellectualism and American urbanism and industrialism (Ray & Anderson 2000:70). 19th century European intellectualism is considered to have started with Immanuel Kant and came after the period of Romanticism in the 18th century (Shand 2005). It was a time when many new philosophies and ideas were being formed, especially due to the industrial revolution. Many new schools of thought emerged, from new economic theories of free marketplace (Adam Smith), Kantism, utilitarianism, Marxism, theories of labour, positivism, transcendentalism, existentialism, German idealism and British idealism. Most importantly, this also includes the rise of modernist theory in the late 19th century.

As industrialisation of America took hold, the moderns moved from rural living into the cities and towns that were being developed around industrial growth and economic growth. Urbanism is a construct of urban studies that looks at the character and quality of life brought on by industrialisation and capitalism as well as the emergence of subcultures in daily life. American urbanism started with Louis Wirth, who argued that

urbanism could be explained by three categories: size, density and homogeneity. He believed that urbanism would create greater opportunities for the individual for self-fulfilment with others who shared common interests, but the overall effect was negative: urban life was characterized by social disorganization, as personal interactions within the primary group were replaced by voluntary associations among secondary groups (Hutchinson 2010: 886). In addition, urban life would create a sense of isolation even with the large number of individuals. Silva Fava was critical of Wirth's overview of urbanism, as argued that the opposite occurs in suburbanization: smaller in size, less dense and more homogenous. Herbert Gans added that it was not just location but composition factors such as race, age and family status that affected urban life. Later, Claude Fischer would relate back to Wirth to demonstrate that size and density did in fact affect the size and amount of subcultures in one city and that urbanism did come with 'urban unconventionality' not seen outside urban cities and towns. Overall, the significance of American urbanism was its emphasis of subcultures with urban life. The Modern's world-view from the stand-point of urban-industrial thinking has become all encompassing, meaning that alternative viewpoints are difficult to accept, if not illegitimate. This subculture represented 48% of Americas in 1999, which is approximately 93 million out of 193 million people (Ray & Anderson 2000:25). This group has people with a diverse range of age and income brackets, political views and education.

According to Ray and Anderson, the contents of such magazines like *Time*, *The New York Times*, *The Wall Street Journal*, *Business Week*, *Forbes* and/or *USA Today* represent many of the founding values and ideologies of the Modern mindset (Ray & Anderson 2000:25). These values are based on (often secular) materialistic ideas, i.e. seeking success in life, as well as technological, economical and scientific progress.

This culture can be reflected in many areas: the government; the military; the courts; office towers and big business; in banks and the stock market; in university science labs and high-tech firms; in the hospitals and most doctors' offices; in the mainline churches and synagogues; in the 'best' schools and colleges; culture of professional sports, chain stores and malls; most TV programs; most 'mainstream' magazine and newspaper articles (Ray & Anderson 2000:25).

The modern subculture is based on progress following 'one path' of development, never straying or looking for alternative ways of thinking. As Zygmunt Bauman proclaims, modernisation is 'heavy', 'bulky', or 'immobile' and 'rooted', and 'solid' (Bauman 2000:25). In other words, society, culture, the economy, politics and so forth are unchanging, unbending forms. They have compartmentalised processes where these segments do not interact in daily life. In all these sectors, success or being the best are highly regarded as the highest form. Progress is also under the mantra of modernisation and industrialisation and the value of progress is rarely questioned.

From the research and surveys produced by Ray and American LIVES, they identified four types: economic conservatives, conventional moderns, striving centres and alienated moderns (Ray 1997a:1; Ray & Anderson 2000:71-73). Economic conservatives are the most affluent and follow the 'American way'; they have strong materialistic views. They represent about 8% of Americans. Conventional moderns are nearly as affluent as the economic conservatives and but are distinguished from the first group in that they dislike Traditional and Cultural Creatives' values. In addition, they are rather cynical and less success driven than the first group. They constitute 12% of the population. Striving centres feature the second largest Modern population (14% of Americans). They search for spirituality but prefer seeking economic success more.

They are usually from ethnic minorities and often agree with the person-centred concerns of Cultural Creatives. Alienated Moderns present the largest portion (15% of Americans) of Moderns and are the most cynical and alienated group from the prospects of success (Ray 1997a:1; Ray & Anderson 2000:71-73).

Whilst modernisation and industrialisation brought about many positive developments, such as modern medicine, scientific and technological innovation, democracy etc., modernisation has caused many problems, which are only being fully realised today. Modernisation's successes have often come at the expense of traditional cultures and ideas and Western modernisation is often enforced on other nations and groups. For all the good that has come from modernisation, its unmovable position on not seeing any other alternatives, has created a wide range of problems in society, from secularisation where religion and spiritualities are suspicious (the rise of militant atheism as one example), the environment degradation and destruction of species due to the economy being first priority with, scientific and technological growth enhancing this problem, globalisation of the market effecting the lower wage earners into working longer hours; suppression of ideas from other groups, and a moral principle of self-interest has created a variety of issues in of its self. In addition, Ray suggests that Moderns have been losing confidence in society and the future (van Gerder 1999:826-828), due to slow economic development and rising social issues related to domestic and global changes (such greater out-sourcing, less jobs and low interest rates).

The next group that coexists within this modernised world are the Traditionals, people who live by traditional values that impede with the Modern's vision of progress.

4. The Two Subcultures (2): The Traditionals

A short list of values and beliefs taken up by some Traditionals includes:

- Patriarchs should again dominate family life.
- *Feminism* is a swear word.
- Men need to keep traditional roles and women need to keep theirs.
- Family, community and church are where you belong.
- The conservative version of their own particular religious traditions must be upheld.
- Customary and familiar ways of life should be maintained.
- It's important to regulate sex: pornography, teen sex, extramarital sex, and abortion.
- Men should be proud to serve their country in the military.
- All the guidance you need for your life can be found in the Bible.
- Country and small-town life is more virtuous than big-city or suburban life.
- Our country needs to do more to support virtuous behaviour.
- Preserving civil liberties is less important than restricting immoral behaviour.
- Freedom to carry arms is essential.
- Foreigners are not welcome.
- Pro-environment and anti-business- small-business versus big business or worker versus employer attitude.
- Avoid complex situations and ideas (*Ray & Anderson 2000:31-33*).

The Traditionals (also known as Heartlanders (Ray 1997b:1) are the subculture still holding on to traditional ideas²¹ in a world dictated by modern growth and change.

21 Traditional ideas refer to the ways of living before modern values took emphasis. These ideas are focused on traditional family structures and importance of family, religion still being key to society and success and capital gains unimportant.

Traditionalism is short hand for a complex cultural conservatism and refers to a real subculture of shared values and familiar customs, rich with details of life (Ray & Anderson 2000:30). Ray estimates that, as of 1999, about one quarter (24.5%) of Americans adults (approximately 48 million) could be classified as the Traditional (Ray & Anderson 2000:30). Their value system, i.e. 'Traditionalism', represent beliefs, a way of living and personal identity (Ray & Anderson 2000:31). The Traditionals feature people from social conservatives, ethnic Catholics, uneducated people and people from small towns and rural America. Many Traditionals are African-Americans and Hispanics. Quite paradoxically, the Traditionals can be perceived as the first counterculture to emerge against modernisation since the American Revolution (Ray & Anderson 2000:81). When modernisation became the prominent philosophy of living, traditionalism was replaced. Those who still followed traditionalism became the first to argue against modernisation.

Within the Traditionals, there are two sub-types: double conservatives and low-status Traditionals (Ray 1997b:1). The political agenda of social conservatism²² is only supported by half of the Traditional subculture and this half is the double conservatives. Its political views span many social conservative positions, such as Republicans, Reagan Democrats and older union members. In addition, 70% of this sub-type are religiously conservative and disagree with abortion (Ray & Anderson 2000:31). From that 70% percentage, those that are in the political arena reside in the Christian Coalition and the right wing of the Republican Party, are quite wealthy and are generally politically and culturally conservative. The double conservatives are only 8% of the American population, some 15million people (Ray & Anderson 2000:31).

22 This refers to a political view that rejects a variety of issues such as abortion, euthanasia, stem cell research, eugenics, gay marriage, gay adoption, non-martial sex and other sexual permissiveness. It agrees to such things as gun ownership, school prayers, marriage between a man and a woman, supports keeping recreational drugs illegal, family values and puritanical morality

Many people associate being a Traditional with conservative Republican politics and fundamentalist Christian religious views but this viewpoint has actually been galvanised by the media; most low-status Traditionals are in fact not. Low-status Traditionals represent 22% of the American population and many of them do not associate with politics i.e. voting, listening to political issues in media. They come from lower income brackets and are less educated. The elders from this group do not trust or want complex change and are pro-environment and anti-business. The younger generations of low-status Traditionals are individuals who hold traditional values but have absorbed many modern ideas. This mix has left them with conflicting opinions over their own values and beliefs, their traditional ideas do not fit modern economics.

Those Traditionals with strong religious feelings generally come from religious backgrounds, including Catholicism, Mormonism, fundamentalist religious views or evangelical Protestants. Surprising, whilst they are culturally conservative, they can be quite liberal on other issues. Much of their sustained success in American society comes from the double conservative Traditional's political affiliation with the church and a similar affiliation in the media.

The ideological difference between the Moderns and Traditionals created a broad platform of values and ways of living, something the Cultural Creatives would frame their own values and ideologies. The importance of this difference would come from the development of counter-movements and social movements that were against particular values present in American society.²³ The formation of the new social movements

23 Counter movements and social movements are different in that social movements are formed by people who support a particular political or social position whereas counter movements are usually movements that *oppose* other social movements: pro-life versus pro-choice groups are one such example

would be the catalyst to the development of the Cultural Creative subculture. Below, three major social movements will be discussed and will demonstrate how they influenced the Cultural Creatives.

5. The New Social Movement: Foundations for a Manner of Living

The new social movements of the 1960s formed the foundations for the Cultural Creatives by paving the way for new values and ideologies in American society. They had influenced many people, including those that would become the Cultural Creatives. These groups not only redefined societal values and paved the way for major changes in the United States but their philosophies and ways of using these values became important cornerstones for the Cultural Creatives' own methods.

The new social movements that largely influenced the Cultural Creatives were: the freedom movement, which encompassed the civil rights movement, the freedom of speech movement, gay liberation, the women's movement,²⁴ combined with the consciousness movement, gave the Cultural Creatives the longing for self-actualisation and new spirituality and later the environmental movement. These were a series of movements that started with the success of the civil rights movement in beginning to remove racial discrimination through non-violent protests. The civil rights movement and its model of protest would be greatly influential on the other movements that fell under the banner of the freedom movement. The freedom movement would be the predecessors for the peace and environmental movements; specifically from the

²⁴ In *Feminism and the Women's Movement: a Global Perspective* (2004), Ferree and Mueller note that the women's movement is actually not a new social movement. Feminist thought started in the 1800s long before the new social movements emerged. However, the movement of the 1950s-1960s played a prominent role in the Cultural Creatives development.

freedom movement, the women's movement's emphasis of 'women's issues' and its framework of values, ideas and social issues would transfer into the key structure of the Cultural Creatives' ideology; the final important social movement are the environmental movement and consciousness movement. The environmental movement is the direct springboard from which the Cultural Creatives launched, taking the environmental movement's ideals to another level. The consciousness movement was taken further by the Cultural Creatives to explore the spiritualism, new psychologies and healing on a cultural scale. Hence, the freedom movement and the women's movement would give the foundations of personal experience, authenticity, whole process and the importance of women's issues. The environmental movement and conscious movement proved fundamental for the basis of values and ideas that would be promoted by the Cultural Creatives.

6. The New Social Movement (1): Civil Rights Movement

The Civil Rights Movement, otherwise known as the Black Freedom Movement, was forged against the discrimination of African-Americans from the Jim Crow social codes and other forms of discrimination in 'white American society'. Jim Crow (1876-1965) was a discriminative social code in the South of the United States and was in full effect up until the 1960s. Originally, the Jim Crow social model was developed in the northern United States before the civil war, and was essentially a replacement of slavery. Jim Crow was a widespread system of discrimination, segregation, and repression in legal and extra-legal codes and eventually this code would be adopted by the South during its Restoration (Ray & Anderson 2000:117). The freedom movement would be part of an interconnected historical fight for justice in societies around the globe (View 2007:1). The movement was one of the first new social movements, and would change the values of American society. Their ideology on living by their values and the use of non-

violence and religious faith would become major components of the Cultural Creatives.

The Black Freedom Movement was formed by black and white university students who started the sit-ins in 1960 and formed the Student Nonviolence Communication Committee (Carson 1981:311). Martin Luther King Jr and the other leaders of the movement declared that the discrimination against African-Americans was 'un-American', rotting away the core values of American society paved out by Declaration of Independence, the Emancipation Proclamation, the Fourteenth Amendment and the U.S. Constitution. The movement is considered to have begun in 1954 when the U.S. Supreme Court decision banning school segregation and ending with the passage of the 1965 Voting Rights Act or the 1968 assassination of Martin Luther King, Jr (View 2007:1).

The freedom movement utilised three core ideas: Reverend James Lawson believed and taught a philosophy of non-violence that was a fusion of ideas from Ghandi's philosophy of non-violence and Christianity; 'walking the talk', phrased by movement leader, Reverend C. T. Vivian, emphasised living what you claim to believe (Ray & Anderson 2000:123). This phrase became the symbol of the Freedom Movement and later utilised by the New Left and Freedom of Speech Movements; lastly personal experience. These core ideas would become the foundations for many emerging movements and become an integral part of Cultural Creatives' psyche.

7. The New Social Movements (2): The Women's Movement

The second wave of feminism in the United States (1960-1990) (Gamble 2001:25) focused on women's issues and women's way of thinking, were fundamental for the Cultural Creatives. The second wave occurred due to the opportunities left by the civil

rights movement and by Betty Friedan, who wrote the best-selling book, *The Feminine Mystique*, which critiqued the social construction of the woman in society and within the nuclear family system (Epstein 1988) and was response for the rise of the women's movement (Ray & Anderson 2000:126). This movement is generally synonymous with organised feminism and the push for more equal gender relations. The women's movement spans the globe in many forms and should be understood from comparative, historical and transnational angles. Myra Ferree and Carol Mueller suggest that the 'Women's Movement' should be understood from a broad perspective. This view takes into account that most feminist movements are dynamic: beginning from non-gender goals-such as peace, antiracism or social justice and gradually acquire feminist components; feminist mobilisations may expand their goals to challenge racism, colonialism and other oppressions (Ferree & Mueller 2004:577). The women's movements were split into the 'cultural arm' and 'political arm', which created the dynamics that, would influence the Cultural Creatives.

The political arm of the women's movement was based on non-gender goals of anti-discrimination but would eventually shift towards 'equal rights feminism'. The political arm worked towards rejecting the old way to create new and inventive ways of resolving issues through the utilisation of personal issues by transforming them into political actions for: anti-discrimination, equal rights, peace, greater protection for families and children. The political actions of the women's movement were extensive until the end of 1970s. By the time the 1980s arrived, however, the political arm of the women's movement had forked into two separate directions: one faction headed into more grass-roots and local action movements whilst the second faction experienced many feminist values becoming mainstream thought and consequently, campaigning for the improvement of these rights was no longer their responsibility.

The cultural arm helped to develop a 'women's culture' with expression through art, spirituality, music, poetry and literature, with feminist spirituality (Ray & Anderson 2000:134) and Helen Reddy's anthem, *I Am Woman* (1971) being examples (Arrow 2007). According to Michelle Arrow, 'one of the projects of second-wave feminism was to create 'positive' images of women, to act as a counterweight to the dominant images circulating in popular culture and to raise women's consciousness of their oppression' (Arrow 2007:214). The cultural arm of the women's movement though, was more so invisible. The cultural arm was run by a younger group that looked to reframe ideas and problems. This arm started by creating small conscious-raising groups which were important spaces for discussion and listening to the feelings, opinions and general views of women. These spaces allowed for inner and outer development of these women and were essential for women in beginning to break from social conditioning dispensed in social codes, religion, literature, art and history. What was considered truth had to be redefined through personal experience and living by one's opinions and values. Hence, the cultural arm played the invisible but important role of bringing about positive social change and values to women.

The Cultural Creatives were deeply influenced by the women's movement and would later adopt the feminist approach to understanding truth. Since Ray, Anderson and American LIVES Inc. studies of the Cultural Creatives started in the 1980s, it could be presumed that the feminism promoted by the Cultural Creatives could be part of the third-wave feminism. Third wave feminism began in the 1980s and focuses on diversity of women and change (Tong 2008:284-285).

8. The New Social Movements (3): Environmental Movement

The environmental movement is the catalyst for the emergence of the Cultural Creatives and regarded as one of the most successful new social movements in history (Castells 1997:67; Rootes 2004:608, Ray & Anderson 2000:140,). In 1962, *Silent Spring* written by Rachel Carson would place the term *environmental* into the mainstream. The book followed the likes of Luther King Jr. and Friedan, reframing the argument for the protection of the environment. The book proclaimed that science and technology could be bought and thus corrupted. The concern for environmental sustainability in mainstream culture has seen a large shift in cultural priorities across the globe, and is now valued as important as economic development. From 1910-1960 the emerging environmental movement was propelled by four key streams: the conservation movement, the land preserving movement, the occupational health and safety movement and expanding public health movement protesting against pollution (Ray & Anderson 2000:150). Although these groups had no real common focus, they had many victories and overcame many societal and government pressures. These victories were further enhanced by two landmark publications in the 1970s: the Club of Rome's *The Limits to Growth* and *The Ecologist* magazine's *Blueprint for Survival*. These papers countered modernisation's stress on development and instead focused on the *survival* of nature for generations to come. Nevertheless, the period of 1980s-1990s saw environmental movements seek financial backing, and consequently their impact for change was greatly nullified. The result saw the movement return to local, grassroots activism.

The Cultural Creatives' attitude towards nature originated in philosophy of those like the American Transcendentalists, naturalist John Muir and the first conservation movement's William Kent, regarded as an ancestor to the Cultural Creatives and prominent historically for the values of modern environmental sustainability²⁵ and the

25 Kent was a wealthy landowner and a California state legislator in 1890 who was responsible for buying three hundred acres of virgin redwoods and Douglas fir in Redwood Canyon, which eventually

environmental movement itself. Their worldview is 'biocentric' or 'ecocentric' which can be considered to mean having similar values to indigenous cultures. Whilst the environmental movement was their direct predecessors, the Cultural Creatives enhanced their ideas, becoming the leading edge of the ecology movement, an umbrella for many environmental sustainability projects, ideas and groups, seeking to better the environment and man's connection to it. According to Alain Touraine, the ecology movement would be the working-class movement of the industrial society for the 'post-industrial society' (Rootes 2004:608). The continuous stream of information currently available together with the greater speed of environmental degradation has forced the ecology movement to grow at corresponding speed. William McDonough of the University of Virginia views the ecological movement as 'a new industrial revolution' (Ray & Anderson 2000:163). They are attempting to change culture completely, setting new standards for business, design, architecture, values and ideas whilst being interdependent from other social movements and community groups.

9. The New Social Movements (4): Consciousness Movements

The new social movements were fundamental in the formation of the Cultural Creatives but they were not the only new social group to trigger the transformation of them. The Consciousness Movement represented a new emergence of spiritual and scientific exploration, thinking and understanding within the world. As Australian philosopher and cognitive scientist David Chalmers wrote:

'Consciousness poses the most baffling problems in the science of the mind, there is nothing that we know more intimately than conscious experience, but there is nothing

became Muir Woods National Monument. A friend to John Muir, Kent fought a legal battle against the North Coast Water Company and the media to keep these redwoods untouched by human development. Facing financial debts and societal pressure, Kent fought hard to keep these woods, for 'the children who had not even been born yet (Ray & Anderson 2000:144).

that is harder to explain. All sorts of mental phenomena have yielded to scientific investigation in recent years, but consciousness has stubbornly resisted. Many have tried to explain it, but the explanations always seem to fall short of the target.' (Chalmers 1994:1)

As Ray and Anderson reveal, whilst the new social movements were about seeking a greater democracy and more freedom in society, the consciousness movements were more quiet and subtle, seeking internal transformations of people's identities and realities (Ray & Anderson 2000:172-173). It was a matter of trying to understand the world that they are a part of, both spiritually, socially and scientifically. Their foundations could be seen in nineteenth century and early twentieth century individuals including Transcendentalists like Ralph Waldo Emerson, Henry David Thoreau, Margaret Fuller and Emily Dickinson, psychologist William James, naturalist John Muir, Canadian physician Richard Bucke who wrote the book *Cosmic Consciousness*, and Mary Baker Eddy the founder of Christian Science (Ray & Anderson 2000:171). Those Cultural Creatives who were more influenced by the conscious movement were those of the Core Cultural Creatives.

The Consciousness Movement evolved from the concept that the holistic worldview and achievements of poets, saints, scientists and great thinkers are not unique, but can be found in all living things (Ray and Anderson 2000:173; Omega Institute 2014:1; Alexander 2014:1). Caroline Alioto, a Cultural Creative and a lama in the Tibetan Kagyu lineage, described her interactions in the Vietnam Summer²⁶ as something within herself and everyone else, and by rooting out this aggression people could seek peace (Ray & Anderson 2000:174). The consciousness movement can be divided into the first

26 The Vietnam Summer (1967), included by the 'Freedom Summer' of the civil rights movement in 1964, which saw the push from female activists towards protesting and going door-to-door against military action in Vietnam (Bernikow 2008:2)

and second generations.

The first generation of the Consciousness Movement started in the 1960s and early 1970s, and could be envisioned as a great wave of people personally experiencing their consciousness 'waking up'. The 'waking up' process was a form of liberation from their previous self and from their old cultural bonds, as if they were leaving the family home to explore the world all over again. Eastern spiritualism and practices and new stream of psychology²⁷ played a large role in catalysing the movement.

Places such as Esalen and Frindhorn Foundation were two very important institutions for the growth of the Consciousness Movement. They created spaces for teachers and practitioners as well as creating forms of centrality for the movement. Esalen Institute was founded by Michael Murphy and Dick Price in 1962 at Big Sur, California (Truett 1983, 2004:64). It is a non-for-profit retreat that focuses on humanistic alternative education, utilising activities that centre on personal growth, Gestalt, meditation, massage, yoga, psychology, ecology, spirituality and organic food. The Findhorn Foundation is a spiritual community, Eco village and an international centre for holistic learning located in northeast Scotland and one of the largest intentional communities in Britain (Parker, Fourinier & Reedy 2007:100). It was founded by Peter and Eileen Caddy and Dorothy Maclean in the Findhorn Caravan Park where they started to create an organic garden. From their dedication to the spirit and to God and to the education of others eventually formed into community and NGO organisation based on holistic, ecological and spiritual practices.

According to Ray and Anderson, by the time the second generation of the

27 Practices that revolved around new science, alternative health and medicine, art therapy, dance therapy, spirituality and religion, intuitive movement and transpersonal psychology.

Consciousness Movement, by the 1980s-1990s the movement swelled to hundreds of thousands (Ray & Anderson 2000:184). The first generation went from seeking inspiration and comfort to truth, however, this quest revealed the cultural difficulties of implementing new psychology, healing and spirituality with modern culture and traditional culture. The Cultural Creatives, who represent the second generation looked possible solutions, such as new social inventions and 'conscious commerce'. Furthermore, they are also pushing the point of not being part of the media's New Age impression (Ray & Anderson 2000:188).

The Core Cultural Creatives fuse consciousness issues and social concerns, merging spiritual and psychological issues and social and environmental concerns, activism and volunteering. Hence, the Core Cultural Creatives' assimilation in the Consciousness Movements second generation has seen a move from personal 'waking up' to cultural 'waking up'. The main emphasis is changing the perception of healing from a professional, medicine driven model to a more humanistic, spiritual and loving process that will not only improve the present, but their children's lives as well.

10. Cultural Creatives: An Emerging Subculture

The Cultural Creatives are the third subculture to emerge in American society, an 'unconscious' movement, deriving values from traditional culture, modern culture and the lifestyle choices arising from the new social movements of the 1960s previously discussed. They are a subculture which is rewriting values and attempting to reshape their culture, what Sarah Ruth van Gerder calls 'a postmodern identity' (van Gerder 1999:822-826). As Ray suggests, they utilise a form of transmodernism used by the American Transcendentalists of the 19th century (Ray 1997c:1). Since the 1980s, the research of Ray and the American LIVES Inc. has revealed this large emerging

subculture that cannot be defined as a homogenous demographic: they cover a wide range of income brackets, age brackets, religious backgrounds; however, 60% of Cultural Creatives are female (Ray & Anderson 2000:23). According to Cultural Creatives.org, from 1995-2008 there has been a 175% growth in the population of the Cultural Creatives, making up 23 million American adults and consisting of 3% of per year constant annual population growth in the United States (Cultural Creatives 2014:2)

A person who would typically fit the description of a Cultural Creative would be someone that would have been directly involved in the new social movements and the conscious movement or unconsciously influenced by these groups and would have grown up feeling 'outside' of their friends and families who fit the Modern or Traditional character. They would prefer being amongst nature, like camping, swimming in the ocean, hiking and bird watching than expensive resorts and other money-oriented status symbols. Asking the big questions concerning themselves and the world are essential to their living process, and they seek these answers throughout their lives. Community groups and endeavours (including activism), new spiritualism, humanistic psychology and transpersonal therapy, art, innovative and green business, the environment, relationships with family and close friends are all components of their quest to understand themselves and their place in the world. They come from a wide demographic but even so, they seem to share the same set of values or lifestyle.

11. Core Values of the Cultural Creatives

Below is a list of values associated to Cultural Creatives:

- Environmental sustainability beyond environmentalism- sacredness of nature.
- Globalism.

- Importance of feminism and women's issues.
- Importance of family and relationships.
- Altruism, alternative health care, spirituality, self-actualisation and spiritual psychology.
- Well-developed social conscience and social optimism.
- Value personal experience and the 'big picture'.
- Dislike of success and materialist culture and its alienation of others.
- Dislike narrow-minded thinking (Ray 1996:1; Ray & Anderson 2000:7-24).
- Take their values very seriously and also take criticism quite seriously (Ray & Anderson 2000:43).
- Separate themselves from New Agers²⁸

Some of the lifestyles lived by Cultural Creatives:

- Readers and radio listeners, not television viewers.
- Consumers and producers of art and culture.
- Careful and well informed consumers.
- Buy hybrid cars.
- Technological moderates.
- Soft innovators.
- Desire for authenticity in what they consume.
- Renovators and not buyers of new homes.
- Personalisation of their home.
- Experiential consumers.
- Leading edge of travel vacations.

²⁸ According to Sarah van Gelder, New Agers are about inner development however they let the world run its own course. Cultural Creatives disagree with this method (Ray & Anderson 2000:93).

- Holistic consumers (Ray 1996:2; Ray & Anderson 2000:35-37).

The Cultural Creatives live their lives on the basis of personal experience, authenticity and the whole process acquisition of information. Cultural Creatives invented the current interest in personal authenticity in America (Ray & Anderson 2000:8). Authenticity is the 'walking the talk' utilised by the civil rights movement, which means to do what you say, believe and value. When obtaining new information, they want the whole process: how it began, the middle of the products journey and its end. When they place their time, their money and their knowledge into something, they become personally involved. Personal experience is significant in this whole process and allows them to analyse what is important, what is false and what is valuable to them. Educator Jean Houston, one of the early Cultural Creatives according to Ray and Anderson, says 'the world is too complex for linear analytical thinking now. To be smart in the global village means thinking with your stomach, thinking rhythmically, thinking organically, thinking in terms of you as an interwoven piece of nature (Ray & Anderson 2000:9). Cultural Creatives live their values and beliefs, gaining knowledge from personal experience and the whole truth. This is referred to as the cognitive style of obtaining information (Ray 1997a: 2).

This philosophy of living is enhanced by a strong sense of idealism and activism. Cultural Creatives are more idealistic, optimistic and far less cynical than the other two subcultures with 64% of Cultural Creatives wish for their work to be contributing to society, whilst 54% want to involve themselves in creating a better society (Ray & Anderson 2000:10). They are striving for what they want to complete, no matter the struggle. This sense of wanting to improve has seen them amalgamate as the highest percentage of volunteers in the United States (70% compared to the 60% of the rest of

America) and look for alternative solutions that better the environment, the community, business and society.

The Cultural Creatives are split into two types: the Core Creatives and the Green Creatives. The Core Creatives are the creative, idealistic leading edge of the Cultural Creatives. They are half the Cultural Creative population, approximately 12 million. The Core Creatives are better educated and are the catalyst for change - both inner and outer change - and fight the most for a sustainable future. Their backgrounds range from published writers, artists, musicians, psychotherapists, environmentalists, feminists, alternative health care providers and other professions (Ray & Anderson 2000:14). They seek greater spiritual actualisation both personally and culturally and engagement with new psychologies, spiritualities, alternative medicine and healing. Green Creatives are more secular and extroverted; hence, they care less for spiritual inner development and look more to societal and community enhancement. Their opinions are usually derived from what the Core Creatives think. The Green Creatives main concerns and values centre in the environment, relationships with people and community and social issues. This group regards nature as sacred; however, activism for nature is prominently fought for by Core Creatives.

Ron Rental (2008) in *Karma Queens, Geek Gods and Innerpreneurs* first identified the entrepreneurship of Cultural Creatives. He identified the Cultural Creatives as entrepreneurs as innerpreneurs, who rather than seeking economic gains, use their businesses to obtain different levels of personal gain. An example is Ray C. Anderson, CEO of Interface Inc., the largest commercial carpet company in the world who reshaped his business to be more environmentally thinking. This change was influenced by Paul Hawken's *The Ecology of Commerce*. The result was savings on expenses from

recycling waste and giving back to the Earth. In five years, the company's investment of \$25 million became \$112 million. From 1998, Anderson began educating other businesses all over the world on environmental business practices and its benefits (Ray & Anderson 2000:10)

Cultural Creatives extended the environmental movements concern for the environment to a concern for global ecology and how to create a sustainable world for future generations; 81% of Cultural Creatives are concerned with the problems affecting environmental sustainability and 75% wish to live in harmony with the Earth. In addition, 65% wish to develop a new way of attaining ecological sustainability (Ray & Anderson 2000:11). Nature is sacred and sustaining and living with it is an essential part of Cultural Creative ideology. The Sacred Grove, which consists of fourteen acres of redwood, which has been sustained by about 850 women, is just one example of how Cultural Creatives sustain the environment. Catherine Allport- the project's initiator- and the other women created a women's foundation to support the protection of the grove, linking up with other groups to give awareness and help sustain other areas of nature.

Women are a central part of the Cultural Creatives and not only demographically. Women make up 60% of Cultural Creatives and 67% of Core Creatives (Ray & Anderson 2000:8-12). Women's key issues and ways of knowing are regarded as valid for Cultural Creatives. These issues include feelings of empathy and sympathy for others, viewing things from the 'other side', personal experience, and the ethic of caring for family, relationships, community and society in general. The active Core Creatives take women's issues from the personal to the public, such as wage gaps, violence to women and children, lack of child support. Both male and female Cultural Creatives

uphold 'women's values' and 'women's issues'

Cultural Creatives have a deep social conscience, and unlike Moderns and Traditionals, are optimistic about the future. Rather than making money, they would prefer to spend their time on social justice, personal growth, social activism and services to other people and communities. As well as being strong activists, Cultural Creatives are strong seekers of spirituality, self-actualisation and altruism. Core Creatives are strong users and advocates for alternative health; however, Green Creatives are similar to the Moderns and Traditionals on their views of alternative health and spirituality and are suspicious or cautious.

The Cultural Creatives, whilst forming values through integration, have particular values of others that they reject. The very nature of modern culture in America - a success culture derived on materialism and 'me-firstism'- they reject. They dislike how modern culture alienates those who cannot succeed and has allowed for social inequalities in race and class, prevented the elderly from receiving proper care and the poor treatment of women and children through social injustice. They distrust big corporations and big government and the way the media obtains and reproduces information; most importantly though Cultural Creatives dislike modernism's cynicism especially towards religion and spirituality. Whilst this demonstrates similarities between Cultural Creatives and Traditionals views, Cultural Creatives do not agree with Traditionals entirely. Cultural Creatives dislike the narrow-minded viewpoints of Traditional culture, which does not assist in finding solutions to modern day societal problems.

The key six values of Cultural Creatives are hence: 1) ecology, 2) the importance of

women's issues, 3) altruism and importance of family and close friends, 4) self-actualisation, 5) spiritualism and 6) a rejection of materialism, success culture and narrow-minded views and information. This framework of these six core values will be used to compare against the core values of the Slow Culture Artists

12. Cultural Creatives: Academic Criticisms

Ray and Anderson's book and the prospect of a new rising culture has been praised by many individuals, such as other alternative groups such as the Slow Movement in Japan as discussed later, and academics interested in value changes. There are other scholars, however, that see cause for concern in the Cultural Creatives and transmodernism generally. Their criticisms convey an imagery of the Cultural Creatives as an excessively utopian group and rather than being a new culture, are just another brand of consumer. The Cultural Creative's formed from groups that were the Other to the system, and the Cultural Creatives look beyond their own culture for ideas, values and ways of life. Reshaping one's culture comes with adversities and in the case of the Cultural Creatives, they are attempting to cultivate this new culture by *transitioning* rather than removing the current culture. Below the criticisms directed towards the Cultural Creatives will be focused on three different issues with the first two issues directly related to the Cultural Creatives and the third directed at transmodernism specifically but these implications can be shown in the Cultural Creatives. The issues are the impact on politics, the commercialisation of spirituality and issues pertaining to the utopic nature of transmodernism

13. Politics: A Lack of Impact

Tony Stevenson discusses social technologies and its future prospectivesprospective and

the implications of traditional ideology, political imperatives and traditional research dollar and commercialisation. Stevenson discusses the historical context for this paper by discussing the massive changes garnered by September 11 and how the following events have seen the regulation/deregulation of social technologies being superseded by an omission of ethics in other financial sectors (Stevenson 2004:110). These include the U.S's new security policies and military spending, the emphasis of making democracy a global vision and a new wave of emphasis on cultural and economic hegemonies in many nations. In asking whether people can find an inclusive globalism, Stevenson asks whether the Cultural Creatives are an answer. Using Crenson and Ginsberg, he argues that the impact of the Cultural Creatives on politics may be futile. In Crenson and Ginsberg *Downsizing America*, they show how the importance of the citizen in politics has come to an end. According to them, governments have come to replace the citizen as a soldier, tax collectors and administrators by changing citizens to customers. As customers they have become individual recipients of government services and are no longer part of the process of politics and government (Stevenson 2004:111). This transition from citizen to customer has seen democratic processes owning democratic government and part of the political community to becoming customers that seek government services and individual consumption has been rapid, especially since the 2000 American election.

14. Commercialised Spiritualism

Joseph Gelfer in *LOHAS and the Indigo Dollar* discusses how spiritualism can be commercialised as a consumable good and how the LOHAS (Lifestyles of Health and Sustainability), a multi-billion dollar industry of alternative spiritualism and alternative

culture²⁹, are continuing the consumption of spiritualism. Gelfer then shows how this consumer-focused logic is expressed by integral theorist Ken Wilber resulting in what is called the 'indigo dollar'. His purpose is to show that the growth of the spiritual economy is not spiritual growth. The LOHAS industry was inspired by the Cultural Creatives and Gelfer believes that LOHAS put the Cultural Creatives into the spotlight (Gelfer 2010:48-49). Spirituality is a core component of LOHAS culture and falls under the category of personal development. It falls under a vague category of 'values' such as 'well-being', 'sustainable' and 'ethics'. LOHAS focuses on consumer products that sell on the basis of spiritual values and purchasing desires, identifying for the concept of 'people, place and profit' in the production of goods and services and to the product or service itself. This can be seen by the large variety of LOHAS media that offer a substantial range of levels of spiritualism and personal development for their consumers. Co-opting language is used to sell clean technology, sustainability, authenticity and spiritualism in order to make a profit and seek new marketplaces. Authenticity is the most powerful of these words, producing a social malaise that overlooks the financial profits of the LOHAS business and draws attention to ultimate concerns such as the environment and the sustainability of inner growth. Ray is in fact a founding member of the LOHAS movement and describes 'authentic power' which builds upon spiritual awareness and an 'emerging wisdom culture' (Gelfer 2010:51).

Gelfer views the Cultural Creatives and the LOHAS as part of late capitalism- a shift from production capitalism to consumer capitalism- and hence LOHAS simply perpetuates the capitalist norm. Gelfer uses Ray's *The New Political Compass* (2003) to demonstrate the reason Ray's findings have been so strongly embraced. He argues it is because they create a distraction for the new progressives towards left politics by re-

29 LOHAS five core sections: sustainable economy, health lifestyles, alternative healthcare, personal development and ecological lifestyles.

branding late capitalism to be conscious by abandoning economic, political class analysis. Under LOHAS culture, the standard member can identify with liberal ideals but not understand the economics that go into it (Gelfer 2010:51). Ken Wilber - an influential proponent of LOHAS culture- and his integral theory represents this focus on authenticity over economic, political and class. Wilber's theory is different to Ray's 'integral' in the Cultural Creatives, as Wilber argues that Ray's integral refers to 'green ideas' and Wilber's integral is a full integration due to a transcendence of all 'coloured components' of development creating indigo.³⁰ Gelfer refers to Wilber in examining how the LOHAS culture is just perpetuating a similar kind of economics.

Wilber was originally a reclusive writer but eventually spread into the market, selling various goods under the 'indigo dollar' spawning a market that's worth millions of dollars. The rise of the indigo dollar came in 1998, when Wilber established the Integral Institute to spread his philosophy (Gelfer 2010:52). Gelfer is suspicious towards Wilber's latest writings that seem to focus on the brand of the indigo dollar and Integral Certification packaging that produces 'authenticity'. This branding falls under corporate capitalism, using the label of integral business to sell 'business that is growing rapidly that no one can compete with' (Gelfer 2010:53). Furthermore, Gelfer demonstrates how Wilber in *Right Bucks* gives a questionable impression on his views of money and spiritualism. Gelfer believes that Wilber creates pretext of liberation of sex, women and money in his philosophy in order to justify profiting from gender liberation materials.

Gelfer acknowledges the Cultural Creatives means of bridging 'the left VS the right' and that they engage in economic and political analysis, but he also points out the affiliation

30 Wilber utilises a similar categorisation of Gebser and uses the colour system from the colour spiral dynamics system of Beck and Cowan. Segmenting his 'Great Nest of Being' into components: matter/physics, biology/life, psychology/mind, theology/soul, mysticism/spirit, Wilber gave each a colour and thus once all the levels are met, one can achieve full transcendental integration or indigo.

with Ray and the LOHAS. As Ray also identifies himself as a Cultural Creative and engaging in research concerning them, this suggests that the Cultural Creatives participate in this spiritual economy. The Cultural Creatives utilise the same wording as the LOHAS: 'authenticity', 'sustainability' and 'values'. Though, rather than being of the indigo dollar, this component of the late capitalist market would focus on the 'green dollar' of environment sustainability, green goods and personal actualisation.

Gelfer concludes that the operations of the LOHAS have contributed to a normalisation of spirituality as an economically consumable good. This consumable spiritualism generates expectations of interest in goods that can be sold to their consumers. Wilber's philosophy, the Integral Institute and the indigo dollar are a subsection of this LOHAS culture that do exactly that. Unlike Ray's Cultural Creatives the LOHAS culture dismisses economic and political analysis, Gelfer shows that this mentality is a product of late capitalism.

15. The Problems Concerning a Utopic Nature

In chapter one, Mike Cole's perspective on transmodernism was touched on in regards to the work of Smith. Whilst generally positive towards Smith's (2003, 2004) assessment of U.S imperialism through discussions with transmodernism, modernisation and Marxism, in *Enfranchising the Public Sphere*, Cole points out faults with Smith's declaration of Dusselian transmodernism as a means to change educational theory. He defines three immediate concerns with transmodernism within Smith's assessment.

Firstly, Cole rejects Smith's application of transmodernism's rejection of total synthesis, which he views Marxism on the same grounds as modernisation. Cole argues that Smith neglects Marxism's ongoing and continual contribution to the critique of modernism and

postmodernism. In addition, Cole uses Satre's interpretation of Marxism as a 'living philosophy', that continues to be adapted and to adapt itself. He enhances this argument using Crystal Bartolovich's concept of Marxism as a living project concept (Cole 2004:636; Cole 2008:72). He says another issue with transmodernism's rejection of total synthesis is its unparalleled utopianism. Cole is critical of Smith's use of Thomas Paine's liberal democratic ideals as a means to solve confliction in opinions (Smith 2008:76). The notion of 'sitting around in a circle talking to one and other to find a solution' is viewed by Cole as completely utopian and lacking in real world practicality.

Transmodernism as utopic is actually the second issue pointed out by Cole. Smith accuses Marxism of being an 'utopian typification' (Smith 2004:645; Cole 2008:80) but Cole retorts that this utopic manner is merely a misunderstanding, as Marxism never instructed a path to the future. Cole in turn demonstrates how transmodernism is utopian in nature, even showing that Dussel himself describes to transmodernism as utopian (Cole 2008:80). Liberation philosophy works in the realm of ethical hermeneutics, whereby it is not only about liberation of the other from the oppressor, but liberation of the oppressor themselves from the desire and need to oppress. Dussel states that transmodernism does what postmodernism can't, by working for the exterior and keeping 'ancient cultures intact' (Cole 2008:80). For this reason, Cole sees transmodernism's future multicultural utopia emerging out of nothing, *ex nihilo*. This new culture would be created from those outside capitalism, as if a new culture could emerge detached from capitalism. For instance, Cole refers to Smith's claim that by harnessing Taoism and Buddhism people can overcome capitalism and U.S. Imperialism. Cole points out the difficulty of this hypothesis in the U.S, as theo-evangelicalism is the hegemonic. By using transmodernism's rejection of total synthesising, Cole demonstrates that transmodernism, unlike postmodernism and post-

structuralism, runs by a set of rules of procedures that reject all universal truths (including Marxism) as impossible and that Smith intends through using Buddhism, Amerindian philosophy and Confucius, to define a romanticised moralism that can overcome capitalism (Cole 2008:80-81). Cole highlights the limited nature of this answer which only deals with capitalist spirituality and overlooks the critical real issues with capitalism.

Thirdly, Cole sees problems in using Smith's enfranchising to explain U.S. Imperialism. Smith's enfranchising uses 'its vague transmodern notions of Western 'narcissism' in explaining the source of Western violence directed against the Other (Cole 2008:104). Cole uses Paul Warmington to show the problematic of Smith's view of Western narcissism in Marxism. Warmington pointed out two points: the first point, focuses on the essentialist notion of 'kinship' in Smith's claims, which Warmington implies as problematic because it bases a form of 'kinship of people' founded on the image of a victim; the second point refers to Smith simply inverting the historical relationship of imperialism and Otherness in the development of modernisation, and as such, Warmington feels it causes a vague social and psychological understanding of Marxism³¹. As with much of Cole's criticism of transmodernism, Cole highlights the failures of transmodernism's rejection of total synthesis on incorrectly understanding Marxism and its utopic answers to capitalism and imperialism.

Cole's concerns about Dusselian transmodernism, when translated to the Cultural Creatives, emphasis a group of people that intimately believe in a society that can be created from values and ideas from all aspects of life, but in doing so, creates a social phenomenon of poorly critical people. In his retort to Smith, Cole warns that this

31 Cole signifies racialization as a better tool over Smith's argument.

method will fail to truly critically engagement society, capitalism, industrialisation, imperialism and modernisation and post-modernisation.

The criticisms of Cultural Creatives over these three issues raise some interesting points. Whilst Gelfer's criticism doesn't deeply examine the Cultural Creatives directly but Ray is a part of this LOHAS culture and borrows some of Wilber's integral theory and Cole only confronts concerns with Dusselian transmodernism, there is still enough to raise questions in regards to the Cultural Creatives. Combining Gelfer's position with Stevenson and Cole's position, it can be argued that the Cultural Creatives could simply be a product of late capitalism with utopic values that do not actually contribute to political and economic analysis. The Cultural Creatives would simply be another market that uses liberal and transmodern values to sell spiritual goods but unlike the LOHAS, does interact in the political and economic spheres but with little effect.

16. The Cultural Creatives' Influences in Japan

Whilst there is plenty of criticism directed at transmodernism, Ray's notion of integral transmodernism and his Cultural Creatives are still important, as they are trying to positively reshape the future. Most sources dictate that much of their growth can be attributed within the West but is there evidence of their influence beyond this boundary? In fact, The Slow Movement of Japan through academic Shinichi Tsuji and his colleagues, are promoting values that can justify them being Cultural Creatives.

17. Shinichi Tsuji

Shinichi Tsuji, or Keibo Oiwa (his pen name), has had some of the most influential

impact on the Slow Movement and alternative culture in Japan. Tsuji is a cultural anthropologist, author, translator, environmental activist and a public speaker (Oiwa 2012:1). His most praised work, *Slow is Beautiful*, is considered the bible of the Slow Movement in Japan and he is the co-founder of the Sloth Club, one of the leading Slow Movement organisations and a leading environmental NGO group in Japan.

Tsuji, since his time on a Peace Boat ship at the age of 19 (Funky Education 2010:1) has been involved in understanding and partaking in alternative ways of living. During the 1970s, he was heavily involved in student activism and was even imprisoned. Expelled from university in Japan, he spent fifteen years abroad in North America where he acquired his PhD in cultural anthropology at the Cornell University, New York. Returning to Japan, he became a professor at Meiji Gakuen University (Oiwa 2012:1) and started actively engaging with NGOs and NPOs, such as founding the Sloth Club and becoming the representative for the Candle Nights annual event (Slow Japan 2009:2).

Tsuji, under both his real name and pen name, has written on numerous issues, in English and Japanese. His literary interests include: environmentalism, food culture, socially responsible business, grassroots activism, Harlem and African American culture, Jews, Japanese and Native Canadians (Sloth Club 2012c:1; Sloth Club 2012d:2). Later in life, he discovered that his father was Korean. In 1996, he co-authored *The Japan We Never Knew* with prominent environmental activist and media broadcaster David Suzuki. Tsuji's book, *Stone Voices: Wartime Writings of Japanese Issei*, won the 1992 Canada-Japan Book Award (Sloth Club 2012c:2).

The book *Slow is Beautiful* emphasises many of the ideas and values that Tsuji believes

in and promotes. Tsuji feels strongly for slow philosophy and the terms 'slow' and 'beautiful', as he believes that 'it bridges the gap between the easy rhythm of everyday life with technical theories that only live in books' (Tsuji 2001:1). In the manner of African American liberation, Tsuji views 'beautiful' as a powerful word (Tsuji 2001:2). He defines beautiful as a term that allows acceptance, recognition and an embrace of one's true nature. It is about knowing oneself and simply living with oneself. Of course, these ideas reflect Tsuji's dissatisfaction with modern culture's extreme orientation to development, affluence and the implications of modernisation and globalisation on the world.

As a founder of the Sloth Club he has considered himself a Cultural Creative (Slow Japan 2012:2). As a key person in the Slow Movement, this is quite a significant statement. The Cultural Creatives and the Sloth Club are thus linked through individuals such as him. This adds to the validity and applicability of a transmodernism to slow and alternative cultures in Japan. Also, Tsuji's philosophy and life story could fit into the stories of Couturier's book that this thesis analyses. Some of Tsuji's beliefs and practices seem to parallel many of the values of the Cultural Creatives (Slow Japan 2012a:2) and those that I call the Slow Culture Artists with an intimate experience abroad, a dissatisfaction with modern culture, the search for alternative means of living and the ability to embrace ideas and thoughts from many different corners of the world.

Tsuji has taken prolific steps in introducing slow ideas to Japan. For the Slow Culture Artists, he could have influenced their own philosophies through either his literary works, his own similar lived experiences (being aboard and such) or maybe even contact or been seen during student movement of the 1960s, however, there is no literature that presents this case. Nevertheless, he still could have indirectly affected

them through the 'slow people'. Tsuji, like his Sloth Club, has advocated Slow Culture on the front lines, something that more is more similar to the Cultural Creatives' approach to activism than the Slow Culture Artists' subdued approach.

18. The Sloth Club

The Sloth Club is an NGO created in July 1999 in Tokyo (Sloth Club 2012a:1; Sloth Club 2012b:1; Slow Japan 2009:1). It represents the 'slow life' movement in Japan which is based on the book *Slow is Beautiful* (2001) by Shinichi Tsuji who is also one of its co-founders. In addition, Tsuji was inspired by Ray and Anderson's Cultural Creatives, and view the members of the Sloth Club as Japan's Cultural Creatives (Slow Japan 2012:1). Fourteen years since it was founded, the Sloth Club still promotes slow values and linked with other organisations that promote slow ideas and other alternative philosophies of living. The Sloth Club features many prominent people who advocate alternative lifestyles such as: Satish Kumar, Britain-based Indian activist-philosopher and former a Jain Monk,³² who has written widely on issues of pacifism and nuclear disarmament as well as being the editor of *Resurgence* and *Ecologist Magazine*; Ryuichi Sakamoto, musician, pianist, activist, singer and actor; Aya Wada, the director of Kurikindi, an organic permaculture farm in Ecuador; Anya Light, Australian singer, song writer and environmentalist; Kato Tokiko, singer, composer, lyricist, actress and anti-nuclear activist; Yae Tokiko, singer and farmer and also the daughter of famous singer-activist, Kato Tokiko.

The Sloth Club understands being 'slow' as meaning 'alternative, sustainable, ecological, local and happy' (Slow Japan 2012:1). Slow recognises the important connection of life,

³²Jainism is an Indian religion that promotes non-violence towards all living beings, emphasises spiritual independence and equality between all life forms.

nature and people. In a society concerned with prioritisation within one's life and efficiency, the Sloth Club are asking 'isn't it okay to do things slowly?' (Sloth Club 2012a:1). They are symbolised by the sloth: which cannot live without their natural habitat but also play a crucial role in sustaining the native forest through its perfectly sustainable lifestyle. By proposing to 'become a sloth', they can envision solutions to some of the detrimental problems created by modern, rich countries (Slow Japan 2009:1). According to the Sloth Club website, they have three prominent goals. Firstly, being an active part of the environmental movement, especially focusing on forest preservation and biodiversity through direct action. Second, as a cultural movement that puts into practice a proposed low energy lifestyle. Thirdly, is to develop a three pillar system of actions and revolves around environmental, business and culture pillars. By transmitting their message through various seminars and events, they aim to spread being 'slow' to the entire world 'like a giant stream to create a 'movement'" (Sloth Club 2012a:1).

The Sloth Club emphasis particular core values and ideas: localism, growth national happiness,³³ food and agriculture (in the same vein as the Slow Food movement and emphasis on self-sufficiency), peace and non-violence, slow business and entrepreneurship, slow living, slow-community-building, ecology and a general slow philosophy. By living these values and promoting them to others, the Sloth Club has created many events and linked up with many other organisations. In 2001, they started an initiative for volunteer blackouts', and have formed into nationwide event called Candle Night Summer Solstice. They are actively involved in supporting Article 9 of the Japanese constitution, an article that renounces the right to form a military army and

33 Satish Kumar, Indian activist and philosopher who visitor the Sloth Club, explores the concept of happiness as being content and with using just the right amount. He believes that this happiness can come from an intimate connection between people, nature and life, and that person experience can help establish a change in the world.

to upkeep international peace based on justice and order and anti-nuclear activism. They pursue these activist endeavours through many initiatives such as meeting with Article 9 activist groups like 9 Lovers, publishing books such as *Sowing 9* (Slow Japan 2009:2), creating peace festivals such as the annual Earth and Peace Festival (Sloth Club 2009:1) (running since 2011 with 2011's theme around supporting Tohoku and victims of the tsunami and Fukushima Daiichi Disaster (Slow Japan 2012b:4) and protesting against nuclear facilities in Rokkasho, Aomori Prefecture, Hamaoka Nuclear plant in Shizuoka. Furthermore, The Sloth Club actively engages in cultural interaction and forestry preservation across the globe and has the sloth fund to help achieve these goals. Finally, they have projects to create and inspire slow business and they tie in these initiatives with an emphasis on localism and traditional and indigenous cultures.

Even with the issue of mainstream businesses adopting 'a green image', the Sloth Club continues to teach others about slowness (Slow Japan 2009:1). Sloth Club view that the uniqueness of Japan's slow movement lies in the fact that there are many diverse subgroups which seek different answers on how to live. The Japanese Slow Movement promotes the idea of 'walking in every direction', in other words, to compose an answer by seeking it through experiences many aspects of life. The Sloth Club believes that 'instead of just walking from point A to B, the slow living movement encourages wandering and considering the impacts of our decisions. Through this wandering, an alternative way of thinking can be born. We see a Japan that is gradually shifting towards a more sustainable, ecological, and happy way, in a word, a 'slow way' (Sloth Club 2009:2).

The Sloth Club are the symbolic hub of slowness in Japan, and the Slow Culture Artists can be included as living the 'sloth way'. The Slow Culture Artist's major values are also

part of the Sloth Club's primary values, hence placing them within a compass of other familiar groups. A specific similarity between them is the influence of foreign cultures, both modern and traditional, on much of the Japanese members (of both parties). Their connection to multiple cultures and ideas coincides with their notion of connectivity in the slow movement and to transmodernism. The Slow Culture Artists and Sloth Club, however, are contrasting in that the Sloth Club is a large organisation that uses its key members to promote its ideas and link with other groups and the community, whilst the Slow Culture Artists are a handful of people who do not advertise their involvement in projects. In addition, it is most likely that the key members of the Sloth Club do not live a lifestyle away from urban modern cities. If the Sloth Club did retreat into rural Japan, the ability to be able to reach a larger audience and to build relations are likely to decline.

The Cultural Creatives and Japan's Slow Movement share many of the same key values: the significance of the environment, ecological business, importance of spirituality, altruism and activism, criticisms of their own societies and utilise ideas from abroad and from their own roots. The subtle difference between the two is what values they emphasise: the Cultural Creatives seem to place self-actualisation, the environment, spirituality and altruistic values whilst the Slow Movement concentrate primarily on slow living, the environment, slow business and community and activism projects. Nevertheless, it is still clear that the ideologies and values of both groups are very similar and considering Tsuji who lived abroad in North America and is thought as a pioneer of slow living in Japan refers to the Sloth Club as 'Japanese Cultural Creatives', this gives additional evidence to suggest so.

19. Conclusion

The Cultural Creatives are a growing subculture and they are introducing new values and ways of living into society. They represent an emerging group of people and a new form of thinking that strives to find the solutions to the problems left by modernisation, globalisation and industrialisation. The promise of the Cultural Creatives is the promise of developing an integral culture that can bring together the traditional and the modern, the planetary and the local, and inner and outer change (Ray & Anderson 2000:94).

The Cultural Creatives are the lived example of Ray's conception of transmodernism. They integrate ideas from many aspects of different societies, cultures, and values. The Cultural Creatives have taken many core ideas from American Transcendentalism such as sacredness of nature, integration of Western and Eastern values and the importance of inner spirituality. Traditional and modern values are merged to create a new values and a more optimistic approach to the future. Whilst there are some critics who consider the Cultural Creatives as nothing more than a new utopic component of late capitalist economics, the Cultural Creatives have pushed the envelope for change in many areas of society.

This chapter identified six value groups that create the framework of the Cultural Creatives: 1) ecology, 2) the importance of women's issues, 3) altruism and importance of family and close friends, 4) self-actualisation, 5) spiritualism and 6) a rejection of materialism, success culture and narrow-minded views and information. The thesis hypothesis' that this framework can be seen in similar groups (Sloth Club for example) and as such, Ray's conceptualisation of transmodernism can be applicable beyond the Cultural Creatives.

In the following chapter the applicability of Ray's transmodernism to groups other than

the Cultural Creatives will be demonstrated, through looking at a group of people in Japan called 'Slow Culture Artists'. The group is very small in comparison to the millions of people that make up the Cultural Creatives, however, their beliefs, values and ways of living are akin showing that they are both transmodernist groups.

Chapter 3: The Slow Culture Artists

1. Couturier's A Different Kind of Luxury

Japan is praised as the epitome of modernisation and technological innovation. Andy Couturier's *A Different Kind of Luxury*, however, expresses another side of life in Japan that goes completely against the modern philosophy. Couturier is an American-born essayist, poet and a professionally-trained writing instructor and the son of a biographer and a civil rights activist. He is an experienced writer, and has written for newspapers, magazines and literary journals including *The Japan Times*, *The MIT Press*, *The North American Review*, *Kyoto Journal*, *The Writer* and *Fiber Arts* (The Opening 2013:1). He was taught writing at SF Museum of Modern Art, Sofia University (previously the Institute of Transpersonal Psychotherapy), UC Santa Cruz, California State University, East Bay and JFK University (The Opening 2013:1). He has published two books, *Writing Open the Mind* and *A Different Kind of Luxury*. As well as being a writer, Couturier is a researcher for Greenpeace, has studied Buddhist meditation and other Asian philosophies, is a seasoned traveller and operates his own writing centre called The Opening (The Opening 2013:1)

The book, *A Different Kind of Luxury*, grew out of Andy Couturier's interest in creating a life where his partner Cynthia and he could 'provide for themselves' (Couturier 2010:9). He had friends in California who had achieved this goal, and wished to do the same. In his mid-twenties, he and his partner moved to Japan to teach English, and at the time, only saw it as a country which is extremely materialistic (Couturier 2010:9). In the four years that he lived in Japan, his perception greatly shifted by participating in the environmental movement, fighting with local activists against large dam projects, rainforest destruction and huge electric power plants (Amazon 2013:1), he was

befriended by Atsuko and Gufu Watanabe, two individuals were influenced by many cultures and strayed away from modern ideas and conveniences. Through them, Couturier's eyes were opened to many other individuals like them. As his Japanese improved, he was able to identify a philosophy on the basis of which these people lived (Couturier 2010:11). Their principles and philosophy significantly influenced Couturier in his search for 'the good life'. Couturier and Cynthia have since built their own home in California by only using hand tools, and have moulded a rural homestead functioned on solar and hydro-electric power with running hot and cold water and even a Japanese bath (Amazon:1).

A Different Kind of Luxury is a book that describes the lives of eleven Japanese who do not conform to the standard modern lifestyle. They live amongst the rural communities of Japan but they do not live 'traditionally'. In fact, each individual's life experience and the cultivated sense of living makes them unique even outside Japan. Couturier's subjects represent an entirely different approach to what it means to live in Japan and its environment.

The individuals within Couturier's book have been named in this thesis as the Slow Culture Artists. These Slow Culture Artists are analysed under the Cultural Creative framework introduced in chapter two, examining their six core values. The thesis shows that Ray's notion of transmodernism can be applied to other groups, more specifically even outside of the American and European cultural spheres: Japan. Additionally, this thesis postulates a 'Japanese conceptualisation' of this Cultural Creative framework by dissecting the similarities and differences between the Slow Culture Artists and the Cultural Creatives.

The Slow Culture Artists represent a group of individuals who have ideologically deviated from the way modern Japan developed. From the period of the end of World War II until the bubble burst in the early 1990s, Japan underwent dramatic changes and shifted their ideology towards rebuilding the state and economic development. Japan's development - has had wide ranging influences across the globe, especially in Asia³⁴. This relentless focus on state-building and the economy has had consequences. The recent Fukushima Daiichi nuclear disaster, which caused in the unending devastation to the Tohoku region and beyond, suggests the negative consequences of rapid modernisation. The largest nuclear disaster since Chernobyl, the Fukushima incident would make nuclear power topical, reopen the dialogue on the use of nuclear power in the public domain and cause great shifts in the people's perception of nuclear power.³⁵ The lifestyle of alternative cultures, such as the Slow Culture Artists, is supremely important at this point in the history. By analysing and understanding this group, the thesis aims to contribute to expand the dialogue on alternative cultures and explore possibilities for solutions to the current problems embedded to modernisation.

The hypothesis of this thesis is that the Slow Culture Artists can be explained by using Ray's transmodernism. In order to reach this hypothesis, the Slow Culture Artist's major values will be compared to the Cultural Creatives to demonstrate the similarities and differences. This will be done in chapter five. It will be shown that they have coinciding values and that transmodernism can be prescribed to both.

34 For instance, *Japanese influences and presences in Asia*, edited by Marie Söderberg and Ian Reader, discusses many aspects on Japan's relations economically, culturally and politically within Asia and how their presence in the region influences Asia.

35 For instance, the nuclear disaster at Fukushima Daiichi nuclear reactor has largely interrupted India's push for nuclear power, with many people protesting the opening of the Russian-built Kudankulam Atomic power plant (Indolink 2012)

This chapter examines the six core values of the Slow Culture Artists in order to show that their key values are similar to the Cultural Creatives. These core values of the Slow Culture Artists are: 1) a connection to nature on a physical and spiritual level; 2) simple and self-sufficient living; 3) criticism of modernisation and materialism; 4) the importance of foreign ideas and traditions; 5) spiritualism of 'oneness with all'; 6) traditional practice and art as a focal element. This analysis will be broken into two sections outlining two type of Slow Culture Artists; 1) explain the meaning behind the title Slow Culture Artist and 2) their values extracted from the stories of the eleven people within Couturier's book. The aim of the chapter is to show that whilst appearing different on the surface, the Slow Culture Artist have the fundamental characteristics of transmodernism.

2. Slowness and Art: Connection

The name, Slow Culture Artists, consists of three elements ('Slow', 'Culture' and 'Artists') that represent the primary components of their philosophy of living. The factors of 'Slow' and 'Artists' are attributed to their manner of living and their philosophy of living with nature. 'Culture' refers to the many broad traditional and modern values that they adopt in formulating their ideas.

The 'Slow' is taken from 'slow living' or 'simple living', a form of living that detracts from modern, mainstream lifestyle choices that focus on economic advancement and consumerism. As the organisation Slow Japan suggests, 'Slow can be understood to mean alternative, sustainable, ecological, local, and happy. Slow means 'to connect'; connection between people and people, people and nature, north and south, right and left, urban and rural, and more (Slow Japan 2012).

Slow/simple living is associated with rural and self-sufficient living and with it, a connection to the local environment and community. Rather than mainstream agricultural farming, it does not focus on profits and speedy development of products. It is about the use of traditional farming and agricultural techniques to produce organic products at a 'slow pace' and working with one's local environment and people. Slow living is more than a lifestyle choice; it is a philosophy of sustainability and 'oneness' with nature and the world. The 'Slow' portion of their name also references core values 1) and 2).

Below is a table containing the 11 members introduced in Couturier's book; the number markers are there for readers to refer back to.

<u>Order in Book</u>	<u>Name</u>	<u>Main Occupation</u>	<u>Age</u>	<u>Place</u>	<u>Relationship</u>	<u>International³⁶</u>
#1	San Oizumi	Potter	60s	Honshu, Nagoya region	Father to one daughter, husband, friends with Atsuko and Gufu	Korea, France, Chernobyl
#2	Osamu Nakamura	Woodblock Carver	40s-50s	Shikoku-mountains	Friends with Atsuko and Gufu	Nepal, Burma, Europe (especially Sweden), villages of the Himalayas (teacher from), Thoreau, Tibet
#3	Atsuko Watanabe	Community Activist	50s	Shikoku	Wife of Gufu, mother, friends with Oizumi, Nakamura, Jinko, Takaoka, Ito, Amemiya	Afghanistan, Nepal, India, Pakistan, Buddhism, Christianity, Chernobyl, Rudolph Steiner, Hinduism
#4	Kogan Murata	Bamboo Flute Player	56-57	Honshu, mountains of central Japan	Father to a son and husband ³⁷	Confucius, Lao Tsu and Chuang Tsu, Asian Buddhism,

³⁶ The International category is wide category that refers to international places, influences from abroad, places mentioned that they have spent time in.

³⁷ In the book, his wife is mentioned by name (Sayaka). From what Couturier indicates, she seems to have as interesting story as the rest in the book but does not divulge with him

#5	Asha Amemiya	Batik Artist		Koichi Prefecture	Mother of three, partner Yamashita, friends with Atsuko, Gufu, Takaoka, Ito	Europe, Syria, Iran, India, China Nepal, India, Bengali, Rabindranath Tagore, Himalayan kingdom of Sikkim
#6	Akira Ito	Painter	Died at 82	Honshu, near Mt Fuji	Friends with Atsuko, Gufu, Takaoka, Amemiya, Murata, Nakamura	Nepal, China, Tibet, India, Europe, Afghanistan, Pakistan, Himalayan tribes
#7	Wakako Oe	Organic Farming Mentor	70-85	Honshu, mountains in Chubu region	Husband is Masanori,	India, Nepal, Tibetan Buddhism, Human Rights issues, WW2, Music (from around the world)
#8	Gufu Watanabe	Potter	50s	Shikoku	Husband to Atsuko, father	Europe, India, Nepal, Pakistan, Burma, Sri Lanka
#9	Koichi Yamashita	School Teacher		Shikoku, near a fishing region	Partner to Amemiya, father	India, Hinduism, China, Lepha people of Sikkim, India
#10	Jinko Kaneko	Restaurant Proprietor and Painter	50s	Honshu, mountain area in Chubu region	Mother, Friends with the Watanabes, Amemiya, Takaoka, Nakamura, Akamatsu, Mitsui, the Oes,	Cultures of the Himalayas, Hinduism, India, Nepal, Buddhism, Odilon Redon,
#11	Masanori Oe	Author	74	Honshu, mountain area in Chubu region	Husband to Wakako,	Tibet, New York, Washington D.C, Native American Indians, Australian Aborigines, WW2, Bergman, French New Wave cinema, antiwar movement and psychedelic movement in the US,

Koichi Yamashita #1, a teacher, philosopher, activist and farmer and is well versed in Hinduism and Buddhism, has a connectedness to nature and life. He feels this

connection through self-sufficient farming and his life philosophy, from being amidst the rice paddies and tea plantations. In addition, slowness is a principle part of his philosophy. Without rushing, he has the time to consider and understand the world. In regards to his farming, he considers where the food was produced, who was involved in the process of production, if pesticides and chemicals were used, and what role nature played in the production and what it means to him spiritually (Couturier 2010:251-253).

Yamashita discusses his philosophy:

the ordinary way of thinking is that the human body and the rice plant are totally different, separate. But something I realised recently is that the human body and the rice plant are not separate entities. If you make a thorough investigation of the question, you will see that there are not many lives, there is only one Life. Both rice plants and humans are made up of the same substances, the same atoms and molecules. A rice plant and humans are made up of the same substances, the same atoms and molecules. A rice plant starts small, grows larger, produces its seeds, dies. It is in possession of a life, just like a human. Humans aren't higher up. But this is not something I think; it is something I directly feel. (Couturier 2010:251).

Yamashita's philosophy is evident throughout Couturier's book. The attachment to nature, both as a physical and spiritual connection, is a primary ideology that runs deep in the individuals seen in the book. Furthermore, this connection is enveloped in their crafts and traditional practices, their activism and their engagement with people. Yamashita's philosophy can be seen as the foundations of Couturier's groups of Japanese.

Wakako Oe #7 is an organic farming mentor, puppet carver, painter, calligrapher and botanic sculptor, who seeks a spiritual connection to the world, its environment and its people. When discussing farming, she says 'Sometimes just to touch the ground is

enough for me, even if not a single thing grows from what I plant. Often I'll go outside and just place my hands on the soil, even if there's no work to do on it. When I am filled with worries, I do that and I can feel the energy of the mountains and of the trees' (Couturier 2010:201). Oe's life is entwined with nature: from the way she considers life, approaches her art and home and her activism. In addition, Wakako's and her husband's experience in India, and in particular, with Hinduism and Buddhism cemented their belief that living simple is attainable.

Slow living is not just a means of connecting someone with the world. It also allows for people to have more time.

Akira Ito #6 was a petroleum engineer who left his job and focused on the study of *chi* philosophy through writing, art and music. His philosophy, based on life energy, takes traditional spiritual ideas and modern science and combines them. He spent his days painting, bookbinding, studying both ancient Chinese philosophy and modern theoretical physics, as well as in deep contemplation of nature (Couturier 2010:181-182).

Born in 1935, Ito was raised in a dual world: at school, militaristic education was promoted preparing children for the Imperial Army and at home, his father was a devote Buddhist and artisan who would recite sutras every morning and night (Couturier 2010: 160-161). He became an engineer, and like most of his generation, became caught up in the post-war economic expansion. However, at twenty-eight he left the money and status of being an engineer to pursue being an itinerant artist and philosopher and later to live in woods near the slope of Mt Fuji to follow the footsteps of ancient Chinese mountain literati. As a vegetarian and abiding by yoga precepts, Ito feels that his life is

depended on plants (Couturier 2010:164). To him, they are not only food, but provide gifts that allow him to live. Since escaping the mainstream modern world and becoming free, Ito pursued various pilgrimages across continents to follow his mentors' life, the Japanese illustrator Takeshi Motai, in order to understand life, death and cosmos.

The term 'Artist' in *Slow Culture Artist* is the core characteristic of the people in Couturier's book. The term 'Artist' takes a much broader definition and includes those people that practice traditional art techniques that are not limited to Japan. The eleven people in the book work as artists with a wide range mediums: pottery, woodblock and puppet carvery, traditional bookbinding, traditional farming techniques, various traditional instruments are played, batik fabric artistry, various forms of writing and painting, various forms of sculpting, traditional means of cooking, dyeing, felt art and even film making (Couturier 2010). Art and traditional practices have allowed them to express, to understand, to continue traditions, to teach others and to formulate a connection, to people, to nature and to life. It could be suggested that The Slow Culture Artists practice slow art. Slow Art and the Slow Art movement was founded by artist Tim Slowinski as a counter to the growing interest in fast food and fast consumption that emerged in the 1980s (Slowart 2012:1). It sees art as a life journey, a slow process in which one devotes their life to art. It rejects rapid construction of art, and sees other components of an individual's life as just an extension of art. As Slowinski suggests, 'Much as a monk will engage in mundane activity such as farming or manufacturing to support the monastic devotion, the artist working under Slow Art will also perform such activities, but will do so only to the extent that it enables and supports a continuing devotion to art.' (Slowart 2012:1) The portion 'Artist' refers to numbers 4), 5) and 6) of their core values.

Kogan Murata #4 is a storyteller, a rice farmer, a student of Zen and a player of bamboo flute. After many journeys across the world through Europe, the Middle East, India, the Himalayas in Nepal and around Japan on a motorcycle, Murata discovered his life path, the path of 'blowing Zen,' of the Buddhist bamboo flute (Couturier 2010: 113). Murata was a student of renowned bamboo flute master Koku Nishimura for seven years (Couturier 2010:103) and he learnt to play the *kyotaku*, a longer version of the *shakuhachi* (bamboo flute). Murata proclaims that the name, *kyotaku*, came from a disciple of an eighth century Chinese *Ch'an* monk who wished to replicate the sound of the bell, which would lead one to the path of enlightenment (Couturier 2010:119). Nishimura, his teacher, received his *kyotaku* training from a Zen monk of the Rinzai order whose name was Tani Kyochiku. For ten years he lived as an alms-begging monk in Japan. Murata was taught to play in the manner that a new monk would experience when coming to a Zen temple. The Zen way of teaching is different to standard methods. Murata was not shown directly techniques and how to improve quickly but rather was told *to do*. This method created a Zen approach to playing the *kyotaku* and by simply playing and devoting, one could improve. According to Murata, playing the *kyotaku* and becoming capable of playing thousands of sounds is not possible if one plays half-heartedly; in order to play, one must *love* to play (Couturier 2010: 115-116). The task of Nishimura as the teacher was not to teach technique, but to teach the *essence* of what it meant to play. Murata comments, 'He told me to just *forget* about technique. Throw all of that away. It's only playing, and continuing to play that has meaning. That's all.' (Couturier 2010: 122)

Buddhist principles have a strong influence in Murata's life, and he chooses to live simply and adhere to Buddhist philosophy, all the while continuing to play his *kyotaku*. Murata and his family live a simple, sufficient life, eating organic foods, interacting

within their local community and not being materialistic. Murata acknowledges that he cannot live without money completely and the little money he needs he acquires through two methods: sometimes by strolling from one house to another, playing his *kyotaku* and begging for money or food as a *komuso* (alms begging) monk. Alms begging is a method to connect the full time mediators to the local community (Couturier 2010: 120). Couturier views this form of begging as a means to teach people about the importance of inner life. The second method is by growing rice and through complex gift exchanges with friends, he sells his rice at half the price of other organic farmers in exchange for necessities such as clothing. In fact, Murata states 'that Sayaka (his wife) and he lived on eight thousand dollars over three years.' (Couturier 2010: 126). His manner of living has been formulated over many years of playing the *kyotaku* in connection to Zen principles and has allowed Murata to make a happy, contented life. In regards to his outlook on life and to growing rice, Murata contemplates:

To continue, that's meaningful. Forward, forward, even a little bit, as long as you don't stop walking. Experience tells you everything. Playing the bamboo, that's what I always think. If I were to stop I wouldn't have made anything of it. The rice paddy is the same. Whatever you do, it is all about practice: you can't just think about it, or just look at it, or dream about it- even though that's fun- you have to *do* it. (Couturier 2010: 127).

Osamu Nakamura #2 lives a life that completely counters the tenants of modern mainstream Japan and does so out of complete joy. He is a woodblock carver, a cook, a storyteller, a handbook binder, a traveller and craftsman who practices living traditionally, primarily using techniques and methods taught to him in a Kathmandu and a Sherpa village in the Himalayas. He studied the art of woodblock carving under his teacher Tapkhay Gendum and lived amongst the people of the Sherpa village. Nakamura 's time in that village allowed him to understand that method of living and

when he returned to Japan, he decided he could continue this method of living there (Couturier 2010: 61-62). The choice of living without the aid of modern technology, to continue the traditional techniques and his various crafts is Nakamura's sustained philosophy. He believes that a craftsman's work is half meditation and half creation: creativity to design something and meditation to do it right. Being a craftsman is a state of mind, it cultivates a certain generosity and openness of the heart that is intimately connected to life. Couturier views Nakamura's life as a means of preserving the essence and sensibility of a traditional way and to continue it through vital cross-fertilisation with the realities of recent times, thus connecting and integrating it into daily life (Couturier 2010:63). By continuing these practices, Nakamura tries to understand these techniques on a physical, experiential level, to feel what they meant in the past by doing them himself (Couturier 2010:63).

Gufu Watanabe #8 is a collector, potter, amateur botanist, Indian cooking aficionado, clay sculptor, home canner, diarist and illustrator. Couturier views him as a contemplative, knowledgeable person whose philosophy on living incorporates an eclectic range of philosophies, ideas and influences. As a young man, he quit university after meeting Kawamoto Goro, a *togeika* (potter) and started working with ceramic pottery before heading to India to see Indian Buddhist statues in 1978. Over this time, Watanabe created illustrated diaries that portrayed every part of his journey abroad: from the places he lived, went to and ate at, to the things he purchased and saw, his studies of statues, hand drawn maps. Whilst Watanabe admits he had no reason for creating these diaries, Couturier views them as a means to demonstrate the importance of sustaining the memory of experience and the beauty of not only the 'world', but the specific world, in this case Indian continent (Couturier 2010:219-221). After living in India for a year and a half, Watanabe travelled through to Pakistan, Burma, Sri Lanka

and Nepal. The Japanese term, *binbo ryoko* (essentially to travel on nothing), is how he travelled, spending as little as possible and taking his time when travelling. Eventually, he arrived at the Himalayan kingdom of Ladakh and stayed with Japanese monk Shucho Takaoka (largely influenced many of the individuals in Couturier's book) at Shanti-Kuti (House of Peace) in Kathmandu, a place that would transform the direction of his life. Here he meet with other Japanese travellers, engaged in Nepali festivals, searching and studying Nepali art, relaxing and engaging in conversations with other travellers and meet his wife here. Over time, his travelling journeys evolved and eventually his reason for staying overseas was the journals: the recording of experience became one with the experience itself (Couturier 2010:225). The contents of the diaries and the way he chose to live abroad eventually formed the foundations on how he would choose to live his life. Watanabe comments:

If you start to accumulate things, you can't travel, so I lived without for a year and half more. So I figured I could live a whole life without anything, and then I wouldn't really have to work when I got back. I figured I could do the same in Japan, and I could live in the mountains in the very same style. (Couturier 2010:225)

Watanabe grows a large variety of plants and spends much time gardening. Additionally, he cooks most of the meals, makes pottery and prepares for his annual exhibitions, makes large batches of jams and preserves, making Indian *achar* (spicy citrus pickle) and reading the works of philosophers such as Heidegger (Couturier 2010:226). Gufu views himself as a collector and attempts to grow large varieties of different plants in a natural garden (does not weed or use pesticides). He has an extensive knowledge of these plants and sees the importance of fragrances and the symbolism of plants culturally.

Watanabe has strived to live as self-sufficiently as possible, something that was originally shown to him by living as an Indian sadhu. Whilst he realises that it is impossible to live without money in Japan, Watanabe strives to have to use a little money. Furthermore, he admonishes the system of 'time is money', and how time has become another component of the economy. This perspective has allowed him to remove himself from prioritising work as number one in his life. He views work as only necessary when the circumstances arise that a particular job needs to be done. Watanabe endeavours to be a person with *furyu*, meaning someone who has time. This term is used to describe people who have time to write haiku, or appreciate flowers or to have space in their emotions. It is someone who cares not for working or making money (Couturier 2010:244).

This attitude of prioritisation though, is not as present in his approach to pottery. Watanabe's pottery is created from a range of influences but primarily from Indian tribal minorities. He dislikes placing price-tags on his pottery and especially avoids the commercialisation of pottery. This commercialisation as Watanabe refers to is the simplification of art that becomes extremely refined techniques but lacks character and he feels this is a problem in Japan. It is the primitive nature of tribal art that interests him, as it has not been affected by economic and societal development. He feels that if a craftsman becomes refined by technique and becomes commercialised, they lose the primitive nature and the art becomes too human. In addition, he feels that mass-production of things only creates garbage and he views the importance in making little and making things that can return to the Earth rather than becoming trash (Couturier 2010:244-245). Watanabe uses the term *kiritto* meaning 'of sharp, strong spirit' in defining how he wishes to be able to create art. By creating art as primitive as possible, by rejecting commercialisation and refined techniques, he finds that a piece of art can be

mysterious and powerful.

'Slow' and 'Artist' are the key components of the Slow Culture Artist's lives and they live fundamentally different lives from mainstream Japan. This difference and the reason and history behind their choices, are enveloped by the 'Culture' factor.

3. Fusing Ideas and Living Alternatively: Living differently to the mainstream

This section will discuss five of eleven Slow Culture Artists whose experience abroad has not only given them a wider perspective on living, but also assisted in their eventual activism. This aspect can be considered a second characteristic of the Slow Culture Artists, with the first component referring to their intimate relationship with the environment and the will to live slowly. Thus, this section will show how their experiences abroad solidified their feelings about modern society in Japan.

The Slow Culture Artists have chosen their paths based on their perceptions on modernity, their experiences abroad and their experiences within Japan. As individuals they have cultivated unique journeys but have developed similar views on modern life and how to achieve happiness. The 'Culture' component then, is the most important. It is the essence of these people. This section will examine 'Culture' in four parts: 1) their experience abroad and inside Japan; 2) and their interactions with traditional cultures and practices and how this affected their lives; 3) their critical responses to modernity and living as 'the Other' in Japan; and 4) the importance of spiritual growth. The 'Culture' portion truly encompasses all the core values, especially core value three.

All the eleven people in Couturier's book had extensive experience of living abroad amongst different people and ways of living. These experiences transformed them and

their manner of thinking. In addition, these people eclectically formed their values and philosophies by borrowing from ideas and philosophers as well as from traditional cultures and people. Primarily, these ideas have originated in Asia, from South East Asia to India as well as Japan. These ideas include philosophies such as Buddhism, Hinduism and Daoism. The traditional societies and places of influence are: around the Himalayas, rural Japan and India as well as specific individuals from these regions.³⁸ There influences can also be found beyond Asia, in places like Europe, the United States, the Middle East and specific people³⁹ and situations of these regions.⁴⁰ Furthermore, their journeys are reflective of their own individual spiritual growth, and spirituality and religion are prominent components of their identities, like Junko Kaneko #11 who was raised in a Buddhist temple and Kogan Murata #4 who is a practicing Zen monk. From Christianity, Buddhism, Hinduism, Shintoism, the thoughts of other philosophers and their art, spiritual self-actualisation and connection with their world are essential to them. The Slow Culture Artists integrate traditional, alternative and modern ideas, and have emerged with a philosophical mindset and value system those conflicts with modernity.

Atsuko Watanabe #3 is an environmentalist, self-sufficient farmer, teacher to her home schooled children, an activist and community leader. She is also a practitioner of esoteric spiritualities and has been deeply influenced by her experiences in Afghanistan, Nepal (Kathmandu and a small lodge called Shanti-Kuti) and India, which has been

38 include people such as Rabindranath Tagore, an India philosopher; Ghandi, Indian, philosopher and activist; Lao Tsu, founder of Daoism; Koku Nishimura, a shakuhachi master; Chuang Tsu, a Chinese Daoist philosopher; Takeshi Motai, a Japanese painter,

39 People such as Rudolph Steiner, Austrian philosopher, esoterist, architect and social reformer; David Thoreau, Transcendentalist philosopher; and Martin Heidegger German philosopher.

40 And Martin Heidegger German philosopher.

influenced by various spiritual traditions, Christianity and the philosophy of Rudolph Steiner.

Watanabe's first experiences abroad to Afghanistan and then India completely transformed her. The lives of people around her in Japan seemed robotic, as she put it, 'gobbling up food and sleeping' (Couturier 2010:77). By actually seeing the lives of people living without the need to continuously consume and supported by their spiritual attachments, Watanabe realised there were other ways to live. In addition, being outside the rush of Japan, she had time to consider, to understand and to reflect on many aspects of the world. In Kathmandu, she lodged at a place called Shanti Kuti, run by a Japanese Zen monk named Takaoka, and during that time, she assisted him to document traditional Nepali Buddhist woodblock printing (Couturier 2010:79). At this place, Watanabe meet her husband, Gufu, and many people she would have long friendships with (including Ito #6, the Oes #7 & #11, Nishimura #2, Amemiya #5 who appear in Couturier's book).

The most significant catalysts that affected her pathway in life come from three phases: interactions with Buddhism and her relationship to modern Japan; her experiences abroad and eventually her time India and Nepal; and finally, her encounter with the works of Rudolph Steiner. Since her youth, having no faith or no interest in religion, Watanabe had been questioning the meaning of life and death and deeply involved in mysticism and spiritualism (Couturier 2010:72-81). Her encounters with spiritualism of Buddhism came through her friend Jinko Kaneko #10 and through her engagements with practitioners she met on her journey, and through these interactions, it invited her to begin to contemplate her major questions more seriously. India and Nepal encapsulated spiritualism and were entirely different to the manner in which she lived in

Japan. At Shanti-Kuti, there existed Buddhism that was not bureaucratized or money-oriented (Couturier 2010:80). Shanti-Kuti allowed her to meet individuals such as Takaoka (the owner of Shanti-Kuti) and **Ito #6** who enlightened her to new ways of living, thinking and spiritually feeling. This period of experiencing the calm and quiet culture of Nepal and the traditionalism of this culture cemented an interest in Buddhist philosophy for Watanabe #3 and it began to give her some answers to the meaning of existence and of death.

The next stage of transformation came from being introduced to the works of Rudolf Steiner, a nineteenth century Austrian philosopher and Christian mystic that wrote in many subject areas and is highly influential. Steiner formulated a spiritual philosophy that was developed over three phases. The first phase went about creating or showing the synergy between science and the spiritual, which emphasises clarity in thought and mysticism. The second phase involved various forms of artistic endeavours and the final phase involved such as the Waldorf education, biodynamic agriculture and anthroposocial medicine (Lindenberg 1992:123-126). Watanabe would adopt many of his ideas, especially in regards to education and his philosophy on what it means to live. These days, Watanabe is an eclectic spiritualist, fusing spiritual ideas with her Catholic beliefs and an activist utilising many ideas from her lived experience in and outside of Japan.

Masanori Oe #11 is Wakako Oe's #7 husband. He is a film maker, author, translator of sacred texts and interpreter of indigenous traditions, community educator, woodblock print artist and sculptor and organic farming mentor. Masanori Oe #11 has had a deep awareness of the presence of death, and the idea of death and the philosophies that engage with the concept of death has shaped his whole life (Couturier 2010:282). He

has been exploring the fundamentals of life and death to his whole life: his childhood experiences of World War Two, from his times in the United States making documentaries of the psychedelic movement and during the antiwar protests in New York and Washington DC and the time spent translating *The Tibetan Book of the Dead* into Japanese have allowed him to further explore philosophical concepts of life and death..

The effects of the war on Japan and the image of traditional ideas as the source of the war was reinforced by the Occupational forces, was the beginning foundations of Masanori Oe's journey. He was born as the son of a Bunraku puppeteer, but in the situation that was presented by the war, he could not follow his father's footsteps. At the same time he felt that there was not enough creativity and imagination in traditional puppeteering. His interest in film came from being exposed to underground films, the works of Bergman and French New Wave films (Couturier 2010:286). He studied sculpture at an art school in Kyoto and worked for a while before heading to the United States in 1965. On the East Coast he met a film professor from Columbia University of New York professor Bob Lowe and eventually studied under him at a film studio on the Lower East Side called 'The Third World Film Studio' (Couturier 2010:286-287). In his first night, he was introduced to psychologist, writer and psychedelic drugs advocate Timothy Leary and the psychedelic movement during the sweeping cultural changes that were occurring due to the Vietnam War. Marvin Fishman, a friend of Oe's when they were in film school together, said that the Lower East Side was a hub for alternative culture and distinctive 'tribes' of people from different groups existed (Couturier 2010:287-289).

After making many films with the psychedelic movement and other people, Fishman

and Oe went independent during the sweeping changes that were occurring due to the Vietnam War. Their film *No Game* represented the wild and frantic nature of the anti-war protests at the time, and showed how these non-violent protests became violent due to the ever increasing brutality seen by police. As Fishman clearly remembers Oe saying, 'Violence changes consciousness.' (Couturier 2010:290). Couturier surmises that his experience with World War II and then with Vietnam War helped relay this message. Fishman describes Oe's films as 'films that seek answers to why people exist and to establish that 'we are here, now'. Oe states that the psychedelic movement was not about taking drugs, but came from the Latin word *psyche-delos*, meaning to 'open the soul' (Couturier 2010:293). His view of the movement is that people were seeking the meaning of living, either through drugs, Western esoteric spiritualities or Indian gurus, but that they never found answers that they were seeking for themselves. By the time Oe had left the United States in 1969 to return to Japan, he still had not found answers.

With his wife, the next part of his journey was to India. India and the time he spent in Nepal were crucial in Oe's life, as he finally felt that pieces of his life had begun to clearly fit together. This was emphasised by his encounter with the book named *The Tibetan Book of the Dead*, an ancient Buddhist text recommended to him by Leary years earlier. Oe felt that the many psychotropic experiences he had in the United States resounded in this book and answered many of his unanswered questions (Couturier 2010:296). He travelled back to Japan, slowly translating this book. His films and books which were released in Japan show the progressive development of his philosophy which led him, his wife and several others to start the Japanese version of the *Whole Earth Catalogue*, a counterculture that directly analysed and listed various resources, tools, items and so forth and listed information about them such as quality, where it came from, how to purchase the item and so on. He later completed translating books by

Hindu sage Sri Ramana Maharshi; South Indian philosopher J. Krishnamurti; two books by eleventh-century Tibetan Buddhist and poet Milarepa and a version of Native American parable, 'Jumping Mouse' illustrated in his woodblock prints, before he began to write his own books (Couturier 2010:298). Oe's book, *The Dreams the Universe Is Seeing*, showcases his thoughts: it is a theoretical and philosophical text that ranges in content from his experiences with death, his experiences abroad and his greater understanding of Zen Buddhism. His journey from Japan, to the U.S., back to Japan and then to India and Nepal and back, intertwined with his films and art, demonstrate and helped to progress his philosophy and search for meaning of life, something that Oe continues to pursue.

The individuals within Couturier's book, they experienced Japan's rapid modernisation process first-hand in this post-war period. Unlike most of the people around them, they felt that they could not just live the mainstream lifestyle. Going abroad allowed them to critically evaluate the direction in which Japan was heading, on the basis of which they decided how they wanted to live. Their major criticisms are associated with the emphasis on technological and economic progress in the modern world that lacks consideration for people, the environment, traditions, and spirituality. Modernisation, in their view, constricts mental and spiritual growth and limits the amount of free time people have. The next people as seen in Couturier's book demonstrate examples of the Slow Culture Artist's critical evaluations of modern society in Japan.

Asha Amemiya #5 is a self-sufficient farmer, a batik fabric artist, mother, author and illustrator. Before moving to the remote corner of the Koichi Prefecture, Japan, Amemiya #5 spend time in India and Nepal. Before meeting her husband Koichi Yamashita #9, she spent two years studying hand-spinning, weaving, vegetable-based

dying and other fabric arts in different textile centres. Later, Amemiya, Yamashita and their children spent 10 years living in the rural India in the state of West Bengal (Couturier 2010:140). Amemiya's art is largely influenced by the techniques and, ideas she learned Nepal and India; the philosophy of Tagore and Ghandi; as well as nature of Nepal, India and rural Japan.

Amemiya's time abroad allowed her to reflect on what Japan was becoming and the various problems of modernisation and its emphasis on economic growth. Commenting on consumerism, Amemiya views it as 'never-ending and once one goes down that road, one has to keep with progresses' (Couturier 2010:135). It is her opinion that if more people slowed down and stopped wanting the next newest item, capitalism would begin to stall. Originally, what drew Amemiya to live abroad were India's different ideas to Japan, especially in regards to time. In India, she felt freer and urgency was not necessary. Being back in Japan, she feels that she at times, has to live by the Japanese sense of urgency and efficiency, requiring things to be completed at the earliest possible time. Amemiya believes this significant difference in philosophy stems from Japan's emphasis on economy above all and she even feels that politics is about economy. In addition, she feels that Japanese politicians do not get into politics to create change but simply for politicians to pursue power and authority (Couturier 2010:138).

When India began its modernisation in the 1970s, Amemiya felt that its ideologies began to change, and it is partly for this reason that Amemiya, Yamashita #9 and their children returned to Japan. Amemiya has a 'sympathetic' connection to Tagore's ideas, as she firmly believes in learning directly from nature and studying unhurriedly. Tagore's philosophy, 'cultivation of sentiments', represents the primary philosophy behind Amemiya's interaction with the world, be it in doing her art or educating her

children (Couturier 2010:140). Couturier, from his perspective as a teacher in Japan, views the mechanised nature of the Japanese education system as 'deadening' and as such, finds Amemiya and Yamashita's approach to education heartening (Couturier 2010:141).

Education is a serious issue for the eleven Slow Culture Artists, whether it is the education of students or of communities. Yamashita #9 runs his own *juku* (after school cram school) and feels that the education system in Japan, both in the schools and at home, do not offer good tutelage to students. He feels that outside these places, students can learn more and in his *juku* he teaches his students *how* to study so they can teach themselves. (Couturier 2010:256-259). Gufu Watanabe #8 views the concept of 'study' in Japan simply as a system of memorisation to succeed in exams, which does not allow time for people to critically think about issues (Couturier 2010:217-218). Atsuko Watanabe #3 shares the same view. She feels that the education system is too formulaic and thus inadequate in properly teaching children how to grow, be critical and reflective, which is why she began to home-school her children (Couturier 2010:84-85).

The issue of education is also a vital component of the activism performed and lived by some of the individuals in Couturier's book. The issues they discuss range from local issues (human waste that creates garbage and pollution; construction that effects the environment such as dams; logging; nuclear power), broader national issues (anti-war; nuclear; environmental sustainability) and even issues in other countries (preservation of ancient texts and traditions; removing land mines in Vietnam; peace; environmental issues). The Slow Culture Artists teach and educate those around them on the issues, and do not emphasise their involvement. Below, the next two members of the Slow Culture Artists represent this antagonism towards specific modern social formats. For

instance, they are artists that disagree with various aspects the art world in Japan, especially its centrality on wealth and consumerism.

San Oizumi #1 is a potter, anti-nuclear organiser, anarchist, community educator and father. Oizumi grew up in the slums of Japan, and as he states, 'because I grew up as a poor person, surrounded by poor people, I learned a lot about the distortion and sickness that lie at the foundations of our society. I don't have any illusions about what it's really all about' (Couturier 2010:32). He grew up through the 1930s and 1940s, and his upbringing was generally non-conformist and filled with his father's anarchism. His father was a poet and woodblock carver who was completely against the military and killing and experienced how two-faced a society can be during and after a war. Like his father, Oizumi holds to his principles and believes that money is not important. Oizumi does not join groups (even those affiliated with some of his interests) as he views groupism as shackles, impeding personal opinion and thinking (Couturier 2010:49).

At the centre of Oizumi's activism and his perspective about modernity is his view that nuclear power is a dangerous and ominous presence. Even before the nuclear disaster in Fukushima was unleashed in 2011, he felt that presence of nuclear power has made the world very dangerous. Oizumi believes that nuclear power can potentially kill many living things through leakages, used as bombs, wastage and in addition, it is extremely costly. Oizumi and his family organise meetings and discussions concerning nuclear waste and its possible dumping in the region. For example, Oizumi had organised a forum because the government ignoring the civil rights movements against the dumping grounds and has invited guests such as Edward Lyman of the U.S. Nuclear Control Institute to educate the local community on the harmful effects of nuclear power (Couturier 2010:34).

Chernobyl is a key reminder of the potential destruction of nuclear power for Oizumi and his wife, who have constructed a tea room from a nuclear fallout shelter that exhibits various pieces of art that reflect on Chernobyl. He views that nuclear power is inconsistent with the philosophy present in the Way of Tea (Couturier 2010:47). Kagata Kouji of Rishouen Tea, believes that the Way of Tea, like flower arrangement, Buddhist art and stone statues and Noh plays, does have a limit when it comes to aesthetics; the Way of Tea has no boundaries (Kogata 2013:1). He believes that it is meditative in nature, in being a means of seeking tranquillity and contextually it is both natural (divine creation) and art (human creation) (Fling 1998:29). The Way of Tea is a process that creates a space of mutual respect between host and guest. Oizumi believes that this philosophy is not plausible with nuclear power, as nuclear power can destroy the environment through weaponisation, waste, and leakages. Nuclear power does not show respect for life and it can create disharmony.

Oizumi educates those within his community by utilising various methods, such as publicity campaigns that lead to people wanting to acquire information on and thinking about the issue of nuclear power, organised forums, discussions with local government and with the local people and through mediums like flyers and pamphlets. One example of a publicity campaign adopted by Oizumi is to use produce from the areas that surround nuclear facilities. With the help of local bakers, housewives and potters, he displays the problems with these foods, their origins, how it effects people so the public can begin to question nuclear power and its cost on produce and people's health. Couturier views these kinds of campaigns as ingenious, as they cross classes and different types of people and most importantly break through the barriers to allow political discussions (Couturier 2010:41-42). Oizumi believes that frank honesty can

only be expressed with voiced language through face to face discussion, and feels that written words can be manipulative, false and deceitful. He uses government marketing campaigns for nuclear power as an example, as these mediums use charts, images and complicated terminology to mask the potential damages that could occur (Couturier 2010:52-53).

The Slow Culture Artists capabilities to live differently and to critique and alter mainstream discourse put them in a similar position to 'the Other'. To clarify, the Slow Culture Artists are the Other as they are considered outside the boundary of modern society due to their slow living philosophy. 'The Other' in Japan are the *burakumin*, the indigenous people of Japan such as the Okinawans and *Ainu*, *Zainichi* Koreans and Chinese and other foreigners, the female perspective and homosexuals. The Other is still struggling in Japan to obtain their own distinct identities and integrate their viewpoints into mainstream society and gain access to all of mainstream Japan's rights under Japanese law. The Slow Culture Artists fit this definition because they are an alternative group who illuminate critically the cultural, economic and political structures of modern Japan. Whilst they do not suffer the same experience as Other have historically, the Slow Culture Artists are still trapped within a modern system that requires money and that requires people to hold a particular viewpoint on progress if they are to be accepted into the mainstream.

Jinko Kaneko #10 is a painter, chef, restaurant proprietor, hand dyer, felt artist and flower gardener. She lives in the Japanese Alps, painting, creating her fabric art and running her restaurant. Kaneko feels that whilst living where she does is beautiful, it is quite difficult. (Couturier 2010:267) In college, Kaneko was considered a talented painter, but the social norms within Japan's art society developed over time and her

having children, lead Kaneko away from painting. She decided to leave Japan and head overseas, leaving everything behind, going to India with her friend Atsuko Watanabe #3. Her father was a Buddhist priest and had always been exposed to esoteric spiritualities, so going to India did not seem strange. In Nepal, she concentrated her efforts on studying weaving and dying effects for fabric, studying various types of curry cooking techniques and in India and Nepal, expanded her spiritual understanding of life. When she returned to Japan, Kaneko opened a restaurant named Botenya which would eventually become a hub for many alternative people. Even though she has the opportunity to run her restaurant, create her art and live the lifestyle she does, Kaneko believes that it is still difficult to live in rural areas where conservative views are predominant. Commenting to Couturier, she states:

"The people in this area gather together for a lot of different traditional reasons and also to make decisions about such things as the water pipes and community weed cutting. I think a lot of these meetings aren't really necessary, and as a woman and an outsider, I am at the bottom of the ranking: first there are all the men, and the oldest ones are higher than the younger ones, and then there are all the women, and I am at the bottom of that ranking, because I don't even come from here. It's tiring. The village mindset is narrow, and there are all kinds of tasks to do that take me away from painting. I feel drained.' (Couturier 2010:272)

The problem of the conservative nature of rural living also extends into acquiring a home. There are many empty houses in rural areas, especially with the continuous decline of the rural population; however, many people still do not want strangers staying in these familial establishments. Yamashita #9 for instance, tried many times to acquire a rural home, and he felt that it sometimes took begging to win people over. In addition, the main reason why young people leave for the cities is the opportunities, the

convenience that comes with living in the city and to escape the hard work required by rural living. In discussion with Couturier, Amemiya #4 reminds him that 'for someone with a family, a job and house they need to make a living. It takes a lot of courage to throw everything away and start 'country living' (Couturier 2010:153).

So far, the lives of Slow Culture Artists have been described to illustrate key values on which they create their lives. Their key values are very similar to the values of the Cultural Creatives. For instance, nature is a sacred part of their identity, both as a means to connect themselves with the world and something to sustain and protect. The environment is a part of the spiritual conscious and they interact with it through art, traditions, activism, community groups and their lived lifestyles. Whilst there are some interesting observations about the differences between the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artist's engagement with nature (discussed in Chapter 4), ultimately the environment is a core component of their lives. Another example is their deep relationships with indigenous and traditional culture. The Slow Culture Artists and Cultural Creatives have cultivated their values with adopted concepts from these cultures that represent spiritual, lifestyle and cultural alternatives to modern industrial culture. Over the course of Chapter 3, it has been shown that the Slow Culture Artists' values correspond greatly to those discussed in Chapter 2, and thusly highlights that if their differences are subtracted, their core can be seen to have a connection between the two groups. At the same time, their values appear to share a lot with traditional Japanese culture sustained in highly-modernised Japan. The relationship between traditional Japanese culture and modernity has been discussed in a most profound manner by the philosophy of Minamata fisherman Masato Ogata. His philosophy of 'Life-world' (*inochi no sekai*) is a most fundamental critique of modernity and has many commonalities with the philosophies by which Slow Culture Artists live. As will be

discussed below, however, there are some differences between Ogata's philosophy and the values cherished by the Slow Culture Artists. In the following section, Ogata's philosophy is discussed with the view to discern and accentuate the characteristics of the Slow Culture Artists that are simply beyond a critique of modernity.

4. Ogata's Philosophy

Ogata's 'Life-World' (Yoneyama 2012) or 'Eternal World' (Oiwa 2001) principles and philosophy are centred on traditional understandings of the connection between people and the environment. This philosophy has been able to emerge due to dual histories: one Japan as a modern society and the repercussions of modernisation and secondly through traditional practices and spiritualities that have made up Japanese thought (Yoneyama 2012:1).

Ogata was a prime member of those seeking compensation from the Minamata disease incident, but would eventually withdraw his application. Minamata disease is a result of sustained poisoning by methyl mercury. From 1932- 1968, the Chisso Corporation through the production of acetaldehyde released methyl mercury in its untreated effluent (Colligan-Taylor 2001:1).

Ogata was born on November 8th 1953 in the village of Oki near the Shiranui Sea (Oiwa 2001:25) and raised in a large family of fisherman where his father Ogata Fukumatsu taught him the connections to the sea and the sea spirits. Within the village there was a deep connection between people and to the world surrounding them. His father referred to the fishing as a 'competition of souls' between the fisherman and the sea life (Oiwa 2001:35). The villages around Amakusa Island were lively before the effects of Minamata disease but this liveliness would be greatly impacted. In September 1959, his

father would become the first victim of Minamata Disease when it hit their village (Oiwa 2001:39). Minamata disease would drastically effect his family, himself and his village.

In 1968, the government would eventually officially acknowledge Minamata disease was caused by industrial chemicals. After four years of court procedures, victims won their case and Chisso were required to enter into compensation agreements. In 1974, the Minamata Disease Certification Applicant's Council was formed to give certification to victims of the disease. Ogata would eventually become a figurehead for the fight for compensation. That same year, Ogata placed his application for certification and joined the Minamata Disease Certification Applicant's Council and became an intricate member in its struggle for compensation. Going away for months at time, Ogata received much criticism from within his family and village for not keeping up with his responsibilities, and this lasted the entirety of the time he spent in the movement. By the 13th anniversary of the acknowledgement of Minamata Disease, Ogata had decided to withdraw himself from the movement (in 1985). He has felt that the movement had lost direction, and that victims no longer held a voice once monetary compensation was given and most of all he realised that his life belonged back home in the village with his family.

After suffering from period of despair from a lack of direction and meaning to his life, Ogata began to visualise the meaning in his life's journey and some of the problems that have arrived in Japanese society. Ogata had what some would call a 'moment of enlightenment', what he refers to as 'a period of madness' (Oiwa 2001:102). He would later describe this sensation as *Tokoyo* or 'the Eternal World', a name he would later call a wooden boat he had built that would take him down the Minamata River to the Chisso

Corporation. It is not a place, as Ogata describes it, 'it is a state of mind, calm, secure place in which there is no room for ego' (Oiwa 2001:105)

Ogata developed a philosophy of living referred to as Life-World (Yoneyama 2012). It began when Ogata realised that the Minamata disease incident occurred because humans stopped treating humans like human beings and that our connectedness to nature had withered. Shoko Yoneyama (2012) defines the Life-World philosophy of Ogata as being based in Japan's cultural tradition of animism and is a philosophy that critiques modernity. It presents humans as being part of a connectedness with all living things and the souls of the living and dead (Yoneyama 2012:1) In *Life-World: Beyond Fukushima and Minamata*, Yoneyama addresses the potentiality of the philosophy to provide 'a new frame of reference for the world risk society [from] non-Western countries by directly addressing the lacuna in (Western-made) social science: spirituality and nature. (Yoneyama 2012:1)

Ogata's philosophy flourished from reflecting on his time during his involvement in the Minamata disease victim's movement and from the time he left. He felt that people and society had strayed away from the connectedness with the world. Ogata saw in modernisation and industrialisation a change in people's nature through over indulgence in making profit/money (Oiwa 2001:144),⁴¹ affluence and 'modernising', too much reliability in technology and convenience, family, tradition and the spiritual in society and finally, the lack of reflection from people at their own involvement in society. Ogata discusses the core problem by addressing what he calls the 'Chisso within' (Yoneyama 2012:1).

41 Ogata refers to the historical pathway of the Minamata victims versus Chisso Corporation as ending as soon as monetary compensation occurred. He comments that this seems to be the trait of most environmental movements (Oiwa 2001:144)

Ogata mused that the overall problem for the Minamata victims lies in an inability to place responsibility and that Chisso, the prefectural government and national government can only respond to the claims of responsibility within the current system. As pinpointing responsibility or accepting responsibility can be impossible, financial compensation became the focus. Financial compensation had become a substitute for responsibility and once compensation had been acquired, it was as if the issue has been swept under the rug. Ogata views compensation as not necessarily bad as it is important for the victims; however, he felt that creating an 'end' to Minamata disease via compensation was not right. As Ogata described, the government had saved the Chisso Corporation many times through financial loans and the company had become 'something like a phoenix' (Oiwa 2001:145). In 1995, a final compensation agreement had been agreed upon by the government and various social movements, a solution that echoed the sentiments of the victims: a quick solution to end the Minamata disease struggle. The dispensing of these compensation packages highlighted the problems of money and the bewitching nature of government and authority that Ogata could see in modern society. Eventually, he came to realise that even if Chisso accepted responsibility, Chisso and the Minamata were all responsibilities of human beings and that he was human. Ogata came to the conclusion that sin and guilt should not be seen as negative but that they should be lived with, in a more positive manner. He acknowledges that human beings have forgotten that they are human beings (Oiwa 2001:146). Ogata resided in the fact that the very nature of people as a collective existence caused the Minamata disease. Society as individuals needed to self-reflect, to see the 'Chisso within'. Ogata notes that the problems of compensation and responsibility are still being addressed in reference to incidents such as nuclear power, dam construction (Oiwa 2001:153) and the Fukushima incident (Yoneyama 2012:1).

In Ogata's Life-World philosophy, responsibility and positively engaging one's sins are parts of being human. To be human means to be connected with life and to be connected with the world. Ogata's beliefs paint a more humble picture of humanity, as not a living being that reigns supreme but rather one piece of a large complex web of life on Earth (Yoneyama 2012:1). Modernisation, industrialisation and mechanisation of society has long alienated human beings from the connectedness with the world. Modernisation has 'devoured the soul' and is preventing humans from recognising the sense of life they are connected with (Yoneyama 2012:1).

Ogata's Life-World philosophy seems to parallel the values of the Slow Movement and the Slow Culture Artists in that they emerged from a similar cultural and historical background. The Slow Culture Artists live in accordance to the connectedness to life that compliments Ogata's ideas. They live in natural surrounds in or near rural communities and have adopted many traditional ideas. Their art, their philosophies, their activism and their ways of living are characterised by connecting to the world through lived experience. The Slow Culture Artists' experience abroad has impacted on their understanding of modernisation in Japan and on their direction to live. These people synthesised a wide variety of ideas and values and concocted a lifestyle that was connected to the larger world. Ogata's references to traditional life as a means to re-engage with the connectedness to the world, is not the only idea that accords with the Slow Culture Artists; their views on modernisation and modern society are similar too. Ogata's critique of modernisation focuses on the failures of the functionality of the state and authority within the system and the failures of modernisation and mechanisation of society in disengaging the familiarisation of human beings as humans within a connected web of life. He recognises this immediate problem that has allowed for

human responsibility to be replaced by monetary compensation and allowing the passage of time and the economic system to rejuvenate companies such as Chisso. These components are cornerstones of the modern system. The Slow Culture Artists centre their critique of modernisation on Japanese society's emphasis on fast-paced business with an economic-focus and consumerist stance. They are specifically critical on education in Japan. Ogata's philosophy can be applicable as a tool to explain the Slow Culture Artists. However, the eclectic values of the Slow Culture Artists are too important to ignore. Ogata's philosophy focuses on his lived experiences within Japan, and does not feature strong influences from other cultures. The Slow Culture Artist's engagement with traditions and modern ideas from many places are significant, indeed, too important to simply retract.

The Slow Movement exhibits some of the sentiments of Ogata's philosophy but has a few key differences. The Slow Movement realises that technology is a prevalent part of society and can't be avoided, and Ogata has agreed on this view. The Slow Movement though, utilising technology in its interactions with like-minded groups, in business and with people. As such, the Slow Movement is willing to reinvent modern concepts and ideas, such as Slow Movement's participation in green business development. These practices do not necessarily dismiss profit making, as transformation or creating a green business whilst increasing profit margins and decreasing wastage can also be beneficial to communities (i.e. employment for the local community, decrease in damage to the environment). Ogata is interested in green enterprises such as renewable energy. He believes that renewable energy increases the compatibility of the life-world and the system-society and can also see it as a positive move for local autonomy (Yoneyama 2012:1). In referencing Son Masayoshi's green energy project, he can see how green energy has the potential of bringing Asia together. Yet, he also believes the increase in

green industry will simply turn nature into a new economic commodity. Ogata feels that nature needs to be viewed with respect and dignity (Yoneyama 2012:1).

Ogata's philosophy and Ray's transmodernism both emphasise re-engagement with humankind. The Cultural Creatives heritage in American cultural and historical background, however, some of these influences have themselves been influenced by Eastern philosophers, religions and people, as well as by traditional cultures that did not reflect the mainstream culture. The Cultural Creatives have a large pool of values spanning many areas of thought and ways of living. They enrich their own cultural and historical understanding of the world by engaging with other aspects of it. Just like Ogata, they contend with various aspects of modern society, but the Cultural Creatives attempt to alter modern society through optimistic, enterprising innovations (such as green business, activism, and spiritualism). The Slow Movement approach replicates the Cultural Creatives. The Slow Culture Artists identities are largely shaped via their experiences abroad and whilst this group has the greatest compatibility to Ogata; it is these experiences that make transmodernism more appropriate device for analysis.

5. Conclusion

Couturier's interviews with the eleven people in his book *A Different Kind of Luxury*, expresses a Japan full of humility and simplicity. Couturier opens the book with, 'There is a larger world surrounding us, not just the resplendent world of nature, but also our own potential as people to live well, to connect with each other, to do meaningful work, and to forge a different kind of future for ourselves and for the next generation' (Couturier 2010:1-2). The Slow Culture Artists *are* people seeking 'to forge a different

kind of future', seeking something beyond modernity and beyond the traditional worlds that greatly influenced their lives. They do not do it because it is necessary but because they want to. As Gufu Watanabe remarks,

Whatever it is that is your purpose in life, you can't push yourself into it. Otherwise it's something you are doing just in order to have a job. Doing things 'in order to' or 'for the purpose of' is no good... That's why the most important aspect of my life is freedom. That's what I wanted. And that's why I chose this life in the mountains, to be around nature and to be free (Couturier 2010:247).

Through the lessons taught to them by people, from philosophies, ideas and living experience, they have spent decades evolving their world-view and 'walking the talk', living self-sufficiently. Individually, they continue particular traditional practices and art and collectively they teach their ideas to the community and to the future generations.

The Slow Culture Artists are embedded around the six core ideas of their name: 1) a deep spiritual and physical connection to the environment 2) slow and sustainable living in rural communities amongst nature, 3) deep interaction with traditional practices, 4) ideals and spiritualities from a range of cultures, 5) art and traditional practices as a central tenant of their life and a means to connect themselves with the world and 6) to criticise and challenge modernity. They are groups who have had influential journeys abroad and this has allowed them to be critical of Japanese society. The Slow Culture Artists live with eclectic choice in values. The primary ideals of these Slow Culture Artists are not unique to them, but can be seen in a variety of other groups within Japan. The Slow Movement culture in Japan represents a wide range of organisations, people and groups who seek an alternative to the world that Couturier views as 'unsustainable' (Couturier 2010:154).

The six core values of the Slow Culture Artists (highlighted earlier in this chapter) share similarities to the six core values of the Cultural Creatives as seen in Chapter 2. The Slow Culture Artists and Cultural Creatives share these essential six components: 1) the sacredness of the environment; 2) alternative values to the mainstream; 3) an engagement with many culture and traditions; 4) activism, 5) self-actualisation and 6) connectedness on a spiritual level to the world. Whilst they differ when it comes to interaction with business culture, wealth and their individual engagements within alternative groups and activist associations, there is a crucial common thread of values shared by both parties, which could suggest a much larger trend towards transmodernism. If indeed the similar values of the Slow Culture Artists and the Cultural Creatives are signs of the emergence of transmodernist values within particular sets of people, then this framework could be made the basis of further analysis and would in addition, confirm the Slow Culture Artists as being like a Cultural Creative (transmodernist).

The following chapter will make affirmative the correlation of the values of the Slow Culture Artists to the Cultural Creatives and discuss the implications associated with both these groups being transmodernist. The chapter will open with a discussion of the six core values of each group. This discussion will explore these values through comparing similar core values to each other, identify their differences and examine the implications of these deviations. The comparison will be followed by investigating three issues that arose from this thesis. These issues detail the importance of Asia within the context of transmodernism, the limitations of linearity on the discourse of modernity and the significance of dialogue as a core fundamental of transmodernism.

Chapter 4: Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists

1. Transmodernism: Cultural Creatives and the Slow Culture Artists

This chapter will focus on comparing the core values of the Cultural Creatives: 1) ecology; 2) the importance of women's issues; 3) altruism and importance of family and close friends; 4) self-actualisation; 5) spiritualism; 6) a rejection of materialism, success culture and information, against those of the Slow Culture Artists: 1) a connection to nature on a physical and spiritual level; 2) simple and self-sufficient living; 3) criticism of modernisation and materialism; 4) the importance of foreign ideas and traditions; 5) spiritualism of 'oneness with all'; 6) traditional practice and art as a focal element. This examination will operate by segmenting each of the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists' values into similar blocks: 1) environment and spirituality; 2) relations to people and culture; 3) critical engagement with modernity.

Following the results of this investigation, the thesis will explore the implications of transmodernism through these emerging social groups. This portion will focus on three inferences: 1) the significance of Asia in the foundations of the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists by discussing the importance of Emerson and Thoreau engagement with Asia; 2) the problematic of linearity in the discourse of modernity; 3) the critical conceptualisation of dialogue within transmodernism.

2. Environment and Spirituality

The Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists view the environment and their relationships to it as a central tenant (Couturier 2010; Cultural Creatives 2014:3). Their relationship to the environment is not only for pragmatic reasons (i.e. for survival), they interact with it on a physical and spiritual level. The Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists engage with the earth using principles seen in traditional and Eastern spiritualities and culture (Couturier 2010). Whilst they acknowledge that humanity needs the earth as means of survival, they also acknowledge that assisting in sustaining the earth, being connected to it, and living as part of its system will create a brighter future.

The Cultural Creatives relate to the environment in varied degrees, depending if the individual is a Core or Green Cultural Creative. Commonly, they borrow from a tradition that has cultivated sacredness for nature from transcendentalism, naturalists, traditional cultures, new social movement and consciousness movement, and alternative spiritualism and religion. They are environmental conservationists, activists, consumers and participants in the green economy and live by principles of sustainability. The Core Creatives extend this through spiritual engagement (both Western and Eastern in nature), alternative natural healing, and medicines. They see themselves connected to nature, such as some who engage with the world through principles seen in Zen Buddhism. The Slow Culture Artists' engagement with the environment and nature comes from traditional Japanese culture and traditions and philosophies primarily from Asia. They view themselves as part of a wider world and feel this connection through living directly within nature. They live sustainably, grow and eat organic foods, use less technology that impacts nature and choose slow living lifestyles. The Slow Culture Artists imbed nature into the conceptualisation of their own spirituality. Their concept involves relating to art and traditional practices, alternative philosophies, religions and

spiritualism, nature and their connection to people and the living world. With their own foundations and influences, the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists have been given the tools to compare, analyse and critique modern societies failed relationship with nature and the spiritual world. Thus, the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists exhibit strong feelings towards the environment, feature in a diverse range of spiritual actualisations and actively criticise mainstream society and seek solutions. Furthermore, their experiences with nature and spiritualism are taught to others who seek guidance into these areas.

The most significant divergence between the Cultural Creatives and the Slow Culture Artists' values revolves around their views on commercial endeavours and nature. In essence, the Slow Culture Artists do not deal with environmental improvement through commercialised business whilst the Cultural Creatives (and this also includes Japan's Slow Movement) act on improving the current modes of business to be ecological and forward thinking. The Cultural Creatives are the catalyst of green industries and look for solutions to realise a brighter future for the following generations. They try to deviate the current trend of economic capitalism towards something more sustainable. The Slow Culture Artists, on the other hand, keep as far away from using money and commercial ventures into green economics as possible. Instead, they rely on the earth to live and educate others on how to be self-sufficient and stand against destruction of the environment by man-made means.

The Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists dedicate much of their lives to seeking a spiritual connection with the world. Their eclectic spirituality relies on learning from a wide variety of traditional and spiritual backgrounds, from Eastern spiritualities and philosophies such as Buddhism, Hinduism, Daoism and Confucius, esoteric spiritualities

and from Western spiritualities and philosophies and native indigenous traditions such as Native American Indian and Australian Aborigines. Seeking to answer the big questions and to try and understand themselves and where fit in the scheme of the planet is essential to their own personal development.

However, it is the commercial explorations of spiritualism that once again creates a gap in their similarities to each other. The Cultural Creatives have been a considerable driving force behind the alternative spirituality industry and the LOHAS culture is just one example as discussed in Chapter 2. Primarily these businesses are created for Cultural Creatives by Cultural Creatives, offering a means to explore their own spiritualities and self-actualisation in a place that abides by their core values. The Slow Culture Artists do not buy into the 'spiritual industry', but even so, much of their life changing experiences happened abroad so technically, money was necessary at some point on their journeys.

The Slow Culture Artists and Cultural Creatives share similar feelings towards the environment, however they have different relationships with business and industry. This is even reflected in their view of spirituality in a commercial sense. This trend will be evident in other sections of shared values.

3. Relations to People and Culture

Connections are the fundamental cornerstone of the Cultural Creatives and the Slow Culture Artists and as such, it would come as no surprise that cultures- both traditional and modern- and the people that make them up are of considerable importance to them. In actuality, without the transformational properties in culture, these emerging social groups would not exist. Through transmodernist dialogues, these groups are able to

connect and sympathise with many different people, in many different places and amongst a large variety of social values and customs. They have transmuted ideas, values, philosophies, style of living and merged them with their own modern societies to formulate an alternative way of living.

The Cultural Creatives emerged from the distinct formation of two social groups (Moderns and Traditionals) and a wave of cultural change that swept through the United States (Cultural Creatives 2014:2). The Cultural Creatives are supported by a strong foundation of individuals and groups that critically engaged with modern society and try to create more positive pathways. As discussed in Chapter 2, the new social movements in particular became the archetype for the Cultural Creatives, through the means of engaging with their own values and their manner of choosing to live. Furthermore, the Cultural Creatives see the importance of globalism, as a means to cultivate new values and interact with culturally different people (Cultural Creatives 2014:2). With access to a large map of values, they have attempted to transform their own lives and those of others. They connect to ideas and people that are 'outside' the modern norms and values and render new ways at approaching problems i.e. push to innovative green business, empowerment of women's issues as social issues, activism against endangerment to the natural environment, spiritual development, and educating others on the authenticity of products.. By 'walking the talk', being authentic, engaging with the world outside of the modern and critically and positively engaging with solutions to modern issues, the Cultural Creatives seek to do what their name implies: create new cultural pathways.

The Slow Culture Artists live contrasting lifestyles to that seen in cities like Tokyo and Osaka; they live by principles of slowness, self-sufficiency and connection to the natural world. From their own lived experiences with traditional Japanese philosophy,

norms and values and their time spent living abroad in places like Nepal, India and Afghanistan, they open their eyes to benefits that befit lifestyles that strain from commercialisation, materialism, and fast paced capitalist economics. The Slow Culture Artists' lived experiences provide them with the opportunities to create their own values in an eclectic manner based on their interactions with 'the Other' (being those people/ideas that do not fit the hegemonic of mainstream Japan) and their own criticisms with modernisation. Another aspect of the Slow Culture Artists' connection with cultures is through their participation with traditional arts and practices. Which deepen their connection to traditional cultures and cultivate their own sense of spiritualism and connection to the world. The importance of culture, via art/traditional practices, their lived experiences abroad, their lived experience in Japan and the values and ideas they have come in contact with, is truly evident in the lives of the Slow Culture Artists.

Family, friends and people are valued greatly by the Cultural Creatives, which is similarly echoed by the Slow Culture Artists. The Cultural Creatives try to develop close, authentic relationships with their families and close friends and in order to do so, many leave or reduce their time in highly successful occupations to sustain and grow these relationships (Ray & Anderson 2000:17-19). This desire is extending into their interactions with their own communities. Many Cultural Creatives engage in projects such as youth and women's community groups, educating people on various issues, and creating new businesses or social groups. The Slow Culture Artists cultivate relationships quite similarly. They prioritise close relationships with family and friends and play important roles as educators and fellow activists. In fact, the relationships they developed amongst each other and with people from cultures overseas are pinnacle in their own development.

The impact of culture on the lives of the Cultural Creatives and the Slow Culture Artists should not be underestimated when discussing their emergence. Both groups have formulated value systems that are centred on alternative values to modern society and critical engagement with modernity, fusion with traditionalism and modernisation and the necessity of engaging in true dialogue with people from a wide range of lifestyles, living conditions and cultures; these aspects of their values truly emphasis the tenants of transmodernism.

4. Critical Engagement with Modernity

The final section of the comparison will address the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists' critical engagement with modernity. This final component is the most essential quality of both these groups. The rest of the core values and ideas have originated from their perception of modernity.

The Cultural Creatives, as mentioned in the category above, have come from a distinct line of alternative cultures and social movements. The values in which they prioritise have been sculptured from social movements that fought for change to areas oppressed by modernity: rights and social positions of black Americans, the rights of women and the sustainability of the environment to name a few. The Cultural Creatives seek to 'fill the hole in modern society' (Ray & Anderson 2000:287-301) with the world through authenticity, whole process investigation and fusion of values. As such, the Cultural Creatives greatly voice their displeasure of the success culture and the narrow-mindedness of modernity and traditionalism. They actively engage with social issues, such as environment, women's issues, creating more sustainable business, lack of authenticity and quality in products, and community issues close to home and in far

reaching places. By using the voice of the other and the foundations of the modern and traditional, they call out the problems of society and look to create a new pathway.

The Slow Culture Artists live their lives by actively engaging against modern Japanese society. Their critical engagement of modernity could be considered more radical than those of the Cultural Creatives. As individuals, they each grew up with a conscious idea that there was something wrong with the pathway of development in Japan which was directing itself towards industrialisation and modernisation. Living overseas in situations strikingly different from a fast-paced developed nation, they could see alternatives to the issues they had with Japan: lack of time, constant development of infrastructure and technology with the disregard of nature, materialism and the perceived need for money and wealth. Eventually each of the individuals return to Japan, and bring with them the values, ideas, philosophies and the manner of living they discovered abroad. After they returned, many turned towards assisting their communities as activists and educators. Their activism is associated with projects that damage the environment and potentially threaten the lives people and the living world (i.e. nuclear energy or war). As educators, they defer from the national education system and develop a pedagogy aimed at educating others on the aforementioned issues. The Slow Culture Artists continue to live differently to modern society, and the whole process of living could in fact be partly considered a form of protest.

When comparing the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists' critical engagement with modernity, it can be seen that the Slow Culture Artists tackle modernity more critically and radically. The Slow Culture Artists take on a more traditional angle to this fusion whilst the Cultural Creatives lean more towards modern. This conclusion is attributed to: 1) the Slow Culture Artists do not wish to engage in business,

commercialisation and materialism but will use money for what is needed. The Cultural Creatives do not agree with success culture, lack of authenticity and quality in products, harmful business practices towards people and the environment, instead seek to rectify industries to be more eco-friendly whilst pushing for innovative products; 2) the Slow Culture Artists live in rural places utilising a lifestyle of slow-living. The Cultural Creatives (keeping in mind that it is a much larger group) come from a wide variety of backgrounds and much of them engage in business and industry; 3) it could be argued that the Slow Culture Artists have been more positively affected by traditional cultures. Their lives were directly affected by traditional cultures abroad, and whilst the Culture Creatives engage with traditional and indigenous cultures, there is not enough evidence to state that they have *all* been influenced by these cultures. Still, both the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists can still be classified as transmodernists, even with this slight alternation between them.

5. Results

In this chapter it has been shown that the most significant shared value of the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists is their views on the sacredness of nature and sense of spirituality. The Cultural Creatives and the Slow Culture Artists express their desires for social change towards the environment through various methods, such as green and slow business, a spiritual connectedness to nature, and environmental activism. Their environmental beliefs are different in their monetary application of their values and their proximity to nature. The Cultural Creatives and the Slow Movement both utilise business and money (only what is necessary) in seeking environmental change. Nevertheless, the Cultural Creatives emphasis various forms of business and business related issues, not just green business; rather, they promote environmental policies, procedures and attitudes in all businesses (where in some cases there is still some

emphasis on profits). The Slow Culture Artists do not inherently use economic funding or associate with business. They spend most of their time living with nature and working with communities on local environmental activism. In regards to their proximity to nature, the Slow Culture Artists are the closest to nature (as they live in rural places and are therefore amongst it). As opposed to the varied proximity of the Cultural Creatives who live in the big cities as well as more rural areas.

The Cultural Creatives and the Slow Culture Artists feel a spiritual connection to nature and seek their spiritual self-development. Ray's transmodernism was greatly influenced by transcendentalism and many Eastern esoteric spiritualities, such as Hinduism, Daoism, and Buddhism are prevalent sources of spiritual guidance. In addition, many traditional cultures and spiritualisms, such as Native American cultures, Australian Aboriginals, traditional Japanese and people of the Himalayas have had an influence. The sacredness of nature and having a connection to the world are foundational cores of their diverse spiritualities. They are continuously trying to understand their connection to the world and integrate their spiritualities into other components of their life, such as art, activism, environmental conservation, traditions, and farming.

The emphasis on environmental sustainability and sacredness is part of the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists' desire to try to discover an alternative way of living and their approach to self-actualisation and spirituality. They express post-materialist values and behaviours and are critical of many aspects of modernisation and capitalism, especially how it does not engage with values and modernisations outside the hegemonic form of modernisation. They are actively trying to change their world to be more sustainable and eco-friendly. The Slow Culture Artists are the most critical towards modernisation and capitalism. Their critical standpoints spread in a wide

variety of categories, from consumerism and education to technology and social constructs. Their issues with modern Japan were a large motivating factor in their decisions to go abroad and to eventually live self-sufficient sustainable lives.

As discussed in Chapters 1-3, transmodernism combines traditionalism and modernist values, ideas and practices. These values are not confined by national borders but are far reaching. These people seek to reinvent traditionalism for a modern age, demonstrating that authenticity and a connection to the people, the animals and the world around them is possible. An aspect that the Slow Culture Artists differ to the Cultural Creatives are in experiences with cultures outside of Japan that seem fundamental in their engagement in slow life activities and living. Many of their experiences abroad have occurred in Asia, such as India, China, Nepal, South-East Asia but others have also experienced living in the United States, Canada, Europe and South America. In addition, the Slow Culture Artists have interacted with a wide variety of traditional cultures including Australian Aboriginals and traditional villages of India and Nepal.

Based on the analysis in Chapters 2-4, it is evident the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists share many commonalities that can allow them both to be explained by transmodernism. The greatest commonalities come from their connection to the natural world, the importance of people, traditions and culture, they seek spiritual self-actualisation communicate with the world through two-way dialogue and a critical engagement with modernity and post-modernity. The major difference between them is the use of money and engagement with business. As the thesis has established, this difference is associated with a greater ratio of traditional values in Slow Culture Artists and a greater ratio of modern values in Cultural Creatives. Most importantly, both fit within the tenants of traditionalism- thinking from the perspective of the Other, dialogue,

importance of traditionalism and critique of modernity- and the extended values expressed in Ray's concept of transmodernism- environment, spiritualism and importance of people as connected to the world. These are two groups that can be defined as transmodernist.

6. Inferences: Asia, Linearity and Dialogue

This comparison has demonstrated that the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists, even with their differences, share core values that reverberate with the concepts seen in Ray's transmodernism. This then demonstrates that there is the capability of transmodernism being universally applicable rather than culturally defined to the West. Ray's transmodernism can be applied to Asia, but why is this important and what does it show? The final section of this chapter will discuss three implications seen within this comparison. The first implication is in reference to Asia. Asia plays a major influence on Ray's transmodernism. By discussing the transcendentalists, an American literary and intellectual group of the 19th century who are one of the bedrock foundations of Ray's conceptualisation, it can be shown that the Orient has had deep influence in many of the spiritual, philosophical and literature journeys of some of its leaders: Emerson and Thoreau. These men developed philosophies and advocated for changes that are deeply ingrained in the Cultural Creative psyche.

The second implication will discuss the issue of linearity in regards to the development of social change in modernity. This will be shown via the World Value Surveys with comparison to the values of the Cultural Creatives and the Slow Culture Artists. These findings will be backed up with academic reference to Tipp (1973) who demonstrates the failures of modernisation theory through Western ethnocentrism and one directional development.

The third and final implication is the fundamental role of dialogue in transmodernism. This section will show how dialogue in both its internal and external forms has helped to shape the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists. The internal dialogue will focus on Emerson's relationship to Neo-Platonism and Asia as a means of demonstrating how these transmodernist groups create their eclectic values whilst the external dialogue will discuss the position from the suffering Other and how it is used to criticise modernity, globalisation and capitalism whilst also projecting positive future pathways.

7. Transcendentalism and Asia

Transcendentalism was a movement in the United States during the 19th century. The movement was a reaction to 18th century rationalism, John Locke's philosophy of Sensualism, the direction New England Calvinism, the general state of spirituality, and the state of intellectualism at Harvard University. The movement featured an eclectic scope of values, including influences from German idealism and from Hindu philosophy. The transcendentalists were greatly influential to the Cultural Creatives. According to Christy, it was obvious to those with experience of or otherwise with Oriental literature that these three key transcendentalists Ralph Waldo Emerson and Henry David Thoreau were widely and deeply read on Oriental literature and philosophy (Christy 1963:3). As such, this section will briefly give insight on what Oriental philosophy most greatly influenced them.

8. Emerson and Thoreau and their Relations to the Orient

Emerson (1803-1882) was an essayist, lecturer and poet and led the Transcendentalists. He was greatly influential to American society, especially for his values in

individualism, freedom and democracy, the potentiality of human beings and the soul and the connection to the world. He was a mentor and friend of fellow transcendentalist Thoreau. Henry David Thoreau (1817-1862) was an American author, poet, philosopher, polymath, abolitionist, naturalists, tax resistor, development critic, surveyor, historian and one of the leaders of the transcendentalists (Howe 2009:623). Thoreau was best known for his works *Walden* and *Civil Disobedience*.

Emerson and Thoreau's engagement with the Orient and how they engaged their own values had a drastic influence on the manner in which transmodernist groups like the Cultural Creatives sculptured their own value foundations. Emerson and Thoreau engaged with Orientalism as a means of improving their own ideas and values without replacing their cultural and historical upbringing. From the Orient, they critically analysed Orient texts and used these Oriental concepts as ingredients in their own intellectual and spiritual journeys. The Transcendentalists, especially Emerson and Thoreau created an eclectic blueprint built on dualism of Occidental and Oriental values additionally composed of integrating components of both East and West. This blueprint would be adopted by the Cultural Creatives and is seen in the Slow Culture Artists.

Even more, the importance of Emerson and Thoreau continues in how they engaged with these Oriental literatures. Emerson and Thoreau were both instrumental figures within the transcendentalists and best friends but there was a great paradox between them. Thoreau was a practical man and Emerson was a student, a dreamer and a mystic. Emerson should have ventured off to somewhere like *Walden* and thought about the Over-Soul but he was much too urbane (Christy 1963:200-201). Thoreau lived simply, greatly admired nature and solitude and his ideas were consistent over the entirety of his life; he felt a great affinity with the idea of the true poet.

Thoreau's introduction to Orientalism came from Emerson. Whilst he agreed with Emersonian philosophy, Thoreau's engagement with Orientalism focused differently. He was interested in nature and using private solitude in the quest for enlightenment, and drew from Hinduism, Buddhism, Confucianism and Sufism.

For Emerson, the concept of 'Asia' was not just a geographical landscape nor was it simply about the literature attached to it; Asia had a deep emotional and intellectual meaning to him (Carpenter 1968:ix). Asia for Emerson was a symbol of mystery, romance, poetry and religion and the Hindu Brahmins best represents this ideal (Carpenter 1968:ix). Whilst many elements from Asian literature and philosophy did influence a great portion of his intellectual expanse, it wasn't until his later years that Oriental influences became prevalent. His tolerance and later acceptance and praise of Orient custom and thought developed from the growth of his own idealism (Christy 1963:71). As such, these philosophies assisted in his own cultural development by furnishing his own ideas (Carpenter 1968:19). Emerson did not merely replicate these sources; he transmuted them into his own ideas, creating something new (Carpenter 1968:24).

Emerson appreciated much of Oriental literature and integrated much into his thoughts. Hinduism and Persian poetry were by far his greatest influences, but also engaged with Arab literature, Buddhism, Zoroastrian oracles and the Chinese Classics. For Emerson, Hindu philosophy and literature represented the very essence of Orientalism (Carpenter 1968:103), especially the *Bhagavad-Gita* (Christy 1963:23). Emerson's eventual Over Soul philosophy could be paralleled to that of Hindu philosophy of the Absolute God (Christy 1963:74). In addition, Emerson's 'Brahma' is considered to be one of the

greatest pieces of work depicting the central essence and philosophy of Hinduism (Christy 1963:263-264; Carpenter 1968:111).

Persian poetry of Mohammedan mystics commonly called Sufism, followed Hinduism in Orient literature/philosophy that affected Emerson, specifically the works of Hafiz, Saadi, Enweri and Kermani (Christy 1963:34-35). Emerson compared to Hafiz to Shakespeare and Saadi to Homer (Carpenter 1968:170). Emerson saw in Hafiz and Saadi an ascribed freedom of thought and freedom of spirit which resulted in absolute joy in the world, showed sincerity and self-reliance which assured them basic value of life and finally perception of beauty in Nature and in Man and which inspired their poetic expression; these ideals represented the true poet to Emerson (Carpenter 1968:179).

Emerson as much as he praised the Oriental, was also critical of it, disliking its want for extremes and its acceptance of fatalism. Emerson paralleled his own ideas to the Orient (such as his Over Soul principle to the Hindu Vedanta) but was very much Occident and of Christian spirit (Christy 1963:77).

Like Emerson, Thoreau related to Hinduism the most of the Oriental literature he read and used it to bolster his own thoughts (Christy 1963:193). Thoreau was considered a Yogi (even by himself). Thoreau's main interest was in nature, its flora and fauna, and believed he could find God amongst nature (Christy:203). His Walden experiment was Yogi influenced in regards to living simply, a place for private solitude to spirituality self-actualise and enlighten.

Nevertheless, Thoreau was a New England Yogi: he reflected both Hindu and Christian

ideals. He was also the type of man who disliked systems, including the systems within being a Yogi Practitioner which made it impossible for Thoreau to obtain the true nature of a Yogi. Thoreau cast great value on many elements of Orientalism, but was as much a Realist and mystic (Christy 1963:230). His interactions with Orientalism reinforced his values in private solitude for spiritual growth. Both Thoreau's *Civil Disobedience* and *Life Without Principle* had many 'un-European' qualities and was more practically applied in the East, such as by Mahatma Ghandi (Christy 1963:211).

Emerson and Thoreau, including the other Transcendentalists, were instrumental promoters of socially progressive and alternative ideas to the modern discourse on values. They supported women's rights, abolitionism, the importance of spiritual growth, the promotion of Oriental literature, democracy, individualism. Their interpretation of value accumulation, assimilation and/or creation formulated a distinct blueprint of dualistic values on top of their Western cultural and historical foundations. Asian values, ideas and philosophies allowed Thoreau and Emerson to better understand themselves and their lived lives in the West and to seek new pathways both intellectually and spiritually. The importance of Asia transmuted to the modern day Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists. Asian traditional cultures represent a means to compare their own lives within fast-paced highly industrialised nations. Even for those in Japan, Asian ways of living from countries and regions like Tibet, India, Nepal and the Himalayas demonstrate alternatives to the adopted systems of Western capitalism, modernization, urbanization and industrialization. The significance of Asia and the fusion of Asian values into these cultures through transmodernist groups will become greatly important as the world shifts to an Asian century. Values that show appreciation of nature's sacredness, the emphasis on the spiritual and physical world and equally important and the emphasis away from fast-paced consumerism and materialism could pave

themselves into the essential values of the future modern world. Transmodernists groups are significant in creating a bridge for Asian values and Western values to communicate and transform and it is these groups that could help to reframe Asia as a source for solutions and meaning in modern Western culture, rather than a potential thorn.

9. Linearity in the Discourse of Modernity

The concept of transmodernism pushes beyond modernity and postmodernity to emphasis a new model that places voice in traditional and alternative cultures in mainstream, Western influenced modernity. Critics of modernisation, as demonstrate by Tipp, that one of modernisation theory's failures is its predisposition towards traditionalism and modernisation being independent of another. What does that say about transmodernism, which acknowledges traditionalism and modernization under the same framework? This section will argue that there is a fixed linearity in modernization theory and this linearity effects the development of transmodernism.

To demonstrate this 'linearity', two points will be discussed. First, the World Value Surveys (WVS) will be used as a resource to highlight this issue. It is a project that has been acquiring data and analysis of values since the 1980s, traversing over a hundred countries. In order to accomplish this task, the United States and Japan will be the focus; reviewing data from the 1980s to 2014⁴² and this will be compared to the values of the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists. The second point will discuss Tipps

42 It should be noted that the book *Cultural Creatives* was released in 2000, and the data found by Ray and Anderson would have been during the period from the 1980s up until 1999.

(1973) evaluation of modernization theory. By doing so, this section will illuminate the complications for transmodernism if this linearity did not exist.

10. The World Value Surveys (WVS)

Based on the WVS⁴³, this section will focus on values that relate to the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists' key values. The issue of the environment and ecological sustainability has increased in importance overall since the first wave but has declined in the sixth wave. The trend of importance of the environment seems to be in universal shift from the first to fifth wave. Curiously though, there is no data for 'traditional versus high economic growth' over the four wave periods of data collection. In addition, under the 'environment' category in the question index, questions relating to humankind, tradition and nature are not present in the current sixth wave data. Judging from the information obtained in the WVS, whilst concern for the environment has increased since the mid-1990s, economic recessions (Kyodo 2013) and economic debts (Collison, France-Press 2013) weigh heavy on people's minds and as a result the importance of the environment versus economic and job growth has seen a shift to the latter. The lack of defined questions concerning where this influence seems to be generated from almost seems to imply that the importance of the environment increasing is just course.

43 One of the difficulties encountered with the WVS is that each wave of study did not necessarily have the same answers or answers for some questions at all. In order to answer some questions multiple similar questions were combined to achieve rounded answers.

Religion contrasts greatly in Japan and the United States (WVS 1990-2014). Reviewing the importance of religion in life, it can be seen that the percentage of the importance of religion is extensively greater in the United States, even though the percentage has declined since 1990. Religion in Japan has had very little change since 1990. The feeling that the 'church' can fill the spiritual needs for people is becoming less convincing for people in the United States and Japan. There has been a gradual decline in the number of individuals who consider themselves religious in both the USA and Japan (WVS 1990-2014). The search for purpose of life and meaning of life through spirituality/religion seems to be reflective of church attitudes in the USA, with an approximate 7% drop in 'often' for using religion/spirituality. However, since 1981 there has been 4% increase in Japan (WVS 2005). Also, Christianity and Islam are the only two specific faiths mentioned but Islam is only mentioned during the wave of 1999-2004, and the questions are more directed at social concerns to the Islamic faith. The most interesting aspect of this is the lack of the term 'spirituality' in discussing religion and its impact on people's lives. These figures counter the importance of spirituality and religion in the lives of the Cultural Creatives, Slow Culture Artists. The lack of questions directed at spiritualism rather than religion itself points against the Cultural Creative and Slow Culture Artists approach to self-development with religion. As much as there are questions pointed at different components and issues relating to religion, none actually address spirituality.

The importance of sustaining close relationships with family and friends is overall more valued these days. The importance of family in one's life since the first wave has had a minor fluctuation in the United States but has been seen dramatically more important in Japan (rise of nearly 20% (WVS 1981-2014)). The importance friends whilst consistently high have seen a minor decrease from the year 2000 to 2014. Only in the

sixth wave is there a question concerning tradition and family and the information shows a slight incline towards traditional customs and family. Nevertheless, there is not enough questions that depict aspects of tradition and family.

The impression of leisure time being essential has increased over the six waves but impressions of work have had fundamental differences between the two nations. The importance of work has sharply slumped in the United States. In Japan, importance of work in life propelled during the period of 1999-2014. The long running economic issues in Japan are one reason for the greater need to sustain employment. According to the data, the recent recession in the United States has declined the importance of work. The value trends associated with family and leisure are shown parallel with the Cultural Creatives and the Slow Culture Artists for both Japan and the United States up until 1999. The feelings towards work felt by the Cultural Creatives (including how it is compared to leisure and family/friend time) is coherent with modern society in the United States up to 2014, something that is not coherent with the Slow Culture Artists' views versus Japanese modern society. However, it should also be noted that the attitude that placing value less on work in the future has not seen any changes. This attitude is additionally reflected in many of the other questions relating to work and leisure which are catered around standard views of work within modern culture: success, working hard. Any questions that *seem to depict* traditional perspectives of work are motioned as negative, such as questions that imply working mothers as bad and suspicion towards immigrant workers.

The WVS presents the perspective of women and the role of women in society as overall improved. The image of women in the political arena and their position within universities was gradually better. The view of single female parents as capable parents

has also been seen more positively in Japan but this opinion has been less stable in the United States. Even with the increased acceptance of single female parents, the position of a father and a mother as essential to raising children is still predominantly agreed upon by the surveyors. The confidence of women's movements in societies has dropped, which could largely be associated with many women's issues becoming components of mainstream society. The Cultural Creative greater approval of women goes beyond what modern society does. Additionally, the target questions that depict traditional are expressed in a negative connotation, such as 'women who make more than their husbands, could this cause a problem?', or 'men make better politicians/business leaders' etc.

Reducing the emphasis of money and materialist values in life are being more embraced according to most recent waves but surprisingly though, the most extreme feeling of wealth accumulation being negative has a mildly decreased in the United States and Japan. When it comes to an increase in technology in society, the results are opposite for Japan and the U.S. The United States values a decrease in the emphasis of technology and in Japan, people feel a greater need for technology. Since the 1980s, the perception and necessity of advanced technology has roughly stayed the same. Contrastingly, the most striking difference since the 1980s has been the decrease in perception of science and technology only causing harm, with an increase in opinion that both helpful and harmful things come from science and technology. The formation of the questions concerning science and technology are mixed, with most questions when comparing science with religion painting science as the negative in the question. Concerning science and technology in regards to the future, the questions are appropriated generally as positive.

11. WVS Results

The World Value Surveys is based on the Inglehart-Welzel model that asserts two major dimensions of cross cultural variation in the world: traditional values versus secular-rational and survival values versus self-expression values. These values are used to describe particular cultures. The WVS using this model also examines for aspirations of democracy, empowerment of citizenship, globalisation and converging values, gender values, religion and happiness and satisfaction. When looking across the waves, it is clearly evident that there is particular goal to their questions: most of the question themes focus on progress as illustrated in modernisation theory (technology, science, economic, democratic etc.) but there are also many related to social, political and economic situations that relate to specific concerns/events of the time such as the importance of wealth during economic recessions, economy versus nature and other social issues relating to other cultures i.e. during times of terror threats, war, mass immigration. The data is ranged from a wide range of countries in different stages of 'development' from the United States, Japan, Yemen, Belarus, Chile, Palestine, the Netherlands, Australia etc.

The thesis, following the argument of Tipp, that there is an embedded perspective within modernisation that produces a linear outcome of examining social change and values. Tipp argues that modernisation theory has been largely influenced by tradition of thought, evolutionary theory and twentieth century functionalism (Tipp 1973:200). This influence can be seen in a variety of places within modernisation theory, such as its dichotomous concepts ('social system' and 'social differentiation'), emphasis on adaptation and change, attributing importance in the causes of immediate change and social change as a directional process (Tipp 1973:201). In addition, within the literature of modernisation theory, non-Western states are identified under the perspective of

developmental, and this manner has been dominate in Western thought from pre-Socrates, through the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries of theorists in social change (Tipp 1973:200-201). There are two main features of modernisation theory: the first being has been to identify what modernisation involves, through summarising what it is rather than discussing what it isn't and secondly to prescribe the most important forms of modernisation development being at the national level.

Reviewing the results of the WVS and comparing them to the core values of the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists, evidence points to the data focusing in one particular format. The Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists match much of the changes seen to be happening in Japan and the United States, but according to evidence seen in Chapters 2-3, on their core values they go beyond mainstream expectations or in do not correspond at all (such as the views on success culture and work). The WVS generally fails to branch from modernization theory conventions. The WVS targets questions that adhere to a model inherent in modernization theory. Questions concerning traditionalism are scant and questions linked to some socially progressive ideas (such as women's issues) are often worded in a negative manner. Additionally questions are commonly omitted from further waves that don't continue to correspond with the modernization format. Indeed, the implications declared by Tipp in regards to modernisation theory can be seen within the WVS.

The implication towards linearity of modernization theory could be resolved in time through the supplementation of theoretical concepts like transmodernism that centre its focus alternatively to current modes. Transmodernism places the dialogue with the Other and creates dialogue that would equally benefit the outside and inside to current modernization theory. As Paul Raskin discusses in discussing the new wisdom culture

seen in the Cultural Creative philosophy:

Basically, we need to work our way back, back-casting from a positive vision of the future, and work our way forward from our present trends. And some branches of those two trees of possibility will meet in the middle, to form the core of how our strategy unfolds over time. That will allow humanity to develop a shared, collective macro-strategy with thousands of facets in it, and room for diverse explorations and experimentation on what works. (Raskin 2008:115)

However, the issue of linearity is paradoxically the reason for the existence of transmodernism. Dusselian transmodernism is a critique of modernity, postmodernity and globalization from the position of the suffering Other was and was created against the mainstream model of development. As such, without the pretence set by Western modernisational theory, the impact of transmodernism would fail. Ray's conceptualization through the Cultural Creatives was transformed under conditions of an advanced, industrialised society that bared the hallmarks of Tradition versus Modern with new socially progressive ideas converging on both. In other words, their formation was dependent on the conditions laid out by Western colonization and modernization to begin with. Transmodernism is hence, by-product of this linear model.

These implications means that transmodernism can be global reaching and culturally restrictive. It has global relevance to advanced industrialised nations who produce people that emerge under these conditions, but this may not be functional in current developing nations. This issue regarding transmodernism and modernity's linearity needs further evaluation, however, it clearly demonstrates that whilst transmodernism creates equal dialogue and fused values, it is still dictated by the conditions laid out by modernization and modernization theory.

12. Dialogue and Transmodernism

Transmodernism was formulated by Dussel as a means of repositioning the world from the perspective of the Other and creating a true concept of equal dialogue. The concept of dialogue in transmodernism is by far the most important and significant value brought about by this theoretical conceptualisation. From Chapters 1-3, the thesis has indicated two equally crucial aspects of dialogue in transmodernism: first is an internal dialogue based on values, philosophies and ideas creation on an individual and collective level followed by the second aspect which is a dialogue from an external position, interacting with the world from the position of the Other.

13. Internal Dialogue

The concept of internal dialogue as projected by the thesis relates greatly to the fusing of values and ideas as seen in part in the discussions of the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists in Chapters 2-3 and in the discussions on Transcendentalism and Asia. This internal dialogue is imagined by the Cultural Creatives in that they are Western but demonstrate elements of Asian, African, Native American, Latin-American and other traditional and alternative values; in the Slow Culture Artists who are Japanese, they engage with their own traditional and modern values and with traditional values from Asia and alternative Western values. Both groups, like the formulation of values by Emerson and Thoreau, have taken the appealing values and discarded those they abhor to construct their own values and lifestyles. It is one aspect of the concept of 'dialogue' that is an important factor in transmodernism.

As explored earlier, Emerson cultivated his own values on the foundations of his

Western Christianity, Western culture and his relations to the Orient. This section will then discuss this nature of Emerson by exploring his relationship with Neo-Platonism and Orientalism.

Neo-Platonism was a small but fundamental part of Emerson's growth and cultivated his transition into the study of the Orient in his later life. Neo-Platonism was a movement of New Platonist ideology, led by the likes of Ammonius Saccas, Plotinus, and Proclus. It expanded the concepts of Plato, but they were much Oriental as Occidental, engaging with people from the Orient and as such, many of their ideas being in fact Oriental in nature. In fact, it was Neo-Platonism's own relationship to the Orient that manifested an interest in the Orient within Emerson. According to Carpenter, much of Plotinus' ideas were closer to Oriental in design, such as his 'Emanations', All-Soul principle, his theory of evil merely being the absence of good, matter is negation of spirit, his high regard for pure instinct and his love for mysticism (Carpenter 1968:42).

For Emerson, Neo-Platonism, especially Plotinus, was significant for a number of reasons: firstly, many of Emerson's ideas were either rendered or inspired by Plotinus, which includes the perception of Nature and Man, theories of Art and the Poet and theories of the soul; secondly, and most importantly, Neo-Platonism supplied a vague 'transcendental' background that was superadded to the poetic thought of Coleridge and Wordsworth and Goethe and would form the most distinctive elements of Transcendentalism; thirdly, Neo-Platonism prepared Emerson's mind (and to a lesser extent Thoreau) for Oriental translations and stood at the crossroads of Western and Eastern (Carpenter 1968:99-100).

From Neo-Platonism, Emerson discovered the Orient already in the West and ideas that

would further expand his engagement with new Western ideas. Neo-Platonism demonstrated the dialogue that existed between the East and the West and how these Western thinkers had integrated Eastern ideas into their own thoughts. Emerson himself utilized a process of developing his own values using similar tenants. The Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists delve into this construction of values. Through seeking authenticity and engaging with cultures and traditions from their perspectives, these groups are able to 'discuss' the merits and failures of particular values and ideas and what would best fit with their own lifestyles. Like Emerson who was both Occidental and Oriental, the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists take more than their own nationality. This element of internal dialogue in transmodernism pushes beyond current globalized mechanisms of value changes through the appreciation and direct relationships to alternative and traditional values, by placing them as important process in global societal and cultural value changes. It is this notion of internal dialogue that transforms the individual allows them to seek changes through external dialogue with the world.

14. External Dialogue

Internal dialogue is concerned with the personal value culmination and assimilation done by individual. The thesis indicates that this form of dialogue strengthens the ability of seeing the world from the other side, the side of the suffering Other as described by Dussel. The discourse on dialogue has both been used as a form of criticism to modernisation, Western/Eurocentrism and globalisation and as an educational tool to exchange ideas.

Dussel's evolution of his philosophy cemented itself on re-establishing the position of the 'talker' in the conversation. By shifting the position, Dussel's transmodernism's

ultimate goal is to retell world history and create a new centrality that doesn't wipe away European modernity, but make it part of a collective of modernities in inclusivity and solidarity (Martin 2012:63). It is a means to create the possibility of alternatives in order to facilitate solutions to ongoing social, economic, political, cultural and environmental issues. This is transmodernism and it is also the ideal of 'dialogue'. Below will give an account of the discourse on dialogue and how dialogue is used as a critical, analytical and problem-solving tool by discussing Giorgos Tsimouris evaluation of education and immigration in Greece.

In Tsimouris (2012) discusses the role of critical educators in regards to immigration in Greece and the impact of nationalism. Tsimouris discusses the environment of education in Greece and its future which is being fought for by two different sides: there is the conservative right that want a system goes 'back to basics' of Greek culture and language and critical educators that want an education system that is intercultural and by passes parochial ethnocentrism (Tsuimouris 2012:22). The current economic/political crisis has fuelled great unemployment and social instability that has resulted in a parochial ethnocentrism and an educational model based on bureaucratic, ethnocentric and centralised system. Tsuimouris' goal was to demonstrate that for critical educators, they need to shape through dialogue an intercultural education system that goes beyond nationalism and methodological nationalism in order to create a co-existent reality with the 'other'.

Globalisation has allowed for the movement of cultures, currency, business, information and goods which has allowed for nearly interconnected world. National borders have become more porous but whilst the flow for is easy for corporate markets, it is still in accordance to 'national interests'. These national interests are threatened by the flow of

people, in particular from refugees and immigrants. A 'power of geometry' exists which is backed up a new growth of patriotism based on homogenous, classless citizenship, in the case of Greece prompted by the Greek 'socialist' administration, conservative political forces and the media (Tsuimouris 2012:24). This 'power of geometry' effects the 'speed of flow' for different social groups and political tension from this flow of corporate markets and international institutions like the IMF and the World Bank, have shown to be stronger in the peripheries of the West and of the peripheries in the West. Hence, as barriers of distance (national borders) become more transparent, the colonisers and the colonised encounter each other on more occasions. Tsumouris reminds the readers that the problems of immigration and the 'power of geometry' that currently exists were formulated by the West. When colonisation failed to exist after World War 2, the colonisers left zones in political, economic and social instability. He continues by stating that Western domination has never ended but rather undertook more subtle forms of political intervention and economic exploitation phrased as neo-colonialism (Tsumouris 2012:26). Greece's geographical position, position with Europe and as a channel to Europe, has made Greece's stance on immigrants as utilitarian (of both sides of the fence) and as such as left immigrants marginalised.

Tsumouris advises that it is the task of critical educators to create a co-existence with the 'other' in a Greek climate that focused on nationalism, 'we-ness' and bio-ethnicity and direct lineage in one's genealogy (Tsumouris 2012:27). The role of the critical educator is to demonstrate the interconnection between neo-capitalism and immigration by discussing the roots of why immigration is occurring in the first place. This need to operate at all levels of the immigration process in order to fully articulate how neo-capitalism and monetary flow has aggressively expanded the flow of immigration and refugees. The root causes to immigration, has not been investigated and debated by

international academics.

Critical educators need to become transformative educators. They need to work towards restructuring curriculum to be inclusive of the marginalised and to deconstruct the 'naturalness' of nation-state. To become a transformative teacher, a teacher would need to reinvent nationality and national tradition as being the result of transformational cultural and linguistic contact in an era of diffused borders, mingled cultures and blurred identities (Tsumouris 2012:31). In a Greek educational system dictated by government and neo-liberal ideology, assimilation (which inherently creates racism) is the law, and to fight this, Tsumouris believes that teachers must become 'dangerous entities' that are capable of combating the oppressive nature of the Greek system (Tsumouris 2012:32). The role of the critical educator needs to combat racism and apply antiracist policies, educate externally and internally within the community (students and their parents), to demonstrate the view that cultural diversity can be possible and fight against the collective action against solidarity. Critical educators through dialogue and communication must erode their image as submissive public servants and take on the image. Tsumouris believes that 'their endeavour will expose the barbarity of the neo-liberal, transnational and corporative forces and the submissive domestic governments as responsible for escalating human suffering and making life so precarious and virtually non-viable in the peripheries *of* and *in* the West, on the borders of Europe and the multiple margins in the centre of the western metropolis' (Tsumouris 2012:33).

The argument set by Tsumouris is a form of external dialogue that is reminiscent of the critical engagements of the transmodernists as described in chapter 1. This external dialogue is an important process to both transmodernism and others who display critical engagement with modernity. External dialogue places the conversation in the frame of

the Other and its purposes is the criticism the societal conventions that needlessly marginalise and make exclusive individuals and groups whilst offering forms of solutions to problems that may seem impossible to solve.

Dialogue is a seminal cog of transmodernism and critics of modernity. For transmodernists, dialogue allows the individual to exceed their own cultural boundaries and is part of their transformative character. Internal dialogue allows them to incorporate, interact and discuss values on equal grounds. Transmodernists can take the most favoured portions of other values and furnish their own and discuss values without excluding or marginalising values from different cultures and people. External dialogue is part of their connection to people, communities and the world through critical engagement. This engagement operates from the side of the marginalised, suffering Other (which can be referred to social groups, traditions, the environment, women etc.), and from this standpoint that look to alternative solutions to problems generated by modernity, globalisation and capitalism. This dual dialogue is the most essential part of transmodernists groups.

The Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists utilise both forms of dialogue to self-actualise their own identities and to engage with the world as part of the world. They have eclectic value system that interconnects with modern and traditional values across the globe. These values are part of their search for who they are and work in correspondence to their spiritual connection to nature, people and the world as part of the system. Externally they look for positive changes through critical engagement with governments, business and communities through activism and green business initiatives. They create new values from fusing modern and traditional values through dialogue that starts with the suffering Other and the alternatives to mainstream modernity. Their

connections to Asia and their splintering from linearity of modernity are all possible due to this sense of dialogue and communication.

15. Conclusion

In this chapter the thesis has discussed three aspects that emerged from the analysis of the Cultural Creatives and the Slow Culture Artists. These three dimensions were related to the significance of Asia in transmodernism, the linearity in the discourse of modernity and the fundamental importance of the concept of dialogue.

The Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists are embedded in the discourse of humankind from a position that grants them the ability to navigate from outside modernity's boundaries. From transcendentalism, Asian philosophy has played a significant part in the development of alternative social values. Asia represented a mystical and spiritual unknown that seemed to parallel the values of the West. Emerson, Alcott and Thoreau's philosophies and their approach to Asian values, ideas and philosophies would greatly influence the value formation within Ray's transmodernism, the Cultural Creatives and even the Slow Culture Artists.

The second aspect was about the linearity in the discourse of modernity. This issue was examined by analysing the World Value Surveys in accordance to the core values of the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists and followed with Tipps' criticism of modernization theory. The social values emerging in the United States and in Japan were reflective of the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists in many regards. However, in some cases the values lived by the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists far extended the values of the mainstream (such as women's issues and environmental issues), possibly due to political/economic issues occurring. Within the

WVS though, many questions particularly partaking to spirituality and traditions were fairly non-existent. The layout of questions were clearly reminiscent of standards of social change in modernisation theory. The discourse on modernisation follows a Western-oriented design and fails to address alternative modernities that could exist. Transmodernism is one such concept that does exist as an alternative modernity, and whilst a potentially cure for the malaise of linearity in modernization theory, transmodernism is only possible due to the conditions set by modernisation.

The last section investigated the concept of dialogue as both internal and external. The internal aspect reviewed Emerson's relationship with Neo-Platonism and its relation to the Orient. Emerson's treatment of values and his own personal growth reflect the manner in which transmodernist groups interact with their own cultural values and beyond its boundaries to create new value pathways. The external dialogue relates to Dussel's critique of modernity from the Other's perspective and the power this form of dialogue has Tsumouris' article on critical educators was used as an example on this method of dialogue. Dialogue has the ability to transform social situations by interconnecting the suffering Other and the mainstream. It is a core component of alternative methodologies of social value changes and it is at the heart of transmodernism and transmodernists groups.

Conclusion

Modernisation has been a process that is globally reaching and influencing. Yet, this concept has demonstrated many cracks, and suggesting the need for alternatives. The task of this thesis was to examine one such alternative, transmodernism. Transmodernism is a concept that positions the voice of the world from the 'suffering Other' and was originally formulated from the intellectual development of Dussel. Many contemporaries have engaged the concept of current crucial social issues, but it was Ray who first utilised it on an emerging social group in the United States.

The Cultural Creatives, the book that formulated two decades of work by Ray and Anderson, elevated an unnoticed social group into the American forefront and constructed a specific value system that showed who the Cultural Creatives are and why they are so important to America's future. Many of these ideas were greatly reflected in the Japanese individuals illustrated in Couturier's *A Different Kind of Luxury*, and the thesis set out to demonstrate a link. As such, the thesis asked and wanted to solve two fundamental questions: can transmodernism (as conceived by Ray) be applicable outside of the West and if this is indeed the case, what is its significance?

Dussel's transmodernism was the cultivation of many years of critically engaging with modernisation, post-modernisation and globalization and succeeded his philosophy of liberation. Transmodernism was based in values of criticisms of modernity, post-modernity, colonisation and globalisation, analogical reasoning from outside the system of modernisation, an emphatic relationship with traditions, indigenous cultures and the suffering Other and the negation of totalisation. Like the theoretical concept itself, transmodernism developed from an intellectual dialogue from Dussel with the historical,

cultural and societal events that affected his life. Unlike modernization and postmodernisation though, transmodernism looked further, to shift speaker and the listener, creating a fundamentally new way to approach the future.

Contemporary advocates of transmodernism such as Cole, Dallamy, Smith, Sardar, Gilroy and Ray have expanded the concept into new grounds; from discussions about Marxism and transmodernism, the identity of black culture, the relationship of minority communities and Islam in the West and the emergence of new social groups, transmodernism is creating new grounds of dialogue and different ways to consider important social and cultural issues.

Ray's concept of transmodernism embarked on highlighting that a social movement that sung the tenants of transmodernism was emerging, and would begin to change the face of modern America. The Cultural Creatives formed from amidst the opposing views of two primary social groups in the United States: the Moderns and the Traditionalists. The catalyst for the eventual emergence came from the dramatic social changes brought on by the new social movements of the 1950s-60s. The social movements primarily discussed, the Black Freedom Movement, the Women's Movement, the Environmental Movement and the Consciousness Movement, who greatly shaped the manner in which the Cultural Creatives shaped their values, created their values and how they would live.

The Cultural Creatives fused traditional and modern values from within and outside their own cultural boundaries. Their core values were shown as ecology, the importance of women's issues, altruism and importance of family and close friends, self-actualisation, spiritualism and a rejection of materialism, success culture and narrow-minded views and information. The thesis hypothesized that if these core values

represented the ‘transmodernist framework’, could this demonstrate transmodernism’s applicability elsewhere? The Cultural Creatives have begun to emerge within the advanced, industrialised nations of United States and Europe, suggestion this emergence seemed to be capable in similarly developed places. Hence, could the emergence of an ‘Asian Cultural Creative’ movement be seen in Japan, a society that has dualistic Western and Asian values and is highly industrialised? If so, what would the significance of this finding be?

The Slow Culture Artists (all 11 as described in Couturier's book) were identified as people who reflected the core values seen in the Cultural Creatives. The Slow Culture Artists' values as a connection to nature on a physical and spiritual level, simple and self-sufficient living, criticism of modernisation and materialism, the importance of foreign ideas and traditions, spiritualism of 'oneness with all', traditional practice and art as a focal element.

The Slow Culture Artists were shown to fit within this ‘transmodernist framework’ due to a few important points. 1) The Slow Movement in Japan through Tsuji and the Sloth Club identify themselves as inspired by the Cultural Creatives. This identification is significant, and the Sloth Club’s values and Tsuji’s life abroad parallel many of the values championed by the Slow Culture Artists. 2) Whilst other concepts such as Ogata's Life-Philosophy can answer some of the value development of the Slow Culture Artists, the time these 11 spent abroad cannot be ignored. Transmodernism’s identification with traditional and alternative cultures from their perspective better shapes at theoretically understanding the values undertaken by the Slow Culture Artists. 3) The core values of both the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists parallel greatly, even with their apparent differences.

The Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists have values that correlate, values that identify with board cultural backgrounds and are critical of mainstream -both traditional and modern aspects- society; which subsequently means they can both be explained via Ray's transmodernism. Nevertheless, their relationships to economic means is the greatest and most prevalent difference between the two transmodernist groups. The Cultural Creatives are responsible for the booming green business, and industries such as many alternative medicine businesses, the boom of yoga, the experience industry and spirituality industry (the LOHAS industry being their major output). The Culture Creatives stand at the forefront of their respective business, community and activism projects, willing to engage them through economic and altruistic means. The Slow Culture Artists, on the other hand, do not engage in materialism and avoid money and business as much as possible. They all experienced life evaluating moments living abroad and have come back to Japan to live slow lives connected to the earth. They engage in activism and community issues but unlike the Cultural Creatives the Slow Culture Artists do not wish to position themselves as leaders in these projects/community events. These differences suggests that transmodern groups can share key values (nature, critical of modern values and materialism and engagement with traditional values, fusion of modern and traditional values, spirituality and a connection to the world) the spectrum of 'being transmodernism' can be quite wide. The comparison between the two suggests that the applicability of transmodernism is reliant on advanced stages of industrialization and ironically, the space to critically respond against this advanced industrialised state. This applicability is further enhanced through the cultivation and fusion of values outside and inside one's cultural boundary and the ability to communicate from on the Other's perspective. In the United States, Europe and Japan, these people who can be described as transmodernist envelope core values

seen in the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists. As such, transmodernism is indeed universally assessable, if the environment is correct. The thesis then explored the significance of this applicability.

Three key inferences were highlighted from the thesis: going back to Asia as a means for values and ideas, linearity in the discourse of modernisation and the significance of 'dialogue'.

Asia has been a constant Other for the developing West and has been a means to inspire as well as resent. The Transcendentalists, like Emerson and Thoreau, it was the former, and Oriental philosophies, values, ideas and spiritualities intertwined with the cultural foundations of both men in their exploration and proposals for socially and spiritually progressive ideas. Asia is still significant for the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists, who engage these traditional cultures, spiritualisms and communities with gusto, and reimagine them in their own values and communities. In an age headed towards an Asian century, the importance on these alternative values to mainstream Western modernity are more important than ever. Transmodernism's positive drive and reassessment of 'voice' could help to spark a greater voice for these communities in the advanced industrialised world and a new direction that truly equalizes the importance of Asia (and even Africa and Latin America) in the global direction of the modern world.

The second point discussed in this part of the thesis was the failures of the discourse of modernity in its linearity. Using Tipp's argument and correlated data from the WVS, it was shown that modernisation theory in regards to social changes fails to see the influence traditional and alternative modernities have on mainstream modernity. From the data exported from the WVS, it can be demonstrated that particular modes of social

development still have prevalence and even with additional questions implement around the time of significant historical events (9/11, Japanese bubble economy bursting), there is still an expected development. Transmodernism is one such alternative modernity that branches 'back and forth' between tradition and modern in order to create new values and explain processes of development. However, whilst transmodernism pushes to supersede the linearity seeded in modernity, it is also paradoxically reliant on this linear model. Without the conditions of an advanced, industrial society, which comes from adhering to modern economic and societal approaches, the seeds of transmodernism cannot grow.

The third theme centred on the aspect of dialogue within transmodernism. The thesis declared two types of dialogue seen within transmodernism: an internal aspect of dialogue that focused on value assimilation, communication and fusion that happens within the personal development of transmodernists and 2) an external dialogue that embraces the concepts seen in Dussel's transmodernism. This dualism is the fundamental basis of transmodernism and can be reflected in the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists.

This thesis hypothesized that transmodernism was universally applicable and that testing this was significant. What the thesis discovered through articulating the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists was that Ray's transmodernism a theory of the advanced, industrialised kind. The theory has significance in the West and in Japan, and will continue to see significance in the changing landscape of developing countries. Indeed, if as the Cultural Creatives.org claims, that the current climate crisis has been the cause for 10% of the current American population to be 'in transition' to the Cultural Creatives philosophy (Cultural Creatives 2014:1) and their emergent could

continue to rapidly grow. Transmodernist groups adhere to particular core values, but can extend over wide demographics and many different ways of living these values. The Slow Culture Artists and the Cultural Creatives are both the same transmodernists but are also different. The thesis also showed that alternate/traditional Asian can still greatly influence and change the perspectives on ways to live in Japan. In light of the difficult economic conditions and the impact of the Fukushima incident, the lives of the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists are of great value to Japan going forward. Transmodernism is important because it is a strong philosophy of criticism of modernity that can be seen on a practical scale. Its' many forms of conceptualisation are based on the side of many 'Others' (women, homosexuals, immigrants, the environment, Latin-America, Africa, Asia to name a few). Transmodernism critically engages and praises values, philosophies, cultures and people in equal dialogue and that is attempting to throw out the discourse of social development as linear. Asia is seen as a dynamic, essential and fundamental part of Western and global development of social change and pushes for more engaged dialogue between East and West, North and South. Dialogue is the essence of transmodernism and through groups like the Cultural Creatives and Slow Culture Artists, a more humane, interconnected reality is being conceptualised.

Bibliography

Amazon (2013) *Andy Couturier*, <http://www.amazon.com/Andy-Couturier/e/B001K8M8LK>, October 2013.

Anderson S. R and Hopkins P (1992) *The feminine face of god: the unfolding of the sacred in women*, Bantam Books, New York

Asahi Shimbun (2010) *Agreement reached to settle Minamata suit*, Asahi Shimbun, 31 March 2010, retrieved 1 April 2010.

Barnes, N (1996) *Black Atlantic Black America*, Research in African Literatures, 27(4): 106-107.

Barriaux, M (2012) *China says Europe debt crisis is now 'critical'*, AFP, March 2012, <http://www.google.com/hostednews/afp/article/ALeqM5gCvpRHHmvaXUein143OKOnDzduk?docId=CNG.21be1ed1564c673ff737064777591033.871>.

Bauman, Z (2000) *Liquid Modernity*, Polity Press.

Bedell, M (1980) *The Alcotts: Biography of a Family*. New York: Clarkson N. Potter.

Bhanot, A (2002) *Creative visualisation- a new culture*, Retrieved November 2011, www.lifepositive.com/Mind/culture/creatives.asp.

Blanchard, P (1987) *Margaret Fuller: From Transcendentalism to Revolution*. Reading, Massachusetts: Addison-Wesley Publishing Company.

Brazier, J E and Mannur, A (2006) *Theorizing Diaspora*, Blackwell Publishing, Malden, MA.

Brooks, V W (1952) *The Flowering of New England*. New York: E. P. Dutton and Company, Inc.

Brugger, B, Hannan, K (1983) *Modernization and revolution*. Routledge.

Campbell, D (2002) *Science and spirituality- the Cultural Creatives*, Retrieved November 2011, www.lifepositive.com/Mind/culture/culturalcreatives.asp.

Carpenter, F I (1968) *Emerson and Asia*, New York, Haskell House Publishers.

Castells, M (1997) *The Power of Identity*, Oxford, Blackwell Publishing.

Chivallon, C (2002) *Beyond Gilroy Black Atlantic: The Experience of the African Diaspora*. *Diaspora: A Journal of Transnational Studies*, 11(3): 359-382.

- Christy, A (1963) *The orient in American transcendentalism*. New York, Octagon Books Inc.
- Clammer, J (1997) *Contemporary Urban Japan: A Sociology of Consumption*, Blackwell Publishers, Oxford.
- Collinson, S, France-Presse, A (2013) *Obama warns cuts to hit US, global economy*, The Inquirer, Retrieved April 2013 <http://newsinfo.inquirer.net/366397/obama-warns-cuts-to-hit-us-global-economy>.
- Couturier, A (2010) *A different kind of luxury*, Stone Bridge Publishing, Berkeley, California, USA.
- Crispell, D, (1997) *Bias vs. fact*, American Demographics, Jun97, Vol. 19, Issue 6.
- Cultural Creatives (2014), *Cultural Creatives*, www.culturalcreatives.org/cultural-creatives/.
- Dallamayr, F (2004) *The underside of modernity: Adorno, Heidegger and Dussel*, Constellations, 11(1): 102-120.
- De Souza, M, Francis, L.J., O'Higgins-Norman, J., and Scott, D (2009) 'General Introduction', in De Souza et al (eds.) *International Handbook of Education for Spirituality, Care and Wellbeing*, Volume 1, Springer, p.1.
- Ducasse, A (2004) *The slow revolutionary*, Times Europe, Vol 164:14.
- Dunkelberg, B (2012) *Small matters: Greece's debt crisis posing risks for U.S.*, Inquirer, March 2012, <http://www.philly.com/philly/business/139196094.html>.
- Dussel, E [1977] (1980) *Philosophy of Liberation*, trans by Martinez, A and Morkovsky, C, New York, Orbis.
- Dussel, E [1992] (1995) *The invention of the America; eclipse of the 'Other', and the myth of modernity*, trans by Barber, M.D, New York, Continuum.
- Dussel, E (2006) *World-system and 'trans'-modernity*, in Dube, S and Banerjee-Dube, S, *Unbecoming modern: colonialism, modernity, colonial modernities*, Social Science Press, New Dehli: 165-189.
- Dussel E [2007] (2011) *Politics of Liberation: a critical world history*, trans by Cooper, T, London, SCM Press.
- Ferree, M M & Mueller, C M (2004) *Feminism and the Women's Movement: A Global Perspective* in Snow, D. A., S. A. Soule, et al., Eds. (2004), *The Blackwell companion to social movements*. United Kingdom, Blackwell Publishing.
- Fling, S (1998) *Psychological Aspects of The Way of Tea*. *Research Scholarship*, Japanese Studies Association Journal, Vol 2:29-36.
- Francis, Richard (2010) *A Journey into the Transcendentalists' New England*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Fuller, M & Reynolds (1998) *Women in the nineteenth century: an authoritative text, backgrounds, criticism*, Norton Critical Edition, United States.

Funky Education (2010) *Tsuji Shinnichi san*,
<http://funkyeducation.cocolog-nifty.com/blog/2010/08/post-32e0.html>.

Gamble, S, ed (2001) *The Routledge companion to feminism and postfeminism*, p. 25.

Gelfer, J (2010) *LOHAS and the indigo dollar*, New Proposals: Journal of Marxism and Interdisciplinary Inquiry, Vol 4, No 1

Gilroy, P (1993) *The Black Atlantic: modernity and double consciousness*, United States of America, Harvard University Press.

Goizueta, R S (2000) *Locating the Absolutely Absolute Other: toward a Transmodern Christianity*:81-193, in eds Alcoff, L M, Mendieta, E, (2000), *Thinking from the underside of history: Enrique Dussel's philosophy of liberation*, Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, New York.

Grof, S (2004) *A brief history of transpersonal psychology*, StanislavGrof.com:11.

Howe, D W (2009) *What Hath God Wrought: The Transformation of America, 1815–1848*. p. 623.

Hunter Davidson, J (1991) *Culture wars: the struggle to define America*, Basic Books, New York.

Hutchinson, R (2010), *Encyclopedia of urban studies*, SAGE publications

Indexmundi (2012) *Japanese Demographic*,
http://www.indexmundi.com/japan/demographics_profile.html.

Inglehart, R (1990) *Culture shift: in advanced industrialised society*, New Jersey, Princeton University Press.

Inglehart, R (1997) *Modernisation and postmodernisation: cultural, economic, and political change in 43 societies*, New Jersey, Princeton University Press.

Inglehart, R, Ed (2003) *Human values and social change: findings from the value surveys*, International Studies in Sociology and Social Anthropology, Leiden, Brill.

Inglehart, R (2006) *National-level value scores on traditional/secular-rational values and survival/self-expression values for all available surveys*, World Value Survey.

Inglehart, R, Basanez, M, Moreno, A, (1998) *Human values and beliefs: a cross-cultural sourcebook*, Michigan, The University of Michigan Press.

Inglehart, R and Norris, P (2003) *Rising tide: gender equality and cultural change around the world*. Cambridge, Cambridge University Press.

Inman, J (2011) *China confirmed as World's Second Largest Economy*. The Guardian (London), January 21st 2011 Retrieved 21 January 2011.

IWTP (2012) Retrieved November 2012, <http://iwtp.jp/>.

Jones, K (2012) *US budget: debt will be \$1 trillion higher in a decade*, The News Tribe, <http://www.thenewstribes.com/2012/02/13/us-budget-debt-will-be-1-trillion-higher-in-a-decade/>.

Kalman, B, (2008), *Japan: The Culture*, Crabtree Publishing, Canada.

Khan, Joel S (2001) *Modernity and exclusion*, SAGE Online.

Kagata, K (2013) *Philosophy of tea*, Rishouen, <http://www.rishouentea.com/en/philosophy-of-tea/>.

Kornman, R (1996) *The Kosmos According to Ken Wilber*, Shambhala Sun.

Kyodo News (2012) Toyama concludes cadmium clean up, Japan Times, 18 March 2012, p. 2.

Kyodo News (2013) *Economy off 0.4% as recession continues*, Japan Times, <http://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2013/02/15/business/economy-off-0-4-as-recession-continues/#.US7PRaJDnE8>.

Kyodo News (2013) *Key events in Fukushima crisis*, Japan Times, 12/03/2013 <http://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2013/03/12/national/key-events-in-fukushima-crisis/#.UWtgiqJTCcs>.

Kyodo News (2013) *Minamata disease criteria called outrage*, Japan Times, 5/06/2013, <http://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2013/06/05/national/minamata-recognition-criteria-called-outrage/#.Um8gl3AbAQk>.

Lange, L (2000) *Burnt Offerings to Rationality: a Feminist Reading of the Construction of Indigenous Peoples in Dussel's Theory of Modernity: p.135-148* in Alcoff M A, Mendieta, E, (2000), *Thinking from the underside of history: Enrique Dussel's philosophy of liberation*, Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, New York.

Leiserowitz, A. A Kates R. W et al (2006) *Sustainability values, attitudes and behaviours: a review of multinational and global trends*, University of Adelaide: 413-444.

Lenin, V I (1932) (2009) *State and revolution*, Penguin books, United Kingdom.

LILIPOH (2009) *New farm-based community forming in Floyd, Virginia*, LILIPOH Autumn 2009: 71. Academic OneFile. Web. 17 Apr. 2013.

Lindenberg, C (1992) *Rudolph Steiner*, Rowohlt.

LOHASa (2008, 2010, 2012) *Mission*, LOHAS (Lifestyles of Health and Sustainability), Retrieved July 31st, 2011, <http://www.lohas.com/mission.htm>.

LOHASb (2008, 2010, 2012), *LOHAS takes Japan*, LOHAS (Lifestyles of Health and Sustainability), Retrieved May 2012, www.lohas.com/lohas_japan.

LOHAS-Asia (2013) *Philosophy*, LOHAS-Asia.org, <http://www.lohas-asia.org/index.php/philosophy>.

Luyckx, M (1999) *The transmodern hypothesis: towards a dialogue of cultures*, *Futures* 31: 971-982.

Marsh, James L (2000) *The Material Principle and the Formal Principle in Dussel's Ethics*:51-68, in eds Alcoff, L M, Mendieta, E, (2000), *Thinking from the underside of history: Enrique Dussel's philosophy of liberation*, Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, New York.

Martin, H. P, Schumann, H, (1997), *The global trap: globalisation and the assault on prosperity and democracy*, trans by Camiller, P, London, Zed

Martin Alcoff, L (2012) *Enrique Dussel's transmodernism*, *Journal of Transmodernity*, pp 60-68, <http://escholarship.org/uc/item/58k9k17t>.

Masao, M and Harrotunian, H D (1989) *Postmodernism and Japan*, London, Duke University Press.

Matteson, J (2007) *Eden's Outcasts: The Story of Louisa May Alcott and Her Father*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company.

McAdam, D and Snow, D A Eds (1997) *Social movements: readings on their emergence, mobilisation and dynamics*, Los Angeles, Roxbury Publishing Company.

McKillop, C (2012) *Seeds of hop in Qld rice crop*, ABC Rural, 25th of May 2012.

McNeil, D (2012) *Fukushima lays bare Japanese media's ties to top*, Japan Times, <http://www.japantimes.co.jp/life/2012/01/08/general/fukushima-lays-bare-japanese-medias-ties-to-top/#.UXZ6rqJTCcs>.

Mendieta, E (2000) *Beyond Universal History: Dussel's Critique of Globalisation*, in *Underside* pg 117- 134 in Alcoff M A, Mendieta, E, 2000, *Thinking from the underside of history: Enrique Dussel's philosophy of liberation*, Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, New York.

Micklethwait, J and Wooldrige, A (2009) *God is back: how the global rise of faith is changing the world*, Allen Lane Publishing, England.

Middendorf, B (1999) *Cultural Creatives: Cultural Creatives making a difference for the future*, Conscious Choice, January Edition.

Mignolo, W D (2000) *Dussel's Philosophy of Liberation: Ethics and the Geopolitics of Knowledge*, in Alcoff M A, Mendieta, E, 2000, *Thinking from the underside of history: Enrique Dussel's philosophy of liberation*, Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, New York.

- Neales, S (2012) *Japan farmer harvests hope in our soil*, *The Australian*, May 23rd 2012.
- Oiwa, K (2012) *Keibo Oiwa*, <http://keibooiwa.sblo.jp/>.
- Opening, The (2013) *The Instructor*, <http://theopening.org/the-instructor.html>, retrieved October 2013.
- Paish, M (2012) *New Queensland rice growing industry being developed by Japanese tsunami farmers*, *AFN Online*, May 24th 2012.
- Parker, M, Fournier, V, Reedy, P (2007) *The Dictionary of Alternatives: Utopianism and Organization*, Zed Books, UK.
- Powers, Janet M (2012) *Montgomery Bus Boycott*, *Encyclopedia of Activism and Social Justice*. Ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE, 2007. 971-72. *SAGE Reference Online*.
<http://sage-reference.com.proxy.library.adelaide.edu.au/view/activism/n574.xml?rskey=13Ldoz&result=1&q=montgomery%20bus%20boycott>.
- PR Newswire (2005) *New global chamber hits the web: Cultural Creative's global chamber of commerce (tm)*, PR Newswire, September 1st, *Academic OneFile*. Web. 16 Apr. 2013.
- Raskin, P (2008) *The emerging wisdom culture: a summary of the early chapters in the emerging planetary wisdom*, <http://culturalcreatives.org/emerging-wisdom-culture/>,
- Ray, P H (1968) *Human ecology, technology and the need for social planning*, *American Behavioural Scientist* 11(16): 16-19.
- Ray, P H (1996a) *The rise of integral culture*
http://www.humankindadvancing.org/9/paul_ray__the_rise_of_the_integr.htm.
- Ray, P H (1996b) *Excerpts from the integral culture survey: a study of the emergence of transformational values in America*, The Fetzer Institute and The Institute of Noetic Sciences.
- Ray, P H (1997a) *Emerging Culture*, American Demographics Inc, 19(2).
- Ray, P H (1997b) *Modernists and heartlanders*, American Demographics Inc, 19(2):33.
- Ray, P H (1997c) *Using values to study customers*, American Demographics Inc, 19(2):34.
- Ray, P H and Anderson, S R (2000) *The cultural creatives: how 50 Million people are changing the world*, New York, Three Rivers Press.
- Ray, P H and Anderson, S R (2001). *Cultural Creatives*, Retrieved December, 2011, <http://www.culturalcreatives.org/>.

Ray, P H (2002) *The new political compass: the new progressives are in-front, deep green, against big business and globalization, and beyond Left vs. Right*, Noetic Sciences.

Rentel, R and Zellnik J (2007) *Karma queens, geek gods and innerpreneurs: Meet the 9 consumers types shaping today's marketplace*, New York, McGraw-Hill.

Robinson, D M (1999) *Emerson, Thoreau, Fuller, and Transcendentalism*, American Literary Scholarship, 3-32.

Rootes, C (2004) *Environmental Movement*, in Snow, D. A., S. A. Soule, et al., Eds. (2004), *The Blackwell companion to social movements*. United Kingdom, Blackwell Publishing, 608-635.

Ruggiero, V and Montagna N Eds (2008) *Social movements: a reader*, London, Routledge.

Sardar, Z (1997) *Postmodernism and the Other: new imperialism of Western culture* London, Pluto Press.

Sardar, Z (2006) *Beyond difference: cultural relations in a new century*, Masood E and Sardar, Z (2006) in *How do you know: reading Ziauddin Sardar on Islam, science and cultural relations*, London, Pluto Press.

Sardar, Z (2010) *Opening the gates: an east-west transmodern discourse?*, in Bagaeen, S and Uduku, O, (2010), *Gated communities: social sustainability in contemporary and historical gated developments*, London, Earthscan: 9-14.

Slater, A (1978) *In Search of Margaret Fuller*. New York: Delacorte Press.

Sloth Club (2012a) *Namakemono kurabu ni tsuite*, sloth.gr.jp, http://www.sloth.gr.jp/namakemono_about/.

Sloth Club (2012b) *What is the sloth club?*, sloth.gr.jp, <http://www.sloth.gr.jp/E-chapter/english1.htm>.

Sloth Club (2012c) *Keibo Oiwa*, sloth.gr.jp <http://www.sloth.gr.jp/tsuji/koiwa.html>.

Sloth Club, (2012d), *Tsuji Shinnichi*, sloth.gr.jp, <http://www.sloth.gr.jp/tsuji/profile.html>.

Slow Japan (2009) *The sloth club*, slowjapan.wordpress.com, <http://slowjapan.wordpress.com/2009/08/04/slothclub/>.

Slow Japan (2012a) *About*, slowjapan.wordpress.com <http://slowjapan.wordpress.com/about/>.

Slow Japan (2012b) *Slow Japan homepage*, slowjapan.wordpress.com.

Slow Japan (2012c) *Yukkuri-mura*, slowjapan.wordpress.com, <http://slowjapan.wordpress.com/2009/08/04/yukkuri-mura/>.

Smelser, N J, and Anderson, J C (1999) *Introduction: the ideological discourse of cultural discontent*, in Smelser, N J, and Anderson, J C edited by (1999) *Diversity and its discontent: cultural conflict and common ground in contemporary American society*, Princeton Press, UK.

Smith, A (2013) *Fukushima evacuation has killed more than earthquake and tsunami, survey says*, World News-NBC News, 10th September 2013, http://worldnews.nbcnews.com/_news/2013/09/10/20420833-fukushima-evacuation-has-killed-more-than-earthquake-and-tsunami-survey-says.

Smith, C (1991) *The emergence of liberation theology: radical religion and social movement theory*, University of Chicago Press, Chicago.

Smith, D G (2003) *On enframing the public sphere: the futility of empire and the future of knowledge after 'America'*, Policy Futures in Education, 1(3):488-503.

Smith, D G (2004) *A reply to Mike Cole*, Policy Futures in Education, 2(3 and 4): 644-645.

Sotokoto (2010) *Volunteer Life 100!* Sotokoto. Japan. 3, 30-85

Stevenson, T (2004) *Time for new social technologies?*, Futures, Vol 36, Issue 1, pg109-113

Suzuki D & Oiwa, K (1996) *The Japan we never knew: a journey of discovery*, Stoddart Publishing, Canada.

Takanashi, Y (2009) *Emerson and Zhu Xi: the role of the 'scholar' in pursuing 'peace'*, *The Japanese Journal of American Studies*, 20.

Tetoteto (2012), *Tetoteto haru*, Tetoteto seasonal brochure.

Tetoteto (2013a) *Tetoteto project*, Tetoteto website, <http://sokuteimiyagi.blog.fc2.com/blog-category-12.html>.

Tetoteto (2013b) *Sokutei kekka [measurement results]*, Tetoteto website, <http://sokuteimiyagi.blog.fc2.com/blog-entry-30.html>.

Tipps, D (1973) *Modernisation theory and the comparative study of social science: a critical perspective*, University of California, Berkeley pp 199-226.

Tong, R (2009) *Feminist Thought: A More Comprehensive Introduction* (Third ed.). Boulder, Westview Press. pp. 284–285, 289.

Truett, A W (1983, 2004) *The Upstart Spring: Esalen and the American Awakening*, Addison Wesley Publishing Company.

Tsimouris, G (2012) *The task of critical educators in an era of globalised immigration: a view from the European periphery*, Panteion University, Athens, Greece.

Tsuji, S (2001) *Slow is beautiful*, Heibonsha, Tokyo

Tsuji, S (2012) *Philosophy*, slowjapan.wordpress.com,
<http://slowjapan.wordpress.com/philosophy/>.

United States Census Bureau (2013), *2012 National population projections: table summary*,
<http://www.census.gov/population/projections/data/national/2012/summarytables.html>
van Gerder, S R, (1999), *Self and the Cultural Creatives*, *Futures* 31:822-826.

Van Marrewijk, M (2010) *Strategic Orientations: Multiple Ways for Implementing Sustainable Performance*, *Technology and Investment*, Vol 1, 85-96.

View, J L (2012) *Civil Rights Movement*, *Encyclopedia of Activism and Social Justice*. Ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE, 2007. 343-48. *SAGE Reference Online*.
<http://sage-ereference.com.proxy.library.adelaide.edu.au/view/activism/n184.xml>.

Von Mehren, J (1997) *Minerva and the Muse: A Life of Margaret Fuller*.
Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press.

Wasserman, S (1998) *The rooftops of Japan*, *World & I* vol 13 issue 2:142.

Word Value Surveys (2014) *Findings and Insights*,
<http://www.worldvaluessurvey.org/WVSContents.jsp>.

Wueller, C F (2011), *Beyond economic and value wars: Mythic images of future cities*,
Futures vol 43:662-672.

YeonWoo, S (2008) *From nature to morality in Emerson and Yi Hwang's literature*,
The Review of Korean Studies 11(2): 75-95.

Yoda, Y (1996) *The foundations of Japan's modernisation: a comparison with China's path towards modernisation* translated by Radtke, K. W, Brill Publishers, The Netherlands.

Yoneyama, S (2012) *Life-world: beyond Fukushima and Minamata*, *Japan Focus*,
<http://www.japanfocus.org/-Shoko-YONEYAMA/3845>.

Yukkuri-mura (2013) *About us*, http://www.yukkurimura.com/?page_id=85.