



THE STRUCTURE OF SEQUENTIAL EFFECTS

Dinis Sequeira Do Couto Gökaydin

A THESIS SUBMITTED FOR THE DEGREE OF DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY AT

THE UNIVERSITY OF ADELAIDE IN 2015

SCHOOL OF PSYCHOLOGY



Contents

Abstract	ix
Declaration by author	xi
Acknowledgements	xii
List of Figures	xiv
List of Tables	xxi
1 Literature review	4
1.1 Early history - 1920 to 1960	7
1.2 Sequential effects in reaction time	16
1.2.1 The dominance of information theory	16

1.2.2	A repetition effect in reaction time	18
1.2.3	Reconciling positive and negative recency effects	21
1.2.4	Looking at all possible histories of events	25
1.2.5	Subjective expectancy and automatic facilitation	26
1.2.6	A different pattern of sequential effects	31
1.2.7	The locus of sequential effects	31
1.3	Sequential effects in EEG	33
1.4	Individual Differences in Sequential Effects	39
1.5	Quantitative models of sequential effects	40
1.5.1	The geometric average or exponential filter	42
1.5.2	Capturing a repetition effect - Falmagne (1965)	44
1.5.3	Two geometric means - Laming (1969)	47
1.5.4	An ordered memory scanning process - Falmagne (1975)	49
1.5.5	The biased leaky accumulator - Cho et al (2002)	50
1.5.6	Dynamic belief model - Yu and Cohen (2008)	52
1.5.7	Adding base rates to DBM - Wilder et al (2009)	53
1.5.8	Tackling RSI dependence - Gao et al (2009)	55

1.5.9	Different types of statistics - Gokaydin et al (2011)	56
1.5.10	Joint learning model - Jones et al (2013)	56
1.6	Summary	61
2	Human use different statistics depending on the task	62
2.1	Introduction	63
2.1.1	Some fundamental concepts	66
2.1.2	The need for a new experimental paradigm	67
2.1.3	The need for a new model	69
2.2	Model	74
2.2.1	Formal details	74
2.3	Experiments	79
2.3.1	Data analysis and model fits	79
2.3.2	Experiment 1	80
2.3.3	Experiment 2	83
2.3.4	Experiment 3	87
2.4	General Discussion	89
2.5	Conclusion	93

3	The Structure of Sequential Effects	95
3.1	Introduction	96
3.1.1	Background	98
3.1.2	Experimental differences	101
3.1.3	Individual Differences	105
3.1.4	Separate processing stages	106
3.2	Method	108
3.2.1	Participants	108
3.2.2	Experiments	109
3.2.3	Procedure	110
3.2.4	Data analysis	111
3.3	Results	116
3.3.1	Coefficient patterns	116
3.3.2	Discussion	117
3.3.3	Component scores	122
3.3.4	Discussion	127
3.4	General Discussion	129

3.4.1	The nature of sequential effects - C2 and C3	129
3.4.2	The role of processing speed - C4	131
3.4.3	Conclusion	133
4	An oscillator-based modelling framework for sequential effects	134
4.1	The difficulties with modelling sequential effects	135
4.1.1	A tale of two filters	135
4.1.2	Two separate processing stages	141
4.1.3	Ingredients for a complete model	143
4.2	A new framework for sequential effects	147
4.2.1	Representing the stimuli in continuous time	147
4.2.2	The physics of oscillatory motion	148
4.2.3	The relationship between physics and psychology	154
4.2.4	A single oscillator model	156
4.2.5	Two coupled oscillators	170
4.3	Assessing the modelling framework	175
4.3.1	Covariance structures	176
4.3.2	Reaction time fits	187

4.3.3	Unusual patterns of sequential effects and C4	189
4.3.4	Dependence on RSI	191
4.4	General discussion	193
4.4.1	Covariance structures and underlying physical model	193
4.4.2	The mechanism behind C4	195
4.4.3	Temporal and spatial filtering?	197
5	Discussion	203
5.1	Two different views of sequential effects	205
5.1.1	The classical or statistical view	205
5.1.2	The emerging two component view	209
5.1.3	Resonance and the exponential filtering of alternations	213
5.2	The statistics humans use in different tasks	218
5.3	Sequential effects as spatio-temporal filtering	220
5.4	Future directions	224
5.4.1	Empirical	224
5.4.2	Theoretical	225
5.5	Wider implications and conclusion	232

References	235
A Appendix A: Supplementary information to Chapter 3	248
B Appendix B: Random RSI experiment	254
C Appendix C: All individual data	257
D Appendix D: Solution of differential equations	285
E Appendix E: Mathematica code	289
F Appendix F: Frequency spectra	291

Abstract

Research into sequential effects has a long and rich history spanning almost one hundred years. In their most general definition sequential effects can simply be considered a dependence of behaviour on the past sequence of events, and are of the most pervasive phenomena in psychology. Some form of sequential effects has been observed in multiple perceptual and cognitive tasks, and across different modalities. In addition, sequential effects have also been observed in electrophysiological studies, with a great deal of similarity observed between EEG and behavioural results, making this a relevant topic for both psychology and neuroscience. This gives sequential effects a great deal of potential as a doorway for elucidating the relationship between human behaviour and neuronal activity, between the mind and the brain.

Yet perhaps in part because of the great diversity of domains in which sequential effects are observed, this is an often fragmented field of research, with a multitude of experimental paradigms used, often leading to some confusion as to how different results are related to each other. One of the main objectives of this work is therefore to begin to unify the field into one coherent whole, and to do so at both a computational and process levels. To begin with, Chapter 2 addresses the computational nature of sequential effects in terms of different types of statistics humans use in different circumstances. In Chapter 3 it is shown that the most results described before in the

literature can be explained by only three components, including a wealth of individual differences which had been largely ignored so far.

On a more theoretical level it could be argued that there is a degree of redundancy between the various mathematical models of sequential effects proposed over the years. Models are usually fit to isolated datasets, when it is well known that even minor experimental manipulations can lead to different results, making it unclear how conclusions extend to other settings. Moreover, by virtue of their common mathematical structure, most models of sequential effects suffer from similar difficulties in reproducing key empirical observations. This, together with other considerations, motivates an entirely different approach to modelling sequential effects proposed in Chapter 4. The framework suggested is based on the physics of oscillatory motion, being continuous-time in nature and able to incorporate space, reflecting the fact that both time and space have been found empirically to play a role in sequential effects.

More generally there are two central proposals which unify this dissertation. Firstly that sequential effects are the consequence of two main independent components possibly related to the separate processing of stimuli and responses. Secondly that sequential effects reflect some form of filtering implemented through interaction with an oscillatory system.

Declaration by author

I certify that this work contains no material which has been accepted for the award of any other degree or diploma in my name in any university or other tertiary institution and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by another person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission in my name for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the University Library, being made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the Copyright Act 1968.

I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the University's digital research repository, the Library Search and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the University to restrict access for a period of time.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisors:

Anna "What does it by you?" Ma-Wyatt

Daniel "The devil is in the details" Navarro

Amy "The proof is in the pudding" Perfors

I would like to thank Eric Soetens and Ines Jentsch for permission to reproduce their data.

Above all, I want to thank my wife for her patience and sacrifice in the later stages of writing-up.

I also want to thank my mother for shaping the way I think.

Finally, I want to thank all the friends that accompanied me on this journey: Adam Kane, Sarah Kane, Anastasia Ejova, Simon de Deyne, Tine Van de Wiele, Grant Dewar, Emma Stewart, Belinda Bruza, Heidi Long, Andrew Hendrickson, Diana Schmalzried, Rachel Stevens, Wai Keen Vong, Lauren Kennedy, Toby Elmhirst, Fernando Marmolejo-Ramos, Nadja Klafke, Adella Bhaskara,

Kathleen Wright, Kaitlin Harkess, David O'Shaughnessy, Carola Sanders, Wanda Prokopiak, Deidre Simpson, Sayed the coffee man, and many others.

This thesis is dedicated to the most beautiful creatures in the universe: Alex and Lara.

List of Figures

1.1	Zenith radio experiments	11
1.2	An alternation effect (Jarvik, 1951)	14
1.3	A repetition effect (Bertelson, 1961)	19
1.4	Contradiction between reaction times and predictive behaviour (Hale, 1967)	23
1.5	Decreasing RTs with runs of repetitions and alternations (Hale, 1969)	23
1.6	Benefit-only and cost-benefit patterns of sequential effects	27
1.7	The dependence of sequential effects on the RSI (Soetens, 1985)	29
1.8	Unusual patterns of sequential effects (Jentzsch, 2002; Melis, 2002)	30
1.9	Sequential effects in the ERP (Squires, 1976)	34
1.10	Sequential effects in P300 with short and long RSI (Sommer, 1999)	36

1.11	Two separate processing stages - S-LRP and LRP-R (Jentzsch, 2002)	37
2.1	Exponential decay	72
2.2	Model predictions for a 2AFC	77
2.3	Model predictions for a 3AFC	78
2.4	Experiment 1 results	82
2.5	Experiment 2 results	85
2.6	Experiment 3 results	88
2.7	Evidence for zero-th order statistics	91
3.1	Dependence of sequential effects on the RSI	101
3.2	Unusual patterns of sequential effects	102
3.3	Individual differences for the same experimental conditions	104
3.4	S-LRP and LRP-R	106
3.5	Latent structure of sequential effects.	116
3.6	Invariance of the latent structure of sequential effects with RSI	118
3.7	C4 as the consequence of delayed activation of C2 and C3	121
3.8	Effect of varying the balance of C2 and C3	122

3.9	Effect of negative scores on C2 and C3	124
3.10	The effect of C4	125
3.11	Mean reaction time patterns as a function of RSI	126
3.12	Mean individual scores as a function of RSI	127
4.1	Two types of exponential filter	137
4.2	Humans sometimes behave like a simple exponential filter	138
4.3	Typical patterns of sequential effects obtained with a long RSI	139
4.4	Evidence for two processing stages involved sequential effects	142
4.5	Square pulse representing a single stimulus	148
4.6	Functions of time representing RRRR and AAAA	149
4.7	Resonance curves	152
4.8	REP	157
4.9	ALT	158
4.10	Illustration of the parameters used to generate REP and ALT	159
4.11	Oscillator behaviour at resonance with repetitions and alternations	160
4.12	Effect of varying the damping coefficient on model results	161
4.13	Power spectra of RRRR and AAAA	162

4.14	Power spectra of the sequences RRRR, AAAA and ARAR(RARA)	164
4.15	Patterns similar to -REP and -ALT produced by a heavily damped oscillator	165
4.16	Illustration of the parameters used to generate patterns similar to -REP and -ALT	166
4.17	Selected patterns of results for a single heavily damped oscillator	167
4.18	A lightly damped oscillator can no longer produce -REP and -ALT	168
4.19	Selected patterns of results for a single lightly damped oscillator	169
4.20	Example forcing functions in standard coordinates	171
4.21	Example forcing functions in canonical coordinates	173
4.22	Resonance in a system of two coupled oscillators	174
4.23	Amplitude response of a system of two coupled oscillators	175
4.24	A comparison of the two main latent components of sequential effects with the two resonance patterns	177
4.25	Latent structure of a heavily damped system before rotation	180
4.26	Latent structure of a heavily damped system after rotation	181
4.27	Latent structure of a lightly damped system before rotation	182
4.28	Model parameters for four rotation targets	183
4.29	Latent structure of a lightly damped system after rotation	184

4.30	Effect of underestimating the number of latent components in the latent structure of a lightly damped oscillator	186
4.31	Fits of a single oscillator with the last pulse removed	189
4.32	Spurious inversion of REP when the RSI is short	192
4.33	Results of a random RSI experiment	197
4.34	Long RSI experiments with spatially separate stimuli	198
4.35	Long RSI experiment with overlapping stimuli	199
5.1	Two types of exponential filter	206
5.2	Comparison of a sum of exponential filters with empirical data	207
5.3	Fit of exponential filters to S-LRP and LRP-R	209
5.4	Evidence from behavioural experiments for stimulus and response processing . . .	211
5.5	A comparison of the two main latent components of sequential effects with S-LRP and LRP-R	212
5.6	Fit of a combination of S-LRP and LRP-R to a typical cost-benefit pattern	213
5.7	Fit of ALT and REP to S-LRP and LRP-R	214
5.8	Fit of a combination of REP and ALT to the typical cost-benefit pattern of sequential effects.	215
5.9	Results of a 2AFC with a random RSI.	217

5.10 Example normal modes	228
A.1 Unrotated latent structure	249
A.2 Individual scores	250
A.3 Latent structure per experiment	252
C.1 Experiment 1, 50 ms RSI	258
C.2 Experiment 1, 250 ms RSI	259
C.3 Experiment 1, 500 ms RSI	260
C.4 Experiment 1, 800 ms RSI	261
C.5 Experiment 2, 250 ms RSI	262
C.6 Experiment 2, 500 ms RSI	263
C.7 Experiment 2, 800 ms RSI	264
C.8 Experiment 3, 50 ms RSI	265
C.9 Experiment 3, 250 ms RSI	266
C.10 Experiment 3, 500 ms RSI	267
C.11 Experiment 3, 800 ms RSI	268
C.12 Experiment 4, 50 ms RSI	269

C.13 Experiment 4, 250 ms RSI	270
C.14 Experiment 4, 500 ms RSI	271
C.15 Experiment 4, 800 ms RSI	272
C.16 Experiment 5, 50 ms RSI	273
C.17 Experiment 5, 250 ms RSI	274
C.18 Experiment 5, 500 ms RSI	275
C.19 Experiment 5, 800 ms RSI	276
C.20 Experiment 6, 50 ms RSI	277
C.21 Experiment 6, 250 ms RSI	278
C.22 Experiment 6, 500 ms RSI	279
C.23 Experiment 6, 800 ms RSI	280
C.24 Experiment 7, 50 ms RSI	281
C.25 Experiment 7, 250 ms RSI	282
C.26 Experiment 7, 500 ms RSI	283
C.27 Experiment 7, 800 ms RSI	284
F.1 Frequency spectra of all 16 sequences	292

List of Tables

2.1	Evaluation of the fit of the zero-th and first order models	79
3.1	Number of participants per experiment and RSI	109
3.2	Summary of experimental designs	110

