

The effectiveness of GLP-1  
analogues compared to DPP-4  
inhibitors for beta cell function  
and diabetes related complications  
among adults with type 2 diabetes:  
a systematic review and meta-  
analysis

Mrs Susan Bellman  
Master of Clinical Science  
The Joanna Briggs Institute  
Faculty of Health Sciences  
The University of Adelaide  
South Australia

23<sup>rd</sup> December 2015

# Table of Contents

---

<b>Acknowledgements</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Declaration</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Abstract</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Chapter 1: Introduction</b>	<b>9</b>
1.1 Background	9
1.2 Aetiology and pathophysiology of diabetes	12
1.2.1 The incretin effect	17
1.3 Antihyperglycaemic agents	20
1.3.1 Biguanide	20
1.3.2 Sulfonylureas	21
1.3.3 Meglitinides	21
1.3.4 Thiazolidinediones	21
1.3.5 Alpha-glucosidase inhibitors	22
1.3.6 Sodium-glucose co-transporter-2 inhibitors	22
1.3.7 Insulin	23
1.3.8 Glucagon-like peptide-1 (GLP-1) analogues	23
1.3.9 Dipeptidyl peptidase-4 (DPP-4) inhibitors	24
1.4 Measures of beta cell function	25
1.4.1 Hyperglycaemic clamp technique	26
1.4.2 Measures of plasma connecting peptide (C-peptide)	27
1.4.3 Proinsulin to insulin plasma concentration ratio	28
1.4.4 Homeostasis model assessment (HOMA)	29
1.5 Measures of glycaemic control	31
1.5.1 Fasting plasma glucose	31
1.5.2 Postprandial plasma glucose	31
1.5.3 Glycated haemoglobin (HbA1c)	32
1.6 Diabetes related complications	33
1.6.1 Retinopathy	34
1.6.2 Neuropathy	36
1.6.3 Nephropathy	37
1.7 Why a systematic review is needed	38
1.7.1 Current evidence for the comparison between GLP-1 analogues and DPP-4 inhibitors on beta cell function and diabetes related complications in adults with type 2 diabetes	38
1.8 Review question	39

<b>Chapter 2: Systematic review methods</b>	40
2.1 Types of participants	40
2.2 Types of interventions and comparators	40
2.3 Types of outcomes	40
2.4 Types of studies	41
2.5 Search strategy	41
2.5.1 Search method	42
2.6 Assessment of methodological quality	43
2.7 Data extraction	44
2.8 Data synthesis	45
2.8.1 Data conversions	45
2.8.2 Meta-analysis	45
<b>Chapter 3: Results</b>	48
3.1 Study inclusion process	48
3.2 Methodological quality	49
3.3 Description of included studies	50
3.3.1 Interventions and comparators	51
3.4 Effects on pancreatic beta cell function	68
3.4.1 HOMA-beta (%)	68
3.4.1.1 High dose and low dose GLP-1 analogue compared to DPP-4 inhibitor for duration of 26 weeks	68
3.4.1.2 High dose and low dose GLP-1 analogue compared to DPP-4 inhibitor for duration of 52 weeks	69
3.4.2 Plasma proinsulin to insulin (PI/I) ratio	70
3.4.3 Plasma C-peptide levels	71
3.5 Effects on glycaemic control	72
3.5.1 Glycated haemoglobin (HbA1c)	72
3.5.1.1 High dose and low dose GLP-1 analogue compared to DPP-4 inhibitor for duration of 26 weeks	72
3.5.1.2 High dose and low dose GLP-1 analogue compared to DPP-4 inhibitor for duration of 52 weeks	73
3.5.2 Fasting plasma glucose	74
3.5.2.1 High dose and low dose GLP-1 analogue compared to DPP-4 inhibitor for duration of 26 weeks	74

3.5.2.2	High dose and low dose GLP-1 analogue compared to DPP-4 inhibitor for duration of 52 weeks	75
3.5.3	Postprandial plasma glucose	76
3.6	Outcomes of diabetes related complications using GLP-1 analogue compared to DPP-4 inhibitor	77
3.7	Adverse events using GLP-1 analogue compared to DPP-4 inhibitor	77
3.7.1	Gastrointestinal adverse events	77
3.7.1.1	High dose and low dose GLP-1 analogue compared to DPP-4 inhibitor for duration of 24 to 26 weeks	77
3.7.1.2	High dose and low dose GLP-1 analogue compared to DPP-4 inhibitor for duration of 52 weeks	79
3.7.2	Headache, infections, pancreatitis and mortality	80
<b>Chapter 4: Discussion</b>		<b>83</b>
4.1	General discussion	83
4.2	Limitations of included studies	90
4.3	Limitations of the review process	91
4.4	Implications for clinical practice	92
4.5	Implications for research	95
4.5.1	Cost effectiveness of adding GLP-1 analogues to metformin monotherapy	95
4.5.2	Use of GLP-1 analogue in prediabetes	96
4.5.3	Use of GLP-1 analogue in beta cell preservation and regeneration	97
4.5.4	Long term safety data for GLP-1 analogues	97
4.6	Conclusion	98
<b>Appendices</b>		<b>99</b>
I.	Systematic review protocol	99
II.	Search strategies	107
III.	Joanna Briggs Institute (JBI) Critical appraisal tool	112
IV.	Joanna Briggs Institute (JBI) Data extraction tool	116
V.	Details of additional data obtained for included studies from study authors	118
<b>References</b>		<b>119</b>

## Acknowledgements

---

It is with immense gratitude that I acknowledge my supervisors, Associate Professor Edoardo Aromataris and Dr Jared Campbell, for their advice and support. I would particularly like to thank Edoardo for his continuing patience and dedication, immense knowledge and tireless encouragement and enthusiasm. Without his guidance and mentorship this thesis would not have been possible.

I would like to take this opportunity to express my sincere appreciation to staff members at Joanna Briggs Institute for their help, support and friendly faces. In particular, I would like to thank Siang Tay for her assistance with copyediting the thesis chapters to assist with grammatical consistency and punctuation.

Finally, to my wonderful family, especially my husband, I thank you for coming on this journey with me, for supporting me during this challenging time, and for your company during the long, late nights of study. For this, I am eternally grateful.

## Declaration

---

I, Susan Bellman, certify that this work contains no material that has been accepted for the award of any other tertiary institution, and, to the best of my knowledge and belief, contains no material previously published or written by any other person, except where due reference has been made in the text. In addition, I certify that no part of this work will, in the future, be used in a submission for any other degree or diploma in any university or other tertiary institution without the prior approval of the University of Adelaide and, where applicable, any partner institution responsible for the joint award of this degree.

I give consent to this copy of my thesis, when deposited in the university library, to be made available for loan and photocopying, subject to the provisions of the *Copyright Act 1968*. I also give permission for the digital version of my thesis to be made available on the web, via the university's digital research repository, the library catalogue and also through web search engines, unless permission has been granted by the university to restrict access for a period of time.

Susan Marie Bellman

23<sup>rd</sup> December 2015

## Abstract

---

Continued loss of beta cell function is responsible for progressive deterioration of plasma glucose control and complications characteristic of type 2 diabetes. Two classes of incretin-based antihyperglycaemic agents, dipeptidyl peptidase-4 (DPP-4) inhibitors and glucagon-like peptide-1 (GLP-1) analogues, have shown favourable effects on beta cell function. The aim of this systematic review was to provide a comprehensive synthesis of randomised clinical studies comparing the effectiveness of GLP-1 analogues to DPP-4 inhibitors in improving beta cell function and managing diabetes related complications.

A search of PubMed, EMBASE and national and international clinical trials databases was conducted for randomised controlled trials that compared GLP-1 analogues to DPP-4 inhibitors, either alone or in combination with metformin, in adults with type 2 diabetes. Methodological quality of included studies was assessed using the Joanna Briggs Institute (JBI) critical appraisal checklist, and research data was extracted using the JBI data extraction tool. Outcomes included beta cell function (measured by homeostasis model assessment-beta [HOMA-beta], plasma connecting peptide [C-peptide] and proinsulin to insulin [PI/I] plasma concentration ratio) glycated haemoglobin (HbA1c), fasting and postprandial plasma glucose levels, diabetes related complications, and adverse drug events.

Seven randomised controlled trials including 2661 participants were included in this review. The overall quality of included studies was good. Treatment duration ranged from 24 to 52 weeks in the included studies and included a number of different dosages. Results of meta-analysis showed that GLP-1 analogues, at different dosages and duration, were associated with statistically significant improvements in beta cell function compared to DPP-4 inhibitors as measured by HOMA-beta; mean difference 23% and 25% for high dose GLP-1 analogues

after 26 and 52 weeks, respectively ( $p < 0.00001$ ); 18.5% and 16.7% for low dose GLP-1 analogues after 26 and 52 weeks, respectively ( $p < 0.00001$ ). Treatment with GLP-1 analogues showed a greater reduction in glycated haemoglobin (HbA1c) compared to treatment with DPP-4 inhibitors: a mean difference of -0.52% and -0.68% (-5.67mmol/mol and -7.41mmol/mol) for high dose GLP-1 analogues after 26 and 52 weeks, respectively ( $p < 0.00001$ ); and -0.38% and -0.45% (-4.14mmol/mol and -4.91mmol/mol) for low dose GLP-1 analogues after 26 and 52 weeks, respectively ( $p < 0.00001$ ). Treatment with GLP-1 analogues resulted in a greater reduction in fasting plasma glucose compared to DPP-4 inhibitors: a mean difference of -1.23 mmol/L and -1.47 mmol/L (-22.16 mg/dL and -26.49 mg/dL) for high dose GLP-1 analogues after 26 and 52 weeks, respectively ( $p < 0.00001$ ); and -1.01mmol/L and -0.84mmol/L (-18.20mg/dL and -15.13 mg/dL) for low dose GLP-1 analogues after 26 and 52 weeks, respectively ( $p < 0.00001$ ). No studies reported outcomes for diabetes related complications. However, DPP-4 inhibitors were associated with fewer gastrointestinal adverse events compared to GLP-1 analogues. There were no differences in other adverse events such as headache and infection.

The findings showed that GLP-1 analogues had greater beneficial effects on pancreatic beta cell function and plasma glucose control than DPP-4 inhibitors, but caused more gastrointestinal adverse events. Longer term safety data is required to better identify the contribution of GLP-1 analogues in reducing diabetes related microvascular complications, and determine their long term pancreatic and cardiac effects.